Catholic Choir School Models in the United States:
Reinvigorating the Musico-Liturgical Life of the Church

A TREATISE

Submitted to the Faculty of the
Benjamin T. Rome School of Music
Of The Catholic University of America
In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements
For the Degree
Doctor of Musical Arts in Sacred Music

©
All Rights Reserved

By
Jennifer L. Seighman

Washington, D.C.

2015
Catholic Choir School Models in the United States: 
Reinvigorating the Musico-Liturgical Life of the Church

Jennifer L. Seighman, D.M.A.

Director: Leo Nestor, D.M.A.

Choir schools have been an intrinsic part of the Catholic Church since the fourth century. While the Holy See has instructed that such schools and training be diligently promoted, few programs exist, and even less is known about them. This paper provides much-needed research on Catholic choir school programs and the benefits they offer to the twenty-first-century Church, particularly in bringing the musico-liturgical goals of the Second Vatican Council to fruition. Using a multi-case-study approach, I investigate the only known Catholic institutions in the United States currently employing a traditional choir school education of rigorous daily instruction in choir and sung liturgy: St. Paul’s Choir School (Cambridge, MA), The Madeleine Choir School (Salt Lake City, UT), and The Atonement Academy (San Antonio, TX).

To formulate the framework for this study, a survey of related literature was made encompassing musico-liturgical directives of the Second Vatican Council, Church documents calling for chorister formation, papal writings, scholarly sources addressing sacred music within the Catholic Church, and various sets of education standards. From this, a research instrument was developed against which to investigate each school according to eight standards: placing importance on the teaching of music, giving pride of place to chant, preserving and fostering the
singing of polyphony, promoting the full treasure of sacred music, cultivating new compositions, facilitating active participation, providing liturgical training, and fostering spiritual formation. Data related to these standards was collected from each school through interviews with music and pastoral staff, field notes from on-site observations of classes and liturgies, and a variety of school documents and sources.

Results show that all three schools were highly successful in achieving these standards. Secondarily, the research instrument created for this study contributes a set of benchmarks from which other Catholic institutions can assess their own progress in achieving musico-liturgical objectives. Because of their exemplary adherence to Vatican II directives, choir school programs should be advocated as models for use in other kinds of Catholic institutions. The potential benefits these types of programs can contribute to Catholic education and the New Evangelization are worthy of substantial investigation by the Church.
This treatise by Jennifer L. Seighman fulfills the dissertation requirement for the doctoral degree in Sacred Music approved by Leo Nestor, D.M.A., as Director, and by Sharyn Battersby, Ed.D., Andrew Weaver, Ph.D., and Michael Witczak, S.L.D., as Readers.

Leo Cornelius Nestor, D.M.A., Director

Sharyn L. Battersby, Ed.D., Reader

Andrew H. Weaver, Ph.D., Reader

Michael G. Witczak, S.L.D., Reader
Vide ut quod ore cantas, corde credas, et quod corde credis operibus probes.

– Gelasian Sacramentary

---

1 Liber sacramentorum Romanae ecclesiae [The Gelasian Sacramentary], ed. with introduction, critical notes, and appendix by Henry Austin Wilson (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1894), 145. This excerpt is taken from the ordination regulations for the minor order of psalmista, or the psalmist. Translation: “See (make certain) that what you sing with [your] mouth, you believe in [your] heart, and what you believe in [your] heart you prove/demonstrate by [your] works.” The English text was published by the School of English Church Music in 1934 in the Choristers’ Pocket Book: “Grant that what we sing with our lips, we may believe in our hearts, and what we believe in our hearts, we may show forth in our lives.”
# CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF FIGURES</td>
<td></td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABBREVIATIONS</td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td></td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER I: REVIEW OF LITERATURE</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER II: METHODS AND PROCEDURES</td>
<td></td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Selection of the Sample</td>
<td></td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Research Procedures</td>
<td></td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interview</td>
<td></td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observation</td>
<td></td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document review</td>
<td></td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Development of the Research Instrument</td>
<td></td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Administration of the Research Instrument</td>
<td></td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER III: ST. PAUL’S CHOIR SCHOOL</td>
<td></td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Background</td>
<td></td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Presentation of Data</td>
<td></td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standard #1: Catholic institutions and schools attach great importance to the teaching of music</td>
<td></td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standard #2: Gregorian chant is given pride of place in liturgical services</td>
<td></td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standard #3: Sacred polyphony is included in liturgical celebrations</td>
<td></td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standard #4: The treasure of sacred music is preserved and fostered with great care</td>
<td></td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standard #5: Composers cultivate new works of sacred music to increase the church’s store of treasures</td>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standard #6: The faithful are led to full, conscious, and active participation in liturgical celebrations</td>
<td></td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standard #7: Singers receive a genuine training in liturgy</td>
<td></td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standard #8: Singers receive spiritual formation of the highest standards</td>
<td></td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Summary</td>
<td></td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER IV: THE MADELEINE CHOIR SCHOOL</td>
<td></td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Background</td>
<td></td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Presentation of Data</td>
<td></td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standard #1: Catholic institutions and schools attach great importance to the teaching of music</td>
<td></td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER V: THE ATONEMENT ACADEMY

1. Background

2. Presentation of Data

3. Summary

CHAPTER VI: ANALYSIS AND CONCLUSION

1. Initial Assessment

2. Analysis of Data and Explanation of Procedures

v
Standard #5: Composers cultivate new works of sacred music to increase the
church’s store of treasures.................................................................337
Standard #6: The faithful are led to full, conscious, and active participation in
liturgical celebrations.................................................................339
Standard #7: Singers receive a genuine training in liturgy......................345
Standard #8: Singers receive spiritual formation of the highest standards.....346
3. Conclusion......................................................................................348

APPENDICES..................................................................................354
A: Rehearsal/ Classroom Observation Form...........................................354
B: Liturgical Observation Form...............................................................358
C: Research Questions.........................................................................360
D: Additional General and School-Specific Questions.........................366

BIBLIOGRAPHY.............................................................................367
FIGURES

CHAPTER II: METHODS AND PROCEDURES

2.1 Standards and benchmarks derived from the eight musico-liturgical directives........27

CHAPTER III: ST. PAUL’S CHOIR SCHOOL

3.1 Illustration of procedures for calculating time students spend in musico-liturgical areas.................................................................54
3.2 Minutes per week spent in musico-liturgical subject areas.................................55
3.3 ‘Dignus est Agnus’ from Graduale Romanum.....................................................83
3.4 Choral repertoire performed at St. Paul’s Choir School in 2013.............................86
3.5 Choral repertoire in 2013: Renaissance polyphony (31 out of 147 works) = 21%.......87
3.6 Choral repertoire in 2013: Baroque (13 out of 147 works) = 9%..........................92
3.7 Choral repertoire in 2013: Rococo/ Classical (7 out of 147 works) = 5%.................93
3.8 Choral repertoire in 2013: Romantic/ Cecilian Movement/ Oxford Movement (32 out of 147 works) = 22%..........................................................94
3.9 Choral repertoire in 2013: twentieth century (42 out of 147 works) = 28%.............97
3.10 Choral repertoire in 2013: living composers (22 out of 147 works) = 15%.............101
3.11 Calculation procedure for determining amount of singing by the presider, choir, and congregation in the five liturgies observed at St. Paul’s Choir School (minutes : seconds).................................................................109

CHAPTER IV: THE MADELEINE CHOIR SCHOOL

4.1 Minutes per week spent in musico-liturgical subject areas...............................145
4.2 Choral repertoire performed at The Madeleine Choir School in 2013.....................174
4.3 Choral repertoire in 2013: Renaissance polyphony (54 out of 203 works) = 27%......175
4.4 Choral repertoire in 2013: Baroque (17 out of 203 works) = 8%.................................180
4.5 Choral repertoire in 2013: Rococo/ Classical (6 out of 203 works) = 3%..................181
4.6 Choral repertoire in 2013: Romantic/ Cecilian Movement/ Oxford Movement (41 out of 203 works) = 20%.........................................................182
4.7 Choral repertoire in 2013: twentieth century (53 out of 203 works) = 26%.............185
4.8 Choral repertoire in 2013: living composers (32 out of 203 works) = 16%................189
4.9 Calculation procedure for determining amount of singing by the presider/ deacon, choir, and congregation/cantor in the five liturgies observed at The Madeleine Choir School (minutes : seconds)..................................................196

CHAPTER V: THE ATONEMENT ACADEMY

5.1 Minutes per week spent in musico-liturgical subject areas.................................233
5.2 Stages of the boys’ changing voice – by John Cooksey.....................................252
5.3 Choral repertoire performed at The Atonement Academy in 2013......................266
5.4 Choral repertoire in 2013: Renaissance polyphony (14 out of 106 works) = 13%....267
5.5 Choral repertoire in 2013: Baroque (6 out of 106 works) = 6%............................269
5.6 Choral repertoire in 2013: Rococo/ Classical (6 out of 106 works) = 6%.............270
5.7 Choral repertoire in 2013: Romantic/ Cecilian Movement/ Oxford Movement (14 out of 106 works) = 13%.........................................................271
5.8 Choral repertoire in 2013: twentieth century (14 out of 106 works) = 13%..........273
5.9 Choral repertoire in 2013: living composers (52 out of 106 works) = 49%............275
5.10 Calculation procedure for determining amount of singing by the presider, deacon, choir, men’s schola, and congregation in the five liturgies observed at The Atonement Academy (minutes : seconds)...........................................285
CHAPTER VI: ANALYSIS AND CONCLUSION

6.1 Comparison of school statistics for 2013-2014..................................................315
6.2 Comparison of musico-liturgical minutes per week among the choirs and schools for 2013-2104.................................................................................................325
6.3 Comparison of musico-liturgical curricula and methods from 2013-2014.............327
6.4 Comparison of choral repertoire and most frequently performed composers for 2013...333
6.5 Number of pieces and percent of treble-only music found in each era in 2013........335
6.6 Language and usage represented by sung repertoire in 2013................................336
6.7 Comparison of musical roles in the liturgy among the three schools.......................340
6.8 Distribution of sung elements at Mass.................................................................342
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABRSM</td>
<td>Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AFPC</td>
<td>American Federation Pueri Cantores</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AGO</td>
<td>American Guild of Organists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CMAA</td>
<td>Church Music Association of America</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPA</td>
<td>International Phonetic Alphabet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCW</td>
<td>Music in Catholic Worship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MENC</td>
<td>Music Educators’ National Conference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MS</td>
<td><em>Musicam sacram</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAfME</td>
<td>National Association for Music Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NATS</td>
<td>National Association of Teachers of Singing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RSCM</td>
<td>Royal School of Church Music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td><em>Sacrosanctum concilium</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPCS</td>
<td>St. Paul’s Choir School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TCDA</td>
<td>Texas Choral Directors Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TMEA</td>
<td>Texas Music Educators Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TPSMEA</td>
<td>Texas Private School Music Educator Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VBC</td>
<td>Vienna Boys’ Choir</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

After nearly ten years, this treatise symbolizes the culmination of my doctoral education. I wish to thank the members of my committee: Dr. Leo Nestor, Dr. Sharyn Battersby, Dr. Andrew Weaver, and Rev. Dr. Michael Witczak for their guidance and generosity in this massive endeavor. I am also grateful to Fr. Michael Drea and John Robinson of St. Paul’s Choir School, Gregory Glenn and Melanie Malinka of The Madeleine Choir School, and Fr. Christopher Phillips and Edmund Murray of The Atonement Academy for their insight and assistance during my collection of data for this study.

I have been blessed by all those with whom I have had the privilege of serving alongside in the liturgy over the years, particularly my choristers and pastors. I am especially grateful to Msgr. Bernard Christman for being my first organ teacher, Fr. Louis Stingel for offering me my first music director position, and Msgr. R. Cary Hill for sharing his love of liturgy with me.

To my colleagues and friends who have been a constant source of encouragement through their prayers and interest in this project, I am ever so appreciative.

To my sister for her support and my loving mother for her many selfless sacrifices that have allowed me so many opportunities in life.

To my sweet husband, Gary, I am grateful for your patience and unconditional love. Thank you for always being by my side and believing in me.

I thank God for His many blessings, for filling me with a passion for sacred music, and for sending His Holy Spirit to guide and inspire this work from its inception.
INTRODUCTION

Evidence of the choir school tradition in the Catholic Church extends back to the papacy of Pope Sylvester I (314-36) when the schola cantorum, or singing school, was established in Rome for the training of men and boys.¹ First out of necessity, because the church needed trained musicians to sing the vast quantities of plainchant that was part of the liturgy, and secondly to educate boys for potential entry into the priesthood, choir schools arose in cathedrals and monasteries throughout Europe during the Middle Ages. In the succeeding centuries, there is evidence that choir schools were instrumental in the cultivation of priests, composers, and adult choristers. Josquin, Morales, Victoria, Palestrina, Joseph and Michael Haydn, and Bruckner are among those descended from this great lineage. Following an overall period of decline after the Reformation, the choir school tradition and its prominent role once again resurfaced in the late nineteenth century as a result of liturgical reform movements, influential individuals, and key institutions. Reputable choirs of men and boys, such as R. R. Terry’s Westminster Cathedral Choir and Fr. William Finn’s Paulist Choir, were established. In 1903, Pope Pius X’s motu proprio Tra le sollecitudini directed that males, both children and adults, be gathered and instructed for the purpose of aiding the restoration of Gregorian chant and Renaissance polyphony in the liturgy.² Later Church documents, such as De musica sacra et sacra liturgia, further reinstated the tradition by directing central churches to establish schools in


which to train boys’ choirs.\textsuperscript{3} \textit{Sacrosanctum concilium}, the Second Vatican Council’s constitution on the sacred liturgy, mandated that choirs, including children’s choirs, “be diligently promoted” through the “teaching and practice of music” in Catholic institutions.\textsuperscript{4}

Choir schools have been an integral part of the Catholic Church for centuries, dating back nearly as far as the Edict of Milan. Since Pius X’s 1903 motu proprio, the Holy See has directed that the Church provide musical instruction for singers (boys), yet very few programs exist, and little is known about them. This paper will investigate the only three Catholic institutions in the United States currently employing a traditional choir school education and characterized by rigorous daily instruction in choir and sung liturgy: St. Paul’s Choir School (Cambridge, MA), The Madeleine Choir School (Salt Lake City, UT), and The Atonement Academy (San Antonio, TX). Using a multi-case study approach will allow for the provision of much-needed qualitative data on how these programs work as well as the benefits they may offer to the twenty-first-century Church, particularly in bringing the musico-liturgical goals of the Second Vatican Council to fruition. In order to make this assessment, eight overarching standards have been developed based on ecclesial directives as an instrument through which to measure each school. Institutions will then be investigated according to the following eight standards: the importance of teaching music, giving pride of place to chant, preserving and fostering polyphony, promoting the full treasure of sacred music, cultivating new compositions, facilitating active participation, providing liturgical training, and fostering spiritual formation within the framework of the choir


school. If the schools are successful in meeting these standards, then they may provide effective models which can be adapted for use in other kinds of Catholic institutions. Secondarily, the research instrument created for this study will contribute a set of benchmarks through which other Catholic institutions can assess their own progress in achieving the musico-liturgical objectives of Vatican II.

Chapter I reviews the body of literature currently available on topics most relevant to Catholic choir schools. Aside from Lucas Tappan’s recent document on The Madeleine Choir School, almost no research exists specifically on Catholic choir schools in the United States. Because of this lacuna, a wider net was cast to determine related sources that would provide insight on this field before undertaking the study. Studies of American Episcopal choir schools, the English choir school tradition, boy choristers, and current musical practices in Catholic parishes; musico-liturgical directives of the Second Vatican Council; Church documents calling for chorister formation; papal writings on sacred music; assessment standards for the arts, Catholic music education, and general Catholic school education; and chorister teaching methods and resources provide this comprehensive knowledge from which to proceed.

Chapter II describes the methods and procedures used in executing this study. Based on the goal of assessing the praxis of each of the three schools against the musico-liturgical directives of Vatican II, a multi-case study approach was deemed the most appropriate approach. Processes used in selecting the sample, determining the research procedures, developing the research instrument, and administering this instrument will be explained.

---

Chapter III, IV, and V present the data collected from St. Paul’s Choir School, The Madeleine Choir School, and The Atonement Academy respectively. Following a general background to contextualize each school, qualitative information (and at times quantitative information) is presented in support of each of the eight musico-liturgical standards. This culmination of data reflects the schools’ praxis as gained through documents, interviews, and observations collected from each institution. Teaching methods and resources employed during this chorister training will be discussed and cited throughout each chapter as applicable.

Chapter VI compares the data of the previous three chapters and offers conclusions based on the outcomes seen in the study. First, a general assessment is made analyzing the overarching trends among the three schools. Next, the data is synthesized to explain how and the degree to which the schools were able to meet the eight ecclesiastical standards. Finally, a summary of the study, conclusions about what the findings do and do not suggest, and further recommendations will be made.

Appendices contain the observation forms I used to collect data from rehearsals and liturgies while in residency at each school and the list of questions I answered in assessing each of the eight standards and gaining general information from each institution.
CHAPTER I
REVIEW OF LITERATURE

While no extensive research on Catholic choir schools in the United States existed until 2014, several researchers have published material on closely related topics which help to lay the groundwork for my study. Some of the major issues these sources brought to light include the inability to define an exact method used in a traditional choir school education; gauging if fulfillment at being a chorister is musically or spiritually motivated, or both; considering the benefits choir school education offers to children; and considering the benefits choir school education offers to the Church. Before undertaking such a study of Catholic choir schools, it was important to consider what this prior research showed. Further sources published by ecclesiastical and scholastic institutions were drawn upon in designing the research instrument for this study and in surveying the methods and resources used in chorister training.

When considering choir school education, the English tradition comes readily to mind. In England, the craft is passed down through an intensive apprenticeship system whereby individuals learn the trade first serving as choristers, then assistants, then ultimately taking over as choirmaster and replacing their mentors. Outside of this, there are not method books or university degrees which prepare one for such a vocation. This idea is foreign to the American mindset which seeks to pedagogically explain how this chorister training is achieved and emulated from one generation to the next. In a never-before-attempted book, Jeffrey Sandborg
questions leading figures of English choral music to learn their approaches, philosophies, techniques, ideas, and practices.\(^1\) However, other than some discussion of the David Willcocks versus George Guest tonal philosophies, their responses about how they do what they do are vague and lack a description of methodology. In looking to other Englishmen steeped in the tradition, Peter Phillips offers some discussion of English tonal philosophy, chorister training, and the inclusion of girls in his article.\(^2\) John Bertalot,\(^3\) and particularly George Guest,\(^4\) comes closest to articulating English choir school methods and the techniques they have used to train choristers. Written from the point of view of an apprentice observing a master conductor at work, Bertalot’s book offers practical tips for day-to-day chorister training, including use of the Royal School of Church Music’s graded training system. Part II of Guest’s book offers a section on choral techniques used during his historic tenure as organist and choirmaster at St. John’s Cambridge. Though far from a complete “method” book, it does provide the best sense of any publication to date of how this choral training is achieved. Each of these publications alludes to the lack of written information available for discovering a method to chorister formation. As a result, this discovery can perhaps only be approached through direct observation of the training in action as will take place during my study.

---


\(^3\) John Bertalot, *Immediately Practical Tips for Choral Directors* (Minneapolis: Augsburg Fortress, 1994).

Two important conclusions about musical and spiritual formation in choristers can be made from a recent investigation by Martin Ashley. The results of his study show that a majority of students regard the high musical standards and hard work they experience in chorister training positively. Ashley reports, “Group interviews validated the view that the boys would soon be bored by less demanding music or less exacting standards. Contempt was expressed for what several boys regarded as the low and patronizing expectations of the music they had experienced in school.” While it was overwhelmingly confirmed that students were fulfilled emotionally and intellectually by the challenge and type of the music they sang as choristers, the study also revealed difficulty in assessing the extent to which choristers were formed spiritually from these same experiences. Due to the young ages, interviews with choristers seemed problematic for ascertaining information about spiritual development. As a result, my study will instead focus on analyzing the schools’ alumni/alumnae to assess the long-term impact of this spiritual formation which began during their chorister training rather than on any immediate impacts.

There is a great deal of research that advocates that education in the arts, and particularly choir school training, offers many benefits to children musically, educationally, behaviorally, spiritually, and vocationally. As was confirmed by Ashley’s study, engaging music at such challenging levels brings enjoyment and excitement to the developmental process. According to MENC’s National Standards for Arts Education, now the National Association for Music

---


6 Ibid, 261.
Education (NAfME), “Study and competence reinforce each other; students become increasingly interested in learning . . . .”

Due to the strong comradely environment indicative of choir schools, choristers develop interpersonal and intrapersonal skills which can be applied to the rest of life, such as patience, cooperation, self-discipline, self-esteem, self-motivation, and perseverance. Because students are able to develop such advanced, professional behavior from an early age, Daniel McGrath states, “The institution of the choir of men and boys has long been a place where boys learned to be good churchmen, where future vocations to the ministerial priesthood of the church are fostered and leaders are developed.” Choir schools provide the impetus for a lifetime of learning and spiritual growth in the mysteries of the Church due to their extensive service to the liturgy. For these reasons, Lucas Tappan argues “for the [choir] school as a model for the Christian education of youth.”

Based upon his experiences as former Headmaster of St. John’s College, Cambridge, Alan Mould comments on the long-term benefits of a choir school education:

No wonder so many then go on to achieve distinction in a great variety of spheres. . . . There are chairmen of companies, top civil servants, members of government and Parliament from across the political spectrum; bishops, priests, monks; there are actors, comics, producers, directors, broadcasters; novelists, poets, journalists and their editors; chefs and wine experts; doctors and surgeons; leaders of charitable causes, sportsmen; leading educationalists and academics. . . . Above all, in their

---


multitudes, there are distinguished musicians. . . . To send a son or daughter to a choir school today is close to a guarantee of a first-class education. 

It has long been known that many prominent church composers, conductors, and organists began their musical training as choristers (Josquin, Purcell, Haydn, Bruckner). I expect to find more evidence to illustrate these long-term advantages from my study.

Choir school education may offer benefits to the Catholic Church in the form of liturgical renewal, helping to better teach and implement musico-liturgical directives, recovering the “inestimable treasure” of the Gregorian inheritance, and enabling active participation. A number of documents have been written on Episcopal choir school programs in the United States, including Daniel McGrath’s study of Anglican after-school, day school, and boarding school choir training in which he concludes that a revival of chorister programs could lead to liturgical renewal in the Anglican Church. A similar outcome might be the case in the Catholic Church as well if more chorister programs are adopted, particularly ones that could further the liturgical goals of the Second Vatican Council. According to a study in 2008 which surveyed church musicians in Kansas Catholic Churches, Charla Lewis reports,

These numbers are troubling because the lack of familiarity with important Church documents relating to music by the respondents is disturbing: 44% are familiar with the Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy, 40% were familiar with Musicam Sacram, 49% were familiar with the General Instruction of the Roman Missal. . . .


If the three choir schools in this study successfully achieve musico-liturgical aims reflected in these Church documents, they would serve as important models for helping other institutions recognize and implement these directives. One can also make a connection between choir school education and Walter Whitehouse’s linking of Gregorian chant and the active participation of the laity in Pius X’s motu proprio. If choristers are trained to capably sing these chants in the liturgy, then chant would likely be more popular among the faithful as a result of such positive listening experiences. This in turn would motivate active participation by the laity in singing some of the common chants themselves. Given the slow progress that Whitehouse reports in this area to date, choir schools may help to preserve and promote chant and the sacred treasure while, at the same time, leading the laity to greater degrees of participation in singing the liturgy. The achievability of each of these realities to coexist will be tested in my study.

In addition to the literature cited above, the consideration of other sources was paramount in designing this study. To form my research instrument, the documents *Sacrosanctum concilium* and *Musicam sacram* were consulted. From these, the overarching musico-liturgical directives of the Second Vatican Council that pertained to chorister formation were extracted. For example, *Sacrosanctum concilium* states that the “teaching and practice of music” must take place in Catholic schools and that “choirs must be diligently promoted” in order to foster the treasure of sacred music, particularly Gregorian chant, and in the singing of newly composed works. *Musicam sacram* states that liturgical and spiritual training are necessary alongside

---


14 SC 114-116.
musical training for choristers. Because of the vague nature of many of these directives, numerous papal writings and documents by councils, committees, congresses, congregations, conferences, and symposia from the past sixty years were consulted to better interpret the meaning of each of these directives. Before these directives could be turned into standards and benchmarks used in analysis, I examined several sets of educational standards for ideas on language and formatting, namely National Standards for Arts Education, Catholic Connections to Music in the National Standards for Arts Education, and National Standards and Benchmarks for Effective Catholic Elementary and Secondary Schools. The complete list of sources used is cited in Chapter II: Methods and Procedures.

Finally, the resources used in executing the chorister training at each institution were mostly provided by the three schools themselves. The teaching methods and resources used can be divided into three categories: those stemming from organizations such as RSCM and MENC (or NAfME); philosophies and methods that evolved from leading individuals in the field (John Bertalot, Zoltán Kodály, Justine Ward); and resources used in the teaching of chant (Abbaye Saint-Pierre de Solesmes, Theodore Marier, Church Music Association of America, Corpus Christi Watershed on-line database). The complete citations of these resources are listed within Chapters III, IV, and V.

---

CHAPTER II
METHODS AND PROCEDURES

This chapter will present methodology and research procedures used in the study. While I was interested in exploring all aspects of Catholic choir schools, choices were made to focus the goal of this particular study. By reviewing related literature on the topic, it was possible to identify gaps in the research on Catholic choir schools and to narrow the scope of the present investigation. I determined that concentrating on the praxis of currently operational choir schools in relation to the Second Vatican Council musico-liturgical directives would allow me to include subject matter of interest about the schools while, at the same time, create a theoretical scaffolding upon which to make the case for Catholic choir schools. The primary purpose of the study is thus to investigate the continued relevance and benefits of choir school programs in the twenty-first-century Catholic Church. While each of the three Catholic choir school programs included in this study exists for its own goals and purposes, if it can be shown that these institutions support the goals of Vatican II at the same time in their every day practices, then one can make the argument that these institutions are of particular relevance and benefit for the post Vatican-II Church. A multi-case study research design has been chosen and implemented for this purpose. The following sections are included in this chapter: (a) selection of the sample, (b) research procedures, (c) development of the research instrument, and (d) administration of the research instrument.
Selection of the Sample

The process of selecting the sample was conducted foremost with the purpose of the study in mind: to investigate the continued relevance and benefits of choir school programs in the twenty-first-century Catholic Church vis-à-vis the Vatican II reforms. In order to gain insight into Catholic choir school practice, I needed to specifically target institutions from which the most information could be learned and described. According to Daniel J. Boudah, “Random sampling is usually not appropriate for answering qualitative research questions. Sampling for qualitative research should be purposeful and strategic. . . . In critical case sampling, the researcher chooses situations or participants because of their uniqueness or how important they are to the issue.”¹ The fact that only a handful of choir schools exist in the world makes the sample rare and unique to begin with. The decisive criterion that distinguishes these institutions as choir schools is their attachment to a church or cathedral where the raison d'être of the choir is to provide music for the daily offices and celebrations of the Mass. It is in this daily liturgical context that the choristers’ rigorous academic, musical, and spiritual formation is enriched above all else. In addition to providing music for day-to-day liturgical services, the choir often serves the community at large with high-quality concert performances, tours, recordings, and collaborations. Preserving and furthering music of the Western sacred choral tradition is essential to their mission and central to the choir school experience. These are not typical parochial school general music programs where a small contingent of the student body sing for an occasional school or parish Mass; rather, they are anomalies due to their high level of

achievement in liturgical choral music in which all students at the school actively engage. At initial glance, Catholic choir school programs also exhibit a seemingly high concordance with Vatican II goals. It is this uniqueness that creates interest and makes them fascinating to study. In addition to these criteria, I developed a list of attributes to purposefully narrow the selection of institutions for the study: the school must be of Catholic denomination, the school must be currently active, and the program must be full-time with instruction taking place during regular school hours (this would exclude parish choirs and afterschool/extracurricular choir programs). Due to geographical inaccessibility and the disparity of directives among different episcopal jurisdictions, I decided that schools outside of the United States would not be included in the study. Presently, only two Catholic institutions existing in the United States refer to themselves as “choir schools” by name – St. Paul’s Choir School (Cambridge, MA) and The Madeleine Choir School (Salt Lake City, UT). Both institutions satisfy all criteria to be included in the study. A third school, The Atonement Academy (San Antonio, TX), considered a preparatory school, has also been included since it meets the criteria of the study due to its rigorous chorister training program and daily choral services. The reason The Atonement Academy does not label itself as a choir school, even though its practices reflect those similar to one, is that the school wants to be inviting to any child regardless of their musical talent or previous background. The school’s philosophy is that it is possible to achieve high quality sacred choral programs with any group of children if they are exposed to outstanding teaching and musico-liturgical experiences. These three are the only schools in the United States of which I am aware fit all of the necessary requirements to be included in this study.
In order to achieve the purposes originally posed in this study of comparing the school praxis to the Vatican II goals, further purposeful sampling within each school, or case, occurred as the research design developed. Each program was vastly different in size and composition, with one school having four choirs and another having as many as ten school choirs plus additional afterschool parish choirs. I had to take into account the variables as well as the commonalities among each of the schools in order to create a study that would be comparable, yet relevant, in each instance. Even though each school had a different number of choirs, making for a seemingly unbalanced study, each school did have at least two treble choirs, one changed voice choir, and one mixed choir. This was an important factor in helping me decide to focus on just these four choirs for continuity among schools as well as manageability regarding the amount of data collected. Among the sample of these choirs, students ranged from grades four to twelve. Two of the mixed choirs included adult men singing the tenor, bass, and sometimes alto parts. When there was a choice among multiple choirs at the larger institutions, I selected the ensembles that performed most frequently in the liturgy. Each choir in the sample was observed singing for at least one liturgy and one choral rehearsal. Likewise, observations were made of as many related classes as possible, selected from the following: music history, music theory, vocal music classes, group instrumental classes, theology, religion, church history, sacred scriptures, and art history. As many liturgies as possible from among the following were observed: weekday Mass, sung celebrations of Lauds or Vespers (Evensong), and Sunday High Mass. While each of the schools employed numerous part-time and full-time music staff, I decided that only two participants from each school would be asked questions and interviewed formally: the director of music and either the pastoral administrator or pastor. In addition to
being full-time staff members, these interviewees reflected the individuals most acquainted with
the musical and liturgical practices of each institution. Additionally, documents pertaining to
mission statements, histories, admission procedures, student handbooks, curricula, class
schedules, repertoire lists, concert programs, choir tours, pilgrimages, recordings, artist in
residence programs, special projects, summer programs, alumni news, articles, and
documentaries would be reviewed from each school as available. Repertoire lists, concert
programs, and academic calendars would be collected from the 2013 calendar year (January
through December). Student handbooks, class schedules, staff, and curricula would reflect the
2013-2014 academic year (August through June). All other information collected would
encompass data from several school years.

Research Procedures

Based on the objectives of this inquiry, the general lack of understanding about choir
schools by most Americans, and the rarity of samples available, I determined that a case study
design was the best research method by which to conduct this analysis. Martyn Shuttleworth
defines a case study as “... an in depth study of a particular situation rather than a sweeping
statistical survey. ... you are deliberately trying to isolate a small study group, one individual
case or one particular population.” Since I considered each school a “case,” the study at hand is
technically a “multiple case study.” First and foremost, this design facilitated the purpose of the
study – to measure the three choir school programs against the goals of Vatican II. Second, this

---

2 Martyn Shuttleworth, “Case Study Research Design,” Explorable Psychology Experiments Website, 1
type of design was advantageous for its ability to generate interest and make better known the success and uniqueness of these specific programs. Third, a case study enabled a great depth and breadth of knowledge to be gleaned on an unknown topic by focusing on a small number of samples in great detail. Finally, the limitations of case study approaches were identified as they related to my study. Three techniques common in case-study research were employed to collect and analyze the data in this study: interview, observation, and document review.

Only by studying these schools in their natural environment would I be able to give a firsthand account of the actual, unique praxis and be able to make an assessment of whether these practices achieved the Second Vatican Council’s goals. According to Shuttleworth, “The case study research design is also useful for testing whether . . . theories . . . actually work in real world.” The Vatican II goals are theoretical principles. In order to fulfill the desired liturgical renewal of Vatican II, these principles must be interpreted into some kind of meaningful set of standards or benchmarks that can be practically implemented, observed, and measured. Practices or methods are adopted in accordance with these benchmarks and applied to dynamic, constantly changing, real-life situations. Because of the qualitative nature of case studies, the data reflecting these choir school practices produces richly descriptive reports which are crucial for more meaningful analysis. In order to do this, I collected not only objective types of data, but, even more so, sought qualitative elements that lay behind the objective evidence. For example, by observing liturgies, I was able to objectively state which musical portions and to what degree the presider, the choir, and the congregation sang. However, this information alone was insufficient for indicating how each perceived their role and participation in the liturgy. Only by

---

3 Ibid.
probing the rationale for these musical divisions and what had been done to develop the congregation and choristers in both internal and external participation could it be understood how each benefited spiritually from their role. In order to make sense of what had been discovered and to classify the school’s practice according to the interpretations of conciliar doctrine, I had to fill in the blanks with information from my own experiences and interpretations of the situation. Since prior research was incompatible with the current study, I drew new connections and meanings to test whether these theoretical church directives work in choir school programs.

Case studies are advantageous for their ability to generate interest while revealing the successes and distinctions of a particular case. Merriam states, “A case study might also be selected because it is intrinsically interesting; a researcher could study it to achieve as full an understanding of the phenomenon as possible.” Ex4actly fifty years after the Second Vatican Council, a case study of Catholic choir school programs is particularly relevant due to the current disparity in musical quality and effectiveness within the Church, the necessity to assess the implementation of musico-liturgical directives of the council, and the overall deficiency of research on this topic. Because of the practical nature of this subject matter and its potential implications on future musico-liturgical practice in the church, it was important to present this study in a manner that would generate interest in choir school programs and increased exposure of this relatively unknown, yet notable entity within the Church. Likewise, the success and uniqueness of these specific programs made them worthy of increased attention and

---

investigation. A case study approach allowed the flexibility necessary to investigate variables as well as commonalities found among these schools.

Case studies are also advantageous when the large number of samples needed for more quantitative, statistical type studies are not available. In this instance, I was aware of only three Catholic choir school programs in the entire United States that met the criteria of this study. By sampling only three cases, the depth and breadth of the data collected allowed a greatly increased understanding of these directives in relation to the actual practice within one entity of the Catholic Church, the choir school. As a result, using this design allowed me to make never-before-made comparisons that explore not only if these theoretical church directives could be implemented but how institutions, such as a choir school, actually implemented them.

In addition to its benefits, the limitations of a case study were considered to understand what such a study would and would not be able to show. Because these boundaries were acknowledged, the research was still capable of being a valuable instrument. Because the sample size is small in case study research, the groups represented may be atypical. As a result, broad generalizations to fit an entire group or population are not possible. For example, if these three choir school programs do in fact achieve the eight musico-liturgical directives of the Council, I will not be able to declare that therefore all choir schools must by their nature fulfill these conciliar goals. Likewise, I am not able to make the claim that only choir school programs are capable of meeting these goals, because the study was not broad enough to include a more quantitative comparison with other types of institutions such as parochial schools, university programs, seminaries, etc. Furthermore, concrete predictions about what would happen if this type of praxis were adopted by other types of institutions are not possible.
Illustrating another potential disadvantage, Shuttleworth states, “Analyzing results for a case study tends to be more opinion based than statistical methods.” In general, the results of case studies provide highly vivid descriptions of a situation, reference a specific population, are rooted in context, and are developed by the researcher and reader who bring their own experiences and understanding to the situation. In a case study, the researcher presents his/her interpretation based on the firsthand experience s/he had during the study. Because the study is dependent on the researcher’s interpretation to turn the raw data into meaningful findings, it is possible for other or even contradictory conclusions to be drawn from the same data. Nonetheless, both the researcher’s and the reader’s interpretations provide a potential springboard for future practice, policy, and research that might not have otherwise existed had this study not taken place. According to Merriam, “. . . case study plays an important role in advancing a field’s knowledge base. . . . [They have] proven particularly useful for studying educational innovations, for evaluating programs, and for informing policy.” In the end, a case study’s strengths outweigh its limitations.

Within the case study design, three specific techniques were utilized during the data collection process of this investigation: interview, observation, and document review. By triangulating, or using all three practices in conjunction with one another, it could be verified that each produced the same results. Triangulating the findings in this way gave authenticity and credibility to the research. From each of these techniques, I collected data based upon informal

---

5 Shuttleworth, “Case Study Research Design.”

6 Merriam, *Qualitative Research and Case Study Applications in Education*, 31-32.

7 Ibid, 41.
and formal discussion with school staff and clergy, observations of classes and liturgies, and records and documents, all of which I used to answer the research questions of my study (see list of questions in Appendices C and D). Throughout the various stages of my investigation, data was filed according to each school into one of the following locations: 1) electronic documents and sound files were placed in one of the three folders on my computer desktop, 2) completed observation forms, textbooks, worship leaflets, student handbooks, concert brochures, and all hard copies of documents were placed in one of three file crates, and 3) handwritten notes were compiled in a three-subject notebook (one section for each school).

**Interview**

The first technique used to collect data in this study was interview. This technique is used to gain data when small numbers of people are involved, the individuals are accessible and significant because of the information they can provide, and the questions of the study lend themselves to extended responses which these individuals provide. Interview techniques encompass a wide assortment of informal and formal methods by which to acquire information from individuals. Simply listening to other people speak, spontaneously asking them questions in a natural conversation, asking them a predetermined set of questions that facilitate open-ended responses, and giving them structured questionnaires with only closed multiple choice or even ‘yes/no’ answer possibilities are among the techniques that can be utilized. The method(s) used depend on the types and depth of information needed. Because of the descriptive and detail-
oriented nature required to adequately illustrate the praxis of each school, gathering open-ended responses from the participants was important to supplement and verify the data collected from the other techniques used in this study. My ability to formulate and time the progression of questions in a manner that facilitated these types of open-ended responses from the participants was essential.

A progressive approach took place during this study. During the entry phase of the data collection, I asked introductory questions of each director of music via email to gather general background and demographic type information about the programs at each school without the need for a formal interview. During the on-site visits, I conducted formal interviews with the music director and pastor/pastoral administrator in order to ask more in-depth questions. These formal questions were planned carefully to gather data on the theoretical and theological aspects of each school and to enhance the more objective information I was collecting from the other two techniques. In addition to answering questions about the schools’ praxis toward the musico-liturgical standards (see Appendix C), the interviews also afforded an opportunity to address general questions and variables, such as boys-only schools, non-auditioned programs, Anglican Use liturgical-musical aspects, and future strategic plans (see Appendix D). I recorded each of the formal interviews so I could play back and transcribe the conversations at a later time.

Finally, upon completing each of the school chapters, the exit phase was conducted. This phase consisted of concluding email and phone conversations with the music director at each school to fill in any remaining unanswered questions or deficiencies in the data.
Observation

The second technique used to collect data in this study was observation. This technique has the advantage of allowing one to witness everyday normal life activities of people, groups, and phenomena in their natural setting. While interviews rely on what people *say* they do, observations focus on what people *actually* do. Rehearsals, classes, and liturgies were observed at each of the schools in the natural field setting of the institution’s choir room, classroom, chapel, adjoining church, or cathedral. My ability to select and convert the raw data into meaningful field notes on the observation forms during these observations was essential.

Pre-determined forms were developed in advance so that emphasis could be placed on extracting the salient points during each observation as well as provide consistency among the data collected in each case (see forms in Appendices A and B). By conducting all the observations as a non-participant, I was able to witness the everyday occurrences of the schools without impacting the activities studied. During the rehearsal/classroom observations, I filled in the form unobtrusively from the back of the room. Information on the Rehearsal/Classroom Observation Form (see Appendix A) included materials used during the instruction, the amount of time and emphasis given to particular aspects, instructional objectives, methods, philosophies, assessment, and additional comments on vocal attributes observed. This data was collected to gain a better understanding of the instructional content and procedures utilized to teach students at each school. While I partook of the liturgical celebrations as a normal congregant during the liturgical observations, the activities of the liturgy were not impacted by my participation. In

---

9 Ibid, 46.
light of this, I was considered a non-participant during the liturgical observations. I used a
digital recording device to tape each of the liturgies. While playing back the recording at a later
time I logged notes on the Liturgical Observation Form (see Appendix B) pertaining to the type
and focus of the liturgy, the participants and their ministerial duties, the repertoire used, the
timing and attributes of each sung portion, the types of worship aids, the degree of solemnity,
and aspects pertaining to spirituality. This data was collected to identify the musical elements
found in these liturgies, so their subsequent impact on the liturgy and its participants could be
further examined. The data collected on the forms was then used to provide answers to some of
the research questions.

**Document review**

The third technique used to collect data about the praxis of each school was document
review. This technique provides data that, unlike observations and interviews, is completely
developed for purposes other than the research study at hand. The advantage of these documents
is that the researcher’s presence has no impact on them, since the materials have been in
existence prior to the undertaking of the study. In this situation, many documents were
accessible online at each of the school’s websites. My ability to wade through and select only
pertinent information that had bearing on the research questions was paramount.

I examined documents produced within the group, or in this instance by the school, on-
and offline. I could be sure of the authenticity of these documents since I received them directly
from the author, or the school itself. While the content on the school websites was typically
current due to frequent updating and site maintenance, the downside was the irretrievability of formerly accessed documents. When relying substantially on these types of sources for data, it is important to not only visit the websites often to look for new and additional information, but also to save any information found in electronic files, in case the particular document is unavailable at a later date. For the most part, and due to the fact that these documents were generated by the school about itself, they were intended to portray the ideal of all that the school hoped and strived to be. In this way, the case could be made that these documents might be biased in an effort of self-promotion. Once again triangulation was helpful, to the extent possible in this study, in confirming that the schools did in actual practice what they said they were striving to do. In circumstances where the above documents were not available online, I emailed the director of music at each school to obtain these materials. Any remaining documents unaccounted for were requested in hard copy during the on-site visit. These documents were used to gain insight into the history, focus, mission, schedule, curriculum, related formation, and repertoire associated with each of the various schools. Secondary sources, such as published articles on these three schools, were collected throughout the study and analyzed. These resources, produced by outside individuals, rely on a third-party depiction and interpretation of data. Since these materials may have been intended to encourage a particular viewpoint, data from these types of sources was confirmed or triangulated against other data before being incorporated into the findings.
Development of the Research Instrument

Based on careful examination of the Vatican II documents, I extracted eight overarching directives that were relevant to chorister formation and practice as the framework for this study. I then used additional church documents and scholarly sources to help interpret each of these directives more fully. I consulted the National Standards for Arts Education,\textsuperscript{10} Catholic Connections to Music in the National Standards for Arts Education,\textsuperscript{11} and National Standards and Benchmarks for Effective Catholic Elementary and Secondary Schools,\textsuperscript{12} to determine the format and types of language to use in turning these directives and interpretations into standards and measurable benchmarks through which I would assess the schools of this study. The research instrument is outlined below in Fig. 2.1. Taking related literature on choir schools and chorister training into consideration, I developed a list of questions and areas to be explored in addressing each benchmark as well as gain other pertinent information on each school. Specific research questions I used during the collection of data from documents, observations, and interviews are listed in Appendices C and D.

\textsuperscript{10} Consortium of National Arts Education Association, National Standards for Arts Education.

\textsuperscript{11} Barbara Varian Barrett, et al., Catholic Connections to Music in the National Standards for Arts Education (Silver Spring, MD: NPM Publications, 2006).

Fig. 2.1 Standards and benchmarks derived from the eight musico-liturgical directives

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHURCH DIRECTIVE #1</th>
<th>“Great importance is to be attached to the teaching . . . of music in . . . Catholic institutions and schools.”¹³</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

INTERPRETATION OF CHURCH DIRECTIVE

- “Sound music education includes instruction in good vocal production and music reading skills, as well as exposure to a wide spectrum of musical literature. We advocate strong choral and other musical programs for young musicians, graded for various levels of ability, in Catholic schools and parish religious education programs.”¹⁴
- The ethos of Catholic institutions is realized when the faith is “. . . tangible in our universities and schools . . . [and] given fervent expression liturgically . . . Only in this way do we really bear witness to the meaning of who we are and what we uphold.”¹⁵
- “. . . we do children a disservice when we limit them to a repertoire that is seldom if ever heard outside of ‘children’s liturgies’ or events such as first communion. The songs of the Sunday assembly are primary. . . . Children’s choirs are one valuable way to incorporate them as singing members of the assembly and to help them accept ministerial roles within the community.”¹⁶

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STANDARD #1</th>
<th>BENCHMARK(S)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Catholic institutions and schools attach great importance to the teaching of music.** | 1.1 Musical training advocates strong choral music experiences, particularly when they give fervent expression to the Catholic ethos within the context of liturgy.  
1.2 A rigorous curriculum serves as the framework in which the sequential acquisition of skill and learning takes place, through use of a graded choir system or similar, appropriate to the varying ability levels of individuals.  
1.3 Aspects of good, healthy vocal production are promoted during singing.  
1.4 Music reading skills are developed.  
1.5 A wide spectrum of musical literature, particularly those songs of the Sunday liturgy, is employed during musical training. |

¹³ SC 115.


### CHURCH DIRECTIVE #2

“Gregorian chant . . . should be given pride of place in liturgical services.”

### INTERPRETATION OF CHURCH DIRECTIVE

- Pope Paul VI has often expressed his desire “. . . that the faithful of all countries be able to sing at least a few Gregorian chants in Latin. In compliance, this Congregation has prepared the enclosed booklet *Jubilate Deo*, which provides a short collection of such Gregorian chants.” The best ways “. . . for the faithful to learn and to sing the Latin chants in the booklet . . . [as well as] to promote the preservation and use of the Gregorian chant” should be decided upon and employed.\(^\text{17}\)
- “Each worshipping community in the United States, including all age groups and all ethnic groups, should, at a minimum, learn *Kyrie XVI, Sanctus XVIII, and Agnus Dei XVIII*, all of which are typically included in congregational worship aids. More difficult chants, such as *Gloria VIII* and settings of the *Credo* and *Pater Noster*, might be learned after the easier chants have been mastered.”\(^\text{18}\)
- “When the congregation does not sing an antiphon or hymn, proper chants from the *Graduale Romanum* might be sung by a choir that is able to render these challenging pieces well.”\(^\text{19}\)

### STANDARD #2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Gregorian chant is given pride of place in liturgical services.</strong></th>
<th><strong>BENCHMARK(S)</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.1 Choirs and congregations are exposed to hearing live chant in the liturgy and singing a minimum repertory of this chant.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.2 Teachers possess effective methods of teaching and promoting chant.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

\(^\text{17}\) SC 116. The complete Latin phrase found in *Sacrosanctum concilium* “. . . ceteris paribus, principem locum obtineat” is translated “. . . other things being equal, it [chant] should be given pride of place in liturgical services.” This phrase has been extrapolated in various ways in succeeding Church documents. *Musicam sacram* (50) implies this condition of chant applies to liturgical services in Latin: “In sung liturgical services celebrated in Latin, Gregorian chant . . . should be given pride of place, other things being equal.” *Sing to the Lord* (73) insists that, “The ‘pride of place’ given to Gregorian chant by the Second Vatican Council is modified by the important phrase ‘other things being equal.’” The issue at stake is the interpretation of *ceteris paribus* and whether it allows chant’s primacy or principle place in the liturgy to be negotiable based on outside variables. As a result the term *ceteris paribus* has been the cause of much debate by those in the sacred music and liturgical field in the past decade. The following interpretations are from a series of on-line postings in 2010 which may be found at: http://www.praytellblog.com/index.php/2010/07/15/npm-in-detroit-thursday/. Anthony Ruff, OSB justifies not giving chant “pride of place” in the liturgy due to the loophole in *Sing to the Lord* citing that *ceteris paribus* implies that “pastoral concerns” are of equal [or even trumping] value. On the other hand, Jeffrey Tucker argues in comment #7 that, “Chant has pride of place even if the conditions of time and place provide little or no opportunity to sing it (no schola, no understanding, no talent, there’s no time, etc.). In other words, using the traditional implications of that formulation, we would say that ceteris paribus constitutes a strengthening of the chant mandate, not an opportunity to list a series of excuses not to sing it.”


\(^\text{20}\) Ibid., 76.
“But other kinds of sacred music, especially polyphony, are by no means excluded from liturgical celebrations . . . .”

INTERPRETATION OF CHURCH DIRECTIVE

- “All the passages we have heard - and especially the performance as a whole in which the 16th and 20th centuries run parallel - together confirm the conviction that sacred polyphony, particularly that of the so-called ‘Roman School,’ is a legacy to preserve with care, to keep alive and to make known, not only for the benefit of experts and lovers of it but also for the entire Ecclesial Community, for which it constitutes a priceless spiritual, musical and cultural heritage. . . . An authentic renewal of sacred music can only happen in the wake of the great tradition of the past, of Gregorian chant and sacred polyphony.”

STANDARD #3 | BENCHMARK(S)
--- | ---
Sacred polyphony is included in liturgical celebrations. | 3.1 The singing of polyphony is employed by the choir, or other capable individuals, in liturgical and non-liturgical celebrations at times for the benefit of the ecclesial community.

---

21 SC 116.

22 Benedict XVI, “Address Following a Concert Sponsored by the Domenico Bartolucci Foundation,” The Sistine Chapel, 24 June 2006, nn. 7-8; http://www.vatican.va/holy_father/benedict_xvi/speeches/2006/june/documents/hf_ben-xvi_spe_20060624_fondazione-bartolucci_en.html (accessed 7 May 2013). Benedict has repeatedly advocated applying the “hermeneutic of continuity” when interpreting and implementing the reforms of the Second Vatican Council. While the spirit of the Second Vatican Council is in continuity with tradition, meaning it is a continuation of the pre-Vatican II Church and its doctrine, the interpretation and implementation of this reform has at times presented a break or rupture that has severed itself from the Council and this tradition in favor of Modernism. To expel chant, polyphony, and the sacred treasure from the liturgy is to say that the way the Church has been praying for centuries is suddenly false, bad, and invalid. True and legitimate renewal can only develop out of that which came before it. Benedict speaks more at length on this subject in an historic address to the Roman Curia on 22 December 2005 (http://w2.vatican.va/content/benedictxvi/en/speeches/2005/december/documents/hf_ben_xvi_spe_20051222_roman-curia.html).
**Church Directive #4**

“The treasure of sacred music is to be preserved and fostered with great care.”

**Interpretation of Church Directive**

- In his letter to the Fifth International Church Music Congress in Chicago-Milwaukee, Pope Paul VI expressed his wishes that the treasury of sacred music be conserved and promoted with great care within the liturgy for which it was born for “... the glory of God and the sanctification of the faithful ...”
- *Liturgical Music Today,* sheds light on the tension that exists between preserving this rich treasure of sacred music and the more recent “... restoration of active participation in the liturgy, the simplification of the rites, and the use of the vernacular [which] have meant a massive change in the theory and practice of church music ...” Of this treasure it states that, “A place can be found for this music, a place which does not conflict with the assembly’s role and the other demands of the rite. Such a practice no longer envisions the performance of ‘Masses’ as set pieces, but looks more to the repertoire of motets, antiphons, and anthems which can be harmonized more easily with the nature of the renewed liturgy and with its pastoral celebration.”

---

23 SC 114. A note must be made here that among the different periods of history, sacred music compositions reflect varying degrees of suitability for the liturgy and places of prominence within the sacred treasure. Sacred music not included in the liturgy may find a more appropriate place in concert and non-liturgical settings whereby the faithful can be spiritually enriched. For example, much of the choral music written during the Classical period (c. 1750-1820) relies on symphonic and operatic techniques and forms. As a result, Masses became longer, with multi-movement settings of each part, alternating solo and choral textures. The duration of these works and the demand for orchestral instruments as accompaniment made this body of repertoire less practical to use in the liturgy on a frequent basis. In the nineteenth century, a movement to reform music in the Catholic Church known as the Cäcilienverein, took place in Germany, France, and Italy as a reaction against the affections of the Baroque era, the rationalism of the Classical period, and the contemporaneous Romantic aesthetic which were thought to move listeners to unduly profane seductiveness rather than religious piety. This movement sought to purge the liturgy of operatic novelties by returning to an *a cappella* style that closely embodied the seemingly “conservative” approach of Palestrina and the Council of Trent. The Cecilianist composers who vigilantly followed these guidelines produced music of rather uninspiring artistic merit that has been of minimal lasting legacy among the sacred treasure. Other composers who based their compositions more loosely on these Cecilian ideas have more successfully contributed to this treasury such as Anton Bruckner, Michael Haller, César Franck, Gabriel Fauré, Camille Saint-Saëns, and Lorenzo Perosi. Concurrently in the nineteenth century, a reform centered in the Church of England known as the Oxford Movement, or Tractarianism, advocated a return to many pre-Reformation ideals. Consequences of this movement include the revival of chant and Renaissance polyphony as well as significantly higher standards in church music. Sung choral services with formal, elaborate liturgical rituals became common in parishes, with cathedrals providing these types of liturgies daily. The need for such large amounts of music not only necessitated properly training choristers but created a demand for many new anthems and services to be composed. Ralph Vaughan Williams, Charles Stanford, Charles Wood, Herbert Howells, Edward Elgar, Charles Parry, John Stainer, and Richard Terry are among the composers that contributed music to this movement.


INTERPRETATION OF CHURCH DIRECTIVE #4 (con’t)

- Likewise, other musical performances outside of the liturgy may “. . . serve to promote piety or religion . . . [by] keep[ing] alive the treasures of Church music which must not be lost; musical pieces and songs composed for the liturgy but which cannot in any way be conveniently incorporated into liturgical celebrations in modern times; spiritual music, such as Oratorios and religious Cantatas which can still serve as vehicles for spiritual communication.”
- “Hence even boys and girls, learning these sacred hymns at a tender age, are greatly helped by them to know, appreciate and memorize the truths of the faith. Therefore they also serve as a sort of catechism.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STANDARD #4</th>
<th>BENCHMARK(S)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The treasure of sacred music is preserved and fostered with great care.</td>
<td>4.1 The singing of all the different types of sacred music that exist within the church treasury (e.g., Masses, antiphons, motets, anthems, hymns, cantatas, oratorios) is employed by the choir, or other individuals, in liturgical and non-liturgical celebrations for the glory of God and sanctification of the faithful.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---


CHURCH DIRECTIVE #5: “Composers . . . should . . . cultivate sacred music and increase its store of treasures.”

INTERPRETATION OF CHURCH DIRECTIVE

- “The Church also needs musicians. How many sacred works have been composed through the centuries by people deeply imbued with the sense of the mystery! The faith of countless believers has been nourished by melodies flowing from the hearts of other believers, either introduced into the liturgy or used as an aid to dignified worship. In song, faith is experienced as vibrant joy, love, and confident expectation of the saving intervention of God.”

- “Anyone who looks carefully will see that, even in our own time, important works of art, inspired by faith, have been produced and are being produced—in visual art as well as in music (and indeed literature). Today, too, joy in the Lord and contact with his presence in the liturgy has an inexhaustible power of inspiration.”

- “The Liturgy [and consequently sacred music] . . . lives on a correct and constant relationship between healthy traditio and legitima progressio . . . . tradition is a living reality, which therefore includes in itself the principle of development, of progress.”

- A threefold musical, liturgical, pastoral judgment is proposed by Music in Catholic Worship to determine the value of a given composition in a liturgical celebration. “To admit the cheap, the trite, the musical cliché often found in popular songs for the purpose of ‘instant liturgy’ is to cheapen the liturgy, to expose it to ridicule, and to invite failure.” Furthermore the nature of the liturgy determines the type of music called for: “. . . [texts] should be drawn chiefly from holy scripture and from liturgical sources. The signs of the celebration must be accepted and received as meaningful for a genuinely human faith experience for these specific worshipers.”

---

28 SC 121.


31 Benedict XVI, “Address to Participants in the Congress Promoted by the Pontifical Athenaeum of Saint Anselm on the 50th Anniversary of Foundation,” (The Pontifical Liturgical Institute, Rome, 6 May 2011), n. 11-12, Vatican Website, accessed 7 May 2013, http://www.vatican.va/holy_father/benedict_xvi/ speeches/ 2011/may/ documents/hf ben-xvi_spe_20110506_sant-anselmo_en.html. Here Benedict validates the need for a co-existence between tradition and progress in sacred music. Both work in tandem for the benefit of each, rather than serving mutually exclusive purposes or one replacing the other.

INTERPRETATION OF CHURCH DIRECTIVE #5 (con’t)

- “Because repetition is at the basis of all . . . ritual music, we need music whose quality can bear the repetitive demands made by the liturgy. Music that is too simplistic will inadequately engage the assembly after the first hearing. At the same time, the repertoire cannot be so challenging that it frustrates the community's song.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STANDARD #5</th>
<th>BENCHMARK(S)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Composers cultivate new works of sacred music to increase the church’s store of treasures.</td>
<td>5.1 Sacred works by recent and living composers are among those taught and employed by Catholic institutions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5.2 Reasons for adding new works to the treasure of sacred music are identified.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5.3 Sources that serve as inspiration for composers to create new music for the church are identified.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5.4 Criteria which makes some pieces of sacred music more appropriate than others for the liturgy is acknowledged.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

### CHURCH DIRECTIVE #6

“... all the faithful should be led to that full, conscious, and active participation in liturgical celebrations which is demanded by the very nature of the liturgy.”

### INTERPRETATION OF CHURCH DIRECTIVE

- “At times the choir, within the congregation of the faithful and as part of it, will assume the role of leadership, while at other times it will retain its own distinctive ministry.”
- “The faithful fulfill their liturgical role by making that full, conscious and active participation . . . . This participation should be above all internal, in the sense that by it the faithful join their mind to what they pronounce or hear, and cooperate with heavenly grace, [this participation] must be, on the other hand, external also, that is, such as to show the internal participation by gestures and bodily attitudes, by the acclamations, responses and singing.”
- Cardinal Ratzinger describes how this goal has not been fully realized because of “the primitive actionism and the prosaic pedagogical rationalism [known as utilitarianism] . . . where one falsely interprets the conciliar phrase ‘active participation’ in the sense of external actionism.” Ratzinger goes on to quote Harnoncourt in regards to inner participation where “the choir, therefore, is not standing before a community which is listening like an audience that lets itself be sung to, but is itself part of the community and sings for it in the sense of legitimately representing it or standing in for it.”

### STANDARD #6 | BENCHMARK(S)

| The faithful are led to full, conscious, and active participation in liturgical celebrations. | 6.1 Sung parts of the liturgy foster both the internal and external participation of the congregation in liturgical celebrations. |

---

34 SC 14. The term *participatio actuosa* or “active participation” must be carefully considered lest contemporary practices construe its intended meaning. In *A New Song for the Lord* (177), Cardinal Ratzinger explains how it is fairly common today to, “falsely interpret the conciliar phrase ‘active participation’ in the sense of external actionism.” A tendency exists to imply that “active participation” may be accomplished through physical or “external” action alone, when this simply is not the case. When our primary purpose is no longer singing the liturgy but rather inserting musical components to keep the congregation externally active, we risk succumbing to practices of utilitarianism. Such a practice mistakenly implies that music that is not “useful” for congregational purposes is of less value and relevance to the liturgy, even if the music is the actual liturgical text itself (e.g., the proper chants). *Musicam sacram* (15) expounds on the distinction between internal and external participation, both of which are necessary constituents of “active participation.”

35 MCW 36.

36 MS 15.

### CHURCH DIRECTIVE #7

“... singers, especially boys, must also be given a genuine liturgical training.”

### INTERPRETATION OF CHURCH DIRECTIVE

- Pope Benedict says that “... Christian liturgy is always a cosmic liturgy. ... The more that human music adapts itself to the musical laws of the universe, the more beautiful it will be. ... The Logos himself is the great artist, in whom all works of art – the beauty of the universe – have their origin.”
- “Singers, both boys and adults, should be taught the meaning of the liturgical functions, and of the texts they sing . . . .”
- “However, in selecting the parts which are to be sung, one should start with those that are by their nature of greater importance, and especially those which are to be sung by the priest or by the ministers, with the people replying, or those which are to be sung by the priest and people together.”
- The idea of progressive solemnity is promoted where “what is of lesser importance should appear so; what is of greater importance should clearly emerge as such. ... The celebration of any liturgical action, then, is to be governed by ... the degree of solemnity suitable for the occasion . . . .”

### STANDARD #7

**Singers receive a genuine training in liturgy.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BENCHMARK(S)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.1 A basic understanding of liturgy and liturgical functions is integrated with the training of singers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2 Teachers develop linguistic, scriptural, and theological understandings of sung musical texts with singers so that they may incorporate them more meaningfully into the liturgy.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3 From the manner and length of the liturgy celebrated, those liturgies and elements which are of highest importance receive due emphasis.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

38 SC 115.


40 Sacred Congregation of Rites, *De musica sacra et sacra liturgia*, n. 98.

41 MS 6.

42 United States Conference of Catholic Bishops, Bishops’ Committee on the Liturgy, “The Place of Music in Eucharistic Celebrations,” 12 November 1967, in *Thirty-Five Years of the BCL Newsletter 1965-2000* (Washington, D.C.: United States Conference of Catholic Bishops, 2004), 116. So that the appropriate degree of solemnity is conveyed through music, those parts of the rite which are sung and the musical styles used should always correspond to the type of liturgy being celebrated. According to *Sing to the Lord* (113), “Solemnities and feasts invite more solemnity.” Examples of incorporating the principle of progressive solemnity are explained further in *Sing to the Lord* (110-114).
“Besides musical formation, suitable . . . spiritual formation must also be given to the members of the choir . . . .”

**INTERPRETATION OF CHURCH DIRECTIVE**

- “. . . spiritual formation must also be given to the members of the choir, in such a way that the proper performance of their liturgical role will not only enhance the beauty of the celebration and be an excellent example for the faithful, but will bring spiritual benefit to the choir members themselves.”
- “Lay ecclesial ministers, just like the ordained, need and deserve [spiritual] formation of high standards . . . .”
- The USCCB cites spiritual formation as one of the core elements for ministry formation because it provides “. . . a personal encounter and ongoing relationship with the Lord . . . the vital soul and source needed to bear lasting fruit.” Spiritual practices built of the Word of God, grounded in the sacraments, and devoted to the Eucharist, as well as studying the lives of the saints and the Blessed Virgin Mary, particularly through partaking in celebrations throughout the liturgical year and through daily Mass, are a primary means of forming individuals spiritually.
- “For it is desirable that . . . the Divine Office, especially the principle Hours, namely Lauds and Vespers, should be performed in sung form . . . at least on Sundays and feast days. . . . Sacred music is also very effective in fostering the devotion of the faithful in celebrations of the word of God, and in popular devotions.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STANDARD #8</th>
<th>BENCHMARK(S)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Singers receive spiritual formation of the highest standards. | 8.1 Spiritual formation helps singers cultivate a personal ongoing relationship with the Lord while, at the same time, develop in their liturgical ministry to help form the faith of others.  
8.2 Daily Mass, celebrations throughout the liturgical year, and a variety of spiritual practices built of the Word of God, grounded in the sacraments, and devoted to the Eucharist, as well as studying the lives of the saints and the Blessed Virgin Mary are a primary means of forming individuals spiritually. |

---

43 MS 24.

44 Ibid.


46 Ibid., 38-42.

47 MS 37, 46.
Administration of the Research Instrument

Qualitative studies place great emphasis on the researcher’s abilities during the collection, analysis, and conclusion phases of the research process. According to Boudah, “... the researcher processes the data in a unique way, based upon training, experience, bias, and other factors.”48 To establish credibility, I provide the following information on my background and potential biases. My professional training includes formal degrees in music education, choral conducting, and sacred music. Likewise my professional experiences have including over twenty years as a church musician in various singing, conducting, and organist capacities as well as seven years of teaching choral music in public and private schools. From August 2010 to June 2012, I served as a part-time organist and choral instructor for four choirs at The Atonement Academy (San Antonio, TX): Grade 4/5 Girls, Middle School Girls, Middle School Treble Boys, and Upper School Women. However, I have not had any involvement with the school or church since that time. Due to this factor as well as recent expansions and restructurings of the program, I needed to collect fresh data from this institution in the same manner as the other two schools for this study. Since I have never been a student of a choir school or similar chorister training program, this brief teaching experience at The Atonement Academy inspired my enthusiasm for undertaking the current study at hand. My background in liturgical studies and interest in choir pedagogy have largely affected the design decisions of the current study and no doubt influence the analysis and types of conclusions drawn.

48 Boudah, Conducting Educational Research, 76.
The successive phases of inquiry used in this study were entry, collection of data, exit, and analysis. The entry phase, gaining access to the cases to be studied, began in April 2013 when I contacted directors of music and pastors or pastoral administrators from each school and recruited them to be part of the study. Immediately following this, I began gathering preliminary background information on each school from the internet, particularly documents from the three school websites, and informal email conversations with music directors. This information was useful and vital in making decisions about the selection of the sample and research design discussed above. For example, since two of the schools did not extend past the eighth grade it was uncertain at first whether questions regarding training the boys’ changing voices should be included. But it was soon determined that, despite this, all three schools did have accommodations and training for boys with changing voices. Likewise, one school used high school students for their mixed choir rather than trebles with adult men singing the alto, tenor, and bass choir parts, so I needed to establish the comparability between these two different types of choirs. As the investigation progressed, the evidence became increasingly detailed and specific. The collection of data from the three schools intensified in June to September 2013 when I electronically requested relevant documents from the participants (e.g., curricula, student handbooks, schedules, and academic calendars).

The most exhaustive collection of data occurred on-site from November 2013 to April 2014, when I visited each of the schools for a period of one week. During this time, I requested remaining documents to review and continued informal conversations with the music and pastoral staff, targeting and probing aspects of the predetermined musico-liturgical questions in more depth. Observations of rehearsals, classes, and liturgies were conducted. Toward the end
of the visit, formal interviews took place. From June 2014 to January 2015, while compiling data and writing the school chapters, exit email and phone conversations were conducted to collect any remaining data that was missing.

The main consideration for terminating the collection of data was assessing that adequate data had been collected to answer the research questions and that no further information was needed. Following the data collection and compilation period, I used member checking to ensure further credibility and reliability in the findings. My ensuing presentation of data (Chapters III, IV, and V of the study) was sent to participants at each respective school. Participants were given a one month period in which to confirm or deny whether these descriptions accurately represented the chorister programs at their institutions and to offer suggestions or clarifications as needed. The chapters presenting the data were then adjusted where needed to reflect the best overall description of each school. The only changes the participants requested was the rewording of a few quotes they gave during the interview process; these changes were extremely minor and did not contradict any of the data I had collected previously.

Chapter VI: Analysis and Conclusion makes comparisons between all three schools for the purpose of answering the research questions of the study. Because continuous evaluation occurred throughout to determine the data needed to answer each research question, the analysis of each individual school already took place during the actual collection process. Chapter VI relays much of what had already been discovered during this process. Merriam states that “data analysis is the process of making sense out of the data . . . [which] involves consolidating, reducing, and interpreting what people have said and what the researcher has seen and read – it is the process of making meaning. . . . These meanings or understandings or insights constitute the
findings of a study.

I considered each of the eight directives representing the goals of Vatican II individually and used a cross-case analysis to determine the degree to which and in what ways these schools met the particular standard. From this, I could analyze the shared processes and outcomes between the schools in order to identify patterns and irregularities. Following this analysis in regards to the church directives, I drew conclusions about the findings with possible explanations and implications expounded upon. In this situation, speculation, grounded in the outcomes of this study and related literature, allowed me to assess the potential implications if these types of programs were to be promoted in the Church.

---

49 Merriam, *Qualitative Research and Case Study Applications in Education*, 178.
CHAPTER III
ST. PAUL’S CHOIR SCHOOL

Background

St. Paul’s Choir School, formerly known as the Boston Archdiocesan Choir School, operates under the umbrella of the Roman Catholic Archdiocese of Boston and is located at St. Paul’s Church in Cambridge, Massachusetts. The school was established in 1963 for three reasons: “To advance the liturgy with sacred music, to lift the hearts of worshippers through participation in song, [and] to instill in young men’s hearts a generosity to serve the Church either as laymen or priests.”

The choir school serves as a day school for boys in grades four through eight and is the only boys’ Catholic choir school in the United States. As the school remarks on its website, “Today, such choir schools have survived, in number, almost exclusively in England, where there is still a thriving culture of Cathedral choirs of boys and men; it is to the excellence of this tradition, over a millennium old, that we aspire for our boys.”

According to Fr. Michael Drea, pastor of St. Paul’s Church, the education at the choir school today consists of three main pillars: “Comprehensive and orthodox faith formation, a challenging and vigorous music program, and an equally challenging and vigorous academic

---

1 St. Paul’s Choir School, liner notes to Silent Night, directed by Dr. Theodore Marier, recorded 1960s and 70s, St. Paul’s Choir School, CD, digitally remastered, 2013.

Within the environment of a rigorous academic Catholic education, this intensive musical training is unique, offering boys daily instruction in choral singing, music theory, and instrumental music as well as participation in daily liturgies. The mission of the school seeks “to engage young men in the development of their intellectual and musical talents and to inspire them to use their gifts for the greater glory of God and in service to his people.”

Accredited by the New England Association of Secondary Schools and Colleges, the choir school’s program of study fulfills guidelines set forth by both the Boston Catholic Schools Office and the Massachusetts State Curriculum Frameworks.

Upon graduating from the choir school at the end of eighth grade, many of the students are sought out by Boston’s prestigious non-denominational and Catholic high schools, such as Roxbury Latin, Phillips Academy, Middlesex School, Chestnut Hill, Belmont Hill, Boston College, St. Sebastian’s, and Xavarian Brothers. “The challenge the boys experience in choral singing and in their studies stands them in sound stead of maturity and self-discipline; they are equipped to proceed to excellent high schools and, indeed, first-rate careers.”

The choir school lays an early foundation for students to go on to prestigious universities and conservatories such as:

---


6 John Robinson, Music Director of St. Paul’s Church and Choir School, e-mail message to author, 12 January 2015.

as Harvard, Yale, Princeton, and Julliard. The training they receive prepares them to continue
with successful musical endeavors and careers long after leaving the choir school.

To understand the contributing factors that led to the founding of St. Paul’s Choir School
in 1963 and the success it has enjoyed to the present, a brief look at the history of the parish is
necessary. “A ‘Romanesque’ church, patterned after the meeting halls of the Roman Empire,”
the building contains stylistic aspects and imagery capturing “the ancient synagogues of Israel
and the temples of Greece and Rome to the medieval Gothic and now modern styles.” Since the
founding of the parish in 1875, St. Paul’s has been led by numerous pastors with a particular
attentiveness to art, architecture, liturgy, and music. Fr. Augustine Hickey, a devoted supporter
of Pope Pius X’s liturgical initiatives, served as pastor of St. Paul’s from 1925 to 1965. Along
with Music Director Dr. Theodore Marier, Fr. Hickey’s slow but pragmatic approach to
developing the devotional habits of his parishioners put St. Paul’s in the forefront of
congregational participation in the liturgy nearly twenty years ahead of the Second Vatican
Council. Since 1948, the congregation had been singing the entire Ordinary at the High Mass on
Sundays. In describing Fr. Hickey’s desire that external participation be more than a passing fad,
William Leonard stated in the 1960s, “He believes firmly that the people must thoroughly
understand the necessity of interior participation and how this is expressed and assisted by
exterior participation.”

---


Having served St. Paul’s as organist since 1934 and choir director since 1947, Dr. Marier was central to establishing the choir school at St. Paul’s in 1963. Influenced by the advocating of boys’ choirs in *De musica sacra et sacra liturgia* (1958) and assisted by Fr. Hickey, Dr. Marier founded the school to revive the centuries-old choir tradition of boys and men. Based on the European choir school tradition, St. Paul’s Choir School set out to develop a choir in service of the liturgy that would attract talented boys from Catholic churches all over the archdiocese of Boston. Twenty-five students in grades five through eight were enrolled in the program that first year. Receiving two periods of music daily and additional rehearsal time with the men, musical study included sight reading, music appreciation, theory and history, and instrumental training. From his leadership in the chant revival, his study with the monks of Solesmes, and his collaborations with Justine Ward teaching chant to children, Dr. Marier developed a distinctive and highly effective way of teaching chant, which he employed with the choristers at St. Paul’s. A book entitled *A Gregorian Chant Master Class*, documenting his way of teaching chant, was compiled by his colleagues and family posthumously. Dr. Marier had good relationships with various monastic Orders in the area, providing chant training to a number of monks. As a result of these connections, many parishes throughout the archdiocese began sending talented boys to audition at the choir school, and recruitment thrived in the 1960s.

---


and 70s. Following his retirement from the choir school in 1986, Dr. Marier became the Justine Bayard Ward Professor of Liturgical Music at The Catholic University of America.

Meanwhile at the parish of St. Paul’s, dynamic pastors continued to develop the liturgical reforms of Vatican II. Fr. Joseph Collins, assistant from 1946 to 1965, then pastor until 1971, offered "demonstration Masses," in order to provide instructive, non-sacramental explanations of the ritual. Mr. John Dunn, having assisted with music at St. Paul’s for a number of years, became music director at the school and church in 1986. Maintaining a strong enrollment at the choir school, overseeing the relocation to newly renovated buildings, and combining the role of music director of St. Paul's Church with the role of headmaster of the choir school all occurred under Mr. Dunn’s leadership. At some time during Mr. Dunn’s tenure, the school became known as the Boston Archdiocesan Choir School.

That brings us to the present. Currently serving as pastor of St. Paul’s Parish since 2009, Fr. Michael Drea has overseen the hiring of several staff members at the school. Possessing extensive experience with English boys’ choirs, Mr. John Robinson was chosen to be the new director of music in 2010, with Mr. William McIvor appointed headmaster of the choir school that same year. Since his appointment, Mr. Robinson has worked to raise awareness of the Choir of St. Paul's as a primarily liturgical choir, increasing the number of sung liturgies and the

---


16 Choir of St. Paul’s, Harvard Square, “History of the Choir School.”
amount of choral repertoire. Fr. Drea describes why John Robinson was a good fit for the school:

A chorister himself . . . John understands this very, very beautiful milieu of sacred church music from his youth, through his formative years of secondary school, and the university at Cambridge, and his work at Canterbury. . . . He understands the significance of what a boy choir can offer to the liturgical life of the church. . . . Various members of the committee looked for different things – ability to conduct, ability to deal with children and the challenges that come with that, to inspire and motivate children. I was looking for someone who was really going to affect what I call the Renaissance of the only boys’ Catholic choir school in the United States, so that we not only just preserve it, but grow it and allow it to be a gift to the life of the church for generations to come. At that point in the history of the choir school, that is exactly what we needed. We needed someone who understood the tradition and significance of what a choir school is and that is really what I was looking for.17

In an effort to align more closely to the European model of training boys at a younger age, the choir school added a fourth grade level in September 2012.18 In the summer of 2013, the school returned to its original name of St. Paul’s Choir School.

The enrollment capacity of the choir school is sixty-five, or thirteen students per grade level. The current enrollment for the 2013-14 academic year is forty-three students. During the 1970s and 80s, due to internal budgeting issues, the choir school was expanded to around sixty boys to sustain the school financially. According to current Music Director, John Robinson, “I think that raised a lot of questions about how big a chorus can be in a choir school and of whom it should consist.”19 Of the students currently enrolled, eighty-five to ninety percent are Catholic, while ten to fifteen percent are Protestant or non-denominational. Robinson describes

17 Drea, interview.
18 Choir of St. Paul’s, Harvard Square, “History of the Choir School.”
19 Robinson, interview.
the issues surrounding demographics: “We have always taken non-Catholics . . . . If it is one hundred percent of people who are not Catholic, then it is a peculiar demographic. It is sort of on a yearly basis; we have not been able to be choosey about this because we are struggling to find boys who have enough potential to do this well enough.”

Due to recent revenue problems, most Catholic schools in the archdiocese have become more adamant about retaining their own students, so the steady recruitment support prevalent during the Marier years has become more sporadic.

Admission to the school is based upon a vocal audition and academic testing. Typically students enter the school in the fourth grade, but later entry points are considered under special circumstances. While some boys come to the school with musical and liturgical experience, this prior training is not necessary. The most important factors for gaining entry to the school are musical potential and dedication. The vocal audition consists of singing a prepared piece, such as a hymn, tonal memory and range testing, and sight-reading. According to John Robinson, “We get a lot of intelligent boys who would make good choristers potentially who cannot sing above a top F [fifth line of the treble staff] because they have just never tried or they have been screaming on the football bench, [but] with time spent working on it they tend to improve [once they begin attending the school].”

In addition to the music audition, each boy is required to take a reading test and must demonstrate a strong record of academic achievement through the

---

20 Ibid.


22 Robinson, interview.
third grade.\textsuperscript{23} Because of how demanding the musical aspects are in a choir school, it is especially important that students have the ability to keep up academically.

Certain factors help the students develop rapidly musically, spiritually, and academically at this school. First, only the candidates with the highest potential for success are admitted to this intense program. The vocal audition, reading test, prior academic accomplishment, and active parental support are prerequisites for the students and families pursuing this unique education. This program would most likely not be a good fit for those who cannot meet this criteria or students who do not show a serious interest in singing. The parents and families that send their boys to the choir school must be willing to make a great commitment to the program and the demanding performance schedule which often extends outside of the normal school day. According to Robinson, “There is a lot of scheduling and driving them here at funny times of the day and picking them up after rehearsals. They do a lot of carpooling . . . . They commute for up to about an hour.”\textsuperscript{24} Small class sizes contribute the added benefit of much individual attention at the school. For example, grade seven currently has seven students in music theory, religion, and other classes. This type of one-on-one attention means that learning can be differentiated according to each student’s current level of understanding. Because students can work at to their own pace, accelerated learning often results. Fr. Drea explains, “Families who appreciate this

\textsuperscript{23} St. Paul’s Choir School, “Requirements.”

\textsuperscript{24} Robinson, interview.
and see the value of it for their middle-school-aged sons, see this as a valuable life experience for them that will form and shape them hopefully for the rest of their lives.”

The 2013-2014 tuition cost at the choir school is 6,200 dollars, funding less than half of the expenses associated with educating the boys. The remainder of the money needed is supplied by donations, parent guild fundraisers, an archdiocesan school tax collection, and money the choir earns from “working scholarship” performances. In exchange for this low tuition cost, the boys commit to regular musical and liturgical engagements at St. Paul’s Church. These duties include daily and weekend Masses as well as weddings, funerals, and concerts. Similar to the historic model of European choir schools, which are endowed by the church, St. Paul’s Choir School receives funding from the parish in exchange for their singing. Likewise the boys are required to participate in outside concert engagements for which the school earns revenue. Additionally, every parish in the archdiocese that does not have a school contributes a five thousand dollar tax to the archdiocese annually; currently, parishes have the option of allocating this money to St. Paul’s Choir School. To fund the school’s annual operating budget of slightly over half a million dollars, approximately forty-four percent of the revenue is collected from tuition, eighteen percent is paid by the parish, nine percent is earned from concerts, seventeen percent is collected from the Archdiocesan school tax, and the remaining twelve percent is generated from parent-sponsored fundraisers.

The choir school is governed by the pastor of St. Paul’s Church, Fr. Michael E. Drea, and run by Headmaster William P. McIvor in conjunction with the Music Director John Robinson.

---

25 Drea, interview.
26 Robinson, interview.
An advisory board of fourteen volunteers assists in carrying out special projects to ensure the school’s growth and sustainability. In addition, a parent guild helps organize important fundraisers for the school. The total number of faculty at the school is fifteen – seven of these teach music, and two serve as religion and liturgy instructors.²⁷ Of the two full-time music staff, one holds a master’s degree and the Fellowship Diploma from the Royal College of Organists, and the other holds a doctoral degree in organ performance and the AGO Colleague Certification. The religion instructor holds a master’s degree in English language and literature from Oxford and has completed coursework in religious history.²⁸

**Presentation of Data**

Data collected through in-depth interviews with music and pastoral staff, field notes from on-site observations of classes and liturgies, and a variety of school documents and sources will now be presented to determine the degree to which St. Paul’s Choir School fulfills the eight musico-liturgical goals established by the Church since Vatican II. Examining the structure and inner functioning of the school in regards to the importance of teaching music, giving pride of place to chant, preserving and promoting polyphony, fostering use of the full treasure of sacred music, cultivating new compositions, facilitating active participation, providing liturgical

---

²⁷ John Robinson, Music Director of St. Paul’s Church and Choir School, e-mail message to author, 12 January 2015.

training, and fostering spiritual formation will take place in order to determine the degree to which each of these ecclesial directives was achieved.

**Standard #1:**
*Catholic institutions and schools attach great importance to the teaching of music.*

1.1 Musical training advocates strong choral music experiences, particularly when they give fervent expression to the Catholic ethos within the context of liturgy.

The choral music program and its service to the liturgy are primary to the mission of St. Paul’s Choir School. According to the student handbook, “At the very center of the School’s ethos is its commitment to developing excellent liturgical singers, and a first-rate choir of boys and men.” The importance of this connection between what the choir does musically on a regular basis within the liturgy is described as follows on the school’s website: “It is the hope that through the singing of the Mass and understanding the rich musical tradition of the Church, each choirboy will appreciate at a deeper level the power of God in his life and thus respond as faith-filled individuals.”

Students at the school participate in daily choir rehearsal and daily Mass Tuesday through Friday. In addition, the boys have singing duties at the weekend liturgies as well as frequent concerts, tours, and recordings. To further strengthen the boys’ formation in choir and liturgy, the school offers many related classes in music and theology. In a recent interview, the choir school was described by reporter Judy Valente with the following statement: “Boys come here to

---


sing. Music is so important that this place has been described not as a school with a choir, but as a choir with a school.”

The school year at St. Paul’s Choir School is approximately forty-one weeks, spanning from early September to mid-June. During those ten months, the choir school provides music for over 275 liturgies and concerts at St. Paul’s Church and in the community. The majority of these musical responsibilities fall to three ensembles: the Trebles, a training choir for boys in grades four through five; the Choristers, a more advanced treble choir for boys in grades six through eight; and the Choir of St. Paul’s, boys from the Choristers and a group of adult men who combine to sing mixed-voice repertoire. The Schola, a fourth choir for boys with changed voices, has a considerably lighter schedule in comparison. Accounting for holidays and breaks during that time, the students attended class on approximately 172 of those days, or thirty-four and a half weeks out of forty-one.

The school day and academic program are built around the students’ rigorous choir training and liturgical responsibilities. In order to execute such a demanding performance schedule and maintain the high quality of music for which St. Paul’s is known, a rigorous rehearsal schedule is employed both inside and outside of school. The school day extends from 8:50 a.m. until 3:30 p.m. on Monday and 7:50 a.m. until 3:30 p.m. on Tuesday through Friday. On Wednesdays, the Choristers remain at school until 7:00 p.m. for Vespers followed by rehearsal with the men. On Saturdays, the Trebles are at St. Paul’s from 4:00 until 5:50 p.m. for

---


rehearsal and Mass. On Sundays, the Choristers are at St. Paul’s from 9:45 a.m. until 12:15 p.m. for rehearsal and Mass. Members of the *Schola* perform altar serving and other ministerial roles at the weekend Masses. As a result of this heavy liturgical and concert schedule on the weekends, students arrive one hour later on Monday morning to begin classes. No music classes or liturgies are scheduled on Mondays to give the boys and staff one day off a week.\textsuperscript{33}

Using times from the Trebles’ schedule as an example, I will now illustrate the procedure I used in calculating the amount of time students in each choir spent in musico-liturgical subject areas (see Fig. 3.1 below). I first consulted the school schedule to determine the number of daytime minutes in school for that particular choir (STEP 1). This came out to 2240 minutes per week for the Trebles. Next, I examined the annual calendar to calculate the number of minutes for any other mandatory rehearsal, liturgical, and performance additions for which the Trebles were scheduled to sing. For instance, the Trebles rehearsed and sang for Saturday evening Masses, comprising 110 minutes, on thirty different occasions in 2013. They rehearsed and sang for Wednesday Vespers, comprising 210 minutes, on seven different occasions. These additional 4770 minutes were then divided by the number of weeks in the school year (e.g., 172 days of instruction, divided by five days per week, equals 34.4 weeks) to determine the average number of extra minutes per week (STEP 2). This came out to 138.66 or 139 minutes for the Trebles. Next, I added together the minutes from STEP 1 and STEP 2 to determine that the Trebles spent an average total of 2379 minutes “in school” per week. After this, the time devoted to each individual subject area could be calculated. Using the choir rehearsal schedule, I determined that the Trebles spent 400 minutes per week in daytime rehearsals (STEP 4). Next, using the annual

calendar, I calculated the number of any other mandatory additions to the Trebles’ rehearsal schedule. For instance, they rehearsed for fifty-five minutes prior to the thirty Saturday evening Masses and for sixty-five minutes before each of the seven Vespers services. These 2105 minutes were then divided by the number of weeks in the school year (34.4 weeks) to determine that the Trebles spent an average of sixty-one extra minutes in rehearsal each week (STEP 5). I then added together the minutes from STEP 4 and STEP 5 to determine that the Trebles spent a total average of 461 minutes in rehearsal per week. In dividing this average (STEP 6) by the total average number of school minutes each week from STEP 3 and multiplying the total by 100, I determined that nineteen percent of the Trebles’ time is spent in choir rehearsals.

Fig. 3.1 Illustration of procedures for calculating time students spend in musico-liturgical areas
(Times from St. Paul’s Treble Choir schedule used in this example)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STEP 1: Average time of standard instruction per week</th>
<th>STEP 4: Time spent in standard choir rehearsals per week</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1a) 8:50a.m.-3:30p.m. (M) = 400 minutes</td>
<td>4a) 9:40a.m. + 10:20-11:10a.m. (T,TH) = 180 minutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1b) 7:50a.m.-3:30p.m. (T-F) = 1840 minutes</td>
<td>4b) 7:50-8:50a.m. + 11:10-12noon (W,F) = 220 minutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1c) 400 + 1840 = 2240 minutes/week</td>
<td>4c) 180 + 220 = 400 minutes/week</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STEP 2: Additional instructional time per week</th>
<th>STEP 5: Additional mandatory choir rehearsal time per week</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2a) 4-5:50p.m. (SAT) 110 min. x 30 = 3300 minutes</td>
<td>5a) 4-4:55p.m. (SAT) 55 min. x 30 rehearsals = 1650 minutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2b) 3:30-7p.m. (W) 210 min. x 7 = 1470 minutes</td>
<td>5b) 4:50-5:10p.m. + 6:15-7p.m. (W) 20 min. + 45 min. x 7 rehearsals = 455 minutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2c) 3300 min. + 1470 min. = 4770 minutes</td>
<td>5c) 1650 + 455 = 2105 minutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2d) 4770 minutes divided by 34.4 weeks</td>
<td>5d) 2105 minutes divided by 34.4 weeks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>= 138.66 minutes/week (139 minutes/week)</td>
<td>= 61.19 minutes/week (61 minutes/week)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STEP 3: Total minutes of school activity per week</th>
<th>STEP 6: Total minutes in choir rehearsals each week</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3a) 2240 + 139 = 2379 minutes/week</td>
<td>6a) 400 + 61 = 461 minutes/week</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STEP 7: Total time spent in choir rehearsals each week</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7a) 461 min. divided by 2379 min. (x 100%) = 19.38% or ~ 19%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
I then repeated the procedure used in STEPS 4-7 to determine the amount of time the Trebles spent in Liturgy and Concerts as well as other musico-liturgical courses such as music theory, recorders, hand bells, piano, and religion. See Fig. 3.2 below for a comparison of the final data produced for each choir using these procedures. Of the 172 instructional days annually at St. Paul’s, students averaged between 805-1315 minutes (thirteen and a half to twenty-two hours per week), or thirty-three to forty-six percent, of their time engaged in choir rehearsals, liturgies, and related musico-liturgical studies. Since after-school and weekend rehearsals, liturgies, and concerts are a mandatory part of the curriculum and school day as they are included on the school’s calendar, the calculations below are inclusive of these times.

Fig. 3.2. Minutes per week spent in musico-liturgical subject areas
MUTH = music theory, REC = recorders, HB = hand bells, PN = piano lesson, REL = religion

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Choir</th>
<th>Total School Day</th>
<th>Choir Rehearsal</th>
<th>Liturgy and Concerts</th>
<th>Other Musico-Liturgical Subject Areas</th>
<th>Total for all Musico-Liturgical Experiences</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Trebles</td>
<td>2379</td>
<td>461 (19%)</td>
<td>240 (10%)</td>
<td>MUTH 60 REC 60 PN 30 REL 130 = 280 (12%)</td>
<td>981 (41%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Choristers</td>
<td>2765</td>
<td>650 (22%)</td>
<td>365 (13%)</td>
<td>MUTH 150 PN 30 REL 120 = 300 (11%)</td>
<td>1315 (46%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schola</td>
<td>2455</td>
<td>90 (4%)</td>
<td>*335 (13%)</td>
<td>MUTH 150 REC 30 HB 30 PN 30 REL 140 = 380 (16%)</td>
<td>805 (33%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*includes altar server/liturgical training

*includes altar/server/liturgical/ministry training
The Trebles comprise fifteen to twenty singers. Their primary responsibilities are sung Mass on Wednesdays and Fridays, sung Saturday vigil Masses, and occasional Wednesday choral Vespers. In 2013, the Trebles sang for 102 liturgies/concerts (3.0 per week) and 305 rehearsals (8.9 per week). These included thirty Saturday night vigil Masses, seven Vespers, sixty-one weekday Masses, and four additional liturgies/concerts.34 The Trebles devote an average total of 980 minutes each week, or thirty-nine percent, of their time “in school” to musico-liturgical experiences comprised of choir rehearsals, liturgies, and concerts as well as classroom instruction in music theory, recorders, piano, and religion.

The Choristers comprise fifteen to twenty singers. Their primary responsibilities are sung Mass on Tuesdays and Thursdays, Wednesday choral Vespers, parish weddings and funerals, and serving as the main performing ensemble and public face of the choir school in recordings and tours. In 2013, the Choristers sang for over 111 liturgies/concerts and 272 rehearsals. These included two Sunday Masses, twenty-three Vespers, sixty-six weekday Masses, and over twenty additional liturgies and concerts.35 The Choristers devote an average total of 1315 minutes each week, or forty-six percent, of their time “in school” to musico-liturgical experiences comprised of choir rehearsals, liturgies, and concerts as well as classroom instruction in music theory, piano, and religion.

The prestigious Choir of St. Paul’s comprises the Choristers along with men. The boys sing the treble line while the men, consisting of nine to twelve professional singers, three to four paid high school choral scholars, choir school alumni, Harvard staff, and parishioners, sing the

34 St. Paul’s Choir School, 2013 Academic Calendar.

35 Ibid.
alto, tenor, and bass parts. The primary responsibility of the Choir of St. Paul’s is Mass on Sunday and providing liturgical music for solemnities, feasts, events, and special Masses throughout the year. Annual liturgies and concerts include the Solemnity of All Saints, a requiem Mass in November, Christmas concerts, Lessons and Carols, Christmas Eve Mass, Christmas Day Mass, choral Vespers, Palm Sunday, the Mass of the Lord’s Supper, Good Friday, the Paschal Vigil, Easter Sunday, Pentecost, Corpus Christi, and Alumni Sunday. In 2013, the Choir of St. Paul’s sang for thirty-three Sunday Masses, fifteen other liturgies/concerts, and eighty-one rehearsals. When factoring this in to the figures listed above for the Choristers, these boys sang for a total of 159 liturgies/concerts (4.6 per week) and 353 rehearsals (10.3 per week). Due to their double responsibility of singing treble-only repertoire on weekdays and mixed repertoire on Sundays with the professional men, the Choristers spend the most time overall in rehearsals, liturgies, and concerts.

The Schola is typically comprised of five to ten singers. Their primary responsibilities are sung daily Mass on the first Friday and third Wednesday of the month. Since the Schola only sings twice per month, their totals for the year were fifteen weekday Masses, four additional liturgies/concerts, and seventy rehearsals. As a result, they averaged singing for 0.6 liturgies/concerts and 2.0 rehearsals per week. When factoring in their non-choral participation at the daily Masses and training as altar servers, lectors, cantors, and ushers, the Schola devotes an average total of 805 five minutes, or thirty-three percent, of their time “in school” to musico-liturgical experiences, including instruction in music theory, recorders, hand bells, piano, and

---

36 Ibid.

37 Ibid.
religion. Though this choir does not typically perform in public very often, members of the Schola did join the Choristers in the recent international choir tour to Rome.

Participation in a variety of musico-liturgical events and recordings as well as collaborations and interactions with renowned performers at St. Paul’s Church provide additional opportunities for the boys to grow as choral musicians. Recent Vespers and concerts have included performances with local and visiting choirs such as the Harvard Glee Club, the Men and Boys of All Saints’ Church Ashmont, the Boys of Trinity Church Copenhagen, the Boston City-Singers, St. Michael's Choir School Toronto, and the Vienna Boys’ Choir. In addition to singing frequently at the Cathedral of the Holy Cross, other special liturgies, such as singing their first Extraordinary Form Mass on the Feast of St. Mark in 2013, has given the boys exposure to a range of liturgical forms and added opportunities for singing a cappella polyphonic Mass settings. Students have benefited from interaction with modern-day composers, renowned scholars, and sacred musicians associated with the school such as Theodore Marier, Charles Callahan, and Leo Abbot, in addition to participating in singing workshops with local directors and interfacing frequently with artists-in-residence at Harvard University. The parish music series has offered occasions to hear celebrated organists and choirs such as the Tallis Scholars in performance. Another significant aspect involving the boys has been the many in-house recordings the choir school has produced over the years. Six recordings were made in-house under Mr. John Dunn from 1992 to 2007. In May 2011, the boys recorded a number of Marian chants at the Basilica of the National Shrine of the Immaculate Conception in Washington, DC for CatholicTV. In honor of the fiftieth anniversary, a series of three recordings, featuring tracks from several albums recorded in the early years of the choir school under Dr. Marier, is being
digitally re-mastered and reissued. In May of 2014, the choir school recorded their first international recording, *Christmas in Harvard Square*, under the direction of John Robinson. Produced by AimHigher Recordings/Decca, the recording was released in October 2014. Fr. Drea comments, “. . . this recording allows us to collaborate in the great endeavor that is the New Evangelization. Sacred choral music, especially that which is centered on the Incarnation of our Lord, can serve to inspire countless people to rediscover, embrace anew or even encounter for the first time the gift of the Son of God made man.”

Over the years, the choir school has garnered performance opportunities throughout the greater Boston area and beyond, as well as embarked on tours. In the early years, the choir made guest appearances with the Boston Philharmonic, the Handel and Haydn Society, the Boston Ballet, and the Boston Symphony Orchestra at Symphony Hall and at Tanglewood, working under the baton of conductors such as Seiji Ozawa and Arthur Fiedler. Recently these major performances have resumed. In 2013, boys from St. Paul’s Choir School performed as choristers and soloists with the Boston Symphony Orchestra, the Boston Lyric Opera, the Boston Civic Symphony, and the Harvard University Choir. The boys have received invitations to perform at significant festivals and conventions such as the 2013 Boston Early Music Fringe Festival and the 2014 American Guild of Organists National Convention. Touring has also been part of the history of the choir school. Recent invitations to perform as part of St. Catherine of Siena’s


[40 Choir of St. Paul’s, Harvard Square, “History of the Choir School.”]
Manhattan concert series have led the choir to New York City with performances at St. Ignatius Loyola and St. Patrick’s Cathedral. In celebration of the school’s fiftieth anniversary in 2013, members of the Choristers and the Schola, twenty-six boys in all, embarked on an international choir tour to Assisi and Rome where they sang for Pope Francis. Robinson explains the current situation and his hopes for the future regarding touring:

What we have done so far is more like pilgrimages. [There have been] no tours yet with the men, just boys – [singing] boys’ voice Mass settings. [It is] very expensive and difficult to pay men for something like this. But the day will come when we need to do that . . . . I think a domestic tour makes the most sense – something in the U.S.  

1.2 A rigorous curriculum serves as the framework in which the sequential acquisition of skill and learning takes place, through use of a graded choir system or similar, appropriate to the varying ability levels of individuals.

When becoming director of music in 2010, Mr. Robinson restructured the program into the four ensembles as they currently exist. One of the main considerations in doing this was to create the best possible arrangement in which to train forty-five or more boys in various stages of development. It was important to limit the number of singers on the treble line in each choir to no more than twenty to twenty-five. The rates at which the boys develop, the amount of individual attention they receive, and the components of the liturgy each could sing also influenced the current format. Delineated by grade level, ability level, and voice part, it is proving to provide an appropriate range of experiences suited to the boys in their various stages of development. When a boy first enters the choir school in the fourth grade, he completes a

---

41 Robinson, interview.
year of probationary instruction to determine if the school is a good fit for him. During this time he is developing skills necessary to become part of the Choristers and benefits from the guidance of the fifth graders who sing alongside him daily in the Trebles. The fourth-grade boys who successfully complete their first year of formation in this probationary program are fully accepted into the choir school through a ceremony of investiture in May of their fourth-grade year. In the rare case of a student not being able to meet these expectations, a mutual decision is made to withdraw the student from the school. At the end of the fifth grade, singers advance to become Choristers. As cited above, the Choristers almost exclusively comprise sixth and seventh graders with a few boys in the eighth grade continuing to participate until their voices change. The Schola is made up mainly of eighth graders. By having such a structure at the choir school, an environment is provided wherein the older, more experienced singers serve as leaders and role models to the younger, less experienced singers.

Since 2010, the choir school has implemented a choir curriculum modeled upon the European/English choir school tradition in which Robinson possesses an extensive background. With this transition came a shift away from the more technique-centered Ward Method, already somewhat modified by Marier. While folk songs and classical music are incorporated to some degree, the main goal of Ward is to make the singing of Gregorian chant accessible to children through incorporating the Solesmes Method. Accordingly, the Ward Method is based more on the entire scale and the church modes, rather than the pentatonic scale often associated with Kodály approaches. However, chants are indicated on numbers as opposed to neumes until quite

---

late in the Ward Method, and the major chants of the Church are not introduced until books three and four. To better suit the needs of preparing music the boys sing in liturgy, a more repertoire-centered approach has replaced the Ward Method. From an extensive body of chant, motets, anthems, and Mass and *Magnificat* settings, concepts are refined and perfected throughout the year and from one year to the next. Building exposure to quality repertoire from the cathedral tradition which can be used first and foremost in the liturgy is the basis for all other learning. To complement this formation in repertoire, every student studies piano (or organ in some cases), music theory, recorder, hand bells, sight singing, musical style, and proper vocal technique as a means to learning and performing this specific body of choral repertoire. The Trebles learn a minimum of forty-five pieces annually, mostly treble repertoire. In addition to knowing this repertoire, the Choristers learn additional treble-voice music plus mixed-voice repertoire, having a minimum of 138 works at their disposal at any given time.\footnote{St. Paul’s Choir School, *The Music List 2013* (Boston: St. Paul’s Choir School, 2013).} While the school choirs combine for a few musical events annually such as family holiday concerts, the investiture of new choristers, and graduation, generally each choir performs and rehearses separately. The choir school continues to work toward building a larger treasury of repertoire that can be sung on a daily basis, to make it much more comparable to the English models.

From the time the boys enter the choir school in the fourth grade their skills and knowledge are being developed through a blanket approach in choir. This strategy emphasizes teaching a set of principles and processes that students will be able to apply to a variety of situations at an increasing degree of depth as they learn to sing more repertoire. This style of learning, adapted primarily by choir schools, is quite different in many ways to music education...
approaches based on Kodály’s philosophy, the Royal School of Church Music’s *Voice for Life* series, or the Ward Method, which seek to break down specific skills and address them in a logical way by assigning them to particular grade or achievement levels. For example, Choksy’s charts integrating Kodály’s ideas specify that students will study 3/4 meter from December through April of their fourth-grade year.\(^{44}\) The program *Voice for Life* states that once singers achieve the White Level they should be able to “sing with focus and concentration in rehearsals, performances, and church services.”\(^{45}\) By the end of the third week using the Ward Method, first graders are expected to be able to sing scales and melodies containing scale degrees 1, 2, 3, 4, and 5.\(^{46}\)

Unlike some of the current drive in music education to teach according to one of the many instructional methodologies that have developed over the last century, this type of choir curriculum engages students directly in the performance of choral repertoire from the start. For example, in such a system it is not necessary for music to be translated through a set of made-up exercise-type songs (e.g., the Ward Method) or hyper-musical symbols and actions like eurhythmics, hand signs, and solfège syllables. When pressed about which techniques European choir schools use to achieve this result, Robinson explains,

European choir schools are very suspicious of the notion of techniques in choir training. They would say, well, look at these choir schools going for hundreds of years making all these recordings. They do not use any techniques; why do we


need them? Isn’t that all that you need is the tools to understand the language? You do not need some kind of a method discipline on top of that.\textsuperscript{47}

Such a response does not come as a surprise after establishing in the literature reviewed at the onset on this study, particularly of Sandborg, Phillips, Bertalot, and Guest, that chorister formation in traditional English choir schools relies less on methodology and more on an apprenticeship approach to pedagogy. Choristers learn from models around them, including older and more experienced singers, such as head choristers and professional men. In terms of making performance-based assessments, authentic tasks, such as singing actual choral repertoire, are the focus of evaluation for the director. The level of precision and musicality the choir exhibits is the culminating indicator of success. The goal is always working towards the refinement of music making, or performance, in the liturgy. Students build their skills and knowledge base because of this opportunity to serve the liturgy perpetually with new and constantly changing repertoire.

The Chorister and Server Investiture Mass as well as promotions within the theory and piano levels mark observable milestones students achieve within the curriculum. The Investiture Mass, generally occurring in May, recognizes the boys who are demonstrating potential and making good progress in choir during their year-long probationary period as fourth graders. They receive their surplice, a white liturgical vestment to wear over top of their cassock, and join the ranks of the older boys as full members of the choir school. The changed-voice boys, now part of the \textit{Schola}, are also recognized for their additional non-singing roles in the liturgy. While there is no rigid test for either of the investiture promotions, there are exams students must be

\textsuperscript{47} Robinson, interview.
able to pass in theory and piano before advancing to the next level. In this way, a gradated approach is used, making the theory and piano portions of the choristers’ formation more analogous to the way students acquire skills in other educational approaches such as Ward and Kodály.

A substantial component of the choir curriculum which I witnessed during my observations at St. Paul’s is its inclusion of human and character formation as part of the boys’ experience in choir. These intra- and inter-personal skills offer many extrinsic benefits to those who become leaders in the church as priests, religious, and sacred musicians as well as for general success in life. In such an environment, the boys develop self-awareness and the ability to relate well to others. Reinforcing practices with the boys such as not having their eyes wandering around the church when the choir is singing at liturgy helps to build self-discipline and concentration. Of their own self-initiative, students raise their hands in rehearsal when they make a mistake while singing. If no one raises his hand when a mistake has occurred, the director will stop the singing to interject feedback. This practice develops qualities of self-critique and honesty in students and lets the director know that they are cognizant and admitting of the mistake that they have made. Since the director does not need to stop to point this out, the entire group’s rehearsal time is not infringed upon as a result. The challenges the boys experience in choral singing – working together to stagger their breathing with those around them, blending with other voices, counting, and following along in the music – cultivate teamwork among the group. When the director gives feedback during rehearsal or following a

---

liturgy or performance, I observed eagerness in the boys to improve and grow from both the praise and criticism they received. By the very nature of singing publicly with such frequency, it is apparent the boys are gaining self-confidence from an early age. A healthy, non-threatening camaraderie is noticeable among the boys in the support they offer fellow classmates selected to perform solos or demonstrate musical and vocal concepts in class.

While I observed many related subjects being integrated within the choral rehearsal (e.g., vocal production, music reading and theory skills, liturgical, spiritual, and human formation), there are more formal opportunities for students to develop in these areas. Each student studies music theory two to four times per week. The fourth- and fifth-grade music theory curriculum includes recorders. The eighth-grade music theory curriculum includes recorder consort and hand bell ensemble. Every student has a thirty-minute private piano lesson once a week and is expected to practice a half hour at home each day. All students of the school participate together in daily Mass Tuesday through Friday in one capacity or another. To continue the development of their theological, liturgical, and spiritual formation first initiated by their experience in the liturgy, all students receive formal instruction in religion three times per week. Additionally, seventh and eighth graders study Latin twice per week. While the boys do not currently participate in any formal course of study in the visual arts, sacred art, or art history, the many educational field trips to art museums and churches in Boston and while on tour do provide a strong parallel to enhance the students’ study of sacred music. More aspects of the students’ formation in these related subject areas will be discussed throughout this chapter.

As was already alluded to, within this choir-centered curriculum, there is a modified program of study once a boy’s voice changes and he becomes part of the Schola. Some choir
school programs have boys stop singing altogether once their voices change. As Robinson explains,

In England, you would just say have a few years off and go and play the piano or something, then bring them back when they were fifteen or sixteen. . . . It would be a couple of years then and they might go on and do a university choral scholarship and have to get good really fast. But basically you would never expect thirteen or fourteen-year-old to be singing well in a changed voice kind of a sound because I think it takes a while for it to settle.  

Labeling them as tenors or basses at this stage is a somewhat misleading notion. Unlike a choir school that goes up through the twelfth grade with more developed tenor and bass voices, boys at this age have a limited capability and stamina for making a proper kind of singing tone in these ranges. As a result, the philosophy is to give them a much lighter singing schedule, particularly with regard to public performances, while at the same time trying to keep them interested in singing. Several options are available with this in mind. By offering an extended musical, liturgical, and academic curriculum, these older boys participate in recorder and hand bell ensembles, voice class, and extra preparation for high school in place of the rigorous rehearsal and performance-based curriculum of the treble boys. Voice classes include different types of repertoire such as art songs and close-harmony barbershop type pieces that have more limited vocal ranges. Boys that are able to navigate learning to sing in falsetto can sometimes continue with the treble choirs. Others serve as altar servers, ushers, lectors, and cantors (whose responsibilities consist primary of physical gesture rather than leading vocally). They meet for altar serving classes twice per week to develop these liturgical areas. Playing in a consort of soprano, alto, tenor, and bass recorders gives the boys experience reading in the bass clef and

---

49 Robinson, interview.
participating in mixed-voice repertoire (e.g., Renaissance pieces such as Heinrich Isaac’s *Innsbruck, ich muss dich lassen*). Playing in the consort helps the boys work on ensemble skills that are very similar to singing, such as breathing together, breath control, phrasing, articulation, and intonation. Similar attributes are developed in hand bell class where dexterity and coordination are necessary to play the different bells at various times. Students must work together as an ensemble to keep the tempo together and gain an understanding of how the parts fit together. In many ways this curriculum is designed to advance the boys toward a continued ministerial role in liturgy and sacred music. Upon graduating at the end of the eighth grade, the young men are encouraged to continue singing alongside the professional men of the Choir of St. Paul’s by auditioning to be choral scholars, even while attending another high school in the area.

1.3 Aspects of good, healthy vocal production are promoted during singing.

Introducing correct vocal training begins when a student walks through the door with little or no prior experience and evolves throughout his time at the choir school. The first goals are rudimentary items such as telling the boys to breathe and open their mouths in ways that are conducive for singing. Robinson describes, “These incredibly basic things that you think ‘Well they are coming to a choir school, they are going to know that you have to breathe to sing,’ but they do not.” Gradually work is done to increase the range, flexibility, and projection of the boys’ voices through vocal exercises and singing confidently on simple pieces. Robinson describes the process as boys progress through the program. “I see a gradual transition here that

---

50 Ibid.
when they come in they are very quiet. When they get to fifth grade, they are very loud. When they get to the sixth grade, we start to try and make it sound nice and not just really loud.”

Because of their tendency to be more unfamiliar with proper vocal technique and timid in the brand new setting, Robinson thinks the fourth grade probationers regularly need to be encouraged to engage their breath in order to “sing out.” It is also important to let them make some mistakes without stopping constantly to correct them so that they gain confidence in their singing. It is different with the older students who have a better mastery of vocal pedagogy and more experience overall; they are tasked to sing with increased nuance and degree of accuracy at all times. When the older boys are singing too enthusiastically and even pushing the tone slightly, usually because they are excited about the music they are singing, this is pulled back by asking them to sing passages gently on neutral syllables such as “oo” or “nn” before putting the music back together on the words.

Because the students sing so much throughout the day and their voices are perpetually warmed up, vocalises are used very judiciously at the beginning of each rehearsal. Aspects of vocal production and exercises are more often incorporated within the rehearsal of individual pieces as the opportunities arise. According to Robinson, “I find a lot of those things have to be addressed. But again, I do not really say well we are going to devote the next week to breathing. I just try to get it covered as we go and hope that they learn by osmosis from each other if things are going well.”

During rehearsal, I observed many instructions being given in regards to breath inhalation, tonal placement, phrasing, diction, jaw position, and other aspects of vocal

---

51 Ibid.
52 Ibid.
production. Students are noticeably engaged and energetic throughout each rehearsal, the entire duration of which they stand in rows at choir desks. Individual as well as constructive general comments are made to the students if they seem to be exhibiting bad or tense vocal habits – such as raising their shoulders. During rehearsals, students did exercises such as making sirens and singing passages on “moo” to increase resonance and reinforce a forward placement of the tone. At other times, students were asked to hum through an entire phrase in one breath, take a huge breath, then hum the next phrase to build better breathing and breath support. They were instructed to use a narrow stream of air without singing really loudly. Body movement while taking a preparatory breath before singing was encouraged in the same way that a violinist prepares his or her bow before playing. Exaggerated diction as well as text and syllabic accentuation were addressed to remind singers to convey the meaning and inflection of words to those listening.

Due to the boys’ rigorous schedule, private vocal and instrumental lessons (aside from piano) are not possible during the school day. According to Robinson, “A number of them do play orchestral instruments but it has to be organized outside of school.” ⁵³ When students express interest in taking after-school lessons, they are referred to a number of teachers in the Boston area, including the professional men in the choir who give private voice lessons. In the future it is possible that there will be a person on staff at the choir school to teach voice who will be able to work with students on a more individual basis. Robinson explains, “That is something

⁵³ Ibid.
very normal in an English choir school that there would be a voice coach as well as a choir director.\textsuperscript{54}

For now, boys develop singing skills within the context of the choir. Often the director models vocal concepts for the students. Falsetto is used exclusively with the probationers as this helps them find their head voice; the director demonstrates in both falsetto and his lower range with the older treble students. During rehearsal, the boys are given opportunities to sing passages individually. Sometimes volunteers are solicited and other times the director calls on students directly to serve as models. This not only assists in reinforcing concepts with the entire group, but it aids in building self-confidence and keeping individual singers invested in the group task. Robinson confirms, “I think they have an innate ability to discern quality in each other and they probably imitate each other.”\textsuperscript{55} When the music calls for occasional treble solos, one of the boys is selected to sing the solo. The professional men also have a strong impact on the way the boys are learning to sing. It is important that the hired adult singers exhibit healthy, proper vocal technique because the boys imitate and learn from what they hear around them. Solid technique and superb note-learning are prerequisites for the professional singers. Robinson attests, “If you are running a choir school like this, you cannot also try to educate adults as singers. Given the standard achieved by the boys at this point, the men have to be at a higher than average professional level in music reading and singing technique.”\textsuperscript{56}

\textsuperscript{54} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{55} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{56} Ibid.
The tonal philosophy at St. Paul’s Choir School is grounded in the English “continental” school of vocal pedagogy, characterized by a distinctively vibrant, colorful, expressive, bass-heavy sound among the sections. While neither employing as much use of chest voice nor necessarily trying to make them sound like a British choir, models such as Westminster Cathedral, London, and St. John’s College, Cambridge, represent the ideal sound Robinson has in his ears as he works on developing the boys’ voices. The director of music at St. John’s College, Cambridge, George Guest, established this “continental” sound during his forty-year tenure. In contrast, the rival King’s College, Cambridge under David Willcocks came to be associated more with the English hooty, top-heavy, less expressive, straight tone sound. Robinson describes the sound he wants to emulate as

More emotionally mature; it is more sort of like an adult would sing. I would encourage warm vibrato, phrasing and textual clarity. Understand we are not really achieving any of it [yet], but these are things to aim at. I would veer away from the sort of pale white sound – which actually is not how Willcock’s choir sounded at all; they are an amazing choir. But I think it had a lot of spin off and imitators who created fairly drab results and a lot of early music groups thought for some reason that must be how early music should sound if it was how boys sounded; and it was a sort of a vicious circle of stylistic malaise.\textsuperscript{57}

Winchester Cathedral in England and St. Thomas Fifth Avenue in New York are other choirs that Robinson holds as good models to imitate for sound and expressivity.

The Choristers from St. Paul’s Choir School recently had the opportunity to sing alongside the Vienna Boys’ Choir in concert, which afforded the rare occasion for comparison with the German-Austrian tonal philosophy. A music critic observing the performance noted the contrasting philosophies between the two vocal approaches:

\textsuperscript{57} Ibid.
The VBC singers sang with the corners of their mouths held wider, while the SPCS boys singing dropped the jaw more, producing very different vowel sounds. How they navigated between registers was also quite different. The VBC boys sang with a pronounced difference between upper and lower registers, with something of a “pop” when an upward shift occurred – but the resulting high notes floated with a loud, clear, and ethereal quality. The SPCS singers approached their register shifts with more weight and produced a more blended transition and a beefier sound overall.  

As divisi is called for in the treble and mixed repertoire, the boys occasionally split into two or three parts (e.g., in Britten’s Ceremony of Carols and Mathias’s Sir Christèmas). But often there is no distinction between higher (soprano) and lower (alto) voices among the boys, because they all sing the top voice part in the mixed repertoire. The professional men of the choir sing the alto, tenor, and bass parts. As a result, as is typical with soprano parts in this kind of repertoire, it is common to have all students singing up to high A above the treble staff or beyond on a regular basis. The result is a heavier, fuller, more robust sound in the upper head register, which is very akin to the strength of the lower chest register with no audible break detectable when transitioning between the two. When the boys are singing aggressively enough, it is easy for the eighteen boys to overpower the nine to twelve men.

1.4 Music reading skills are developed.

Choosing repertoire that builds confidence in reading music and that gradually gets the boys singing more difficult pieces is the basic philosophy for developing music reading skills. Robinson explains, “Even if it is a very simple Alleluia that they all know from their parish

---

churches when they arrive, if they are reading it off the page, they will start to associate those sounds with what is on the page. And this would all be combined with music theory at the same time. I think that is essential that they have theory so they can understand what is going on.\textsuperscript{59}

According to Robinson, musicianship evolves alongside this reading eventually:

\begin{quote}
It is very difficult to make them read a new piece and sing it musically. And when we come back to a piece with very young boys that they have done before there is a real sense of relief in them that they can finally do something they like and it is nice to do and it is not slogging through another piece of plainsong they have never heard before. So it is always trying to balance the two things out.\textsuperscript{60}
\end{quote}

When a new or fairly new piece of music is sung in rehearsal, the boys are asked to identify the possible keys a piece could be in according to the key signature. Two answers are always given initially as possibilities: the major key and its relative minor. Next the students are asked to determine how they will get their starting pitch, whether or not it is in the organ part, and how many beats they should count before they sing. The director asks for a volunteer to sing the first note or interval. Most of the students are able to identify the letter name of pitches, identify the different intervals (e.g., A\# up to C\# is a minor third), and actually sing the intervals. The students have songs associated with each type of interval, which helps them. A number system where 1 indicates the first scale degree, 2 indicates the second, and so on, along with the ability to identifying intervals, are the main tools in the boys’ arsenal for reading music. Solfège syllables, hand signs, and rhythm syllables are not used for reading music at the choir school. Some of the boys have perfect pitch. The piano is used only occasionally during rehearsal to double the voice parts, and the conductor regularly snaps the beat or emphasizes the cut-offs so

\textsuperscript{59} Robinson, interview.

\textsuperscript{60} Ibid.
the boys are learning the pieces with a high sense of rhythmic accuracy. Overall, singing in the rehearsals is exceptionally accurate.

As part of the music reading process, students are engaged in critical thinking to determine a basic music analysis of the pieces they are singing. For example, when two particular phrases are similar yet not exactly the same in a piece, students must discover what musical aspect has been altered in order to be cognizant of what they must do differently on each occasion. On melismatic passages in works such as G. F. Handel’s Let Their Celestial Concerts All Unite, a few specific sections are rehearsed slowly to solidify the tuning of half steps and other intervals before the passage is repeated at tempo. Often the fourth graders will put their finger on a note to demonstrate that they have been following along correctly in the music and are in the right place, then the fifth graders check to see if they are correct. Occasionally the fifth graders point to the correct location if they sense that the younger students are lost. In this way, the older students assist and serve as role models that the younger students can imitate. I witnessed some of the fifth graders writing reminders and circling things in the probationers’ scores. Sometimes the probationers are asked to sing passages by themselves so they become more independent and not as reliant on the fifth graders. In general, the Trebles mostly learn to sing unison and two-part SS or SA repertoire. The Choristers employ mostly two- to three- part treble repertoire and SATB mixed pieces with the Choir of St. Paul’s. The Schola sings mostly three-part TBB music.

To further strengthen the boys’ music reading skills and ability to learn repertoire in the choral setting, an extensive five-year curriculum in music theory, piano, and aural skills is offered. For this training, the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music (ABRSM) music
theory curriculum and piano sequence has been adopted. Though there are eight levels to the program, most choir schools complete up through level five, which corresponds to St. Paul’s Choir School where students complete one level per year on average. Because of the allowance for individual pacing, some students at St. Paul’s Choir School do achieve beyond the fifth level. The theory classes use the workbook *Music Theory in Practice*, which is designed to teach students about rhythmic values, time signatures, pitches on the stave, scales, intervals, key signatures, and musical terms and signs. Each level builds on the content in the previous level and presents increasingly difficult material. For example, Level 1 includes major keys up to one flat and two sharps, Level 2 includes major keys up to two flats and three sharps plus minor keys up to one sharp or flat, Level 3 includes major and minor keys up to four flats and sharps, etc. By the time students reach Level 5 they are expected to be skilled at working with irregular time signatures, identifying notes in treble, alto, tenor, and bass clefs, beginning orchestration, composition and harmonic analysis skills, and all major and minor scales and key signatures up to six flats and sharps. In the fourth and fifth grades there is aural reinforcement of concepts in the theory classes; the older students receive so much aural training in choir and piano lessons that most of the theory they do is in the form of written work.

Each student has a half-hour private piano lesson each week in which they also develop aural skills. Four workbooks are used for piano instruction. *Piano Exam Pieces* includes two-hand keyboard repertoire by classical and English composers such as Alec Rowley, Richard

---

Rodney Bennett, Lennox Berkeley, and Frank Bridge.62 Piano Scales and Arpeggios are technique books for practicing scales and arpeggios.63 Specimen Sight-Reading Tests contain two-hand sight-reading examples for practice.64 Specimen Aural Tests provide musical examples to be played by the teacher while the student is asked to identify, describe, demonstrate, play, and sing various musical aspects.65 Again there are eight levels in the piano workbooks. Many benefits occur as a result of this piano study: gaining familiarity with bass clef, the reinforcement of reading printed musical notation, the refinement of physical hand-eye coordination, the development of harmonic concepts and reading multiple staves, independence as a musician, rhythmic pulse, and intervallic identification. Singing is used in the piano lesson to reinforce musical concepts on occasion. Upon completing Level 5 piano, the student may have the option of beginning organ lessons with the director of music.

1.5 A wide spectrum of musical literature, particularly those songs of the Sunday liturgy, is employed during musical training.

Because each choir at St. Paul’s is primarily a liturgical choir, nearly everything they prepare is for use in liturgy; only occasionally do the choirs learn additional works for concert

---


performances. The boys sing an entire body of music which represents the church’s treasure of choral music. Encompassing over a millennium of sacred works, the choirs spend the majority of their time and effort preparing the pieces they sing alone during the liturgies: a Magnificat, an entrance chant, Kyrie and Agnus Dei settings, and one anthem for each Mass. On Sunday mornings, the Choir of St. Paul’s additionally sings a Gloria setting, one other anthem, and the communion chant (men only). The number of pieces rehearsed in a single class period is impressive – usually averaging around seven pieces but sometimes as many as twelve. Since “note learning” is typically not needed, the rehearsal pacing moves quickly. The students are encouraged to strive towards perfection in pitch and rhythmic accuracy on the first run-through. In some part, the high success rate and pacing in rehearsals can be attributed to the practice of singing music they already know due to the fairly regular repetition of much of the repertoire. Some Mass settings and anthems are repeated as much as a dozen times throughout the year. For pieces they sing in liturgy that same day, they often do a quick review or spot check specific sections, but rarely is it necessary to run familiar pieces from beginning to end or at least not rehearse at length. Overall the Trebles tend to need longer amounts of time rehearsing the chant and their other pieces since they are much less familiar with the repertoire. The choir school has a repertory of over 150 choral works, including thirty-five choral Masses, which the various choirs employ throughout the liturgical year. This repertoire will be discussed further in sections 3-5.

In addition, the boys participate in the congregational singing of the hymns, responses, acclamations, psalms, and Mass parts. To join in the congregational participation, the choirs use the same resources during liturgies as the congregants. Four printed sources are used during the
Mass: 1) *Hymns, Psalms, and Spiritual Canticles, second edition* is a hymnal produced in-house by Theodore Marier in 1983. This hymnal is the parish’s exclusive source for hymns and contains traditional melodies from the sixteenth to the twentieth centuries set in four-part harmony. Original hymn melodies and harmonizations by Marier as well as many scores in choral voicing are including, making this resource much more than a standard congregational hymnal. 2) *Music for the Holy Sacrifice of the Mass* is a resource of congregational Mass settings produced in-house by John Robinson in 2011 reflecting changes in the new English translations. The 2011 English chant settings from the Roman Missal are used by the congregation for all sung responses, acclamations, and Masses. All chants in *Music for the Holy Sacrifice of the Mass* have organ accompaniment parts and have been converted into modern notation, as opposed to neumes, for easier reading by the congregation. Four settings comprise the Masses used by the congregation throughout the year: one English and two Latin chant settings, plus one non-chant setting in English by Theodore Marier. *Alleluia* verses and psalms with pointing comprise the second half of the book. 3) *Liturgy of the Word* is a resource containing Mass texts-only published by World Library Publications. 4) A two-sided printed card containing spoken congregational responses reflecting the new translations is also found in the pews at St. Paul’s Church. During weekdays, hymn numbers, the Mass number (1, 2, 3, or 4), and the psalm number is posted on hymn board in the front for everyone to see. On Sunday

---


morning, there is also a worship leaflet containing an outline of the Mass for the day with hymn
numbers and translations of choral pieces. For Vespers, the choir and congregation use a spiral
book, which has been compiled in-house, containing psalms and all the various parts of the
liturgy. The psalm antiphons are freely composed by Gethsemani Abbey and composers such as
James A. Burns and Francis Kulash, while the verses are set to the Gregorian psalm tones. For
Vespers there are four rotations of psalms for Ordinary Time: week 1, week 2, week 3, and
week 4. For the seasons of Advent, Lent, Easter, and on Holy Days, different psalms particular
to the day or season are used. With the exception of reviewing the pointing of the psalm and
Gospel verses of the day, the congregational music and responses are generally familiar enough
to the boys that it does not need to be reviewed in rehearsal.

Standard #2:
Gregorian chant is given pride of place in liturgical services.

2.1 Choirs and congregations are exposed to hearing live chant in the liturgy and singing a
minimum repertory of this chant.

Participating daily in a variety of liturgical chants at St. Paul’s Church, the congregation
possesses proficiency in Mass Ordinaries, responses, hymns, and the Gregorian psalm tones. As
referenced in section 1.5, three of the Ordinary Mass settings the congregation sings are chant
settings – one being the new English plainsong setting published by the International
Commission on English in the Liturgy for 2010 The Roman Missal. The second setting is the
standard Latin chant Mass specified in Sing to the Lord: Kyrie XVI, Gloria VIII, Credo III,
Sanctus XVIII, and Agnus Dei XVIII. The third, a more difficult Latin setting, is the Kyrie,
Sanctus, and Agnus Dei from Mass XVII. According to Robinson, “The actual responses [the greeting, the penitential rite, the preface dialogue, the Memorial Acclamation, the doxology and Great Amen, the Lord’s Prayer and embolism, the blessing, and the dismissal] have always been in English at St. Paul’s since 1963.” The new English chants of the Roman Missal are currently used for all of these responses. A few other chants, including some of the hymns specified in the Sacred Congregation for Divine Worship’s Jubilate Deo, are also part of the congregation’s repertory and are contained in the parish hymnal, Hymns, Psalms, and Spiritual Canticles. The congregation sings these as indicated in the hymnal with English texts, modern musical notation, and organ accompaniment: Adoro te devote, Ubi caritas, Pange lingua, Tantum ergo, and Veni creator Spiritus. Many of these are also printed in the hymnal with the original Latin text, providing the possibility for occasional use in Latin. At both Mass and Vespers, the congregation joins the choir in singing the psalm verses antiphonally in English using Gregorian chant psalm tones 1-8. More Latin chants have not been programmed congregationally because, as Robinson explains, “We have a very migrant congregation here, so you never know who is going to be here. It is very difficult to know what they know and what they do not know.”

In addition to participating in all of the congregational chants, the choristers present other forms of live chant in liturgy and concerts. The set of chants prescribed to the boys on the most regular basis are the entrance chants for Sunday Mass from the Graduale Romanum. In order to

---

69 Robinson, interview.


71 Robinson, interview.
practice and refine these difficult chants, the boys sing the same chant each day at daily Mass (Tuesday through Friday) leading up to each Sunday. On Sunday mornings (and for the Saturday vigil), the boys sing the entrance chant from the choir loft without organ accompaniment and then proceed downstairs to join the procession as the opening hymn is sung. Reproduced from the online Corpus Christi Watershed chant database, this source provides the added benefits of giving the boys an English translation of the chant and entire Gloria Patri portion fully written on the page the singers are using.  

English translations included in the boys’ music packets, along with chant notation help the boys experience these chants authentically and develop a better understanding of how these texts announce each subsequent feast or liturgical day. During the Sunday Mass, the boys chant the antiphon, the men chant the verse, and then both conclude by singing the Gloria Patri. The antiphon is not repeated again at the end. The men of the choir sing the communion chant each Sunday. Likewise, the boys know some of the major sequences (Victimae paschali laudes, Veni Sancte Spiritus, and Lauda, Sion), Marian antiphons (Alma Redemptoris mater, Ave Regina caelorum, Regina coeli, and Salve Regina), and other Latin chants such as Ave maris stella, Tu es Petrus, Ubi caritas, and Salve Mater misericordiae.  

---


73 Robinson, interview.
2.2 Teachers possess effective methods of teaching and promoting chant.

Besides training students in Latin and modern musical notation, teachers must possess effective methods for helping the boys learn to read and follow neume notation while singing plainchant. During rehearsals, the piano provides a simple modal harmonic accompaniment to help keep the chant going, particularly when the boys are singing a chant that is relatively new or unfamiliar to them. For the weekday Masses, the organ may accompany the boys softly until they gain confidence with a particular chant as the week progresses. The school formerly used a modified version of the Ward Method along with Marier’s techniques in teaching students to sing chant within their choir rehearsals. Presently no such approaches are used, rather students apply a transposable fixed DO system where the C clef is identified as scale degree one and the F clef as scale degree four (FA). No matter which mode the chant is in, the half steps are thus always between scale degrees three and four as well as seven and eight. In the entrance chant *Dignus est Agnus*, for example, the beginning pitches would be three-three-four.

---

Fig. 3.3. ‘Dignus est Agnus’ from *Graduale Romanum*\textsuperscript{74}

---

\textsuperscript{74} Corpus Christi Watershed, “Introit Christ the King,” Corpus Christi Watershed Website, accessed 1 February 2014, http://www.ccwatershed.org/media/pdfs/13/02/16/19-11-54_0.pdf.
Chants are transposed when needed to better suit the tessitura of the boys’ voices. As modal ear training exercises, the students start on scale degree two and sing up the eight-note scale until they reach the high scale degree two, all the while keeping the half steps between scale degrees three-four and seven-eight. The same is done likewise on scale degrees three, four, five, etc. Sometimes the boys sing the chant on numbers rather than the Latin text to emphasize music reading. Each student is encouraged to be a leader by locking their eyes onto the music and following along with each note while chanting. The boys are taught to count rhythmic durations and rests such as adding one beat to a note preceding *a quilisma* (a note indicated by a squiggly symbol which occurs within a grouping of neumes), resting for one beat at a half bar, resting for two beats at a full bar, and not breathing at the quarter bar indications.

The program at St. Paul’s preserves and promotes the use of Gregorian chant regularly through liturgical music the congregation sings, chants and motets the choir sings, and organ improvisations during the liturgy that incorporate chant motives. For example, after singing a modern choral setting of *Ave verum corpus* by Colin Mawby for Communion, the organist prolonged the textual and theological idea by improvising on the chant setting of the same name. Chant-based motets, such as Maurice Duruflé’s *Ubi caritas* and *Tantum ergo*, are incorporated frequently. The philosophy of the choir school is for students to develop the ability to sing this ancient part of the church’s tradition well, so that they cultivate both an enthusiasm for it and an appreciation for the influence it had on sacred music thereafter. The students are able to connect
with chant and use it as a vehicle for prayer, explains Robinson, “Because it transcends all sorts of different backgrounds and things.”

Standard #3:
*Sacred polyphony is included in liturgical celebrations.*

3.1 The singing of polyphony is employed by the choir, or other capable individuals, in liturgical and non-liturgical celebrations at times for the benefit of the ecclesial community.

Standards 3-5 of this study will discuss the sacred treasure as it relates to choral repertoire sung at St. Paul’s Choir School. After collecting the music list of all sung choral works in 2013 from these four choirs, a data base of 147 works was the result. Fig. 3.4 reflects the number of works that are represented by each historical period. The composer that was most frequently performed among the choirs in that era is listed as the most represented composer. Of the 147 works, thirty-one are from the Renaissance, thirteen are from the Baroque, seven are from the Rococo and Classical periods, thirty-two are from the Romantic/Cecilian/Oxford era, forty-two are from the twentieth century, and twenty-two represent compositions by living composers.

---

75 Robinson, interview.

Renaissance polyphony comprises thirty-one out of the 147 choral works, or twenty-one percent of the school’s repertory (see Fig. 3.4 above). The Choir of St. Paul’s, the mixed-voice ensemble, engaged this body of repertoire with the highest frequency, performing it for Mass on Sundays and holy days. The motets, anthems, and antiphons were used most often during the Offertory and Communion time, while eight polyphonic Mass settings were used for the Kyrie, Gloria, and Agnus Dei parts of the Ordinary. The complete list of Renaissance pieces is below (see Fig. 3.5). Though polyphonic music was performed sporadically throughout Ordinary Time and the season of Advent, the highest concentrations occurred during Lent, Holy Week, and on solemnities such as All Saints and Pentecost. A number of the motets, anthems, and carols,
particularly the Christmas ones, were performed in non-liturgical settings as part of concerts. Tomás Luis de Victoria, Giovanni Pierluigi da Palestrina, William Byrd, and Thomas Tallis are the main composers represented in the choir school’s list of repertoire. The English Renaissance is most represented with five composers, while the Italian tradition is also rather highly represented with four composers. The choir school performed several other works in 2013 by later composers that have not been included here, such as Orlando Gibbons, Antonio Lotti, Anton Bruckner, Charles Stanford, Richard Terry, and Maurice Duruflé, that are characteristic of this Renaissance *a cappella* style.

![Fig. 3.5. Choral repertoire in 2013: Renaissance polyphony (31 out of 147 works) = 21%](image)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHOIR</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>COMPOSER</th>
<th>VOICING</th>
<th>GENRE</th>
<th>TEXT</th>
<th>USE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>There Is No Rose</td>
<td>Anonymous Medieval</td>
<td>TBB</td>
<td>carol</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>O Jesu Christe</td>
<td>Berchem, Jacquet de</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Ave verum corpus</td>
<td>Byrd, William</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>hymn</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Mass for Five Voices</td>
<td>Byrd, William</td>
<td>SATTB</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Mass for Four Voices</td>
<td>Byrd, William</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>O sacrum convivium</td>
<td>Byrd, William</td>
<td>ATTB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>When to the Temple Mary Went</td>
<td>Eccard, Johannes</td>
<td>SSATBB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Omnes de Saba venient</td>
<td>Handl, Jacob</td>
<td>SATTB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Missa sobre las voces</td>
<td>Morales, Cristóbal de</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>A New Commandment</td>
<td>Mundy, William</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Ego sum panis vivus</td>
<td>Palestrina, Giovanni P.</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>antiphon</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHOIR</td>
<td>TITLE</td>
<td>COMPOSER</td>
<td>VOICING</td>
<td>GENRE</td>
<td>TEXT</td>
<td>USE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Missa brevis</td>
<td>Palestrina, Giovanni P.</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Missa sine nomine à 4</td>
<td>Palestrina, Giovanni P.</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Sicut cervus desiderat</td>
<td>Palestrina, Giovanni P.</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Super flumina Babylonis</td>
<td>Palestrina, Giovanni P.</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>antiphon</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Ave Maria</td>
<td>Parsons, Robert</td>
<td>SAATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Lo, How a Rose e’er Blooming</td>
<td>Praetorius, Michael</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>carol</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>If Ye Love Me</td>
<td>Tallis, Thomas</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Loquebantur variis linguis</td>
<td>Tallis, Thomas</td>
<td>SSATTBB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Salvator mundi</td>
<td>Tallis, Thomas</td>
<td>SATTB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Verily, verily</td>
<td>Tallis, Thomas</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Dum transisset sabbatum</td>
<td>Taverner, John</td>
<td>SATBB</td>
<td>antiphon</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Ascensorum Dominum</td>
<td>Trombetti, Ascanio</td>
<td>SSAATTBB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH,SC,CSP</td>
<td>Exsultate justi in Domino</td>
<td>Viadana, Lodovico</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Missa L’hora passa</td>
<td>Viadana, Lodovico</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH,SC,CSP</td>
<td>Gaudent in coelis</td>
<td>Victoria, Tomás Luis de</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Hosanna filio David</td>
<td>Victoria, Tomás Luis de</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>antiphon</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Missa O quam gloriosum</td>
<td>Victoria, Tomás Luis de</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Missa quarti toni</td>
<td>Victoria, Tomás Luis de</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>O magnum mysterium</td>
<td>Victoria, Tomás Luis de</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH,SC,CSP</td>
<td>O quam gloriosum</td>
<td>Victoria, Tomás Luis de</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

With the men and boys at St. Paul’s, a unique opportunity is provided for polyphony to be performed as it was originally intended when written by composers of the Renaissance period. Since women and girls would not have been allowed to sing in church, the performance of these works by men and boys affords listeners the occasion to hear this music as reflected by performance practice of the time. As Robinson states, “The unique sound of a boys’ choir is particularly fascinating to work with, because we know it is the sound that composers had in their ears when they were conceiving much of the music.” This opportunity is afforded the parishioners of St. Paul’s on a weekly basis, while some institutions, such as Westminster Abbey, are able to execute this type of repertoire daily. To do likewise at St. Paul’s would mean some substantial changes to the current situation. Robinson explains, “It would mean a massive budgetary increase if we were to try to have men singing at all of our services as well as boys. Second, we do not have evening liturgy at St. Paul’s to serve, and of course, serving the liturgy is our main aim.” Parishioners at St. Paul’s have become accustomed to the long-standing tradition of treble-only repertoire on weekdays. The boys have an expansive enough repertory of quality treble music that they are able to fulfill the demands of these liturgies and utilize more elaborate polyphonic works to confer increased solemnity on Sundays and holy days for the benefit of the ecclesial community.

---

77 Valente, “Boston Boy Choir.”

78 Robinson, interview.
Standard #4:  
The treasure of sacred music is preserved and fostered with great care.

4.1 The singing of all the different types of sacred music that exist within the church treasury (e.g., Masses, antiphons, motets, anthems, hymns, cantatas, oratorios) is employed by the choir, or other individuals, in liturgical and non-liturgical celebrations for the glory of God and sanctification of the faithful.

Aside from the twenty-one percent of Renaissance works already discussed and the fifteen percent of pieces by living composers which will be discussed in section five, music from the Baroque, Rococo, Classical, Romantic, Cecilian, Oxford, and twentieth century periods comprises the remaining sixty-four percent (see Fig. 3.6-3.9). Masses, requiems, antiphons, motets, anthems, carols, hymns, canticles, cantatas, and oratorios are among the genres represented. On occasion, larger works such as the Requiem settings of Fauré or Duruflé were sung in their entirety within the liturgy at St. Paul’s. Other times, works that were less suited to the liturgical form were made available as part of the parish’s annual concert series. The choir school and guest artists perform an average of twenty concerts at St. Paul’s each season including works such as Monteverdi’s Vespers of 1610, Britten’s A Ceremony of Carols, and Vaughan Williams’s Five Mystical Songs. Recitals featuring sacred organ works are also part of this series. 79 Through exposure to sacred works, in both liturgical and non-liturgical settings, that have become such an important part of the church’s treasure, the faithful are lead to encounters with the divine that transcend their normal daily experiences.

The Baroque period, comprising nine percent of all choral works, is characterized by music of two styles (see Fig. 3.6). Many composers continued to write a cappella polyphonic

music in the *prima pratica*, or Palestrina church style, while at the same time many cultivated the *concertato* style of the *seconda pratica* featuring monody with basso continuo. Such pieces, reflecting a single melody line or duet with chordal accompaniment, work particularly well with treble voices. As a result, we find the Trebles and the Choristers engaging this body of repertoire with the highest frequency, performing it with organ during the Communion time on weekday Masses. The English, such as Henry Purcell, George F. Handel, and Orlando Gibbons, are again the most represented composers of the choir school’s repertory in this era. As a result, the texts are generally in English as well.
Fig. 3.6. Choral repertoire in 2013: Baroque (13 out of 147 works) = 9%

CH = Choristers; CSP = Choir of St. Paul’s; SC = Schola; TR = Trebles
DO = Divine Office; M = Mass; NL = Non-liturgical

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHOIR</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>COMPOSER</th>
<th>VOICING</th>
<th>GENRE</th>
<th>TEXT</th>
<th>USE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CH,TR</td>
<td>O Little One Sweet</td>
<td>Bach, J. S. (harm. by)</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>carol</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH,TR</td>
<td>Sub tuum praesidium</td>
<td>Charpentier, M.-A.</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Almighty and Everlasting God</td>
<td>Gibbons, Orlando</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH,TR</td>
<td>Drop, Drop, Slow Tears</td>
<td>Gibbons, Orlando</td>
<td>SATB or unison, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>This is the Record of John</td>
<td>Gibbons, Orlando</td>
<td>SAATB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH,TR</td>
<td>Angels Ever Bright and Fair</td>
<td>Handel, G. F.</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>oratorio</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Let Their Celestial Concerts All Unite</td>
<td>Handel, G. F.</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>oratorio</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH,TR</td>
<td>O mysterium ineffabile</td>
<td>Lalouette, Jean F.</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Messe à tre voci</td>
<td>Lotti, Antonio</td>
<td>TTB</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH,TR</td>
<td>Sound the Trumpet</td>
<td>Purcell, Henry</td>
<td>2 equal vv, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Thou knowest, O Lord</td>
<td>Purcell, Henry</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Remember, O Thou Man</td>
<td>Ravenscroft, Thomas</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH,TR</td>
<td>Laudamus te</td>
<td>Vivaldi, Antonio</td>
<td>SA, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Rococo and Classical periods, comprising five percent, represents the smallest number of choral works performed from any era (see Fig. 3.7). As a result, we find the Choir of St. Paul’s, the most advanced mixed ensemble, performing the bulk of these Masses only for holy days and High Mass on Sundays, often accompanied by organ, rather than orchestra. The Kyrie, Gloria, and Agnus Dei movements were extracted from these settings and sung chorally during the Mass. Though the Masses were performed sporadically throughout Ordinary Time and the season of Advent, the highest concentration occurred during the season of Easter and on major solemnities such as Christ the King, Easter, and Trinity Sunday. The First Viennese School, consisting of such composers as Franz Schubert, Franz Joseph Haydn, and Wolfgang A. Mozart, represent the repertoire from this period almost exclusively. The texts utilize church Latin rather than any type of vernacular adaptation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHOIR</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>COMPOSER</th>
<th>VOICING</th>
<th>GENRE</th>
<th>TEXT</th>
<th>USE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CH,TR</td>
<td>Stabat Mater</td>
<td>Pergolesi, Giovanni B.</td>
<td>SA, org.</td>
<td>hymn</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Krönungsmesse</td>
<td>Mozart, Wolfgang A.</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH,CSP</td>
<td>Laudate Dominum</td>
<td>Mozart, Wolfgang A.</td>
<td>choir, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Spatzenmesse</td>
<td>Mozart, Wolfgang A.</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TR</td>
<td>Ave Maria</td>
<td>Schubert, Franz</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Mass in G</td>
<td>Schubert, Franz</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Romantic period, with its concurrent Cecilian and Oxford movements in church music, comprises twenty-two percent of works performed by the choir school (see Fig. 3.8). The ideas behind these movements inspired a number of composers to produce works that are particularly appropriate for the liturgy. As a result, this music is used often by each of the choirs at St. Paul’s during both daily and Sunday Mass. A wide variety of voicings, genres, and texts are represented by the music of this period; requiems become a particularly popular genre. Several Masses of Josef Rheinberger, who incidentally rejected the Cecilian aesthetic, are also represented in the repertory of the treble choirs.

Fig. 3.8. Choral repertoire in 2013: Romantic/Cecilian Movement/Oxford Movement (32 out of 147 works) = 22%

CH = Choristers; CSP = Choir of St. Paul’s; SC = Schola; TR = Trebles
DO = Divine Office; M = Mass; NL = Non-liturgical

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHOIR</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>COMPOSER</th>
<th>VOICING</th>
<th>GENRE</th>
<th>TEXT</th>
<th>USE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Geistliches Lied</td>
<td>Brahms, Johannes</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>German</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Wie lieblich sind deine Wohnungen</td>
<td>Brahms, Johannes</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>requiem</td>
<td>German</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Ave Maria</td>
<td>Bruckner, Anton</td>
<td>SAATTBB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>The Three Kings</td>
<td>Cornelius, Peter</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Ave verum corpus</td>
<td>Elgar, Edward</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>hymn</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH,TR,SC</td>
<td>Messe basse</td>
<td>Fauré, Gabriel</td>
<td>SSA, org.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TR</td>
<td>Pie Jesu</td>
<td>Fauré, Gabriel</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>requiem</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Requiem</td>
<td>Fauré, Gabriel</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>requiem</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH,TR,SC,CSP</td>
<td>Panis angelicus</td>
<td>Franck, César</td>
<td>choir, org.</td>
<td>hymn</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Ave maris stella</td>
<td>Grieg, Edvard</td>
<td>SATB (divisi)</td>
<td>hymn</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Hear my Prayer</td>
<td>Mendelssohn, Felix</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHOIR</td>
<td>TITLE</td>
<td>COMPOSER</td>
<td>VOICING</td>
<td>GENRE</td>
<td>TEXT</td>
<td>USE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Then shall a Star</td>
<td>Mendelssohn, Felix</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>oratorio</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>I was Glad</td>
<td>Parry, Charles H. H.</td>
<td>SSATTB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Bogoroditsye Dyevo</td>
<td>Rachmaninoff, Sergei</td>
<td>SATB (divisi)</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Slavonic</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Ave verum corpus</td>
<td>Saint-Saëns, Camille</td>
<td>SA, org.</td>
<td>hymn</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>I saw the Lord</td>
<td>Stainer, John</td>
<td>double choir, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH,TR</td>
<td>A Song of Wisdom</td>
<td>Stanford, Charles V.</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Justorum animae</td>
<td>Stanford, Charles V.</td>
<td>SATB (divisi)</td>
<td>antiphon</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>O for a Closer Walk</td>
<td>Stanford, Charles V.</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>The Crown of Roses</td>
<td>Tchaikovsky, Pyotr</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Hymn to Jesus</td>
<td>Terry, Richard R.</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Let All the World</td>
<td>Vaughan Williams, R.</td>
<td>solo, SATB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Love bade me welcome</td>
<td>Vaughan Williams, R.</td>
<td>solo, SATB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Rise, Heart</td>
<td>Vaughan Williams, R.</td>
<td>solo, SATB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH,TR,SC</td>
<td>The Call</td>
<td>Vaughan Williams, R.</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>hymn</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH,TR,SC</td>
<td>Mater ora Filium</td>
<td>Wood, Charles</td>
<td>SS, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Lat./Eng.</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Comm. Phrygian Mode</td>
<td>Wood, Charles</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Music from the twentieth century represents twenty-eight percent, the largest category performed by the choir school (see Fig. 3.9). The Choristers and Trebles engaged this body of repertoire with the highest frequency, performing the Mass settings, anthems, and motets with organ accompaniment during the Ordinary and Communion of the Mass on weekdays. The Kyrie and Agnus Dei movements are extracted from these settings to be sung chorally. Five settings of the Magnificat canticle were performed on a rotating basis throughout the year during Wednesday and special Vespers liturgies, particularly those of Herbert Sumson. A number of the Christmas anthems and carols were performed in non-liturgical settings as part of concerts. Benjamin Britten’s cantata A Ceremony of Carols is an example of a larger work performed outside of the liturgy to promote spirituality. The majority of the composers on the list are English, Herbert Howells being the most represented of these composers. France and the United States are also well represented, including the choir school’s founder, Theodore Marier. Latin Mass settings by Jean Langlais and Flor Peeters are heavily employed in liturgy by the choirs. A wide variety of voicings, genres, and texts are represented by the music of this period overall.
Fig. 3.9. Choral repertoire in 2013: twentieth century (42 out of 147 works) = 28%

CH = Choristers; CSP = Choir of St. Paul’s; SC = Schola; TR = Trebles
DO = Divine Office; M = Mass; NL = Non-liturgical

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHOIR</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>COMPOSER</th>
<th>VOICING</th>
<th>GENRE</th>
<th>TEXT</th>
<th>USE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CH,TR</td>
<td>Missa sponsa Christi</td>
<td>Andriessen, H.</td>
<td>3 equal vv, org.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Jesu, the Very Thought of Thee</td>
<td>Bairstow, Edward</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Angels We Have Heard on High</td>
<td>Barnes, E. (arr.)</td>
<td>ATB</td>
<td>carol</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH</td>
<td>A Ceremony of Carols</td>
<td>Britten, Benjamin</td>
<td>SSA, harp</td>
<td>cantata</td>
<td>Old Eng.</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH,TR</td>
<td>Missa Brevis in D</td>
<td>Britten, Benjamin</td>
<td>SSA, org.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH,TR</td>
<td>In the Bleak Midwinter</td>
<td>Darke, Harold</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>carol</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH,TR</td>
<td>Fairest Lord Jesus</td>
<td>DeLong, Richard</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Pie Jesu</td>
<td>Duruflé, Maurice</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>requiem</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Tantum ergo</td>
<td>Duruflé, Maurice</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>hymn</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Ubi caritas</td>
<td>Duruflé, Maurice</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>hymn</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Magnificat in C minor</td>
<td>Dyson, George</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>canticle</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Tomorrow Shall be My Dancing Day</td>
<td>Gardner, John</td>
<td>SATB, piano, perc.</td>
<td>carol</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH</td>
<td>The Little Road to Bethlehem</td>
<td>Head, Michael</td>
<td>unison, piano</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>A Spotless Rose</td>
<td>Howells, Herbert</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Comm Service Collegium Regale</td>
<td>Howells, Herbert</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TR,SC,CSP</td>
<td>Hymn to St. Cecilia</td>
<td>Howells, Herbert</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH,TR,SC,CSP</td>
<td>My Eyes For Beauty Pine</td>
<td>Howells, Herbert</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>St. Paul’s Service</td>
<td>Howells, Herbert</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>canticle</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Greater love</td>
<td>Ireland, John</td>
<td>SATB(divisi),org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH,TR</td>
<td>Patapan</td>
<td>Jacques, R. (arr.)</td>
<td>SS, piano</td>
<td>carol</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH,TR</td>
<td>Messe d’Escalquens</td>
<td>Langlais, Jean</td>
<td>2 equal vv, org.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHOIR</td>
<td>TITLE</td>
<td>COMPOSER</td>
<td>VOICING</td>
<td>GENRE</td>
<td>TEXT</td>
<td>USE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Messe Solennelle</td>
<td>Langlais, Jean</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH, TR</td>
<td>Missa in simplicitate</td>
<td>Langlais, Jean</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH</td>
<td>God is Ascended</td>
<td>Leighton, Kenneth</td>
<td>SS or SA, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH, TR</td>
<td>O sacrum convivium</td>
<td>Leighton, Kenneth</td>
<td>SS, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>E’en So, Lord Jesus, Quickly Come</td>
<td>Manz, Paul</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Missa Brevis</td>
<td>Marier, Theodore</td>
<td>cong.,SATB,org.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH, TR</td>
<td>Missa Emmanuel</td>
<td>Marier, Theodore</td>
<td>3-part, org.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Welcome, Yule</td>
<td>Mathias, William</td>
<td>SSA, piano, perc.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Sir Christêmas</td>
<td>Mathias, William</td>
<td>SSATB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>O sacrum convivium</td>
<td>Messiaen, Olivier</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Be Strong in the Lord</td>
<td>Nicholson, Sydney</td>
<td>SS, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH, TR</td>
<td>Wedding Anthem</td>
<td>Oliver, Stephen</td>
<td>2-pt. treble, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH, TR</td>
<td>Missa in honorem Reginae Pacis</td>
<td>Peeters, Flor</td>
<td>2 equal vv, org.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH, TR</td>
<td>Missa in honorem S. Lutgardis</td>
<td>Peeters, Flor</td>
<td>2 equal vv, org.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Magnificat in A</td>
<td>Sumsion, Herbert</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>canticle</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Magnificat in D</td>
<td>Sumsion, Herbert</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>canticle</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Magnificat in G</td>
<td>Sumsion, Herbert</td>
<td>2-pt., org.</td>
<td>canticle</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Bethlehem Down</td>
<td>Warlock, Peter</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH, TR, SC</td>
<td>Communion Service in Eb</td>
<td>White, Len</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Hymn of St. Patrick</td>
<td>Woollen, Russell</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Many traditional Latin hymn texts, such as *Ave verum corpus*, have been set to original music by composers throughout the centuries and made into choral motets. Aside from these hymn-motets, the boys’ main resource for hymn singing is *Hymns, Psalms, and Spiritual Canticles*. When all of this music together, representing this entire treasury, is used in the liturgy, it has the great benefit of adding a particular dignity and beauty to worship that leads to transformative experiences for both the boys and the congregants. As Fr. Drea comments,

> The rich liturgical treasury of music that has been handed down through the centuries was written and composed…to be of service to the liturgy, to help the individual congregant, the person of faith, to engage this beautiful reality of worship and to engage this beautiful reality of encountering God. Looking at the quality of this music, the message that it conveys, and the emotional impact that this music has, it truly helps the individual to discover and understand God in a profound way. Being able to hand this on from generation to generation and to help form and educate choirs, in this case particularly a choir of men and boys, to assist in this beautiful endeavor of encountering God through the liturgy is so important.  

This repertoire is beneficial to not only the spiritual but the musical development of the boys. Robinson comments,

> From a choir school perspective I think that there are practical educational aspects to singing that music . . . [which] has created a vibrant singing culture for a long time. If you lose that and bring in other music that is not conceived with classical singing in mind, then you are not going to teach anyone how to do it [develop a classical singing technique]. It’s like lots of musical cultures, say organ cultures, where you have repertoire associated with a certain instrument because that instrument does that kind of repertoire well. And a closely knit question is which comes first – the repertoire or the instrument. And it is similar with good choirs and good choral music. If you do not have good choral music, you are not going to have any good choirs either.

---

80 Drea, interview.

81 Robinson, interview.
Keeping alive quality music from the church’s treasure is vital for continuing to hand down our Catholic identity, as well as our Western musical identity and all of the benefits that come from each.

*Standard #5: Composers cultivate new works of sacred music to increase the church’s store of treasures.*

5.1 Sacred works by recent and living composers are among those taught and employed by Catholic institutions.

Compositions by living composers comprise the remaining fifteen percent of works performed by the choir school (see Fig. 3.10). The Trebles and Choristers engaged this body of repertoire with the highest frequency, performing the Mass settings, anthems, and hymns with organ accompaniment during the Ordinary and Communion sections of the Mass on weekdays. The *Kyrie* and *Agnus Dei* movements are extracted from these settings and sung chorally. One setting of the *Magnificat*, by contemporary American composer Gary Davison, is used in the rotation of canticles for Wednesday Vespers. The vast majority of the works are by English composers, John Rutter being the most represented of these composers, mainly due to his Christmas works. Many employ English texts over Latin. A smaller number of works are by American composers, particularly local musicians. Associated with the choir school, alumnus Leo Abbot and current Music Director John Robinson have contributed arrangements that the boys sing. Carson Cooman, composer-in-residence at nearby Harvard University, was commissioned to write a piece that the boys sang to mark John Dunn’s retirement in 2008.82

82 Ibid.
Other U.S. composers include Robert Lehman and Michael Olbash, the latter making his music freely available on the Corpus Christi Watershed website. As is often the case with living composers, particularly those connected with an institution or organization, compositions or arrangements of works written specifically for some occasion involving their choir or institution often go unpublished to the outside world. Because of this, it is often challenging to have access to many contemporary settings.

Fig. 3.10  Choral repertoire in 2013: living composers (22 out of 147 works) = 15%

CH = Choristers; CSP = Choir of St. Paul’s; SC = Schola; TR = Trebles
DO = Divine Office; M = Mass; NL = Non-liturgical

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHOIR</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>COMPOSER</th>
<th>PERIOD</th>
<th>VOICING</th>
<th>GENRE</th>
<th>TEXT</th>
<th>USE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>The Angels Sing</td>
<td>Abbott, Leo</td>
<td>b. 1950</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>carol</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Mary’s Magnificat</td>
<td>Carter, Andrew</td>
<td>b. 1939</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH</td>
<td>St. Francis Magnificat</td>
<td>Davison, Gary</td>
<td>b. 1961</td>
<td>SA, org.</td>
<td>canticle</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH,TR</td>
<td>Litany to the Holy Spirit</td>
<td>Hurford, Peter</td>
<td>b. 1930</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH,TR</td>
<td>Missa ecclesia Christi</td>
<td>Lehman, Robert</td>
<td>b. 1960</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH,TR</td>
<td>Ave Maria</td>
<td>Martin, Matthew</td>
<td>b. 1976</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Ave verum corpus</td>
<td>Mawby, Colin</td>
<td>b. 1936</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH</td>
<td>By the Waters of Babylon</td>
<td>Mawby, Colin</td>
<td>b. 1936</td>
<td>2-pt. treble, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH,TR</td>
<td>O Sing Unto the Lord</td>
<td>Mawby, Colin</td>
<td>b. 1936</td>
<td>SAB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHOIR</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>COMPOSER</th>
<th>PERIOD</th>
<th>VOICING</th>
<th>GENRE</th>
<th>TEXT</th>
<th>USE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CH,TR</td>
<td>I Sing of a Maiden</td>
<td>Robinson, John (arr.)</td>
<td>b. 1983</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>carol</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Still, Still, Still</td>
<td>Robinson, John (arr.)</td>
<td>b. 1983</td>
<td>S, org.</td>
<td>carol</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TR</td>
<td>Away in a Manger</td>
<td>Rutter, John</td>
<td>b. 1945</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>carol</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH</td>
<td>For the beauty of the earth</td>
<td>Rutter, John</td>
<td>b. 1945</td>
<td>SA, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>I wonder as I wander</td>
<td>Rutter, John</td>
<td>b. 1945</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>carol</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Jesus Child</td>
<td>Rutter, John</td>
<td>b. 1945</td>
<td>SATB, piano</td>
<td>carol</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TR</td>
<td>Patapan</td>
<td>Rutter, John</td>
<td>b. 1945</td>
<td>S, org.</td>
<td>carol</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH,TR</td>
<td>The Lord Bless You</td>
<td>Rutter, John</td>
<td>b. 1945</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>There is a Flower</td>
<td>Rutter, John</td>
<td>b. 1945</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSP</td>
<td>Jesu dulcis memoria</td>
<td>Shephard, Richard</td>
<td>b. 1949</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH,TR</td>
<td>Ave verum corpus</td>
<td>Wills, Arthur</td>
<td>b. 1926</td>
<td>SA, org.</td>
<td>hymn</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


As far as incorporating more living composers’ works into the repertoire at St. Paul’s, Robinson states, “My plan has always been to get a core of historic repertoire going which is really good and doing it well and then be able to use more contemporary music – commissions and things like that.”84 In the meantime, the boys have some opportunities to interact with living composers. With the Harvard campus nearby, various musical experts and composers, such as Carson Cooman, seek out the talented students from the choir school for performances and discuss careers in music with aspiring young composers. The boys premiered *Kyrie eleison* by

---

84 Robinson, interview
Ivan Božićević of Croatia, winner of an ECS Publishing Award in Choral Composition, at the 2014 National American Guild of Organists Convention.  

5.2 Reasons for adding new works to the treasure of sacred music are identified.

St. Paul’s has had reason to add newly-composed works of sacred music to their repertory on a number of occasions: to comply with new ecclesiastical translations, to meet the needs of the liturgy, to mark a special occasion, and to satisfy musical requirements of their specific choirs and congregation. The allowance of vernacular texts in the liturgy after Vatican II created a need for Theodore Marier to compose several English Mass settings found in Hymns, Psalms, and Spiritual Canticles, 1972 edition. In this hymnal, Marier alternates celebrant and congregational singing of Mass parts with more sophisticated choral passages, tailoring the music to both the strong clergy and congregational participation of St. Paul’s and to the quality of singers at the choir school. Likewise, with the new English translations of the Roman Missal in 2011, there was a need to revise previous English Mass settings, as Robinson did in Music for the Holy Sacrifice of the Mass and also to find inspiring new compositions that fit this criterion. Given the heavy liturgical demands and consistently high level of music making at St. Paul’s, it is essential to continually discover new quality repertoire for the boys that: 1) is a body of works separate from the congregation’s song, 2) can bear the repetitive demands of liturgy, 3) incorporates texts drawn from the liturgy and Holy Scripture, and 4) will engage worshippers in meaningful faith experiences. Places using this volume of music on a daily basis, like the choir

85 Ibid.
school, create a demand for just such compositions. And religious institutions are finding modern composers supplying this type of repertoire more and more with various music publishers, online resources like the Corpus Christi Watershed project, as well as with local composers and those on their very own staff. For these reasons, the choir school is in the unique position of championing new works for the church’s treasury.

5.3 Sources that serve as inspiration for composers to create new music for the church are identified.

Both musicians and clergy at St. Paul’s identify the tradition of the church’s music as the major source that modern composers should look to as they labor to meet the growing need for quality liturgical music. Robinson summarizes, “I think a lot of it is inspired by sort of the general trajectory of music . . . if you acquaint yourself with previous masters.” Fr. Drea expands on this idea:

Let us remember one thing; when this music [chant, polyphony, etc.] was first written, this was modern liturgical music. Every era can contribute to the liturgical life of the church. . . . We know some [composers] who are doing fine work liturgically. . . . They speak to the tradition that comes out of the great Gregorian chant tradition as well as the polyphonic tradition. So it can be accomplished. . . . Again you are looking at gifts and talents. Who will be the next J. S. Bach? Who is going to write a beautiful Mass setting or be the next Mozart? These folks are still here amongst us. They are still being gifted by God with gifts and talents to do this.

Robinson explains wherein the potential difficulty to do this currently lies. “For the church today specifically, in answer to the obvious problems of polystylism and how one charts some

---

86 Ibid.
87 Drea, interview.
kind of course out of the many interpretations of Vatican II that have occurred…[it remains to be seen] whether you can make something coherent out of that history over time.”  

5.4 Criteria which makes some pieces of sacred music more appropriate than others for the liturgy is acknowledged.  

At the choir school, discernable criteria are used in deciding what makes pieces of sacred music appropriate for the liturgy. Robinson identified the three judgments from Music in Catholic Worship as one gauge: “Musical quality, liturgical suitability, pastoral appropriateness judgments in the U.S. council of bishops’ document – if it satisfies those, then it would be a good starting point.” Fr. Drea believes the music must be synchronized with the basic needs and essence of the liturgy:  

When you think of all of the signs and symbols that are part of the liturgy, it is to help the congregation, to help the individual person of faith, to experience this beautiful presence of God in their lives through a transcendent experience that takes place in the Mass. . . . This is very much something that goes beyond the daily experience of each of us as human beings. . . . What we have to realize is that the profane does not need to enter into this and should not enter into this. . . . When you hear some of the modern music that has been composed for liturgical use, it is pretty bland and uninspiring. It is not something that is necessarily going to motivate and move the soul. The encounter with the living God in the sacred liturgy necessitates an elevated approach – an elevated language, an elevated musical approach.  

Composers must write music that will adequately serve these demands of the liturgy, necessitating an elevated approach in order to engage the faithful theologically.

---

88 Robinson, interview.  
89 Ibid.  
90 Drea, interview.
Standard #6:
The faithful are led to full, conscious, and active participation in liturgical celebrations.

6.1 Sung parts of the liturgy foster both the internal and external participation of the congregation in liturgical celebrations.

Throughout its history, both preceding the Second Vatican Council and particularly around the time the choir school was founded in 1963, St. Paul’s has been at the very forefront in terms of instructing the congregation in both external and internal participation. As cited above, worshippers were already singing the entire Ordinary of the Mass as early as 1948. It is documented that Fr. Augustine Hickey, Theodore Marier, and Fr. Joseph Collins contributed much to instructing and forming parishioners, all the while maintaining that internal participation was absolutely vital to sustaining strong external participation. Since 2010, Robinson and members of the staff have run workshops on the new chants of the Roman Missal to help prepare the congregation for the changing texts and musical settings. They have also placed various informative articles in the bulletin and written parish letters about music and liturgy. Regarding internal participation, Robinson comments, “They [the congregation] should be praying the words as represented by the choir and uniting their hearts to what the choir is doing. . . . In some ways it is sort of assumed that the people are going to work out the fact that the choir are praying through song and singing beautifully.” Fr. Drea elaborates on what needs to occur:

One of the things that is important is allowing your heart to be open to hear these words and be able to embrace the beauty of the words, the deep sincerity of the words, the power of the words and being able to engage that on both an emotional as well as an intellectual level. . . . What does this means for us and how can we grow in a deeper understanding and a deeper appreciation of that as the choir sings and that music washed over us as individuals? It is not always easy because

---

91 Ibid.
every congregation is different. Every congregation is at different levels of an intellectual understanding of this. But I think there is that common denominator there which is the encounter with the divine. When you think back to the middle ages and the great cathedrals; not everyone was educated in those days. And what did they do? The stained glass windows would tell the stories that were contained in scripture. Many sitting in the cathedral were unable to read but could understand by gazing upon the beauty of the stained glass windows. I think it is the same way with music being sung by a beautiful choir; that there is an engagement that can take place that is trying to help to form people in that understanding. Again thinking about separating it from the profane, separating it from the worldly experience, because we are so engaged in our own worldly day to day pursuits . . . in liturgy we are stepping out of that; we are stepping into this encounter with the divine which should not mirror what we are doing in Starbucks or Dunkin’ Donuts or wherever we may be.  

The liturgies I observed at St. Paul’s Church were marked by external congregational participation as well as signs of attentiveness (interior participation) when the choir sang alone. To the extent that assessment is possible, the fact that most of the congregation remained silent and reverent during the choral pieces may suggest that they were engaged and joining their prayers to that which was being sung instead of being preoccupied with distractions such as reading the bulletin or checking their text messages. How repertoire and the division of musical roles play into this internal and external participation of the congregation alluded to already in section 1.5 of this chapter will be expanded now.

During my visit, the boys sang for three different types of liturgies – Wednesday Vespers, daily Mass of which the entire school participated, and Sunday Mass. By recording five of the liturgies I attended, I was able to time the total duration, and then calculate the timing of individual musical elements and list the participants for each element. After observing and recording each liturgy electronically, I played back the recording to determine information for

92 Ibid.
the *Liturgical Observation Form* (see Appendix B). The start and end time of the liturgy (excluding any prelude or postlude organ music), the musical settings, who sang, and the timing of each component were documented. Once this information was complete on the form, I added up the musical total for each participant at that particular liturgy (See STEP 1 in Fig. 3.11 below). For example, during the first liturgy on November 17, the presider’s sung portions equaled five minutes and forty seconds; the choir’s sung portions equaled fourteen minutes and five seconds; and the congregations’ sung portions equaled twenty-seven minutes and fifty-five seconds. The total duration of sung parts during that liturgy was forty-seven minutes and twenty-five seconds. Since the entire liturgy was seventy-five minutes in length, that meant that only twenty-seven minutes and thirty-five seconds did not consist of singing. After doing the same calculations for each of the five liturgies, I added up the total time each had participated at all five liturgies (STEP 2) and calculated the average percentage of each’s musical role in the liturgy (STEP 3). Overall, singing comprised over sixty percent of the duration of these liturgies on average; there were several instances when liturgical actions were taking place simultaneously with the music. Finally, for further comparison, I determined the percentage of each’s role out of only the 136 minutes during which singing occurred among the five liturgies (STEP 4). Even with the choristers singing thirty-one percent of all sung music by themselves, the congregation along with the presider physically participated in sixty-nine percent of the sung liturgical music, the highest percentage between the three schools of this study. The last two roles have been combined, since the congregation and presider are often singing together or in dialogue during greetings, prayers, and responses. According to *Musicam sacram*, these
dialogical exchanges and parts which the priest and people sing together are of the greatest importance to be sung in the liturgy.⁹³

Fig. 3.11  Calculation procedure for determining amount of singing by the presider, choir, and congregation in the five liturgies observed at St. Paul’s Choir School (minutes : seconds)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STEP 1: Amount sung at each liturgy</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>STEP 2: Amount sung at all five liturgies</th>
<th>STEP 3: Average amount sung at liturgies</th>
<th>STEP 4: Division of sung parts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Liturgy #1</td>
<td>Liturgy #2</td>
<td>Liturgy #3</td>
<td>Liturgy #4</td>
<td>Liturgy #5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:00 a.m.-12:15 p.m.</td>
<td>12:10-12:50 p.m.</td>
<td>12:10-12:50 p.m.</td>
<td>5:15-5:45 p.m.</td>
<td>12:10-12:50 p.m.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parish Mass</td>
<td>School Mass</td>
<td>School Mass</td>
<td>Parish Vespers</td>
<td>School Mass</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presider</td>
<td>5:40</td>
<td>0:35</td>
<td>0:35</td>
<td>4:10</td>
<td>0:40</td>
<td>11:40</td>
<td>5.19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Choir</td>
<td>14:05</td>
<td>7:25</td>
<td>6:50</td>
<td>3:10</td>
<td>10:40</td>
<td>42:10</td>
<td>18.74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Congregation</td>
<td>27:55</td>
<td>11:05</td>
<td>10:55</td>
<td>21:45</td>
<td>11:00</td>
<td>82:40</td>
<td>36.74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Sung</td>
<td>47:25</td>
<td>19:05</td>
<td>18:20</td>
<td>29:05</td>
<td>22:20</td>
<td>136:15</td>
<td>60.67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Non-sung</td>
<td>27:35</td>
<td>20:55</td>
<td>21:40</td>
<td>0:55</td>
<td>17:40</td>
<td>88:45</td>
<td>39.33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Liturgy</td>
<td>75:00</td>
<td>40:00</td>
<td>40:00</td>
<td>30:00</td>
<td>40:00</td>
<td>225:00</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The combination of many elements enabled a natural flow to the liturgies and kept the congregation engaged and participating both exteriorly and interiorly throughout. Because the

⁹³ MS 7.
choir is positioned off to the right side of the sanctuary where they are not especially visible, having a cantor was helpful for reassuring the congregation when to sing. Organ improvisation connected transitions seamlessly and elaborate introductions built excitement leading up to singing. The large interior of the church carries music very effectively in the space, which makes singing enticing. Having the organ accompany all of the congregational parts lends a sense of confidence and cohesiveness to the assembly, who are sometimes scattered around and seemingly isolated during the mid-week liturgies, as is often the challenge in any large sacred space. Printed worship leaflets and postings on the hymn board eliminated the need for instructions and announcements to be made before each hymn, sparing the liturgy of these interruptions. The recent changes of the English Mass translations, creating the need to have four different in-pew resources in addition to the regular worship leaflet on Sunday, has made it a bit of a juggling act to keep up during the liturgy, as is the case in many parishes at the moment. The staff of St. Paul’s is currently in the process of writing a new hymnal to both consolidate the amount of resources needed and to provide an expanded repertoire available for use in the liturgy. According to Robinson, “Moving forward, the plan is to have four [Mass settings] for Ordinary Time and two for Advent and Lent. [Half would be in English and half would be in Latin.] While the actual responses have always been in English at St. Paul’s since 1963, there is talk that we might be able to do a Novus Ordo form Mass at some point in the near future.”

During Vespers, the sung duties were divided between the congregation and choir as follows. The congregation sang multiple responses and psalms antiphonally, two hymns, and

---

94 Robinson, interview.
chanted the Lord’s Prayer while the Magnificat, serving as the high point of the service, was the only work executed by choir alone. No deacon or cantor was present; a religious brother presided, chanting the reading and intonations for the responsory, intercessions, the Lord’s Prayer, concluding prayer, blessing, and dismissal. The organist provided prelude and postlude music, elaborate intonations before each psalm, and accompaniment during all sung congregational parts. At Vespers and during Mass, the choir and congregation perform the psalm verses in alternatim style and then join together on the repeated antiphon.

With the exception of the acclamations at the Gospel, congregational participation at Sunday Mass included all of the sung parts which belong to the first degree according to Musicam sacram: responses and acclamations during the greeting, collects, preface, blessing, and dismissal, as well as the Sanctus, Great Amen, and the Lord’s Prayer with concluding embolism. Additionally, the people sang the Credo, responsorial psalm, Gospel Alleluia, and hymns at the entrance and offertory from the second and third degrees. A recessional hymn and the Memorial Acclamation were also sung congregationally. The Kyrie, Gloria, Agnus Dei, and communion song, also belonging to the second and third degrees, were sung by the choir, while the prayer of the faithful was spoken. The presider intoned each of the responses; no deacon was present. The “cantor,” typically one of the changed-voice boys, offered visual cues to the congregation when it was their turn to sing but did not lead vocally from a microphone. In addition to the Kyrie, Gloria, and Agnus Dei, the choir was responsible for singing the entrance and communion chants, motets and anthems during the Offertory and Communion, and intoning and providing a fauxbourdon verse for the Gospel Alleluia. The organist provided prelude and

\[95\text{ MS 29-31}.\]
postlude music, lengthy improvisations during the entrance and offertory hymns as well as at the end of Communion, and elaborate intonations before the psalm and Gospel Alleluia.

During the weekday school Masses, the Gloria and Credo parts of the Ordinary were omitted, according to ecclesial prescription. The choir did not sing an offertory anthem or communion chant. Also, the presider did not sing any of the prayers or responses except to intone the Eucharistic Acclamations (Sanctus, Memorial Acclamation, and the doxology with its Amen), all of which, according to Sing to the Lord, are parts which can be easily sung at all Masses, including daily Mass.\(^{96}\) The same congregational Mass setting and the same three hymns are used for the entire week and each subsequent weekend. Since there is no sung Mass on Monday, the Mass setting and hymns for the week change each Tuesday.

Rationalizing the division of these musical duties between the choir and the congregation, especially where a choir school is concerned, is always something that must be evaluated. Robinson comments,

> When I came in 2010, my main change was to try and say that the eleven o’clock liturgy on a Sunday morning should be less active participation for the congregation. Really they were singing all of the Ordinary to congregational settings. If you have a choir school and are trying to sing the great treasury of church music as we have been instructed, then you have to do that sometime in the week and that seemed like the obvious place. The nine-thirty Mass is still more congregational in outlook. All of these Masses have hymns that the congregation sings. They sing the Creed – all of it at the moment, which is a bit hard work. A lot of places I know do it antiphonally with a cantor which seems to take some of the long amount of singing out of that.\(^{97}\)

---

\(^{96}\) United States Conference of Catholic Bishops, Sing to the Lord: Music in Divine Worship, n. 115a.

\(^{97}\) Robinson, interview.
Certainly the amount of singing, the difficulty level of the repertoire, and the theological implication of each component that the congregation sings must be assessed. At St. Paul’s, the congregation participates in the responses, acclamations, psalms, hymns, the Lord’s Prayer, the Credo, and the Sanctus. Considering that all of these components comprise sixty-nine percent of all sung music that occurs in the liturgy (see Fig. 3.11 above), to do much more would seem to place a rather large burden on, for the most part, a body of untrained singers in being able to musically learn and physically engage in that much repertoire on a weekly and daily basis. In order for the great treasure of sacred music to be heard in the liturgy, which is otherwise beyond the performance capability of the congregation, it is fitting that some parts of the singing be assigned to the choir. Choral music, polyphony, and some plainchant fall into this category. At St. Paul’s, trained singers of the choir school regularly preserve and promote this treasure in liturgy by singing a vast repertory of motets and anthems, Magnificat, Kyrie, Gloria, and Agnus Dei settings, and the entrance and communion chants from the Graduale Romanum. The choirs are able to illuminate further non-liturgical parts of the sacred music treasure in concert performances throughout the year. If the choir did not sing these, a large part of the church’s treasure would go unheard, particularly within the context of the liturgy for which much of it was written.
Standard #7:
Singers receive a genuine training in liturgy.

7.1 A basic understanding of liturgy and liturgical functions is integrated with the training of singers.

There are four main sources for liturgical training at the choir school: 1) singing, serving, and attending liturgies, 2) formal instruction in religion class, and 3) participating in altar server training. In addition, liturgical formation is also addressed indirectly in a fourth setting, the choral rehearsal.

Religion class is offered to the boys three days per week. Besides being a main catalyst for spiritual formation, this course offers a historical and theological exploration of multiple liturgical topics. For example, sixth graders discover different forms of the Roman Rite: “[Students] considered some Extraordinary Forms of the Mass in preparation for singing for a Tridentine Mass.”98 Themes for seventh graders include focus on components of the Mass. “[Students] outlined the liturgical acts of the Mass, and what each achieves.”99 The origin and meaning of feasts, solemnities, and liturgical seasons throughout the year is studied. The fourth-grade curriculum includes: “[Students] prepared . . . for Easter by outlining the distinctive events of Holy Week liturgies. . . . [Students] recalled the Mass from the Day of the Feast of the Ascension, and thought about the distinctive features of the readings and the celebration.”100 Instruction also includes how to live the liturgy and the church’s catechism in everyday life.

---

100 St. Paul’s Choir School, Religion Curriculum 4th Grade (Boston: St. Paul’s Choir School, 2013), 13, 16.
Seventh graders wrestle with concepts such as how to participate in liturgies and in life as prophet, priest, and king. In many ways, the religion courses offer students an opportunity to discuss and unpack what they have experienced in the liturgy in order to build a deeper understanding of what is taking place.

The altar server training, offered twice per week to the changed-voice boys, also encompasses formation for ushers, lectors, and cantors. As part of this program, this group of students gathers prior to Mass on weekdays and Sunday morning to prepare the altar and other things they need to perform their specific duties in the liturgy.

In choral rehearsal and by singing in liturgy, boys recognize how their ministerial role contributes to the celebration of liturgy and its various elements. According to Robinson,

I think that they understand the basic principles that their singing is prayer and is there to glorify God and is there to beautify the liturgy. I think they understand those concepts and that they are singing at a service in which they are praying and which God is present is a really big deal. On the other hand, given their age, there are – based on their questions – some clear things that they could develop more understanding of. In some ways, just setting them on this path now is sort of work for the future and that they are going to understand more fully what the meaning of all this is in the future.

The boys exhibit signs of developing an understanding of their participation in the liturgy in a number of ways. One way Robinson describes is, “As they become more aware of themselves and what they are doing, they become better communicators. At least on the human level, they

---

101 St. Paul’s Choir School, 7th Grade Religion Lesson Plan: To continue to consider Our Lord as Prophet, Priest, and King – October 18 (Boston: St. Paul’s Choir School, 2013).

102 Robinson, interview.
are able to communicate with the congregation in singing the prayers that they are singing and I think that that is a very discernable maturing.”

7.2 Teachers develop linguistic, scriptural, and theological understandings of sung musical texts with singers so that they may incorporate them more meaningfully into the liturgy.

Inherent to the process of preparing this repertoire are opportunities for addressing scriptural, linguistic, and theological objectives with the boys. The psalms form a substantial body of repertoire that is led by the choir and sung in alternation with the congregation. Between Vespers and Masses, the boys must be able to sing over 130 psalms on Gregorian psalm tones. Time is spent reviewing how the words fit with the pointing of the notes, but other pedagogical goals are also addressed when working with the psalms, particularly biblical exegesis. In order for each psalm not to sound the same, the boys must interpret what each means spiritually to convey the appropriate mood of the psalm. When this kind of understanding is brought to their attention, they can relate it to their own lives and express its meaning more effectively. Likewise this same approach of talking about the meaning and translation of the words is used with other repertoire the choirs sing, such as the introit. The boys are asked to identify and translate key Latin words in the chant, since the text is often related to the theme of the feast or day. Theological aspects are used to guide the interpretation of a work and make connections to what is happening in the liturgy. For example, because of its slow and suspended tempo, Messiaen’s *O sacrum convivium* illustrates the rather mysterious notion of timelessness in a way that the

---

103 Ibid.
boys can experience and comprehend. At Eucharist, we join our celebration with that of the eternal heavenly banquet and the perpetual sacrifice on the cross. Musical pieces such as Messiaen’s help the boys to understand theological concepts that are otherwise difficult to convey or experience.

Musical texts used in the liturgy are also discussed in religion class from time to time. For example, the fourth-grade curriculum states, “[Students] read ‘In the Bleak Midwinter’ and used it to prompt . . . thinking on the wonder of Our Lord’s Nativity.” One fifth-grade topic is that “[students] read the text of the Reproaches and considered how they linked God’s goodness in the Old Testament to Our Lord’s sacrifice on the Cross.” Another theme from the eighth-grade curriculum examines how “the text ‘Tu es Petrus’ emphasizes the importance of the Pope as the successor to Peter and Christ’s Vicar.” Such interdisciplinary learning, so to speak, assists the boys in developing a strong understanding of how music and faith are connected.

7.3 From the manner and length of the liturgy celebrated, those liturgies and elements which are of highest importance receive due emphasis.

Throughout the liturgical year, the boys come to know the range of progressive solemnity from their direct experience in the liturgies in which they participate as choristers. Of the liturgies I attended, the least solemn was Wednesday Vespers, which was thirty minutes long.

104 Ibid.

105 St. Paul’s Choir School, Religion Curriculum 4th Grade, 7.

106 St. Paul’s Choir School, Religion Curriculum 5th Grade, 5.

107 St. Paul’s Choir School, Religion Curriculum 8th Grade, 4.
Although the boys did process and recess in choir dress during the hymns and all texts were sung, there was no incense, no homily, and a religious brother presided and led the responses as opposed to one of the parish priests. The small congregation in attendance was accompanied by organ in all sung responses. The highlight, or most important part of the celebration, the Magnificat, was clearly delineated as this was the only component sung using a choral setting; all other music was rendered congregationally. Next in the order of progressive solemnity were the weekday Masses, which were forty minutes long. The boys did not process for weekday Mass, and they sang the entrance chant from their choir stalls on the side. According to prescription, the weekday Masses naturally did not use incense, a second reading, sung intonations for some of the presider’s parts, the Gloria, or the Credo. On the other hand, Mass on Sunday, being seventy-five minutes in length, was marked by the inclusion of ceremonial processing and recessing of the choir and ministers, incense, and the singing of the Credo and Sanctus, collects, preface, and responses by the presider and people. In addition, the choir sang polyphonic and mixed-voice settings of motets, the Kyrie, the Gloria, and the Agnus Dei, as well as the communion chant. The Gospel Alleluia verse utilized a fauxbourdon setting as opposed to a monophonic rendering. Elaborate intonations before the psalm and Gospel Alleluia and extended improvisations at other points in the Mass also added to the degree of solemnity.
Standard #8:  
Singers receive spiritual formation of the highest standards.

8.1 Spiritual formation helps singers cultivate a personal ongoing relationship with the Lord while, at the same time, develop in their liturgical ministry to help form the faith of others.

As stated in the school’s mission, specific emphasis is placed on the students’ Catholic spiritual formation.\footnote{St. Paul’s Choir School, 2013-2014 Handbook for Students & Parents, 1.} Section 7.2 already discussed some of the ways students develop spiritually in choir through examining the theological and liturgical connections of the sung musical texts they sing. While choir is a major influence on this spiritual formation, the religion course, offered to the students in grades four through eight, serves as the primary formal instruction method for developing this in students. But, as Fr. Drea explains, the mere teaching of these concepts is only part of the goal. “Looking at the moral formation that takes place, the spiritual formation that takes place . . . [we strive] to make sure that it is embraced and that it is lived. It is not just an academic pursuit but that it is a life pursuit. . . . And the choir school can really be an effective tool for that.”\footnote{Drea, interview.}

Not only does singing this music impact the boys’ faith, but it also prepares them for their life-long role as faith-filled individuals. Like liturgy, this formation, according to Fr. Drea, must be

Divinely focused on growing in the relationship with God that we are called to. I think this type of music helps to do that. I think at the basic level it is helping a ten-year-old boy to discover his gifts and talents. We are all blessed and born with gifts and talents that God gives to us. . . . They are fine tuning this gift. It is a gift that will travel with them throughout their whole lives. Whether they stay in professional singing or a become a member of a parish choir, it helps them to
discover that the hard work, dedication, and practice that is required of them at this young age can be a model for how they engage life on many other levels going forward – whether it is their high school, college, or university career.¹¹⁰

There is also the question of whether singing in the choir all of the time hinders them in any way. Robison explains, “I think that is partly why we have this system here where the choirs alternate, so they are singing one day then they are attending Mass the following day.”¹¹¹

By exercising this singing role in the liturgy with a deep sense of faith, choristers aid the spiritual formation of others. The aim in forming a boy in music and the Catholic faith at the choir school is so that he may “place those talents at the service of the Church and the community in which he lives.”¹¹² Such a formation not only impacts the parish and community but is also important to the broader mission of the twenty-first-century church. Fr. Drea explains how he hopes the choir school will be an instrument to

Help the reform of the reform of the liturgy, as Pope Benedict so beautifully has helped us to better understand, and to really be an effective presence, an effective tool for the New Evangelization. Being in university ministry as the chaplain here at Harvard, I can see in our young people the great desire to grow in depth in their relationship with God and how the liturgy can help them to do that. The liturgy really is, if you will, our front line of attack, or front line of defense, however you want to put it. The individual needs to be nourished and sustained and fed through the liturgy – word and sacrament. Having this beautiful choir to help elevate our souls and help to unite us more closely with the divine is a key element of the work of the New Evangelization. That is my hope that we can do that.¹¹³

¹¹⁰ Ibid.

¹¹¹ Robinson, interview.


¹¹³ Drea, interview.
8.2 Daily Mass, celebrations throughout the liturgical year, and a variety of spiritual practices built of the Word of God, grounded in the sacraments, and devoted to the Eucharist, as well as studying the lives of the saints and the Blessed Virgin Mary are a primary means of forming individuals spiritually.

Participating in a variety of liturgical and spiritual practices provides a means of forming boys spiritually at the choir school. Engaging in prayer at the beginnings and ends of classes and participating in daily Mass are the main acts students engage in on a day-to-day basis to nourish their spiritual life. Regarding such methods of faith formation, the school states, “Recognizing the importance of prayer in order to grow in relationship with God, each school day Holy Mass is celebrated. It is the hope that through the singing of the Mass and understanding the rich musical tradition of the Church, each choirboy will appreciate at a deeper level the power of God in his life and thus respond as faith-filled individuals.” Likewise, receiving the sacrament of penance during the seasons of Advent and Lent and commemorating the Stations of the Cross during Lent provide further school-wide practices which assist in developing students’ spirituality.

In addition to Holy Eucharist, Vespers is another type of liturgy that assists in the boys’ spiritual development through the Word of God. Vespers is sung by the Choristers weekly on Wednesday evenings at 5:15. Choral Vespers is also celebrated on special feasts and celebrations throughout the year, such as Epiphany, Feast of the Presentation, the week of Christian Unity, and various choir school events. According to Fr. Drea, “We try to have Vespers services throughout the year on Sunday afternoons, for instance. Even at the choir school, for the investiture of the choir boys and the commencement exercises, both of those

114 St. Paul’s Choir School, “Catholic Faith Formation at the Choir School.”
ceremonies take place within the context of Vespers to help expose the congregation to the scriptures and prayer of the church.”  

The religion sequence in which the boys participate is the main outlet for studying theological doctrine relating to the Word of God, the sacraments, the Eucharist, the lives of the saints, and the Blessed Virgin Mary. The catechetical series *Faith in Life*, published in eight grade levels by Ignatius Press, serves as the main resource for the course. Each level provides an age appropriate description of catechism. For example, the fourth-grade curriculum examines the lives of saints: “[Students] considered traditions surrounding St. Nikolaus, and considered how a devotion to him helps us to think more carefully about the true meaning of Christmas.”  

Fifth graders continue this examination: “[Students] researched St. Basil the Great, in particular his influential teaching on the nature of the Spirit.”  

The life of Mary is also studied in the curriculum: “[Students] considered Our Lady’s Visitation to St. Elizabeth and what it teaches us about faith and fellowship.”  

Seventh-grade objectives include study of the sacraments: “[Students] considered the Rite of Baptism; . . . [they] thought about the connotations of the symbol of water in human experience, and the Old Testament specifically. . . . [they] considered the Fruits and Gifts of the Spirit . . . [they] begin to access fully with the fullness of the Spirit

---

115 Drea, interview.


119 Ibid., 5.
received at our Confirmation.” Spiritual practices are examined: “[Students] considered the Jesuit practices of Examen and Lectio Divina.” Benefits that these practices can offer to the boys are studied: “[Students] considered the Liturgy of the Hours, specifically how Religious contribute to the Church by praying it, and how lay-people can participate.” Much of the curriculum focuses on the responsibility of Catholics to live out these beliefs in the real world. Additional programs and projects that encourage virtuous living and social outreach supplement the students’ classroom instruction.

Summary

This chapter investigated the praxis of St. Paul’s Choir School according to the eight standards derived from the Second Vatican Council. The great importance St. Paul’s Choir School attaches to the teaching of music is evident in a number of ways. Through a repertoire-based choir curriculum, students develop their musical skills to an exceptionally high degree by engaging in rigorous daily training and daily service to the liturgy. Approximately one-third of the school day comprises musical studies and singing in liturgy. Additional time outside of school is spent in rehearsals, liturgies, and a wealth of other types of experiences such as concerts, tours, recording projects, and collaborations with world-class musicians and composers. To further reinforce concepts of vocal production and music reading in the choir

120 St. Paul’s Choir School, Religion Curriculum 7th Grade, 9.
121 St. Paul’s Choir School, Religion Curriculum 6th Grade, 11.
122 St. Paul’s Choir School, Religion Curriculum 8th Grade, 5.
123 St. Paul’s Choir School, “Catholic Faith Formation at the Choir School.”
rehearsal and performance, students study music theory and piano using the ABRSM sequence as well as learn to play recorders and hand bells. While a successive progression of skills is adopted in the music theory and piano curriculum, this same type of gradational approach is not utilized for choir. John Robinson’s background in the English choir school tradition very much impacts this approach to choir. In previous years while the choir school utilized the Ward-Marier method, students were not singing nearly as often in liturgies and performances, nor learning the amount of repertoire that is currently engaged. If the students have the tools they need to read music, their aural skills are developed, and their level of performance is near that of professionals, then the main goal of serving the liturgy daily is not only being met but the current approach is producing exceptional results from a musical formation standpoint. Making a performance-based assessment, it is my opinion, and that of other leading musicians in the field with whom I have spoken, that St. Paul’s is forming choristers of the highest musical caliber.

Because serving the liturgy is the main mission of St. Paul’s Choir School, chant, polyphony, and works new and old from the church’s full treasure, conceived specifically for the liturgy, form the main body of music which the boys sing. By employing this repertoire in Sunday and weekday liturgies, this wealth of sacred music is preserved, promoted, and given pride of place in the liturgy, and the congregation has the great privilege of being exposed to and enriched by this sacred treasure on a constant basis. It is important to note that there is not some altered form of music and liturgy that takes place when the boys sing; the liturgies are not a “Mass with Children,” for example. Choristers do exactly the same things as adults would do. In fact, most adults probably could not perform this level of music, particularly the weekly introit chants from the Graduale Romanum, or execute this liturgical role as competently as these boys
do. It is evident from the way that the boys sing that they understand this music and the important role it has in the liturgy. As can be seen from the analyzed data, repertoire from each era of the church’s treasury is fairly well-represented, with the largest majority of works being by British composers overall.

Not only do the boys excel at this body of sacred choral music, which nurtures the inner participation at St. Paul’s, but they also assist in leading all aspects of the congregation’s external participation as both choristers and members of the congregation. Given the work of Theodore Marier, Fr. Hickey, Fr. Collins, and others early on to cultivate internal and external participation among the congregation, this extraordinary undertaking put St. Paul’s ahead of its time in terms of facilitating congregational participation and still permeates the liturgies to a large degree. When compared to most Catholic churches, there are two major observations I took from St. Paul’s which appear to be remnants from the Marier years. First of all, there is a rather high demand as to the amount and types of music that the congregation is expected to sing. But, one could probably make this argument in most Catholic parishes with the current zeal for “active participation.” The congregation, along with the presider, physically participated in an average of sixty-nine percent of the sung music at liturgies, including more difficult musical components such as the Credo and pointed psalm tones. During the Marier years when the congregation sang the entire Ordinary, the percentage of congregational singing was likely to have been even higher. Worth noting is the fact that the same congregational Mass setting and hymns are used for the entire week and each subsequent weekend, so laity that attend the daily Mass would likely develop a particular confidence singing these parts. Second, there is no distinction in the printed musical editions used by the congregation, choir, and organist. In other
words, the congregation is not singing from a lyrics-only sheet or text under a single melody line. In many cases, four-part harmony settings are provided in these resources, giving the more musically sophisticated congregants at least the option of reading from actual musical notation or singing harmony parts on a hymn. As opposed to St. Paul’s parish fifty years ago, an increasingly migrant demographic of college students and out-of-town visitors comprise the people sitting in the pews each week; nevertheless I observed exceptionally strong external participation by the congregation in all sung responses and hymns. By developing this same internal and external participation in the young boys at the choir school, many of these individuals will continue to play an important role in the liturgical life of the Church into adulthood and as lifetime members of the faithful. In alternating between serving as the choir one day and sitting among the congregation the next, the boys develop both forms of participation, which, as I observed, were even stronger than the congregation overall. As more and more individuals are formed in the church’s treasure of sacred music and its role in the liturgy at St. Paul’s, there is a higher potential to reinvigorate this participation and understanding of the liturgy in the congregation as a whole in the future.

The impact of the strong liturgical training and spiritual formation the boys receive, while perhaps not immediately visible during their years at the choir school, becomes quite evident and measurable when one considers the school’s alumni. From the early years to the present, St. Paul’s Choir School has seen their graduates go on to pursue religious life and sacred music vocations. The unique combination of musical, liturgical, and spiritual formation boys receive at the school is influential in setting them on this path from an early age and preparing them well to make substantial contributions to the life of the Catholic Church. Alumni who have pursued
religious and sacred music vocations include: The Most Reverend Bishop Peter Uglietto, Auxiliary Bishop of Boston; Fr. Bill Kelly, priest of the Archdiocese of Boston; Kevin Joyce, currently in formation at the North American College in Rome; Charles Callahan, leading American organist-composer; Leo Abbot, music director at the Cathedral of the Holy Cross in Boston; and Paul Murray and Christopher Hebard, organists and music directors at large churches. Some of the boys who learned to play the organ while at the choir school, such as Alex Pattavina and Forrest Eimold, have earned organ scholar positions at St. Paul’s Church as teenagers, where they gain valuable experience playing for Masses, giving annual recitals, and growing as church musicians. Recent alumnus Lucas Guzman received acceptance as a participant in the Choral Residency Courses, Eton, UK. As St. Paul’s Choir School continues to expand its presence in the United States, it will no doubt continue this fine legacy of religious, sacred music, and other important vocations, bearing fruit for decades to come.

In the case of all eight directives, St. Paul’s Choir School overwhelmingly met the goals set forth by Vatican II. In the areas of musical, liturgical, and spiritual formation, the school excelled to the highest levels. Though the performance of chant and polyphony are the most challenging in terms of the music that the boys perform, with the help of the professional men, the students are ably executing both with increasing confidence and facility as time goes by. Currently the choirs are working to expand the standard body of sacred repertoire at their disposal. Once this becomes more established, they will most likely increase the number of

124 Robinson, interview.
works they commission and play an expanded role in cultivating new compositions of sacred
music for the liturgy. While St. Paul’s facilitates active participation in the congregation, further
investigation in this area beyond the scope of this paper is certainly warranted, and particularly
what this means in terms of the choir school’s involvement.
CHAPTER IV
THE MADELEINE CHOIR SCHOOL

Background

The Madeleine Choir School, located adjacent to The Cathedral of the Madeleine, is an apostolate of the Roman Catholic bishop in Salt Lake City, Utah. Growing out of an after-school choir program and annual summer training camp, a co-educational grade four through eight day school was established in the basement of the cathedral in 1996. As property became available across the street from the cathedral, instructional space was relocated, and the campus expanded to its present inclusion of pre-kindergarteners through eighth graders. From its inception, the purpose of the school has been “the formation of future musicians who will serve the church’s liturgy as organists, conductors, singers and composers,” says Gregory Glenn, co-founder and pastoral administrator of The Madeleine Choir School. Based in the “cathedral tradition,” choir school students are equipped with “Catholic intellectual, artistic, moral and religious tradition.”

At the heart of this formation is emphasis on the liturgical renewal of the Second Vatican Council and Sacrosanctum concilium.

---

4 Ibid.
According to the student handbook, the school’s mission is to “nurture the whole child, with attention to the intellectual, physical, spiritual and emotional” within an environment that combines a European choir school curriculum with Catholic education. Westminister Cathedral Choir School in London, one of the most preeminent Catholic choir schools, serves as the primary model for this repertoire-intensive music program at the Madeleine. Crucial to this formula is daily high-quality performance, particularly through service to the public worship of the cathedral, but also through concerts, tours, and recordings. Within this European choir school model, students “dive deeply into the study of the classics, from Ancient Civilizations to Latin and English Literature,” and the school claims to be regarded as “one of the best liberal arts schools in the valley [an area of five-hundred square miles which comprises Salt Lake City and its surrounding suburbs].” Likewise providing an exemplary Catholic education, “the school fosters a strong program of moral and character formation, and seeks to provide a thought-provoking and comprehensive study of Christian Theology.” The choir school is accredited by the Western Catholic Education Association as well as the Northwest Accreditation Agency. To build stronger catechetical programs in their schools, the Diocese of Salt Lake City requires testing at the fifth and eighth-grade levels through the National Catholic Educational Association’s Assessment of Catechesis/Religious Education (ACRE) which “evaluate[s] the

5 Ibid.
faith knowledge and attitudes of students.” Furthermore, the school’s curriculum is in conformity with Utah’s core curriculum and satisfies many of the nine national standards provided by the National Association for Music Education.

Upon graduating from the choir school at the end of eighth grade, students pursue rigorous high school programs in the area. According to the school, “The majority of our students test into advanced classes in mathematics and science . . . [and] consistently score in the upper quartile on standardized tests.” Following high school, many go on to attend many top ranking Catholic and secular institutions across the country such as The Catholic University of America, Loyola University of New Orleans, Santa Clara University, the University of Notre Dame, Gonzaga, Loyola Marymount, the University of Pennsylvania, Dartmouth, Johns Hopkins, Yale, and Stanford University. A number of graduates pursue degrees from prestigious music conservatories such as The Juilliard School, Westminster Choir College, Manhattan School of Music, Oberlin, and Indiana University. The goal of the Madeleine is to form “engaged scholars, effective communicators, dedicated liturgical musicians, and responsible world citizens who seek to build a civilization of justice, mercy and love” so that graduates may apply these virtues to whatever they end up doing, being successful in life and contributing

---


11 The Madeleine Choir School, “Capital Campaign.”

positively to their respective communities.\textsuperscript{13} A list of attributes the school focuses on developing with students during their time at the Madeleine is provided in the \textit{Profile of a Graduate} section. Among this list of objectives is to “understand the importance of music within the liturgy.”\textsuperscript{14}

The history leading up to the founding of The Madeleine Choir School and its development will now be explored, including the obvious questions of how a Catholic choir school could exist and flourish in such a predominately Mormon center as Salt Lake City. The Mormon influence and Catholic presence, or at times seemingly the lack thereof, have both played a factor, according to Glenn:

Salt Lake City is a small city, and the arts scene here was to our advantage. Because of the Mormon population, there is a much higher interest in the arts and music. We have a professional ballet, opera, symphony, and many other artistic organizations in town; that is unusual for a city our size. So the arts interest that comes from the Mormon tradition and heritage has been to our benefit. The other thing that has been to our benefit is that the Catholic Church here is a little isolated, and there were no other programs. When we kicked off the choir school, we were the only thing in town, and so that also worked to our advantage.\textsuperscript{15}

Catholicism in Utah can be traced back to 1866 when the first mission parish, St. Mary Magdalene, was established in Salt Lake City. Father Lawrence Scanlan, later to become bishop, served as the first pastor.\textsuperscript{16} Within a few years he was also instrumental in the establishment of the first Catholic school, a boarding and day school for girls which operated until 1970. Saint

\begin{thebibliography}{9}
\bibitem{15} Gregory Glenn, Co-founder/Pastoral Administrator of The Madeleine Choir School and Director of Music at The Cathedral of the Madeleine, interview by author, digital recording, Salt Lake City, UT, 7 November 2013.
\end{thebibliography}
Mary's Academy had its own orchestra in addition to providing opportunities for the girls to study a variety of instruments including organ and banjo. As the Catholic community grew to around 3000 in Utah, the missionary district was elevated to the Diocese of Salt Lake in 1891, with His Excellency Lawrence Scanlan appointed the first bishop. After purchasing land in downtown Salt Lake City, Bishop Scanlan oversaw the building of the cathedral from 1899 to 1909. Documented among those on hand for the dedication of St. Mary’s Cathedral were “a procession of 100 choir boys . . . 200 young women in white, forty priests, eight bishops, five archbishops and James Cardinal Gibbons—highest prelate in the US.” In 1915 Joseph Glass became the second bishop of Salt Lake, artistically improving the interior of the church and retitling it The Cathedral of the Madeleine. While I have not discovered any direct links to the “100 choir boys” from 1909 or Saint Mary’s Academy with the present choir school, the cathedral certainly seems to have had a predisposition towards high quality liturgy and music from early times.

Later developments that would impact the fate of the choir school began in the 1980s with the appointments of Monsignor M. Francis Mannion as rector of the cathedral in 1984 and

---


Gregory Glenn as director of liturgy for the diocese in 1988.\textsuperscript{20} Prior to these positions, both men completed extensive training in liturgical studies at The Catholic University of America. In 1990, Glenn became director of liturgy and music at The Cathedral of the Madeleine. In March of that year, after auditioning students at each of the Catholic schools in Salt Lake and the surrounding vicinity, Glenn started an after-school choir program with seventy boys and girls. Rehearsing separately, the boys and girls practiced for ninety minutes each week. For some time in the beginning, easy unison repertoire was used. That summer an annual week-long summer camp was instituted, making it possible to begin developing part singing with the students.\textsuperscript{21} The choristers sang publically for the first time on 15 August 1990 for the Solemnity of the Assumption of the Blessed Virgin Mary and thereafter for Mass and Vespers approximately once a month.

Around this same time, Msgr. Mannion was embarking on a major renovation of the cathedral’s interior. According to a description provided on the cathedral’s website,

This included renovation of the liturgical elements of the cathedral to bring them into conformity with the liturgical reforms that followed the Second Vatican Council (1962-1965), chiefly building a new altar in a more prominent location in the midst of the congregation; giving a new centrality to the bishop's chair; providing a separate Blessed Sacrament chapel; and adding a more ample baptismal font. Additional elements involved . . . the rebuilding of the lower level of the cathedral, including Scanlan Hall.\textsuperscript{22}


\textsuperscript{21} Tappan, “The Madeleine Choir School (Salt Lake City, Utah): A Contemporary American Choral Foundation,” 25.

Mannion and Glenn also began to seriously consider the viability of expanding the chorister program into a fully functioning choir school. Revamping the cathedral basement now meant having a choir rehearsal room and new classrooms that would be available for religious education on the weekends and other types of instruction during the week. In 1992, a four-manual mechanical action organ by Kenneth Jones and Associates of Bray, Ireland was installed to replace the Schoenstein in the cathedral’s gallery.\(^23\) It is also worth noting that during this time, along with other prominent cathedral liturgists and musicians, Mannion and Glenn were a driving force behind the *Snowbird Statement on Catholic Liturgical Music*, a document comprehensively addressing musical issues in Catholic worship.\(^24\) In the fall of 1992, Mannion encouraged Glenn to spend three months in England observing the choir school program at Westminster Cathedral, then under the musical leadership of James O’Donnell. From this residency, as well as inquiries into other Anglican and Catholic schools, Glenn became equipped with the information he needed for pursuing the choir school idea further. By the time the renovations were complete and the cathedral was rededicated on 21 February 1993, the project costs totaled $9.7 million.\(^25\) A feasibility study was then conducted, taking into consideration input from parishioners as well as budgetary and curriculum projections for the choir school. Upon receiving the proposal, Bishop George H. Niederauer gave his approval, and the first co-educational Catholic choir school in the United States opened in August 1996 in the cathedral


basement. According to researcher Lucas Tappan, “Excitement also grew among the cathedral’s parishioners, who saw the choir school as part of the overall plan to rejuvenate the parish begun by Mannion, a plan that included every facet of parish life, including the liturgy and sacraments, community, education and outreach, and, of course, the cathedral building.”

What resulted in the school’s early years was very much shaped by Mannion’s efforts to “re-catholicize” the liturgy at the cathedral, Glenn’s European choir school vision, and the reality of what was possible given their present situation. Tappan summarizes Mannion’s liturgical viewpoints:

Mannion believes that in order to fully recatholicize the liturgy, the Church must work to once more bring to the fore a “renewal of the eschatological orientation (218)” of the liturgy and once again acknowledge that the heavenly and earthly liturgy are intrinsically bound together. In order to do this, the Church must recover the sense of cosmic worship, the belief that the whole church, in heaven and on earth, as well as all of creation is caught up in the hymn of heavenly praise. . . . In his article, Mannion describes some of the more practical aesthetic aspects that need to be included in a larger recatholicization of the liturgy, especially “taking the present rites and working to celebrate them in a much more profound, dignified, and spiritually edifying manner than has generally been the case since the advent of postconciliar revision,” which presupposes greater liturgical training for priests and the laity. It is also necessary to “provide for a more noble character in liturgical music and to restore a Catholic ethos to places of worship,” an ethos that respects the totality of Catholic liturgical history, not just the patristic era (219-20).

While Glenn set out to build a choir school based upon the model he had observed at Westminster Cathedral, some adaptations were needed to make this type of school work in Salt Lake City. Like Westminster, The Madeleine Choir School strove towards a routine of

---


“incessant rounds of daily rehearsals and liturgies in the cathedrals and the process of going through massive amounts of repertoire year after year” to form the choristers in singing.\textsuperscript{28} Unlike most cathedrals, the placement of the choir in the apse behind the high altar during liturgies is also a distinction that the Madeleine shares with Westminster. However, according to Glenn, “... changes in policies, goals, and priorities have resulted in a distinctly American model.”\textsuperscript{29} The Westminster Cathedral Choir School is a boarding school for boys only, with a substantial number of choristers who attend as day-school students. The Madeline is co-educational and strictly a day school. Westminster is the only Catholic cathedral choir in the world to sing daily Mass and Vespers. The full men and boys’ choir sing Mass daily and Vespers on Sunday; additionally, the men sing Vespers daily. Choristers at the Madeleine participate in a reduced singing schedule due to the pace at which students are able to prepare repertoire and outside demands of other activities which compete for the students’ time. Students rehearse for forty-five minutes each day; boys and girls alternate singing daily Masses during the week and one Mass on Sunday. The choristers occasionally sing Sunday Vespers during special seasons of the liturgical year. Westminster, like most choir schools in England, is subsidized through the cathedral. Because The Madeleine Choir School is financially independent from its cathedral, it must also rely on a rigorous concert schedule where students prepare and perform large works to help raise money, awareness, and support for the school.

\textsuperscript{28} Ibid, 26.

In the years since its inception, the choir school has continued to grow and expand. In 2001 Melanie Malinka joined the staff as music director of the school. In 2002, the choir school was able to relocate their campus across the street, allowing for the inclusion of students in kindergarten through eighth grade in 2003. A pre-kindergarten program was added in 2007. Since the traditional choir school model typically encompasses grades four through eight, the inclusion of younger students gives the Madeleine another distinction. Beginning in 2010, while enrollment was consistently increasing, the school added an additional kindergarten section in an effort to gradually double the size of the student body one grade level at a time.

With the goal of reaching two sections per grade level, the total enrollment capacity is projected to be 484 students by 2018.\(^{30}\) The current enrollment for the 2013-2014 academic year is 337. In recent years, the number of Catholic families has decreased from seventy-five percent in 2007 to fifty-eight percent in 2013. At the same time, the enrollment of students whose families claim no religion at all has risen from five percent in 2007 to twenty-four percent in 2013.\(^{31}\) Like St. Paul’s Choir School, matriculation has been somewhat impacted by the current reluctance of many nearby Catholic schools to allow the Madeleine to recruit students for the choir school as they have in the past. However, one of the school’s recent goals has been to further integrate members of the growing Hispanic Catholic population. According to Glenn, “The cathedral began its outreach to the Hispanic community seven or eight years ago. . . . The

\(^{30}\) The Madeleine Choir School, “Capital Campaign.”

\(^{31}\) Glenn, interview.
Spanish choir was started and we got to know these families a bit. That was our way to reach out to those families in particular and integrate them in the school.\footnote{Ibid.} 

Admission to the choir school is dependent upon taking a tour of the campus, submitting application materials, and completing vocal and academic assessments. The vocal audition evaluates the child's “tone quality, pitch perception and listening skills.”\footnote{The Madeleine Choir School, “Admissions Process and Procedures.”} Assessments in phonics, reading, math, and writing evaluate the students academically before they are offered admittance. Auditions and assessments are not required for pre-kindergarten candidates; instead they are evaluated as a group to judge social, emotional, and academic readiness. While targeting Catholic students with an interest in music, the school states, “The overriding virtue binding this community is genuine love, concern, and respect for one another. Our community represents a wide range of diversity, coming from many religious, ethnic and socioeconomic backgrounds.”\footnote{The Madeleine Choir School, “Capital Campaign.”}

Once enrolled, students excel academically, spiritually, and musically for a number of reasons. The course offerings include traditional subjects of math, science, language arts and social studies, while studies in theology, music theory, music history, Latin, French, Spanish, choral singing, violin instruction, physical education, art, drama, dance, and technology enhance the curriculum and offer students an exceptionally well-rounded education.\footnote{The Madeleine Choir School, “Curriculum,” The Madeleine Choir School Website, accessed 10 September 2013, http://utmcs.org/curriculum.} Obviously, the more involved a student can be in the choral program, particularly the choirs that perform outside...
the normal school day and at Sunday Mass, the more experience and growth they will gain musically. Parent involvement is crucial for driving their children to rehearsals and performances and helping out at the school.

The 2013-2014 tuition cost at The Madeleine Choir School is between 4,623 and 7,250 dollars. While 7,250 dollars is the actual cost of education per student, some families qualifying for need-based tuition assistance pay even less than the lowest amount. A five-tier tuition system is used so that the tuition amount that each family pays is reflective of their income and assets. Families submit financial records to an independent financial assessment program, Smart Tuition Aid (www.smarttuitionaid.com), for evaluation.\textsuperscript{36} Glenn affirms, "Our school is coeducational, and it is accessible to all students who have the ability and the desire to attend. We try to provide financial aid for those who need it."\textsuperscript{37} Each family is further responsible for costs associated with choir camp, Grade Six Teton Science School, graduation, choir tour (optional for students in grade 5-8), hot lunch, extended care, school supplies, extracurricular sports, and transportation.\textsuperscript{38} Annually, parents are also required to fulfill twenty-five volunteer service hours at school activities or pay five hundred dollars. These activities include lunch and yard duty as well as ushering for concerts and helping with gala fundraisers to name a few. Since using this tiered system, the school has been able to cover more of its three-million dollar annual operating budget through tuition alone. Sixty percent of revenue needed is generated from tuition, fourteen percent comes from scholarships, ten percent is collected from concerts and auxiliary programs.


\textsuperscript{37} Lee, “Madeleine Choir School Celebrates First 10 Years.”

\textsuperscript{38} The Madeleine Choir School, “Tuition and Expenses.”
(transportation, extended care, diocesan support), seven percent is raised through the Friends Annual Appeal, six percent is donated at the Spring Gala Auction, and three percent comes from private foundation grants.\textsuperscript{39} To facilitate the expansion plan which will double enrollment in each grade level by 2018, the school is currently mid-way through a capital campaign toward raising $6.5 million for the needed renovations of the main campus building, Jacquelyn M. Erbin Hall, and construction of an indoor gymnasium.\textsuperscript{40}

The choir school is governed by the pastor of the cathedral, the Very Rev. Martin Diaz, and overseen by Gregory Glenn, pastoral administrator. A leadership team of Principal Jill Baillie and several administrators, including Music Director Melanie Malinka, assist in running the school and report regularly to Glenn. The Home and School Association organizes social and fundraising events to benefit the school. The total number of faculty at the school is thirty-one; nine of these teach music and two serve as theology/religion instructors.\textsuperscript{41} Of the two music staff members who are employed full-time, one has a master’s degree in choral conducting and the other has a bachelor’s degree in organ performance. Among the faculty who teach theology/religion, one has undertaken some graduate coursework in liturgical studies.\textsuperscript{42}

\textsuperscript{39} Glenn, interview.

\textsuperscript{40} The Madeleine Choir School, “Capital Campaign.”


Presentation of Data

The same methods of data collection and analysis used for the other two schools will now be applied to determine the degree to which The Madeleine Choir School fulfills the musicoliturgical goals established by the Church since Vatican II.

Standard #1:
Catholic institutions and schools attach great importance to the teaching of music.

1.1 Musical training advocates strong choral music experiences, particularly when they give fervent expression to the Catholic ethos within the context of liturgy.

Choir formation through singing a vast repertory of sacred music, particularly within the context of liturgy, comprises the largest part of the chorister experience at the Madeleine and is central to school’s mission of forming liturgical musicians for the future. The importance of what the choir does is summarized by Glenn: “their musical ministry . . . enhances the life of prayer in the cathedral.” With European choir schools, including English models like Westminster Cathedral, it is fundamental that repertoire be engaged on a daily basis in liturgical services, including Vespers/Evensong. While striving to emulate these models, The Madeleine Choir School, like St. Paul’s and The Atonement Academy, has found the daily liturgical responsibilities of their English counterparts too much for any one choir to fulfill single-handedly. To accommodate the busy American lifestyle and other activities vying for students’

---

time, it has been necessary to divide these liturgical responsibilities between two or more choirs and drastically reduce the occurrences of choral Vespers/Evensong.

The main performing choirs at the Madeleine rehearse daily and share liturgical responsibilities for Mass on Sunday morning, the 5:15 p.m. Mass Monday through Thursday, and the office of choral Vespers on Sundays during the major liturgical seasons. Unlike St. Paul’s and The Atonement Academy, which hold Mass during the school day, the students at the Madeleine do not attend Mass daily due to its later evening time. Instead, the entire student body comes together about twenty times throughout the year to celebrate noon Mass in the cathedral for major solemnities, feasts, and commemorations. Every Tuesday morning students participate in the singing of Lauds in the school chapel. Related programs of study in music theory, music history, violin, and theology further strengthen the students’ formation in choir and liturgy.

The school year at The Madeleine Choir School is approximately forty-one weeks, spanning from late August to mid-June. During those ten months, the choir school provides music for over 180 liturgies and concerts at The Cathedral of the Madeleine and in the community. The bulk of these musical responsibilities rests on three ensembles: the St. Cecilia Choir, an intermediate choir for girls in grades five through eight; the St. Gregory Choir, an intermediate choir for boys in grades five through eight; and the Schola, comprised of the school’s most advanced treble students from the Sts. Cecilia and Gregory choirs, along with the cathedral adult choir. The Changed Voice Choir, a fourth choir for boys who want to continue singing once their voices have changed, sings occasionally with the St. Gregory Choir and men
of the cathedral. Accounting for holidays and breaks during that time, the students attended class on approximately 180 of those days, or thirty-six weeks out of forty-one.\(^\text{44}\)

The school day and choir-training program are built around an intensive schedule of rehearsals and liturgical responsibilities. The regular school day extends from 8:30 a.m. until 3:30 p.m. Monday through Friday. However, some choirs participate in after-school and weekend rehearsals, liturgies, and concerts, which are a mandatory part of the curriculum and school day (the chart below is inclusive of these times). Classroom teachers and the athletic department make accommodations so that their programs are designed to work in conjunction with the choir schedule. On Mondays, the St. Gregory and Changed Voice Choir remain at school until 6:00 p.m. for rehearsal followed by Mass. On Wednesdays, the St. Gregory Choir remains at school until 6:00 p.m. for rehearsal followed by Mass. On Tuesdays and Thursdays, the St. Cecilia Choir remains at school until 6:00 p.m. for rehearsal followed by Mass. On alternating Sundays, the Sts. Cecilia and Gregory choirs (including the Changed Voice Choir) sing from 9:45 a.m. until 12:30 p.m. for rehearsal and Mass. Members of the Schola perform additional liturgies as needed throughout the year.

To calculate the amount of time students spent in musico-liturgical experiences, I used the same procedure as was explained earlier by the example in Fig. 3.1. Consulting the school day schedule and the annual calendar allowed me to collect necessary data for each choir. The final calculation for the choirs at the Madeleine, resulting from these procedures, is illustrated below in Fig. 4.1. Of the 180 instructional days annually at the Madeleine, students averaged

\[^\text{44}\text{ The Madeleine Choir School, 2013 Academic Calendar (Salt Lake City: The Madeleine Choir School, 2013).}\]
between 691-885 minutes per week (eleven and a half to fourteen and three quarters hours), or twenty-nine to thirty-four percent of their time engaged in choir rehearsals, liturgies, concerts, and related musico-liturgical studies.

The St. Cecilia Choir comprises between twenty-five to thirty singers. Including their primary responsibilities on Tuesdays, Thursdays, and Sundays, this choir sings for school Masses and at least sixteen additional liturgies and concerts at the cathedral annually. For the

---

Sunday Mass and special liturgies/concerts, this choir combines with the cathedral adult choir (and sometimes also the St. Gregory Choir) to sing mixed repertoire. On weeknights, the choir sings treble-voice repertoire only. This choir participates annually in the Chorister and Server Investiture Mass, the St. Cecilia’s Day Concert, the Mass and Blessing of Advent Wreaths, the Christmas carol services, Britten’s *Ceremony of Carols*, Christmas Day Mass, the Rite of Election with the bishop, the Founders Day Concert, the Good Friday choral meditation of Pergolesi’s *Stabat Mater*, the Paschal Vigil, the Easter Sunday Vespers and Procession, the Madeleine Festival Concert, and commencement. In 2013, the St. Cecilia Choir sang for eighty-four liturgies and concerts (2.1 per week) and 236 rehearsals (5.8 per week). These included fourteen Sunday Masses, thirty-four weeknight Masses, twenty school Masses, and sixteen additional liturgies and concerts.\footnote{The Madeleine Choir School, *2013 Academic Calendar*.} The St. Cecilia choir devotes an average total of 775 minutes each week, or thirty-one percent, of their time “in school” to musico-liturgical experiences comprised of choir rehearsals, liturgies, and concerts as well as classroom instruction in music theory, music history, and theology.

The St. Gregory Choir comprises between eighteen to twenty-four singers. Including their primary responsibilities on Mondays, Wednesdays, and Sundays, this choir sings for school Masses and at least eighteen special liturgies and concerts at the cathedral annually. For Sunday Mass and special liturgies/concerts, this choir combines with the cathedral adult choir (and sometimes also the St. Cecilia Choir) to sing mixed repertoire. On Monday nights, they combine with the Changed Voice Choir to sing easier mixed-voice repertoire. On Wednesday nights they sing treble-voice repertoire only. This choir participates annually in the Chorister and Server
Investiture Mass, the St. Cecilia’s Day Concert, the Mass and Blessing of Advent Wreaths, the Christmas carol services, Britten’s *Ceremony of Carols*, Christmas Eve Midnight Mass, the Rite of Election with the bishop, the Founders Day Concert, the Mass of the Lord’s Supper, the Good Friday choral meditation of Pergolesi’s *Stabat Mater*, the Easter Sunday Masses, the Madeleine Festival Concert, commencement, and the Vigil of Pentecost. In 2013, the St. Gregory Choir sang for eighty-five liturgies and concerts (2.1 per week) and 234 rehearsals (5.7 per week). These included thirteen Sunday Masses, thirty-four weekday Masses, twenty school Masses, and eighteen additional liturgies and concerts.\textsuperscript{47} The St. Gregory choir devotes an average total of 790 minutes each week, or thirty-two percent, of their time “in school” to musico-liturgical experiences comprised of choir rehearsals, liturgies, and concerts as well as classroom instruction in music theory, music history, and theology.

The *Schola* comprises between sixteen to twenty select singers from the Sts. Cecilia and Gregory choirs along with approximately twenty singers from the cathedral adult choir (nine professional male section leaders, two high school alumni, and nine high school alumnae). The primary responsibility of the *Schola* is to provide liturgical music for solemnities, feasts, and special Masses at the cathedral. Annual liturgies include: the patronal feast day of St. Mary Magdalene, the Assumption of the Blessed Virgin Mary, the Solemnity of All Saints, the First Sunday of Advent Procession and Vespers, the New Year’s Day Mass and Te Deum, Ash Wednesday, Palm Sunday, Corpus Christi, special Masses and performances for the bishop, diocese and various societies, the Equestrian Order of the Holy Sepulchre of Jerusalem Mass and Investiture, weddings, funerals, and ordination Masses. In addition to their Sts. Cecilia and

\textsuperscript{47} Ibid.
Gregory duties, choristers who participate in the *Schola* have slightly higher performance totals since they sang for at least thirteen additional liturgies and concerts (2.4 per week) and 13 rehearsals (6.1 per week) in 2013. The average total for the *Schola* was 885 minutes each week, or thirty-four percent, of their time spent in musico-liturgical experiences.

The Changed Voice Choir averages between four to twelve singers each year. This choir sings on Mondays, Sundays, and for school Masses always in combination with the St. Gregory Choir. Additionally they participate annually in services such as the Chorister and Server Investiture Mass, the St. Cecilia’s Day Concert, the Mass and Blessing of Advent Wreaths, the Christmas carol services, Christmas Eve Midnight Mass, the Rite of Election with bishop, the Founders Day Concert, the Mass of the Lord’s Supper, the Easter Sunday Masses, the Madeleine Festival Concert, commencement, and the Vigil of Pentecost. In 2013, the Changed Voice Choir sang for sixty liturgies and concerts (1.5 per week) and 234 rehearsals (5.7 per week). These included thirteen Sunday Masses, fifteen weekday Masses, twenty school Masses, and twelve additional liturgies and concerts. The Changed Voice choir devotes an average total of 691 minutes each week, or twenty-nine percent, of their time “in school” to musico-liturgical experiences comprised of choir rehearsals, liturgies, and concerts as well as classroom instruction in music theory, music history, and theology.

In addition to singing for all major liturgical services of the cathedral and diocese, choristers participate in two annual series sponsored by the cathedral, where they have the opportunity to perform major works and interact with renowned musical artists. Such musical

---

48 Ibid.

49 Ibid.
offerings make the cathedral a vibrant center for the arts and evangelization, while creating formative experiences for the choristers. The cathedral concert series, established in 1990, features six major performances throughout the year by The Madeleine Choir School. Presentations in 2013 included: a St. Cecilia's Day Concert featuring Howells’s *Take Him, Earth, For Cherishing* and Britten’s *St. Nicolas*; a Christmas Carol Service; a performance of Britten’s *Ceremony of Carols*; a Founders’ Day Concert in March featuring music from their Germany choir tour; a Good Friday meditation of Pergolesi’s *Stabat Mater*; and The Madeleine Festival Concert presenting Bach’s *Der Herr ist mein getreuer Hirt, BWV 112* and Poulenc’s *Gloria.*

A second series, the Madeleine Festival of the Arts and the Humanities, begun by Msgr. Mannion in 1988, presents performances by The Madeleine Choir School as well as a variety of arts groups in the city over six to seven Sunday nights each spring. As part of the 2013 festival, students collaborated with the Utah Opera and members of the Utah Symphony to perform the children’s opera *Shoes for the Santo Niño* by Stephen Paulus.

A third series, the Eccles Organ Festival, occurring on Sunday evenings each fall/winter since 1994, brings five world-class organists to the cathedral each season. Though students are not directly involved in the organ festival or specifically required to attend, the opportunity is there to benefit from hearing such recitals played on the instrument at their church. A one-week camp led by faculty from The Madeleine Choir School, Tanner Dance, and the Utah Opera Education Department each July

---


52 The Cathedral of the Madeleine, “Eccles Organ Festival.”
and the Choristers and Server Investiture Mass are two ways the students prepare physically and spiritually for the task at hand of learning all this music each year.\textsuperscript{53}

Aside from their work at the cathedral, the choristers frequently engage in collaborations, performances, and projects that have garnered opportunities for them throughout the greater Salt Lake area and beyond. The Madeleine serves as the children’s choir-in-residence for the Utah Opera, where students have recently participated in productions of \textit{The Magic Flute} and \textit{Turnadot}. During the 2002 Winter Olympics, choristers performed alongside the Mormon Tabernacle Choir and the Utah Symphony. Current students have served as soloists with the Helena Symphony Orchestra in Montana. Beginning in fifth grade, national and international performance tours to musical and cultural centers provide students opportunities to put their knowledge of music, art, architecture, history, theology, and geography into context. Every four years, students, along with alumni and the professional men of the choir, tour the important churches and religious centers of Italy. Recently, tours have also been made to Paris, Madrid, Berlin, Dresden, Leipzig, Prague, Vienna, and San Francisco. According to Glenn, “Performance tours shock a choir into good condition like nothing else; they are not just a luxury but are really a part of the pedagogical process.”\textsuperscript{54} Since 1994 (two years before the school was even officially established), Glenn and the choir school have been producing compact discs of sacred music and have five recordings to date.\textsuperscript{55} In the autumn of 2012, director Melanie


\textsuperscript{54} Glenn, interview.

Malinka led a group of choristers in the making of a chant recording to accompany Wilko Brouwers’s instructional series on teaching chant to children.\textsuperscript{56}

1.2 A rigorous curriculum serves as the framework in which the sequential acquisition of skill and learning takes place, through use of a graded choir system or similar, appropriate to the varying ability levels of individuals.

As student enrollment has been steadily rising each year at the Madeleine, the number of school choirs has also increased, becoming grade-, gender-, and ability-based. Every child receives the same musical and vocal training through the end of grade four. Performing in two school concerts annually, students in pre-kindergarten through fourth grade also serve as the essential feeder program at The Madeleine Choir School. Because of their vastly unique developmental needs, the program is structured so that boys and girls begin rehearsing separately starting in grade three. Once they reach fifth through eighth grade, choristers are placed in one or two out of five possible choirs based on their “level of musical proficiency, interest and stamina.”\textsuperscript{57} Out of the eighty-two students in the fifth through eighth grade, the bulk of the liturgical and performing responsibilities fall to the fifty-one students, or sixty-two percent, who participate in these four choirs: St. Cecilia, St. Gregory, \textit{Schola}, and Changed Voice. A fifth choir, St. Nicholas, is offered for treble-voice students who are continuing to develop vocally,


progressing in the area of self-discipline, and/or who cannot commit to the more intensive Cecilia/Gregory schedule.

Since its inception, Glenn has based the school’s music curriculum largely on the European/English choir school model. The school has made great progress and continues to strive toward these original goals of developing their performance standard and engaging a vast body of repertoire to be on par with their European/English counterparts, but this has often left little time for developing students’ musical knowledge and sight-singing skills to a similar level. Since arriving in 2001, Melanie Malinka worked to better incorporate a few of NAfME’s educational standards into the music curriculum, particularly for the third and fourth grade, such as reading and notating music. By the time students reach fifth grade, the point at which choristers become active in their liturgical duties, much of their theory and sight-singing skills must already be in place. From that point on, a voluminous body of chant, motets, anthems, Masses, and Magnificat settings becomes the almost exclusive medium through which concepts are refined and perfected throughout the year and from one year to the next. Building exposure to this quality liturgical repertoire is the basis for all other learning. The St. Cecilia Choir learns a minimum of 110 pieces of treble and mixed repertoire annually. The St. Gregory Choir learns a minimum of 105 treble and mixed repertoire annually. In addition to knowing this repertoire, singers in the Schola learn additional mixed-voice repertoire, having a minimum of 160 works at their disposal at any given time. The St. Cecilia, St. Gregory, and St. Nicholas choirs combine to sing a handful of performances and liturgies each year, but generally each choir performs and rehearses separately. The Changed Voice Choir also rehearses separately and learns a minimum
of fifty-seven pieces annually. In striving to be more comparable to the English models, the choir school continues working to augment its treasury of repertoire that can be sung on a daily basis.

In the pre-kindergarten through grade-four music classes, students receive general/vocal music instruction which emphasizes a solid foundation in singing, sight reading, music theory, musicianship, and, to a lesser extent, music history. In these non-choir music classes, the acquisition of skills and concepts takes place in a specific ordered sequence. In pre-kindergarten and kindergarten, singing folk songs along with using solfège syllables and Curwen hand signs gives younger students first-hand, active music-making experiences which are very much adapted from Kodály’s philosophies. Using moveable DO tonic solfà, Curwen/Glover hand signs, and Chêvé rhythm syllables of ta and ti-ti, students are equipped with tools and symbols they can apply when they begin reading and notating music. In the second and third grade, students receive group violin instruction in addition to their general music classes. Music staff supports the notion that “the violin most closely resembles the sound of the human voice and creates an early opportunity for ear training and tuning as well as a wonderful introduction to music theory and the reading of music notation.” In the classes I observed, some teaching tools from the Suzuki method were used, such as “Mississippi-stop-stop” rhythmic patterns and charts with finger positions to help students get started on the instrument, but one of the objectives at this level is also for students to be able to read notes on the treble staff. A third grade objective also states that students be able to “Echo and sight-sing complex melody patterns using solfège

---


59 The Madeleine Choir School, “Choir and Violin Program.”
syllables and hand signs.”\textsuperscript{60} Topics listed under the fourth grade curriculum include the following: “Read and write in Gregorian Chant notation, introduction to vocal anatomy, introduction to conducting, and understand and demonstrate outstanding rehearsal and performance behavior.”\textsuperscript{61} This emphasis on reading and ensemble musicianship skills are crucial to preparing students for their duties as choristers in fifth grade; a weekly sing-along time with the third and fourth grade further strengthens these areas. No specific textbooks are used exclusively in any of the music classes; rather, handouts and worksheets are used to tailor the instruction to each of the curricular objectives.

Once becoming choristers in the fifth grade, choir objectives are not progressively defined in the curriculum; rather, the European choir school idea of building musicianship solely through repertoire takes precedence. The same two objectives are stated for all levels from fifth through eighth grade: “Sing and study repertoire unique to the choral tradition of the Roman Catholic Church [and] Participate in national and international performance tours to musical centers of historic importance.”\textsuperscript{62} Because there is little time in choir to address music theory and music history, students must develop these skills and concepts in a separate class. Fifth and sixth graders have music theory class where they hone skills that are necessary for learning large amounts of choral repertoire. Their objectives include: “Recognize intervals by sight and ear, including augmented and diminished intervals, understand the Circle of Fifths (up to five sharps


and flats), [and] recognize and use minor keys (a, e, d - natural, harmonic, melodic). “Seventh and eighth graders have music history class where they learn to place the music they experience in choir into historical context. Components from many different approaches, such as Kodály, the Royal School of Church Music, and practices of leading experts in the field such as John Bertalot, are used as a means of accomplishing the varying goals of the choir school. According to Malinka, “We do not want to box ourselves in by using only one method; we take the best of several methods.” Solfège syllables and Curwen hand signs from Kodály’s philosophy and sight singing techniques of Bertalot are helpful in teaching students to read music; the Royal School of Church Music’s chorister training programs focus on strategies for developing proper vocal technique, responsibility, and leadership in choristers. At the beginning of each academic year, students in each of the five choirs as well as altar servers participate in the Chorister and Server Investiture Mass, officially making their commitment to serve as a chorister (or server) for the year. Parents present each chorister with a surplice to symbolize their ministerial role. Eight head choristers, selected for their exemplary attendance, behavior, interaction with younger students, leadership, vocal technique, and musical progress, are also announced and presented distinctive surplices with gold crosses around the bottom. In addition to serving as role models, handing out and collecting scores, and assisting other choristers, they


64 Melanie Malinka, Director of Music at The Madeleine Choir School interview by author, digital recording, Salt Lake City, UT, 5 November 2013.

65 John Bertalot, Five Wheels to Successful Sight-Singing (Minneapolis: Augsburg Fortress, 1993).

occasionally have cantorial duties intoning chants, singing psalm verses and petitions, leading responses, and giving cues to the congregation.

As cited above, middle school boys who opt to continue singing after their voices change participate in the Changed Voice Choir. Malinka states, “Once boys can sing low enough down into the tenor range, and they can no longer sing comfortably in their treble voices, then they are moved down. Students are always placed where they can sing in the range that is most healthy for them.” Typically consisting of not more than a dozen students, this ensemble has the added benefit of more individualized attention from the instructor to explore each boy’s changing voice. This choir does not perform separately; rather, they learn the tenor and bass parts in order to augment the ranks of the St. Gregory choir and cathedral men during performances. They do not sing when the St. Gregory Choir is performing treble-only repertoire. The few boys that choose to discontinue singing during this time often serve as altar servers as well as enroll in Collegium Humanitatis, an enrichment course that surveys “topics in the areas of math, science, language arts and the performing arts of specific geographical locations around the world.” With the choir school only extending through the eighth grade, students have the option after graduating of participating in the parish choir, which combines with the treble choristers every Sunday and on major feast days.

I observed multiple instances where human and character formation was exceedingly and quite naturally developed within the context of the choral rehearsal, something that is central to

67 Ibid.
the mission of the school. Certainly self-sacrifice and generosity on the part of choristers is evidenced by the rigorous schedule of rehearsals, liturgies, and concerts to which they commit their time and energy. The exceptionally high level of music making in rehearsal is attributed to teacher expectations but also student self-awareness and self-discipline. Choristers strive for excellence each time singing through a piece and are encouraged to raise their hand to acknowledge when they are aware they have made a mistake. Often without having to be told, students mark reminders in their score so they do not make the same mistake again. Two curricular objectives reflect these goals: “Understand and demonstrate outstanding rehearsal and performance behavior (grade four) and sing as a committed chorister - show leadership (grade five).” A recent article reports Glenn saying that “choir school helps students develop transferable skills, including time management, the ability to perform at a moment’s notice, and being part of a team.” These intra- and inter-personal qualities, attributed to the choir school environment, are essential for general success in life and in forming persons of Catholic character.

Musical, spiritual, and linguistic formation is additionally developed in formal classes, within the liturgy itself, and through optional before and after school programs. From pre-kindergarten through fourth grade, music classes occur within the schedule two to three times per week. In second and third grade there is the addition of group violin class twice per week; in third and fourth grade there is an added sing-along once per week. The choristers in grades five


70 Forgey, “A Noteworthy Education: Music and Liturgy Enrich Learning at Cathedral’s Coed Choir School.”
through eight have choir rehearsal daily, along with music theory once weekly in fifth and sixth grade and music history once per week in seventh and eighth grade. When students reach fifth grade, they may choose to pursue private voice studies after school. Optional lessons in other instruments are also available to further strengthen the student’s musical training. The after-school program staffs three voice teachers, three violin teachers, two piano teachers, an organ teacher, and a guitar teacher. A before-school chamber orchestra, comprised of mostly violins, but also a few violas, cellos, flutes, piano, percussion, and other instruments at times, also provides a venue where students can make music together as an ensemble twice weekly. According to Malinka, “This greatly assists students in building musicianship skills which are transferrable to choir.”

As cited above, the entire school participates together in Lauds each Tuesday and Mass about twenty times throughout the year. To continue their theological, liturgical, and spiritual formation that is first initiated in the liturgy, students receive religion/theology instruction three to four times per week. From fourth to eighth grade, students also receive instruction in Latin two to three times per week, along with Spanish or French twice weekly in seventh and eighth grade to develop their language skills.

1.3 Aspects of good, healthy vocal production are promoted during singing.

While healthy vocal technique is not identified as a curricular objective until second grade, it is developed from the time students enter the choir school in the pre-kindergarten through their eighth grade year. Malinka’s philosophy emphasizes the “immediate vocal health”

---

71 Malinka, interview.
of each student as well as the “longevity of their developing voices.” Because of the early focus on singing in head voice and ample experiences singing folk songs, children’s songs, and learning music for Mass and Lauds, all students I heard from second grade up were able to match pitch and demonstrate proper singing tone (not shouting). Relying on imagery and visual aids to explain vocal anatomy and teach students to sing by sensation, healthy habits are formed in regards to posture, breathing, and vocal technique. I observed third graders being instructed to “be a pencil sharpener mouth” in order to sing a pure “oo” vowel with correct mouth position. To demonstrate proper body alignment for singing, fourth graders were reminded to “pretend that your chest is an open book, your head has a string attaching it to the ceiling which is helping it balance on your spine, and your tailbone is tall and noble.”

Beginning in fifth grade trebles are placed into one of four voice classifications based primarily on what is the healthiest range for them: first soprano, second soprano, first alto, or second alto. According to Malinka,

Some boys and girls have naturally lower, higher, heavier, or lighter voices; range, tessitura, and vocal quality all must be taken into consideration. Students with heavier voices should not be placed on high soprano for extended periods because they could hurt their voice. Likewise, students with lighter voices should not sing alto exclusively because they will try to copy the other heavier voices around them and start belting, losing access to the head voice and upper range.

---

72 Tappan, “The Madeleine Choir School (Salt Lake City, Utah): A Contemporary American Choral Foundation,” 142.

73 Melanie Malinka, “Third Grade Music” (observation, The Madeleine Choir School, Salt Lake City, UT, 1 November 2013).


75 Malinka, interview.
During the middle school years, treble boys’ voices reach their peak strength and clarity while girls’ voices become thin and breathy due to an inability of their changing vocal folds to adduct properly. Pedagogy must be employed to compensate for this breathiness in the sound without having the girls pushing and trying to imitate the sound they hear from the boys, which is a bigger sound than they can physically achieve at this stage. Malinka claims, “It is just a matter of good, healthy vocal technique, which is no different than you would teach an adult.”

More so than at St. Paul’s and The Atonement Academy, I noticed the Madeleine using some techniques that are more often typically associated with teaching voice to adults: having students keep voice journals and engaging a steady diet of Romantic works that demand great vocal stamina (e.g., Bruckner, Rachmaninoff, Parry, and Stanford).

At the beginning of each rehearsal, vocal exercises are employed to cultivate healthy singing technique in students. In grade five through eight, vocalises that emphasize breath support and singing with pharyngeal space are used. Short exercises engage diaphragmatic activity, while longer exercises help singers practice sustaining their breath. Five-note descending scales on “oo” help to strengthen head tone. Later on, when students start to develop chest voice, ascending “ah” exercises are used. I observed the incorporation of everyday activities, such as laughing, yawning, and sighing, to effectively teach vocal concepts. Further vocal ideas are addressed as the repertoire is rehearsed. During rehearsal, emphasis was placed on “bringing the music to life” by discussing the meaning of the text with students and by

---

76 Ibid.
77 Tappan, “The Madeleine Choir School (Salt Lake City, Utah): A Contemporary American Choral Foundation,” 143.
working on stylistic and performance practice aspects of each piece. In Tallis’s *Salvator mundi*, singers practiced moving their breath stream to energize phrases and bringing out their diction to emphasize the meaning. Singers were instructed not to try to over sing in places where the range was too low, but rather to compensate by exaggerating the text more. In Rachmaninoff’s *Dnes spaseniye*, students were reminded that making more space, rather than belting, would result in achieving a more “Russian tone.” In Stanford’s *Beati quorum via*, singing with space and support by moving energy on longer and tied notes was once again a focus. In Victoria’s *Missa O quam gloriosum*, attention was paid to shaping phrases musically as an ensemble by singing more quietly and making room to grow. To assist in keeping students engaged and energized, students alternate between sitting and standing while rehearsing.

Due to the rigorous schedule during the school day, private vocal lessons are offered only after school for interested students. Malinka believes it would also be helpful to work individually with students during the day when they are struggling vocally. According to Malinka, “For the kind of repertoire we sing, it would be ideal to just have a vocal coach on staff to see students individually at least once every two weeks.”78 Glenn affirms, “Most choir schools in England engage vocal coaches to work with singers individually or in small groups outside of the choristers’ ensemble rehearsals.”79 As enrollment increases and the school continues to grow, this will be among the considerations.

Currently boys and girls develop singing skills primarily within a group setting through their respective choral ensemble. Third and fourth graders not only have a combined sing-along

---

78 Malinka, interview.

79 Glenn, interview.
where they begin to build ensemble skills, but they have the added benefit of smaller music
classes where their individual skills can continue to be nurtured in preparation for becoming a
chorister. In the classes I observed, the instructor made a point to hear the children sing
frequently on an individual basis. One at a time, students were asked to sing various vocalises
and demonstrate specific attributes that had been reviewed. The experience was positive, with
students eager to please and make modifications based on the instructor’s feedback. Positive
reinforcement was given to students who projected their voice through engaging their breath
support appropriately, and classmates were respectful and supportive when each student sang
(e.g., not laughing at people’s voices). Once students reach fifth grade, the occasion for
individual hearings become possible only when students participate in after-school lessons. The
method used to build vocal skills during rehearsals of the St. Cecilia and St. Gregory choirs is to
have older students in the back rows demonstrate passages and serve as vocal models when
younger students are having difficulty. Following this, the passage is repeated so the younger
students have a chance to correct their mistakes. The professional men, often classically trained
opera singers, also have a strong impact on the way the students are learning to sing at the
Madeleine. These adult singers exhibit proper vocal technique, model pure vowels, and sustain
and shape musical lines with engaged breath support. The choristers hear and emulate these
healthy vocal habits. It would be much more difficult to train children to sing with proper habits
if the men’s section consisted largely of amateur or untrained voices. At the same time, the choir
director is careful to ensure that young singers are not belting or pushing, since the size of their
instrument is much smaller as compared to the adult men who can produce a much fuller and
resonant vocal tone. Choristers in grades five through eight are assessed regularly in four areas: 1) participation and behavior, 2) attendance, 3) vocal progress, and 4) musical progress.80

Because of Malinka’s musical formation, particularly singing with the children’s chorus of the Stuttgart State Opera and in the German educational system the first two decades of her life, the tonal philosophy at The Madeleine Choir School is very much grounded in the German school of thought. Malinka describes this German timbre as “warmer with more bell-like resonance at the top and more power, though not as full or cutting as an English choir sound on top.”81 To Malinka, the British sound is beautiful, but it can at times be manufactured and exhibit tension. Though some sounds are not possible to achieve until the students are much older, Malinka tries to incorporate some timbre variations in music of different stylistic periods. For example, vocally students use a lighter approach when singing in the French Baroque style and a warmer, deeper timbre in Brahms or Rachmaninoff. These subtleties can be achieved, according to Malinka, by “adjusting the space, support, and tapering of the phrase.”82 Singing pieces in German, French, and Slavonic is viewed as a useful educational experience for choristers. The Dresden Boys’ Choir, comprising choristers between the ages of nine and nineteen, represents the typical German choir school model which extends through high school. This is eventually something the Madeleine would like to imitate, where high school boys are offered more opportunities to continue singing with the trebles as tenors and basses.


81 Malinka, interview.

82 Ibid.
Music reading skills are developed.

As cited in section 1.2, the school strives to ensure that students are developing proficiency in music reading skills by the time they become choristers in fifth grade. While reading skills aid the choristers to some degree in preparing repertoire in the choral rehearsal, sight reading is not specifically addressed through the repertoire or any form of sight reading exercises. Instead, building music reading is typically left to the related music classes (e.g., vocal/general music, violin, and music theory). The ability to sing such difficult and massive amounts of repertoire each year is attributed not only to the music reading levels of the students but also to other factors such as the semi-frequent repetition of repertoire. Typically the same repertoire is used for the same choir, so every new chorister filtering through that choir has an opportunity to learn it and re-sing it several times. Since the choirs consist of combined grade levels (comprising students in grades five, six, seven, and eight), often many choristers are already familiar with the music as a very limited number of singers join or graduate from the ranks annually. This core repertoire is supplemented each year with new pieces. Though not mandatory, around eighty percent of choristers attend summer camp where they begin preparing new pieces for the coming year.\textsuperscript{83}

Components of several teaching techniques, such as Kod\'{a}ly, Curwen, and Bertalot, are drawn upon to give students tools for learning to read music. While solfége is employed quite regularly in the younger grades, it is only referenced as needed in the upper grades. For example, choristers will not sing an entire octavo on solfége in order to learn it. Malinka

\textsuperscript{83} Ibid.
explains, “The goal in teaching solfège is to give students a reference so they can think in those
terms and to teach students that there is a pattern to the notes.” When choristers are reading
new music, according to Malinka, “Most singers follow the contour, some think intervalically,
and the advanced students think the pitches on solfège when they need help finding a pitch.”
Students are generally able to sing through new pieces with minimal assistance from the
instructor. When needed, the instructor will point out solfège references to help students with
problematic intervals. Overall, students do a remarkable job of following along in the score and
are able to perform works accurately and in-tune after a few repetitions of rehearsing with the
piano. In general, the choristers in grades five through eight sing unison through eight-part
music, with the trebles splitting into as many as four parts (SSAA). When they combine with the
cathedral men, most of the works sung by the St. Cecilia, St. Gregory, and Schola choirs are
three-part treble divisi with two- or three-part men. The Changed Voice choir typically
combines with the St. Gregory Choir and cathedral men to sing SAB, SATB, and SATB-divisi
music.

To develop music reading skills, an extensive curriculum is employed in the
vocal/general music, violin, and music theory classes. Starting in pre-kindergarten, students are
building skills that lay the foundations for learning to read music, particularly through solfège
games and activities. Second grade objectives include being able to “Write and recognize by
sight and ear all note values and rests” and “Write and recognize notes in treble clef.”

This is also the point at which students begin a two-year study of violin. Though the Suzuki Method is employed initially, the teacher supplements this approach with having students learn to play simple pieces notated on the treble staff and to perform rhythms ranging from whole notes to eighth notes. Third grade objectives include being able to “write and recognize notes in treble clef and bass clef.” The vocal music classes I observed incorporated activities using Chêvé rhythm syllables and rhythmic dictation. Malinka states, “In third grade we begin to connect what is on the printed page to the direction we make our voices go.” In fourth grade this work expands to include identifying major keys (C, G, D, F), being familiar with notes on the piano keyboard, determining the scale degree on which a piece begins, and plugging solfège into the score so the students begin to read music. In the classes I observed, many activities focused on acquainting students with elements in the score (e.g., where/how to indicate where to breathe and not breathe, how to locate the system, measure, and beat, etc.). In third grade and fourth grade, I observed that students were often asked to determine the key of a piece, establish the location of DO, and then singing the first few notes on solfège. Practicing one of the hymns for Mass, O Saving Victim, the students determined that G was DO and then sang the first four pitches on solfège (DO, RE, MI, SOL); the students then proceeded to sing the remainder of the piece on a

---


87 The Madeleine Choir School, “Music Curriculum: Grade 3.”

88 Malinka, interview.
neutral syllable. As cited above, a heavy emphasis in music theory is continued during their first two years as choristers (fifth and sixth grade), with topics including the circle of fifths, minor keys, intervals, triads, and musical analysis.

1.5 A wide spectrum of musical literature, particularly those songs of the Sunday liturgy, is employed during musical training.

Because each choir at the Madeleine is primarily a liturgical choir, nearly all music prepared is for use in the liturgy. The introduction to the school’s music curriculum states, “We provide a meaningful performance experience through singing sacred choral music in a liturgical context.” Since one of the four main expectations at the Madeleine is to form “dedicated liturgical musicians,” student learning must “preserve and further the choral tradition of the Roman Catholic Church; strengthen full, conscious and active participation in the Liturgy; [and] enhance the cathedral’s public worship life through regular musical service.” Like Westminster Cathedral, the body of literature choristers sing is distinctly Roman Catholic and mostly in Latin, reflecting every period of the church’s history, but especially the traditions of Gregorian chant and Renaissance polyphony. While choral Vespers liturgies are not yet pervasively celebrated at the Madeleine, as is the case with Evensong in many English churches, their Christmas Carol Service is very similar in concept to the Anglican Service of Nine Lessons

---

89 Melanie Malinka, “Fourth Grade Music.”

90 The Madeleine Choir School, “Music Curriculum: Grade 5-6.”


92 The Madeleine Choir School, “Curriculum.”
and Carols. Though the Madeleine is similar to Westminster Cathedral in many aspects and exhibits similarities with a few of the Anglican traditions, they have not embraced a wide use of English anthems. The choirs at the Madeleine spend the majority of their time and effort preparing the pieces they sing alone during the weekday liturgies: an Entrance chant, Kyrie and Agnus Dei settings, the Gospel verse, and one anthem for each Mass. On Sunday mornings, major feasts, and solemnities, the choirs additionally prepare a Gloria setting instead of a choral Kyrie, an extra anthem, and the communion chant. Due to incorporating vocal warm-up exercises into each choral rehearsal as well as employing repertoire that is moderately difficult and not repeated often, an average of only three or four pieces is rehearsed in a single class. The four choirs I examined from the Madeleine had a combined repertory of over 200 choral works which they employed in the liturgy in 2013. Alongside their liturgical role, choristers additionally prepare a half dozen larger works of sacred music that are part of the cathedral’s concert series each year, including multi-movement works such as sacred operas, requiems, Stabat Mater settings, Magnificat settings, cantatas, and oratorios. The choristers’ repertoire will be discussed further in sections 3-5.

During liturgies the choirs participate in the congregational singing of the hymns, responses, acclamations, psalms, and Mass parts. To join in the congregational participation, the choirs use the same printed worship leaflet during liturgies as the congregants. Everything, including the plainchant, is depicted with modern musical notation. English translations of the proper chants and choral motets are also included, while scripture reading texts appear only in the Sunday worship aids. Three settings comprise the sung Ordinary Mass parts of the

congregation: two English settings and one Latin chant setting. The Kyrie and Sanctus from Richard Proulx’s revised Community Mass are used in conjunction with either the Gloria from Normand Gouin’s Mass of St. Peter and Paul or the Gloria from Jeff Ostrowski’s Mass of St. Ralph Sherwin. The Sanctus and acclamations from Richard Proulx’s Mass of the City are used in conjunction with Latin chant settings. The composite chant Mass from Sing to the Lord, containing Kyrie XVI, Gloria VIII, Credo III, Sanctus XVIII, and Agnus Dei XVIII, is known to the congregation along with Gloria XV and Agnus Dei VIII. The main hymnal from which the hymns for school and parish liturgies are drawn is Worship, Third Edition, published by GIA. This is supplemented with music from The English Hymnal, published by the Church of England, and other hymnals on occasion. With the exception of reviewing the pointing of the Gospel verses of the day, the congregational music and responses are generally familiar enough from daily Mass that the choristers do not need to rehearse these.

**Standard #2:**
Gregorian chant is given pride of place in liturgical services.

2.1 Choirs and congregations are exposed to hearing live chant in the liturgy and singing a minimum repertory of this chant.

Gregorian chant not only has a prominent place in the proper chants the choir sings, but on a regular basis the congregation participates in chanting Mass ordinarines, responses, and hymns during liturgies at the Madeleine. As cited in section 1.5, one of the three main ordinary settings the congregation sings is the composite chant Mass identified in Sing to the Lord. The congregation also frequently sings Gloria XV, Agnus Dei VIII, and the Gloria from Jeff Ostrowski’s Mass of the English Martyrs, a newly composed English plainsong setting. The
Gospel acclamation, the responses to the prayer of the faithful, the Memorial Acclamation, the
doxology and Great Amen, the Lord’s Prayer, and the dismissal are each sung in English using
chant or chant-like melodies. A few other chants, including some of the hymns specified in the
Sacred Congregation for Divine Worship’s *Jubilate Deo*, are also part of the congregation’s
repertory: *Adoro te devote, Attende Domine, Divinum mysterium, Jesu dulcis memoria, O
Salutaris, Pange lingua, Tantum ergo, Ubi caritas, Veni creator Spiritus*, and the *Magnificat*.
Some of these hymns are sung in Latin, while others have adapted English texts to the original
chant melodies. On weekdays, repeated English responses during the communion procession are
set to chant melodies (e.g., The Almighty has done great things, Mode VII; We Have Seen His
Star, Mode IV; I Will Go to the Altar, Mode IV, etc.). Depending on the liturgical season, the
congregation sings one of the four Marian Antiphons (*Alma Redemptoris mater, Ave Regina
caelorum, Regina caeli, and Salve Regina*) at the conclusion of daily Mass. Organ
accompaniment is provided during the Mass Ordinary, responses, and hymns. The prayer of the
faithful, Lord’s Prayer, and dismissal are typically sung *a cappella*.

Beyond their congregational participation, choristers present other forms of chant during
the liturgy. The set of chants prescribed to the choristers on the most frequent basis is the
entrance chant for Sunday Mass from the *Graduale Romanum*. In order to gain proficiency in
these difficult chants, students chant them at daily Mass (Monday through Thursday) leading up
to each Sunday. Choristers sing the entrance chant from the back of the nave with organ
accompaniment and then begin processing down the main aisle during the final repetition of the
antiphon following the doxology. In addition to the congregational and choral Mass settings,
choristers add *Kyrie* and *Agnus Dei* movements from several other chant Masses into the rotation
during the week, including Mass I, IV, VIII, IX, XI, XII, XIII, XVI, XVII, and XVIII. On Sunday mornings, major feasts, and solemnities, the choirs prepare a *Gloria* setting instead of the *Kyrie* and additionally sing the communion chant unaccompanied. The choristers also employ chant hymns in the liturgy such as *Te Deum*, *Christus factus est*, *Vexilla Regis prodeunt*, *O filii et filiae*, *Regina caeli*, *Veni creator Spiritus*, and *Benedictus es*, Domine.

2.2 Teachers possess effective methods of teaching and promoting chant.

Through exposure to hearing a vast treasury of chant in the Mass from the time they enter the choir school in the pre-kindergarten to studying Latin in grades four through eight, the remaining element that students must learn in choir is to read neume notation. Beginning in the fourth grade, the curriculum states that students will be able to “Read and write in Gregorian Chant notation.”\(^{94}\) In observing a fourth-grade class learning *Agnus Dei XVIII*, after determining how to find DO aurally and visually and singing a minor scale, the students continued by singing the chant on a neutral syllable.\(^{95}\) The instructor played a simple modal harmonic accompaniment on the piano to help keep the chant going. Lucas Tappan notes that chants from the *Kyriale* (containing movements for the Ordinary of the Mass), learning the names of different neumes, how to sing each, and studying the history of chant comprise the primary areas of instruction in the fourth grade.\(^{96}\) Glenn explains the progression of this development that follows:

\(^{94}\) The Madeleine Choir School, “Music Curriculum: Grade 4.”

\(^{95}\) Melanie Malinka, “Fourth Grade Music.”

\(^{96}\) Tappan, “The Madeleine Choir School (Salt Lake City, Utah): A Contemporary American Choral Foundation,” 61.
Over the course of their studies at the choir school, choristers begin to know that particular feasts are related to particular chant introits. They begin to remember the melodies and texts and associate them with feasts. Choristers feel a sense of responsibility to maintain this body of music and pass it on to the next generation. They are kids, but they have a sense that they are doing something pretty noble.\footnote{Glenn, interview.}

Another technique employed at the Madeleine, while probably mostly intended for variety’s sake and musical embellishment, is to have the choir and congregation alternate singing phrases or sections of a chant (e.g., during the *Gloria* and *Credo*). But the secondary dividend this yields is allowing the congregation to hear large parts of the chants sung on a regular basis by the choir, so that on occasions when they are asked to join in the entire chant it is already familiar to them. In fact, some parishioners seated around me did sing along softly during both the choir and congregation portions. In this way, instructional classes outside of Mass are less needed to teach chant to the congregation since they learn it by imitating what they hear in the liturgy.

Gregorian chant, seen as the root of the Catholic musical tradition, is used extensively to inform music used in the liturgy at the Madeleine. The choir program preserves and promotes the use of Gregorian chant regularly through the liturgical music the congregation sings, the chants and chant-based motets the choir sings, and the organ improvisations during the liturgy which incorporate chant motives. A comparison has already been made between the Madeleine and Westminster Cathedral, both of which focus on the traditions of Gregorian chant and Renaissance polyphony. The Madeleine alternates fauxbourdon settings like Dufay’s *Conditor alme siderum* and Binchois’s *Veni creator Spiritus* with plainchant and also uses many settings based on Gregorian tones, such as Lechner’s *Magnificat octavi toni*, Grassi’s *Magnificat octavi toni*, Bevan’s *Magnificat primi toni* and *Magnificat octavi toni*. Chant-based motets and Masses,
including Palestrina’s *Veni creator Spiritus* and *Missa Aeterna Christi munera*, Maurice
Duruflé’s *Ubi caritas* and *Tantum ergo*, and Martin Baker’s *O filii et filiae*, are sung regularly.
In the liturgies I observed, the organist incorporated the introit chant melody into the prelude and
the recessional *Salve Regina* chant into the postlude. As such, the common thread of chant
returns in many forms throughout each liturgy.

*Standard #3:*
*Sacred polyphony is included in liturgical celebrations.*

3.1 The singing of polyphony is employed by the choir, or other capable individuals, in
liturgical and non-liturgical celebrations at times for the benefit of the ecclesial community.

Standards 3-5 of this study will discuss the sacred treasure as it relates to choral
repertoire sung at The Madeleine Choir School. After collecting the music list of all sung choral
works in 2013 from these four choirs, a data base of 203 works was the result.98 Fig. 4.2 reflects
the number of works that are represented from each historical period. The composer(s) that was
most frequently performed among the choirs in that era is listed in the right hand column. Of the
203 works, fifty-four are from the Renaissance, seventeen are from the Baroque, six are from the
Rococo and Classical periods, forty-one are from the Romantic/Cecilian/Oxford era, fifty-three
are from the twentieth century, and thirty-two represent compositions by living composers.

Fig. 4.2 Choral repertoire performed at The Madeleine Choir School in 2013

*The figures below represent repertoire sung by the four choirs used in this study and no other choirs at the school or parish.*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Historical Era</th>
<th>Number of works</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Most represented composer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Renaissance Polyphony</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>Giovanni Pierluigi da Palestrina</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baroque</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>Johann Sebastian Bach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rococo/Classical</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>Wolfgang A. Mozart</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romantic/Cecilian/Oxford</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>Gabriel Fauré R. Vaughan Williams</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twentieth Century</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>Richard Proulx</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Living Composers</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>Colin Mawby</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total number of works</strong></td>
<td><strong>203</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Renaissance polyphony comprises twenty-seven percent, the largest category of choral works performed by the choirs at The Madeleine Choir School (see Fig. 4.2 above). With the exception of the Changed Voice Choir, each of the choirs sang this body of repertoire more or less equally, performing it mainly for Sunday Mass and major solemnities and feasts. From this repertoire, twenty-six motets, anthems, hymns, and canons were used during Offertory and Communion, and nine polyphonic Mass settings were employed during the *Kyrie, Gloria,* and *Agnus Dei* of the Mass. Nineteen additional motets, one hymn, and one *Magnificat* setting were used during Vespers. A passion by Melchor Robledo was sung as part of the Commemoration of the Lord's Passion on Good Friday. The complete list of Renaissance pieces is below (see Fig. 4.3). While polyphonic music was performed only sporadically throughout Ordinary Time and on weekdays, high concentrations did occur during Advent, Holy Week, Easter, and solemnities such as the Assumption of the Blessed Virgin Mary, All Saints, Christ the King, Christmas,
Epiphany, and Pentecost. No polyphonic motets or Masses were performed in non-liturgical settings as part of concerts, and no works for treble-only voices are represented among this period. Nearly all works use Latin text. Works by Giovanni Pierluigi da Palestrina, William Byrd, and Tomás Luis de Victoria occurred most frequently on the Madeleine’s list of polyphonic repertoire. The Italian and Spanish schools are most represented with twelve composers, while the English tradition is also rather highly represented with four composers.

There are several other later composers such as Orlando Gibbons, Antonio Lotti, Anton Bruckner, Charles Stanford, Morten Lauridsen, Francis Poulenc, and Maurice Duruflé, whose works based on this Renaissance *a cappella* style the choir school also performed in 2013 but were not included here.

Fig. 4.3. Choral repertoire in 2013: Renaissance Polyphony (54 out of 203 works) = 27%

SC = Schola; CE = St. Cecilia; GR = St. Gregory; CV = Changed Voice
DO = Divine Office; M = Mass; NL = Non-liturgical

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHOIR</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>COMPOSER</th>
<th>VOICING</th>
<th>GENRE</th>
<th>TEXT</th>
<th>USE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Hic est panis</td>
<td>Aichinger, Gregor</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Miserere mei Deus</td>
<td>Allegri, Gregorio</td>
<td>solos, SSATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>O virgo splendens</td>
<td>Anonymous</td>
<td>SSA</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC, CE</td>
<td>Die nobis, Maria</td>
<td>Bassano, Giovanni</td>
<td>SSATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>Ave verum</td>
<td>Byrd, William</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Ecce virgo concipiet</td>
<td>Byrd, William</td>
<td>SATTB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Haec Dies</td>
<td>Byrd, William</td>
<td>SSATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>Non nobis, Domine</td>
<td>Byrd, William</td>
<td>SAT</td>
<td>canon</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>Mass for Five Voices</td>
<td>Byrd, William</td>
<td>SATTB</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC, CE</td>
<td>Reges Tharsis</td>
<td>Byrd, William</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHOIR</td>
<td>TITLE</td>
<td>COMPOSER</td>
<td>VOICING</td>
<td>GENRE</td>
<td>TEXT</td>
<td>USE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>Rorate caeli desuper</td>
<td>Byrd, William</td>
<td>SATTB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Sing Joyfully</td>
<td>Byrd, William</td>
<td>SSAATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>Conditor alme siderum</td>
<td>Dufay, Guillaume</td>
<td>STB</td>
<td>hymn</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC, GR, CV</td>
<td>Jubilate Deo</td>
<td>Gabrieli, Giovanni</td>
<td>SSAATTBB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Ave virgo sanctissima</td>
<td>Guerrero, Francisco</td>
<td>SSATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>O Domine Jesu Christe</td>
<td>Guerrero, Francisco</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Rorate coeli</td>
<td>Guerrero, Francisco</td>
<td>ATTB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Aboriente venerunt magi</td>
<td>Handl, Jacob</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Tribus miraculis</td>
<td>Hassler, Hans Leo</td>
<td>SAATTBB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Magnificat octavi toni</td>
<td>Lechner, Leonhard</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>canticle</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Missa Maria Magdalene</td>
<td>Lobo, Alonso</td>
<td>SSATBB</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>Hodie Christus natus est</td>
<td>Marenzio, Luca</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>O magnum mysterium</td>
<td>Morales, Cristobal de</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Quanti mercernarii</td>
<td>Morales, Cristobal de</td>
<td>SATBB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Diffusa est gratia</td>
<td>Nanino, Giovanni Maria</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Ascendo ad Patrem</td>
<td>Palestrina, Giovanni P. d.</td>
<td>SATTB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>Ave Maria à 5</td>
<td>Palestrina, Giovanni P. d.</td>
<td>SSATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>Benedictus sit Sancta Trinitas</td>
<td>Palestrina, Giovanni P. d.</td>
<td>SATTB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Constitues eos principes</td>
<td>Palestrina, Giovanni P. d.</td>
<td>SATTB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Dum compleruntur</td>
<td>Palestrina, Giovanni P. d.</td>
<td>SAATTB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>Inveni David</td>
<td>Palestrina, Giovanni P. d.</td>
<td>SATTB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>Lauda anima mea</td>
<td>Palestrina, Giovanni P. d.</td>
<td>SATTB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Missa Aeterna Christimunera</td>
<td>Palestrina, Giovanni P. d.</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHOIR</td>
<td>TITLE</td>
<td>COMPOSER</td>
<td>VOICING</td>
<td>GENRE</td>
<td>TEXT</td>
<td>USE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC, GR, CV</td>
<td>Missa brevis</td>
<td>Palestrina, Giovanni P. d.</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>Missa Papae Marcelli</td>
<td>Palestrina, Giovanni P. d.</td>
<td>SATTBB</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>Oravi ad Dominum</td>
<td>Palestrina, Giovanni P. d.</td>
<td>SATTB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>Recordare mei Domine</td>
<td>Palestrina, Giovanni P. d.</td>
<td>SATTB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC, CE</td>
<td>Sicut cervus desiderat</td>
<td>Palestrina, Giovanni P. d.</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Veni creator Spiritus</td>
<td>Palestrina, Giovanni P. d.</td>
<td>SATTB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Ecce vicit Leo</td>
<td>Philips, Peter</td>
<td>SATB/SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>Veni creator Spiritus</td>
<td>Plainsong/Binchois</td>
<td>SAT</td>
<td>hymn</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Missa à 5</td>
<td>Robledo, Melchor</td>
<td>SSATB</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>The Passion of St. John</td>
<td>Robledo (adapt. O’Neill)</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>passion</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Loquebantur variis linguis</td>
<td>Tallis, Thomas</td>
<td>SSATTBB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>O salutaris hostia</td>
<td>Tallis, Thomas</td>
<td>SATBB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC, CE</td>
<td>Salvator mundi</td>
<td>Tallis, Thomas</td>
<td>SAATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Dum transisset sabbatum</td>
<td>Taverner, John</td>
<td>SATBB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>Exsultate justi in Domino</td>
<td>Viadana, Lodovico</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Missa ‘O magnum mysterium’</td>
<td>Victoria, Tomás Luis de</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Missa ‘O quam gloriosum’</td>
<td>Victoria, Tomás Luis de</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR, CV</td>
<td>Missa quarti toni</td>
<td>Victoria, Tomás Luis de</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>O quam gloriosum</td>
<td>Victoria, Tomás Luis de</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>O sacrum convivium à 4</td>
<td>Victoria, Tomás Luis de</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>O sacrum convivium à 6</td>
<td>Victoria, Tomás Luis de</td>
<td>SAATBB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Because the men of the choir are scheduled to sing with the choristers each Sunday, for special feasts, and on solemnities, congregants are given an opportunity to hear mixed-voice polyphony weekly on average. Since such a high concentration of polyphony is employed during liturgies, there is no need to supplement concert performances at the cathedral with this type of music very often. Due to the absence of men, this repertoire is typically not performed on weekdays where the practice of treble-only repertoire has become the norm. The musical elaboration that this polyphony contributes is instead used to raise the degree of progressive solemnity and is reserved for the most important days in the liturgical year. Chant intonations precede the polyphony where appropriate, and the organ also provides improvisation leading to and from the choral music so that the polyphony is interwoven quite naturally into the liturgical actions taking place.

**Standard #4:**
*The treasure of sacred music is preserved and fostered with great care.*

4.1 The singing of all the different types of sacred music that exist within the church treasury (e.g., Masses, antiphons, motets, anthems, hymns, cantatas, oratorios) is employed by the choir, or other individuals, in liturgical and non-liturgical celebrations for the glory of God and sanctification of the faithful.

Aside from the twenty-seven percent of Renaissance works already discussed and the sixteen percent of pieces by living composers which will be discussed in section five, music from the Baroque, Rococo, Classical, Romantic, Cecilian, Oxford, and twentieth century periods comprises the remaining fifty-seven percent (see Fig. 4.4-4.7 below). Masses, requiems, passions, antiphons, motets, anthems, carols, hymns, canticles, reproaches, cantatas, oratorios,
and sacred operas are among the genres represented. While many of these works are used in the liturgy, the annual concert series offers an important outlet for the choristers to perform larger, non-liturgical sacred works of significance. The choir school and guest artists perform nearly twenty concerts at the cathedral each season, which aids in strengthening the spiritual life of attendees and serves as a key part of the cathedral’s mission of evangelization.

The Baroque period, comprising eight percent of the choirs’ repertoire, is characterized by music of two styles (see Fig. 4.4). The Schola engaged music of the *prima pratica* style, with its densely imitative texture for mixed voices, most frequently to commemorate important liturgical days. The St. Cecilia Choir, using treble-voices only on weeknights, sang music of the *seconda pratica* with the highest frequency, performing it with organ accompaniment during the Offertory of Mass. Nearly half of the works represented in this historical era are for treble voices, the highest concentration of any period on the Madeleine’s music list. Since J. S. Bach is the most frequently sung composer, students often sing works in German. Composers such as Orlando Gibbons, George Frideric Handel, and Henry Purcell provide anthems for the choirs to sing in English.
Fig. 4.4. Choral repertoire in 2013: Baroque (17 out of 203 works) = 8%

SC = Schola; CE = St. Cecilia; GR = St. Gregory; CV = Changed Voice
DO = Divine Office; M = Mass; NL = Non-liturgical

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHOIR TITLE</th>
<th>COMPOSER</th>
<th>VOICING</th>
<th>GENRE</th>
<th>TEXT</th>
<th>USE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Christ lag in todesbanden, BWV 4</td>
<td>Bach, J. S.</td>
<td>SATB, orch.</td>
<td>cantata</td>
<td>German</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Derr Herr ist mein, BWV 112</td>
<td>Bach, J. S.</td>
<td>SATB, orch.</td>
<td>cantata</td>
<td>German</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jesu, Joy of Man’s Desiring, BWV 147</td>
<td>Bach, J. S.</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>cantata</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lobet den Herrn, BWV 230</td>
<td>Bach, J. S.</td>
<td>SATB, cont.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>German</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schafe können sicher weiden, BWV 208</td>
<td>Bach, J. S.</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>cantata</td>
<td>German</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confitemini Domino</td>
<td>Constantini, Alessandro</td>
<td>SSA</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ut flos ut rosa</td>
<td>Crivelli, Giovanni Battista</td>
<td>SA</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hosanna to the Son of David</td>
<td>Gibbons, Orlando</td>
<td>SSAATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For Unto Us a Child is Born</td>
<td>Handel, G. F.</td>
<td>SATB, orch.</td>
<td>oratorio</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wash Me Throughly</td>
<td>Handel, G. F.</td>
<td>SS, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pater peccavi</td>
<td>Lobo, Duarte</td>
<td>SSATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crucifixus</td>
<td>Lotti, Antonio</td>
<td>SSAATTBB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mass in Bb</td>
<td>Lotti, Antonio</td>
<td>SSA</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mesa à 4 voci</td>
<td>Monteverdi, Claudio</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missa Ego flos campi</td>
<td>Padilla, Juan Gutiérrez de</td>
<td>SATB, SATB</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evening Prayer</td>
<td>Purcell, Henry</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tantum ergo</td>
<td>Tartini, Giuseppe</td>
<td>SSA or TTB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Rococo and Classical periods, comprising only three percent, represent the smallest number of choral works performed from any era (see Fig. 4.5). Because of the duration of the works and demand for soloists and orchestral accompaniment, the choirs at the Madeleine perform these Masses only on Christmas and Easter and the Stabat Mater on Good Friday. In addition to singing the Gloria and Agnus Dei from these settings, the choirs also take the rare opportunity on these more festive occasions to sing the Sanctus movements during the Mass.

The First Viennese School, consisting of such composers as Franz Joseph Haydn and Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart, represents the repertoire from this period almost exclusively. The texts utilize church Latin.

Fig. 4.5. Choral repertoire in 2013: Rococo/Classical (6 out of 203 works) = 3%

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHOIR</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>COMPOSER</th>
<th>VOICING</th>
<th>GENRE</th>
<th>TEXT</th>
<th>USE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>Missa S. Nicolai</td>
<td>Haydn, Franz Joseph</td>
<td>soloists, SATB, orch.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Ave verum corpus</td>
<td>Mozart, Wolfgang A.</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>Missa solemnis in C, KV 337</td>
<td>Mozart, Wolfgang A.</td>
<td>soloists, SATB, orch.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>Stabat Mater</td>
<td>Pergolesi, Giovanni B.</td>
<td>SA, str.</td>
<td>hymn</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Romantic period, inclusive of musical influences from the Cecilian and Oxford movements, comprises twenty percent of the school’s repertory (see Fig. 4.6). Composers such as Anton Bruckner, Joseph Rheinberger, Michael Haller, César Franck, and Gabriel Fauré contribute many works that are particularly appropriate for the liturgy; compositional elements found in some of their music loosely parallel Cecilian ideas. Edward Elgar, Charles Parry, Robert Lucas de Pearsall, John Stainer, Charles Stanford, and Ralph Vaughan Williams are among the composers whose music contributed to the Oxford Movement in English church music. Other works composed in the Romantic style, giving students experience singing in German and Slavonic, include those by German composers Brahms and Mendelssohn as well as Russian composer Rachmaninoff. Representing a wide variety of voicing possibilities, *a cappella* mixed-voice repertoire is often employed for Sundays and feasts, while smaller-force works with organ are easily performed by the choristers during weeknight Masses.

Fig. 4.6. Choral repertoire in 2013: Romantic/Cecilian movement/Oxford movement (41 out of 203 works) = 20%

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHOIR</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>COMPOSER</th>
<th>VOICING</th>
<th>GENRE</th>
<th>TEXT</th>
<th>USE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>Psalm 13: Herr, wie lange willst du mich</td>
<td>Brahms, Johannes</td>
<td>SSA, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>German</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Ave Maria</td>
<td>Bruckner, Anton</td>
<td>SAATTBB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Christus factus est</td>
<td>Bruckner, Anton</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>Os justi</td>
<td>Bruckner, Anton</td>
<td>SSAATTBB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Virga Jesse</td>
<td>Bruckner, Anton</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>Messe Breve</td>
<td>Delibes, Leo</td>
<td>SA, org.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR, CV</td>
<td>Ave verum corpus</td>
<td>Elgar, Edward</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHOIR</td>
<td>TITLE</td>
<td>COMPOSER</td>
<td>VOICING</td>
<td>GENRE</td>
<td>TEXT</td>
<td>USE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR, CV</td>
<td>O salutaris hostia</td>
<td>Elgar, Edward</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>hymn</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Ave verum corpus</td>
<td>Fauré, Gabriel</td>
<td>SA, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR, CV</td>
<td>Cantique de Jean Racine</td>
<td>Fauré, Gabriel</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR, CV</td>
<td>Ecce fidelis servus</td>
<td>Fauré, Gabriel</td>
<td>STB, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Messe basse</td>
<td>Fauré, Gabriel</td>
<td>SSA, org.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR</td>
<td>Pie Jesu</td>
<td>Fauré, Gabriel</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>requiem</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>Tantum ergo</td>
<td>Fauré, Gabriel</td>
<td>SSA, org.</td>
<td>hymn</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>Panis angelicus</td>
<td>Franck, César</td>
<td>SA, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>Messe secunda</td>
<td>Haller, Michael</td>
<td>SAB</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Missa Tertia</td>
<td>Haller, Michael</td>
<td>SA, org.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Psalm 43: Richte mich, Gott</td>
<td>Mendelssohn, F.</td>
<td>SSAATTBB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>German</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>Laudate pueri</td>
<td>Mendelssohn, F.</td>
<td>SSA, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>Lift Thine Eyes</td>
<td>Mendelssohn, F.</td>
<td>SSA</td>
<td>oratorio</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>Veni Domine</td>
<td>Mendelssohn, F.</td>
<td>SSA, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>I was Glad</td>
<td>Parry, Charles H. H.</td>
<td>SSATTB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Tu es Petrus</td>
<td>Pearsall, R. L. de</td>
<td>SSAATTBB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Bogoroditsye, Dyevo</td>
<td>Rachmaninoff, S.</td>
<td>SATB (divisi)</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Slavonic</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Dnes spaseniye</td>
<td>Rachmaninoff, S.</td>
<td>SSAATTBB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Slavonic</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Nine otpushchayeshi</td>
<td>Rachmaninoff, S.</td>
<td>Tsolo, SATB(divisi)</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Slavonic</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>Voskreseniye Hristovo videvshe</td>
<td>Rachmaninoff, S.</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Slavonic</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>Ave vivens hostia</td>
<td>Rheinberger, Josef</td>
<td>SSA, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>Inclina Domine</td>
<td>Rheinberger, Josef</td>
<td>SA, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Twenty-six percent of choral works performed by the Madeleine are from the twentieth century (see Fig. 4.7). The St. Cecilia and St. Gregory Choir engaged this body of repertoire with the highest frequency, performing a vast trove of treble-voice works for week-night Masses on Tuesday through Thursday and mixed repertoire with the Changed Voice Choir and men on other occasions. Out of all the historical periods represented on the Madeline’s list of repertoire, the largest number of Mass settings hails from this era. All of the Masses are set with Latin text, no doubt as a result of the discordance among English settings with the new translations; six are scored for treble voices and organ. The *Kyrie*, *Agnus Dei*, and sometimes *Gloria* movements are extracted from these settings to be sung chorally. The highest number of larger works employed...
in non-liturgical settings also comes from this period. Benjamin Britten’s cantatas *A Ceremony of Carols* and *St. Nicolas*, Herbert Howells’s requiem *Take Him, Earth, For Cherishing*, and Francis Poulenc’s *Gloria* are examples of works performed in concert settings. The majority of the composers on the list are American and British, accounting for the substantial number of works set with English texts. The most represented of these composers include Richard Proulx, composer-in-residence at The Cathedral of the Madeleine from 1994 to 1995, and Russell Woollen, one of the founding faculty members of the music department at The Catholic University of America. France and Belgium are also well represented; Latin Masses and motets by Marcel Dupré, Maurice Duruflé, Jean Langlais, Olivier Messiaen, Flor Peeters, Francis Poulenc, and Rene Quignard are heavily employed in liturgy by the choirs. Overall, a wide variety of voicings, genres, and texts are represented by the music of this period.

![Image](https://via.placeholder.com/150)

**Fig. 4.7. Choral repertoire in 2013: twentieth century (53 out of 203 works) = 26%**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHOIR</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>COMPOSER</th>
<th>VOICING</th>
<th>GENRE</th>
<th>TEXT</th>
<th>USE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>I Sat Down Under His Shadow</td>
<td>Bairstow, Edward</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>O salutaris hostia</td>
<td>Bedell, Robert</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>A Ceremony of Carols</td>
<td>Britten, Benjamin</td>
<td>SSA, harp</td>
<td>cantata</td>
<td>Old Eng.</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR</td>
<td>Corpus Christi Carol</td>
<td>Britten, Benjamin</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>carol</td>
<td>Old Eng.</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Missa Brevis in D</td>
<td>Britten, Benjamin</td>
<td>SSA, org.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>Nigra sum</td>
<td>Casals, Pablo</td>
<td>SSA, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>O vos omnes</td>
<td>Casals, Pablo</td>
<td>SATB divisi</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHOIR</td>
<td>TITLE</td>
<td>COMPOSER</td>
<td>VOICING</td>
<td>GENRE</td>
<td>TEXT</td>
<td>USE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>He is Risen</td>
<td>Cope, Cecil</td>
<td>2-pt. mx., org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Ave verum corpus</td>
<td>Dupré, Marcel</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>O salutaris hostia</td>
<td>Dupré, Marcel</td>
<td>soloists, SATB, org.</td>
<td>hymn</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>Tantum ergo</td>
<td>Duruflé, Maurice</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>hymn</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>Tota pulchra es</td>
<td>Duruflé, Maurice</td>
<td>SSAA</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR, CV</td>
<td>Ubi caritas</td>
<td>Duruflé, Maurice</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>Magnificat octavi toni</td>
<td>Grassi, Ciro</td>
<td>SSA</td>
<td>canticle</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>The Baptism of Christ</td>
<td>Hallock, Peter</td>
<td>solo, SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>Eng./Lat.</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Nunc dimittis</td>
<td>Holst, Gustav</td>
<td>SSAATTBB</td>
<td>canticle</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR, CV</td>
<td>Take Him, Earth, For Cherishing</td>
<td>Howells, Herbert</td>
<td>SATB (divisi)</td>
<td>requiem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Brother James' Air</td>
<td>Jacob, Gordon (arr.)</td>
<td>unison, desc., org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Missa Brevis</td>
<td>Kodály, Zoltán</td>
<td>soloists, SATB, orch.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>Psalm 150</td>
<td>Kodály, Zoltán</td>
<td>SSA</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Messe Solennelle</td>
<td>Langlais, Jean</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Missa in simplicitate</td>
<td>Langlais, Jean</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Domine exaudi</td>
<td>Malcolm, George</td>
<td>SSA</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>E’enSo, Lord Jesus, Quickly Come</td>
<td>Manz, Paul</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR</td>
<td>Regina coeli</td>
<td>Mauro-Cottone, M.</td>
<td>solo, 2 vv.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC, CE</td>
<td>O sacrum convivium</td>
<td>Messiaen, Olivier</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Adam Lay Ybounden</td>
<td>Ord, Boris</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Ave Maria</td>
<td>Peeters, Flor</td>
<td>SA, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHOIR</td>
<td>TITLE</td>
<td>COMPOSER</td>
<td>VOICING</td>
<td>GENRE</td>
<td>TEXT</td>
<td>USE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Ave verum</td>
<td>Peeters, Flor</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>Missa in honorem St. Josephi</td>
<td>Peeters, Flor</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>Gloria</td>
<td>Poulenc, Francis</td>
<td>SATB divi, orch.</td>
<td>Mass mvt.</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Vinea mea electa</td>
<td>Poulenc, Francis</td>
<td>SATB divisi</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>Missa Brevis</td>
<td>Pranschke, Johannes</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>Easter Carol</td>
<td>Proulx, Richard</td>
<td>SAB, org., fl.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Ecce quam bonum</td>
<td>Proulx, Richard</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>Lat./Eng.</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>How Blest Are They</td>
<td>Proulx, Richard</td>
<td>unison., org., fl.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>In te speravi</td>
<td>Proulx, Richard</td>
<td>SA, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR, CV</td>
<td>Jesu, The Very Thought of Thee</td>
<td>Proulx, Richard</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Of the Kindness of the Lord</td>
<td>Proulx, Richard</td>
<td>SA, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR, CV</td>
<td>The Joys of Mary</td>
<td>Proulx, Richard</td>
<td>SATB, org., bells</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>Mass in Honor of St. Teresa</td>
<td>Quignard, René</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>Cantique de Nöel</td>
<td>Rutter, John (arr.)</td>
<td>SATB, orch.</td>
<td>carol</td>
<td>Eng./Fr.</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Improperia</td>
<td>Sanders, John</td>
<td>SSAATTBB</td>
<td>reproaches</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>Song for Athene</td>
<td>Tavener, John</td>
<td>SATB (divisi)</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>A Prayer of St. Richard of Chichester</td>
<td>White, L.J.</td>
<td>SA, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>Rejoice Greatly</td>
<td>Willan, Healey</td>
<td>SA, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>Missa Ave Maria, op. 55</td>
<td>Woollen, Russell</td>
<td>SA or SB, org.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>Missa simplex, op. 32</td>
<td>Woollen, Russell</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Gesù Bambino</td>
<td>Yon, Pietro</td>
<td>solo, SATB, org.</td>
<td>carol</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Throughout the centuries, traditional Latin hymn texts, such as *Ave verum corpus, Veni creator Spiritus, O salutaris hostia, Tantum ergo, O sacrum convivium,* and *Ave Maria* have been set to original music and formed into choral motets by composers. Aside from these hymn-motets, the choirs’ main body of hymns is drawn from numerous hymnal sources, which were cited previously in section 1.5. In implementing the curricular objective to “sing and study repertoire unique to the choral tradition of the Roman Catholic Church,” students and all those who experience this vast treasure of music play a part in preserving the Church’s rich history spanning the last two millennia.

**Standard #5:**
*Composers cultivate new works of sacred music to increase the church’s store of treasures.*

5.1 Sacred works by recent and living composers are among those taught and employed by Catholic institutions.

Compositions by living composers comprise the remaining sixteen percent of works performed by the choir school in 2013 (see Fig. 4.8). The St. Cecilia and St. Gregory choirs engaged this body of repertoire with the highest frequency, performing the Mass settings, motets, and anthems with organ accompaniment during the Ordinary and Offertory sections of the Mass on weeknights. The *Kyrie* and *Agnus Dei* movements are extracted from these settings and sung chorally. A large number of the mixed-voice works, both accompanied and unaccompanied, are also performed by these choirs when they combine with the men. The majority of the works are by composers from the British Isles, Collin Mawby being the most represented. Other works include compositions by Martin Baker, master of music at Westminster Cathedral, and Scottish

---

99 The Madeleine Choir School, “Music Curriculum: Grade 5-8.”
composer James MacMillan. A large number of pieces are also by American composers, including cathedral Music Director Gregory Glenn. Other U.S. composers include Gerald Near, Morten Lauridsen, Frank Ferko, Kevin Allen, and Joel Martinson. Works composed by Madeleine staff often indicate the composer as “Liber Magdalenensis.” Half employ English texts and the other half Latin or Spanish.

Fig. 4.8. Choral repertoire in 2013: living composers (32 out of 203 works) = 16%

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHOIR</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>COMPOSER</th>
<th>PERIOD</th>
<th>VOICING</th>
<th>GENRE</th>
<th>TEXT</th>
<th>USE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GR</td>
<td>Litany to the Holy Spirit</td>
<td>Hurford, Peter</td>
<td>b. 1930</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>Ave verum</td>
<td>Mawby, Colin</td>
<td>b. 1936</td>
<td>SSAATTBB, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>Haec dies</td>
<td>Mawby, Colin</td>
<td>b. 1936</td>
<td>SSA, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR</td>
<td>Thy Word is a Lamp to my Feet</td>
<td>Mawby, Colin</td>
<td>b. 1936</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>King of Glory, King of Peace</td>
<td>Walker, David C.</td>
<td>b. 1938</td>
<td>choir, org., opt. cong.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Mary’s Magnificat</td>
<td>Carter, Andrew</td>
<td>b. 1939</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>Berkeley Missa Brevis</td>
<td>Near, Gerald</td>
<td>b. 1942</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>The Best of Rooms</td>
<td>Near, Gerald</td>
<td>b. 1942</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC, CE</td>
<td>O Magnum Mysterium</td>
<td>Lauridsen, Morten</td>
<td>b. 1943</td>
<td>SATB (divisi)</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR, CV</td>
<td>Ave Maria</td>
<td>Lindley, Simon</td>
<td>b. 1948</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>O God, My Heart is Ready</td>
<td>Lindley, Simon</td>
<td>b. 1948</td>
<td>2-pt., org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>The Echo Carol</td>
<td>Wilby, Philip</td>
<td>b. 1949</td>
<td>3 treble vv., org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>Laus Trinitati</td>
<td>Ferko, Frank</td>
<td>b. 1950</td>
<td>SATB (divisi)</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Magnificat octavi toni</td>
<td>Bevan, David</td>
<td>b. 1951</td>
<td>SSAATTBB</td>
<td>canticle</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC, CE</td>
<td>Magnificat prii toni</td>
<td>Bevan, David</td>
<td>b. 1951</td>
<td>SSATTB</td>
<td>canticle</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHOIR</td>
<td>TITLE</td>
<td>COMPOSER</td>
<td>PERIOD</td>
<td>VOICING</td>
<td>GENRE</td>
<td>TEXT</td>
<td>USE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>O magnum mysterium</td>
<td>La Rocca, Frank</td>
<td>b. 1951</td>
<td>SATB (divisi)</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>Tantum ergo</td>
<td>Sitton, Michael</td>
<td>b. 1958</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE</td>
<td>A Child’s Prayer</td>
<td>MacMillan, James</td>
<td>b. 1959</td>
<td>trebles solos, SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR</td>
<td>St. Anne’s Mass</td>
<td>MacMillan, James</td>
<td>b. 1959</td>
<td>unison, org., opt. SATB choir</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>1 Give You A New Commandment</td>
<td>Glenn, G. (arr.)</td>
<td>b. 1960</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>Missa ‘Sine nomine’</td>
<td>Glenn, Gregory</td>
<td>b. 1960</td>
<td>SA</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>Stetit angelus</td>
<td>Glenn, Gregory</td>
<td>b. 1960</td>
<td>SA, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>God So Loved the World</td>
<td>Martinson, Joel</td>
<td>b. 1960</td>
<td>SA, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC GR CV</td>
<td>Missa Guadalupe</td>
<td>Martinson, Joel</td>
<td>b. 1960</td>
<td>SATB, org., brass, timpani, opt. oboe</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Eng./Sp.</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>Teach Me, O Lord</td>
<td>Moger, Peter</td>
<td>b. 1964</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR</td>
<td>Tantum ergo</td>
<td>Allen, Kevin</td>
<td>b. 1965</td>
<td>SSA or TTB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE, GR CV</td>
<td>O filii et filiae</td>
<td>Baker, Martin</td>
<td>b. 1967</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Christ the Lord is a Priest Forever</td>
<td>Liber Magdalenensis</td>
<td></td>
<td>SATB divisi</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Cristo te necesita</td>
<td>Liber Magdalenensis</td>
<td></td>
<td>SATB divisi, orch., guitar</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR, CV</td>
<td>Este nuevo mandamiento</td>
<td>Liber Magdalenensis</td>
<td></td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Missa in honorem S. Josephi</td>
<td>Liber Magdalenensis</td>
<td></td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Though not represented among the list of choral repertoire, the choirs incorporate a good deal of ritual music written by modern and living composers, in particular, settings by Richard
Proulx and Leo Nestor, both of whom served as composers-in-residence at the Madeleine in 1994 and 2008 respectively. Previous organists of the cathedral have also contributed a number of smaller responses to the library, such as choral verses for the Gospel acclamation, which the choirs frequently use. Adaptable settings integrating the new 2011 English translation of the Roman Missal by Jeff Ostrowski, Kevin Allen, and other composers of the Corpus Christi Watershed project are also employed. In April 2013, choristers performed the children’s opera *Shoes for the Santo Niño*, by composer Stephen Paulus, who was still living at that time.

5.2 Reasons for adding new works to the treasure of sacred music are identified.

The choir school has had a number of reasons for adding newly composed works of sacred music to their repertory in recent years. Ritual music was necessary to not only meet the requirements of the liturgy but also to fit the particular congregational-chorister dynamic at the Madeleine. Music was needed that accommodated strong congregational singing of Mass parts and responses while providing more sophisticated choral passages for the choristers. As referenced in section 5.1, Richard Proulx, Leo Nestor, Gregory Glenn, and previous cathedral organists have provided such specifically tailored settings. Glenn states, “Leo Nestor and Richard Proulx have written a lot of the things for The Madeleine Choir School which are going out to be published.”\(^\text{100}\) While some of these compositions are being made available to the general public, others remain unpublished. For this reason, as is the case with institutions of this type, the music is sometimes difficult to obtain. Projects such as the Corpus Christi Watershed

\(^{100}\) Glenn, interview.
have assisted in making some “in-house” compositions like this more widely available. Furthermore, with the increasing Spanish population at the cathedral in recent years, the requirement for more liturgical choral settings in Spanish became apparent. Leo Nestor composed many pieces for this purpose during his residency. Likewise, with the new English translations of the Roman Missal in 2011, there was a need to revise previous Mass settings, such as those of Richard Proulx, and also to find quality new compositions that could be used in the liturgy. According to Glenn, “It is important to continue development of the treasury. By inviting, encouraging, and commissioning composers to write new settings, we are bringing something from our era and adding it to the treasury.”  

Because choristers sing for daily Mass as well as numerous other liturgies and concerts throughout the year, the sheer volume of music needed puts the choir school in a unique position of championing new works to satisfy this constant demand.

5.3 Sources that serve as inspiration for composers to create new music for the church are identified.

Based on the kind of programs they have chosen to imitate, namely Westminster Cathedral, and the annual repertoire list they employ, it is evident that The Madeleine Choir School is focused heavily on reflecting the traditions of Gregorian chant and Renaissance polyphony. As cited above, while the choirs sing an abundance of music from the Medieval and Renaissance periods, many of the later compositions they use also reflect these same styles. In regards to new compositions for the church, Glenn states, “Chant is still a strong source of

\[101\] Ibid.
inspiration. Within these plainsong-like settings, the modal character is preserved, but at the same time they are clearly modern.” At the Madeleine, the ancient musical tradition of the Church serves as a vital wellspring for modern compositions of liturgical music.

5.4 Criteria which makes some pieces of sacred music more appropriate than others for the liturgy is acknowledged.

In addition to being grounded in the musical traditions of chant and polyphony, new compositions must take into account a number of liturgical considerations. According to Glenn, “You have to find literature that is not disruptive of the ritual of the Mass. The length and timing of a piece is important. A Kyrie or Gloria should not overwhelm the opening rites.” In trying to promote the treasury or incorporate new compositions, a distinction must be made between repertoire that is more suitable for concert settings and that which is appropriate for the liturgy. In order to admit a piece of music into the liturgy, it is important that the meaning of the liturgical prayer be reflected compositionally, says Glenn:

Some modern composers have adopted the structure of past Mass settings, for example relating the Kyrie and Agnus Dei to one another musically. Understanding how the Gloria and Sanctus function in the Mass and composing music that is consonant with this idea is something I look for.

In order to write music that will adequately serve the demands of the liturgy, musical as well as liturgical and theological guidelines such as these must be considered.

102 Ibid.
103 Ibid.
104 Ibid.
**Standard #6:**
*The faithful are led to full, conscious, and active participation in liturgical celebrations.*

6.1 Sung parts of the liturgy foster both the internal and external participation of the congregation in liturgical celebrations.

As early as the cathedral’s dedication, the Madeleine has relied on the liturgy itself to invite participation, as evidenced by the elaborate celebratory procession with hosts of choir boys, young women, and clergy for this occasion in 1909. Following the Second Vatican Council, and leading up to the founding of the choir school in 1996, came revitalization in the liturgical life of the cathedral. With the appointment of Monsignor Francis Mannion as rector in 1984, the spiritual life and the shape of the liturgy at the cathedral began to be transformed. This type of profound dedication to the liturgy included a focus on sacred art, architecture, and music. As a result, the choir school played a key role in implementing Mannion’s liturgical vision. Over the past two decades, the cathedral has worked to use art, architecture, and music as a means of engaging the congregation in a deeper participation in the liturgy. On a regular basis, staff members give tours, expounding upon the theology reflected in the cathedral’s art and architecture. During my visit, an art historian gave a stewardship testimony during the Mass where she explained many symbolic meanings behind various pieces seen in the building. Educating members of the congregation on matters of sacred music has also been a priority. Most recently Glenn has offered classes on drawing spiritual meaning from the Mass, including the musical elements. This was an opportunity to talk about things such as what to do when the choir is singing a *Kyrie*. For Glenn “long *Kyries* are not a problem because there is so much difficulty and horror in the world, to have that more extended musical and prayerful moment
where the church implores the mercy of God. There is so much to implore God’s mercy for, and one has to enter into that, and hopefully the music invites that reaction.”

By continuing to develop spirituality in these kinds of ways, congregants are developing a better sense of their internal and external roles in the liturgy.

At the liturgies I observed, there was noticeable external congregational participation as well as signs of intentness and interior participation when it was the choir’s turn to sing. To the extent that assessment is possible, the fact that most of the congregation remained silent and reverent during the choral pieces may suggest that they were engaged and joining their hearts and minds to that which was being sung. Though already referenced in section 1.5 of this chapter, further analysis of how repertoire and the division of musical roles impact congregational participation will now be conducted.

The choristers sang for four different types of liturgies at the cathedral during my visit – a school Mass, a parish Mass for the Solemnity of All Saints, Sunday High Mass, and weeknight Masses. Using the same process as I explained in the previous school, once again I timed and digitally recorded five of the liturgies I attended and then calculated the timing of individual musical elements, documenting which participants were involved. The results of these calculations are illustrated below in Fig. 4.9. Overall singing comprised forty-seven percent of the duration of the Masses on average; there were several instances when liturgical actions were taking place simultaneously with the music. The deacon and cantor roles have been combined with the presider and congregational roles respectively as they were too small to calculate individually. Solo organ repertoire is not included in this figure. Even with the choristers

105 Ibid.
singing forty-two percent of this music by themselves, the highest percentage out of all three schools in this study, the congregation, cantor, presider, and deacon still physically participated fifty-eight percent of the time in the sung music of the Mass. The four roles have been combined since the congregation is often singing together or in dialogue with the cantor, presider, or deacon. It is important to note that while in the past, during Monsignor Mannion’s tenure, these dialogical exchanges and parts which the priest and people sing together were sung consistently in the liturgy, barely any of these responses are being sung by the current priests or deacons.

Fig. 4.9 Calculation procedure for determining amount of singing by the presider/deacon, choir, and congregation/cantor in the five liturgies observed at The Madeleine Choir School (minutes : seconds)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STEP 1: Amount sung at each liturgy</th>
<th>STEP 2: Amount sung at all five liturgies</th>
<th>STEP 3: Average amount sung at liturgies</th>
<th>STEP 4: Division of sung parts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Liturgy #1</td>
<td>Liturgy #2</td>
<td>Liturgy #3</td>
<td>Liturgy #4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friday, 1 November 2013</td>
<td>Friday, 1 November 2013</td>
<td>Sunday, 3 November 2013</td>
<td>Monday, 4 November 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:00-1:27 p.m.</td>
<td>6:00-7:15 p.m.</td>
<td>11:00 a.m.-12:30 p.m.</td>
<td>5:15-6:00 p.m.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School Mass Solemnity of All Saints</td>
<td>Parish Mass Solemnity of All Saints</td>
<td>Parish Mass</td>
<td>Parish Mass Feast of St Charles Borromeo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presider/Deacon</td>
<td>Choir</td>
<td>Cong./Cantor</td>
<td>Total Sung</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0:55</td>
<td>14:45</td>
<td>21:30</td>
<td>37:10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2:05</td>
<td>19:20</td>
<td>22:40</td>
<td>42:00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0:00</td>
<td>19:25</td>
<td>22:30</td>
<td>41:55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0:45</td>
<td>7:15</td>
<td>11:35</td>
<td>18:50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0:45</td>
<td>68:00</td>
<td>11:35</td>
<td>18:50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4:30</td>
<td>19.88%</td>
<td>89:50</td>
<td>47.47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.77%</td>
<td>41.89%</td>
<td>89:50</td>
<td>52.53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.32%</td>
<td>19.88%</td>
<td>26.27%</td>
<td>47.47%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Many, but not all, factors contribute to the congregation’s successful participation in the liturgy both externally and internally. The lack of sung intonations and musical leadership by the clergy, as cited above, creates disadvantages when attempting to get the congregation singing some of the most basic and natural responses inherent to the liturgy. The other musical components led by the cantor and choir generally have strong congregational participation. The large interior of the cathedral, while it carries sung words more effectively than spoken words, also presents challenges acoustically with its three-second delay. As a result, several things must be done to build a sense of cohesiveness in the assembly, who are positioned in between the choir in the front and the organ in the back gallery. Since the choir is not visible from its place behind a screen in back of the altar, having a cantor in front of the pulpit was helpful for proclaiming the psalm, chanting the petitions, and prompting the congregation’s responses. Combined with the fact that the organ was used to accompany everything the congregation sang, except the prayer of the faithful, Great Amen, Lord’s Prayer, and dismissal, confident participation by the congregation was promoted, even during the weeknight liturgies when individuals were scattered around the building’s large interior. Printed worship leaflets were used at the choral Masses in place of hymnals or missalettes. These contained the Order of the Mass, titles and English translations of sung texts, musical notation for the congregational portions, and texts to the scripture readings specific to the day or occasion. A small number of Worship III hymnals were the only resource found in the pews since they contain the scripture readings for those times when the full texts do not appear in the leaflet. Having worship leaflets allowed the congregation to follow along and participate more easily than missalettes and hymnals, which require constant flipping back and forth to get to the correct place. Worship
leaflets offer great flexibility in the types of music that can be included in the liturgy since material from a variety of sources can be utilized. They also eliminate the need for verbal announcements before each hymn, sparing the liturgy of these interruptions. Organ improvisation connected transitions and contributed to the general flow between various elements of the Mass. Amidst the music and singing, the effective use of silence also occurred at prescribed moments, allowing for the congregation to reflect on the mysteries being celebrated. The cantor’s pausing during the prayer of the faithful, when remembering the beloved dead before proceeding with the sung response “Let us pray to the Lord,” was particularly effective. Following the deacon’s homily and the communion music, the presider remained seated in silence to punctuate these moments and to allow the assembly to reflect on the Word of God and the Eucharist. The combination of these elements kept the congregation engaged in the liturgy and made it conducive to participating both exteriorly and interiorly.

Specific singing duties of the congregation and ministers during Mass will now be described. During my visit, Lauds was sung by the entire school (with no separate congregation or choir present) and Vespers was sung by cantor and congregation (without any school children present), so I did not include data from these liturgies in the above figures as they are not liturgies in which the choirs participate. In the Masses, on the other hand, I observed separate singing roles by the choir, congregation, cantor, and on rare occasions, the presider and deacon.

On Sundays, solemnities, and major feasts, congregational participation consisted of about half of the sung parts that belong to the first degree according to Musicam sacram. Only the Sanctus, the Great Amen, the Lord’s Prayer (without the invitation to prayer), and the

\[106\] MS 29-31.
dismissal were sung. The greeting, collects, acclamations at the Gospel, and sign of peace were spoken. However elements belonging to the second and third degrees were sung in their entirety with the exception of the scripture readings. The congregation participated in the Kyrie, Credo, prayer of the faithful, psalm, and Gospel Alleluia, as well as one entrance and one communion/closing hymn. In addition to the Gloria and Agnus Dei, the choir alone was responsible for singing the entrance and communion chants, motets and anthems during the Offertory and Communion, intoning the Gospel Alleluia, and adding musical embellishment such as harmonic settings of the Gospel verse and descants to the final phrase of the Sanctus. At the school Mass for the Solemnity of All Saints, the congregation and not the choir sang the Gloria and Agnus Dei. The presider intoned the Memorial Acclamation and the doxology preceding the Great Amen. The cantor intoned and sang the verses of the Kyrie and responsorial psalm as well as the concluding responses during the prayer of the faithful. The organist provided prelude and recessional/ postlude music, improvisation during the hymns, and intonations and codas for psalms, chants, and motets.

For weeknight Masses, the Gloria and Credo were obviously omitted, along with the singing of the opening hymn, communion chant and motet, prayer of the faithful, and Lord’s Prayer. The congregation sings the refrain of the responsorial psalm, Gospel Alleluia, and communion response as well as the Sanctus, Memorial Acclamation, Great Amen, and final hymn or Marian antiphon. The choir sings the entrance chant, a Kyrie and Agnus Dei setting, the Gospel verse, and an offertory motet. Typically one of the head choristers serves as cantor, intoning the responsorial psalm.
Particularly when a choir school is involved, the division of musical duties between the choir and the congregation must be carefully evaluated. Many church choirs exist simply to reinforce the unison singing of the congregation and cantor. Choristers, on the other hand, because of their unique and rigorous training, are capable of singing a much wider range of the sacred choral treasury, even the most difficult pieces. Balancing what the choristers can offer for the benefit of elevating the liturgy with meaningful involvement by the congregation is crucial to the success of building the ministerial role of each over time. According to Glenn, “Roles follow the prescription in the Roman Missal. The rationale then is to generally keep the musical importance on the parts of the liturgy that are most important.”

While perhaps in the beginning practical aspects such as the amount and the difficulty level of repertoire each was capable of singing was the main consideration, theological and liturgical rationale have always been the standard-bearer in deciding the musical roles. For the first few years of the choir school, the choristers sang for liturgies only once each month and employed modest, unison works. As time went on, they combined with the adult choir to sing mixed-voice repertoire until eventually being able to serve in their current daily capacity. During this period, both the choir and the congregation’s levels of participation were developed as both became proficient in an increased number of musical settings and the types of music employed by each became more distinct. The congregation currently participates in singing the psalm, two hymns, a few acclamations and responses, the *Kyrie*, the *Credo*, the *Sanctus*, and the Lord’s Prayer. Of these,

---

107 Glenn, interview.

the hymns, *Sanctus*, and Lord’s Prayer are the only pieces that the congregation sings in their entirety; all the other parts are sung in a responsorial or alternating fashion between the congregation and a leader (the presider, cantor, or choir) with the congregation singing only a refrain or small portion. In regard to the debate whether or not the *Sanctus* can be sung by the choir alone, Glenn states, “There is legislation which allows it, and we on occasion have a choral *Sanctus*, but generally the congregation sings it because of the musical importance of that element above most other sung elements.”

Possible additions to the congregation’s role could include the dialogical presider responses that belong to the first degree of sung parts or singing some of the Mass chants such as the *Credo* and *Gloria* in their entirety. To do much more than that would place a rather large burden on the congregation as they already sing over half of all sung components of the Mass, not to mention deprive the liturgy of some meaningful musical components currently contributed by the choristers. So that the entire treasure of sacred music might be heard in the liturgy, it is fitting that some parts of the singing be assigned to the choir. Choral music, polyphony, and some plainchant fall into this category. At the Madeleine, trained singers of the choir school regularly preserve and promote this treasure in liturgy by singing a vast repertory of motets and anthems, *Magnificat, Kyrie, Gloria*, and *Agnus Dei* settings, and the entrance and communion chants from the *Graduale Romanum*.

---

109 Glenn, interview.
Standard #7:  
_Singers receive a genuine training in liturgy._

7.1 A basic understanding of liturgy and liturgical functions is integrated with the training of singers.

At The Madeleine Choir School, there are two main sources that assist students in their understanding of liturgy and liturgical functions: 1) singing for and attending liturgies and 2) receiving formal instruction in religion/theology.

As previously mentioned, becoming dedicated liturgical musicians is among the goals of the chorister curriculum. Since the philosophy at the Madeleine is one in which music and liturgy are mutually enriching, developing a better grasp of liturgy and its function comes from partaking in frequent celebrations of liturgy as ministers. Because of the sacrifice and commitment the choristers make to engage in this ministry on an on-going basis, there is a sense that they are part of the universal church and royal priesthood which is perpetually offering sacrifice to God and joining its thanksgiving to the heavenly liturgy. Glenn explains, “While it can seem superfluous to be here in Salt Lake City on a Tuesday in November singing for the 5:15 Mass, they are carrying on this incredible century-old tradition that bears the teachings of Jesus of Nazareth and advances the kingdom of God.”

Giving students a sense of responsibility in maintaining something as noble as the public worship life of the Church helps them to understand their ministerial role in the liturgy. According to Glenn,

They have a responsibility to maintain the tradition and heritage of sacred music but also to lead the people who are gathered in the congregation in prayer and to facilitate the musical life. They understand when they are assisting with a funeral Mass or a wedding Mass that they have a ministerial function to bring comfort or

\[^{110}\text{Ibid.}\]
add to the joy of the occasion. . . . Or when they are doing Ash Wednesday that they are helping people to enter into the season of Lent.\footnote{Ibid.}

Integrating references to art and architecture leads choristers to a better understanding of the sacred space in which liturgical events occur. The example of the art historian giving her testimony at Mass and the choir’s many tours, particularly to Italy every four years, offers choristers the chance to be enriched by this treasury and its profound meaning when these objects are part of their liturgical encounter.

Students participate in religion/theology class for forty minutes three to four times per week. While serving primarily to guide students’ knowledge of and formation in the Catholic faith, each of the classes also contains a liturgical unit of study. In fifth and sixth grade, topics encompass sacraments celebrated within the liturgy (baptism, confirmation, Eucharist, holy orders, and matrimony) and seasons of the liturgical year, including Advent/Christmas, Lent/Easter, and Holy Week.\footnote{The Madeleine Choir School, “Grade 5 Religion Curriculum,” The Madeleine Choir School Website, accessed 14 November 2013, http://utmcs.org/curriculum/academic-curriculum-by-grade/item/18-grade5curriculum.} A more intensive study of theological and historical liturgical aspects occurs in the seventh and eighth grade. Church history units comprise the following: “the early Church, the persecuted Church, the Roman Church, Medieval/Reformation Church, [and] the Modern Church.”\footnote{The Madeleine Choir School, “Grade 7 Religion Curriculum,” The Madeleine Choir School Website, accessed 1 November 2013, http://utmcs.org/curriculum/academic-curriculum-by-grade/item/18-grade5curriculum.} The study of the sacraments and the rites of Holy Week continue to be expanded. Symbolic gestures, such as anointing with chrism that accompany the words “Be sealed with the Gift of the Holy Spirit” at Confirmation, duties of a deacon, and the practice of people of different cultures expressing their Catholic faith in a variety of ways using music,
art, language, and celebration through enculturation were some of the topics being reviewed for the ACRE tests in the class I observed. Likewise, theological understanding of the Mass and various feasts such as Pentecost and the Assumption of the Blessed Virgin Mary was addressed. Discussing components that change according to the day, season, or saint being celebrated allows students to explore the liturgical year and the meaning of various liturgical colors. The theology courses offer students a meaningful opportunity to discuss and understand more fully what they experience in the liturgy daily.

7.2 Teachers develop linguistic, scriptural, and theological understandings of sung musical texts with singers so that they may incorporate them more meaningfully into the liturgy.

So that choristers may incorporate musical works with deeper understanding in the liturgy, some development of scriptural, linguistic, and theological understanding of these texts is needed. Student awareness and insight comes mostly from repetition of this repertoire and gaining familiarity with the specific feast or season in which it is used. No matter which choral setting of the Mass is sung, the text of the Ordinary is always the same, so employing this daily keeps students very familiar with its meaning. English translations are provided in the scores of the weekly entrance and communion chants and for each motet in the congregational worship leaflet, both of which choristers use. As a result of all these factors, textual meanings are only typically addressed in rehearsals to highlight key words or instances of text painting that can enhance the ensemble’s interpretation musically. This was the case in the choir rehearsals that I observed. For example, because of its connection with the motet by the same composer, movements in Victoria’s *Missa O quam gloriosum* can be interpreted to reflect this association.
In the *Gloria*, it was pointed out that the descending “miserere nobis” passages reflect the same melodic motives as “sequuntur Agnum quocumque ierit” of the motet, where the saints in white robes are following the Lamb back and forth. This section provides a contrast with what follows it the “Quoniam tu solus sanctus,” which requires more volume and energy to bring out the meaning of the text. On another occasion when rehearsing Tallis’s *Salvator mundi*, the teacher inquired of the students what they were singing about and what the Latin text meant. Once they discovered that the text was a plea saying to the Savior of the World “help us,” they were much more engaged in bringing the music to life and conveying its urgency.

Theology classes frequently discuss readings, musical texts, and themes found in the liturgy. The Gospel reading for the Thirty-first Sunday in Ordinary Time (Lk 19:1-10) and Rachmaninoff’s *Dnes spaseniye*, both of which had been part of the weekend’s liturgies, were referenced to make connections with how the students live out the liturgy in their daily life. Depicting the story of Jesus staying with Zacchaeus, the Gospel message proclaims, “Today salvation has come to this house.” Rachmanioff’s resurrection motet states, “Today salvation has come to the world.” I observed a discussion of these texts in class, after which students were asked to ponder how they live the rest of their week – with joy like Zacchaeus or with judgment and envy like the grumblers. According to Glenn, “We do catechesis and mystagogical reflection on what they have experienced and then talk about their ministerial role.”

---


115 Glenn, interview.
7.3 From the manner and length of the liturgy celebrated, those liturgies and elements which are of highest importance receive due emphasis.

While certain commonalities exist among all liturgies, students come to experience a range of progressive solemnity within the music and other elements of liturgies throughout the year. The choir processes and recesses at each Mass, though this is probably somewhat for practical reasons to get them into place behind the altar as much as it is for liturgical reasons. The least solemn liturgy I observed was the weeknight Mass, which was forty-five minutes long. Sung portions included an entrance chant; the *Kyrie*, *Sanctus*, and *Agnus Dei*; some common responses and acclamations; and a hymn or Marian antiphon at the recession. Even though the Sunday Mass and the school Mass were each approximately ninety minutes long, the most solemn Mass liturgically and musically was the parish Mass for the Solemnity of All Saints, which was seventy-five minutes long. These more solemn Masses were marked by a substantially higher degree of sung music, including the *Gloria*, *Credo*, and communion chants, as well as more elaborate polyphonic settings of the Ordinary and motets sung by the choir. Likewise, these Masses were distinguished by having a procession preceding the reading of the Gospel, incense, more elaborate organ intonations and improvisations, and a larger number of ministers including a thurifer, candle bearers, acolytes, Eucharistic ministers, and a deacon. While elements are varied seasonally, on solemnities a final hymn is always employed; on Sundays a Hymn of Praise is used at the end of Communion, followed by an organ recessional.
Standard #8: 
_Singers receive spiritual formation of the highest standards._

8.1 Spiritual formation helps singers cultivate a personal ongoing relationship with the Lord while, at the same time, develop in their liturgical ministry to help form the faith of others.

According to the school’s graduate profile, spiritual growth comprises one of the four overarching areas of student development.\(^{116}\) While much is done to nurture and address spirituality from within the context of liturgy and the choristers’ role as liturgical ministers, theology courses help to reflect upon and further the meaning of these experiences. Section 7.2 already discussed some of the ways students develop spiritually through examining the theological connections of the sung musical texts and mystagogical reflection of what they have experienced in the liturgy. While learning catechesis serves as a departing point, ultimately the goal is to engage students in deepening their faith, developing their prayer life, and putting this faith into action. Specifically The Madeleine Choir School seeks to produce individuals who “understand and live the faith, have a loving relationship with God, comprehend and apply Catholic Christian Church history and doctrine, [and] exhibit a sense of reverence for God's Church and Commandments.”\(^{117}\)

The experience of serving as a chorister, along with the spiritual formation that accompanies this, is intended to impact the students’ faith and plant the seeds for a life-long journey of spiritual growth. With some students there is evidence of this being the case, says Glenn:

\(^{116}\) The Madeleine Choir School, “Profile of a Graduate.”

\(^{117}\) Ibid.
If you ask someone like Fr. Christopher Gray it became his whole life and led him to a vocation in the priesthood. There are other young men and women who have gone on to be professional church musicians, so this whole musical tradition has gotten under their skin. It is kind of funny how it gets in your blood and you are very compelled to continue it. There are other musicians who are maintaining their professional musicianship but have ups and downs with their faith. So they have gotten into the musical tradition but have not necessarily developed a great faith life. So that is always for me a little concerning; I want to be sure we are doing both.\textsuperscript{118}

The curriculum is designed to foster valuable Christian life skills that are applicable to a variety of life circumstances no matter what vocation a student pursues. Among these attributes is the ability to “empathize with others, work cooperatively with others, possess a social conscience, [and] contribute to their community.”\textsuperscript{119}

Stemming from their faith and dedication to serving the church, choristers aid the spiritual formation of others through their liturgical ministry. As referenced in section 7.1, in maintaining the public worship life of the cathedral, choristers have the responsibility of leading the faithful in prayer and facilitating their participation in the liturgy. Furthermore, their music ministry impacts not only the parish, but serves the local community and beyond.

\textsuperscript{118} Glenn, interview.

\textsuperscript{119} The Madeleine Choir School, “Profile of a Graduate.”
8.2 Daily Mass, celebrations throughout the liturgical year, and a variety of spiritual practices built of the Word of God, grounded in the sacraments, and devoted to the Eucharist, as well as studying the lives of the saints and the Blessed Virgin Mary are a primary means of forming individuals spiritually.

Spiritual practices and prayer throughout the school day are very much part of forming students spiritually at the choir school, as St. Paul’s idea to “pray without ceasing” is put into action. The morning assembly that occurs each day at 8:25 on the quad always begins with prayer. Glenn points out, “On feasts when the memorial of a particular saint is celebrated, often that will be the topic of the morning assembly – either a presentation on that saint or a prayer based on that saint.” Additionally prayers or some type of exegesis always occurs at the beginning of the students’ religion/theology class as well as various other classes. It is something that is deliberately woven throughout the day so that students are learning the tradition of Catholic prayers. For the select group of choristers that alternate singing the daily 5:15 p.m. Mass, the Word of God and most especially the Eucharist receive particular emphasis. Marian devotion is also fostered almost daily with the singing of one of the four Marian antiphons at the conclusion of these weeknight Masses.

Other types of liturgies and spiritual practices to mark the liturgical year supplement the students’ development, particularly in the Word of God. Built into the school day itself, the entire student body gathers at the cathedral for noon Mass approximately twenty times annually to commemorate special feasts. Each Tuesday morning, for approximately twenty minutes, students come together in the school chapel to sing the Office of Lauds. On Sunday evenings during major liturgical seasons, the choristers sing the Office of Vespers for parishioners at the

---

120 Glenn, interview.
During the penitential seasons of Advent and Lent, all Catholic students in grades two and higher receive the sacrament of penance.

The theology course sequence further develops students spiritually in regard to the Eucharistic, the Word of God, the sacraments, Mariology, and the lives of the saints. Using an enrichment program derived from the *General Directory for Catechesis* by the Congregation of the Clergy, a baptismal catechumenate model of religious education is adopted whereby spirituality is connected to the sacraments and the rites of the church. Every grade level has some kind of baptismal catechumenate event throughout the year, explains Glenn:

One of the best ones is the kindergarten as they are being brought into the formation program; on the Feast of the Triumph of the Cross they receive the Cross of St. Damiano. Throughout the month of October, the entire school focuses on the prayer of the rosary and the third graders are presented with a rosary at Mass as their baptismal catechumenate event. In May, the third grade leads the May procession around the school campus and down to the cathedral to pray the rosary. At the School Mass on the Solemnity of All Saints, the seventh graders were given the Beatitudes, reflecting the Gospel reading of the day. At the Mass of the Holy Spirit, the eighth grade are given the gifts of the Holy Spirit as part of a whole mystagogical reflection on their celebration of confirmation which occurred back in second grade.

In addition to having these mystagogical connections with the rites and sacraments, the study of sacred scripture is also included at each grade level. For example, sixth graders focus on the Old Testament, while seventh and eighth graders study the New Testament. Additionally students learn to recite various prayers in each grade level. Fifth graders learn how to pray the rosary, the Apostle's Creed, the Nicene Creed, the *Confiteor*, Hail Holy Queen, the *Angelus*, and the prayer

---


122 Glenn, interview.
of St. Francis. The Memorare, Acts of Faith, Hope and Love, and the Mass responses are prayers found among the sixth grade objectives. The Catholic Handbook for Youth, 2nd edition serves as a supplementary resource for instruction in these courses. Further components such as the three-year Virtues program and year-long service projects encourage Christian living and social outreach to supplement the students’ classroom instruction.

Summary

In this chapter, the praxis of The Madeleine Choir School was examined to determine if it fulfilled the same eight standards as the other schools in my study. Many characteristics of The Madeleine Choir School experience exemplify the great importance it attaches to the teaching of music. Progressing from an after-school program to a full-time choir school, the school has demonstrated its commitment to forming “dedicated liturgical musicians,” not students who merely sing at Mass occasionally. Striving to emulate the most preeminent Catholic choir schools in the world, daily immersion in high-quality performance takes place in rehearsal and most especially in the liturgy. Individuals in the Madeleine community support this mission in multiple ways. Bishops, clergy, and countless volunteers have helped to raise millions of dollars

123 The Madeleine Choir School, “Grade 5 Religion Curriculum.”


126 The Madeleine Choir School, “Grade 5 Curriculum.”
to support the school in its goals. Parents help to facilitate the rigorous schedule by transporting their children for rehearsals and performances, many of which occur outside the school day.

While all students receive the same music education in their first six years at the school, starting in the fifth grade students are selected for the chorister program based on their musical ability, interest, level of self-discipline, and willingness to commit to the demanding schedule. Out of eighty-two students in the fifth through eighth grade, twenty-five comprise the St. Cecilia choir, nineteen comprise the St. Gregory choir, and seven comprise the Changed Voice choir. The fourth choir is the Schola which contains a select group of trebles from the Cecilia and Gregory choirs. While it is not typically the case with choir schools, only fifty-one out of eighty-two, or a little over sixty percent of fifth- through eighth-grade students serve in one of the four choirs that sing for liturgies regularly, in part because daily Mass is held during after-school hours. Once their voices change, middle school boys have the option to sit out of choir completely or participate in a small changed voice ensemble that helps supplement the men of the parish choir.

For choristers, between twenty-nine and thirty-four percent of the “school day” is comprised of singing in the liturgy as well as musico-liturgical studies (see Fig. 4.1 above). In addition to their daily service to liturgies at the cathedral, international tours, recordings, and participation as the children’s choir-in-residence for the Utah Opera also provide strong, formative experiences. Two annual concert series sponsored by the cathedral give choristers the opportunity to perform major works and collaborate with renowned musical artists and organizations. In addition to extensive performing and daily choir rehearsals, instruction in music theory, sight singing, and musicianship; studying music history; and group violin serve to further reinforce musical concepts for the choristers. In these non-choir music classes, the acquisition of skills is laid out
progressively with components from many different approaches (e.g., Kodály, Suzuki, the Royal School of Church Music) and practices of leading experts in the field (e.g., John Bertalot) being used during instruction. However, this same gradational approach to learning becomes more difficult to identify and measure in the choir sequence. Rather, the European choir school idea of repertoire as the formatter takes precedence and leaves little time to develop reading skills within the context of rehearsal. Melanie Malinka’s background in the German choral tradition as well as her experience as a vocal performance major at Westminster Choir College impact her pedagogical methods and tonal philosophy, which focus on developing healthy vocal production and a warmer timbre quality in much the same way as an adult voice. These techniques are especially helpful for the abundance of large masterworks and Romantic repertoire the school performs, which otherwise might be some of the most difficult repertoire for young choristers to master vocally.

With the exception of a half dozen larger sacred masterworks performed each year as part of the cathedral’s concert series, the remainder of chorister’s repertoire is sung within the liturgy, including forty choral Mass settings. This literature reflects every period of the church’s treasure, but most especially the traditions of Gregorian chant and Renaissance polyphony. Like Westminster Cathedral, the body of literature choristers sing is distinctly Roman Catholic and mostly in Latin. In fact, two-thirds of choral music at the Madeleine is sung in Latin. Additionally, choristers sing settings of the weekly proper chants in Latin daily. Plainchant is used extensively in the liturgy, including hymns and Mass Ordinaries sung by the congregation. Renaissance polyphony represents the largest category, comprising over one quarter of the pieces on the Madeleine’s list of choral repertoire. These forty-five motets and nine Masses,
represented mostly by Italian and Spanish composers, are used during Mass and Vespers and reserved for the most important days in the liturgical year. Many later compositions found in the Madeleine’s liturgical repertory, including those by living composers, reflect compositional techniques characteristic of chant and polyphony, such as the use of modes, irregular meter, and the *a cappella* style.

The congregation’s internal and external participation in the liturgy is a result of their spiritual maturity and the ability of the liturgy itself to invite participation; the ministerial role of the choristers plays a key part in both. In recent years, Monsignor Frances Mannion, Gregory Glenn, and other staff members have been instrumental in advancing the faithful’s theological understanding of symbolic meanings found in the sacred art, architecture, and music of the cathedral through homilies and offering classes and tours. Through Mannion’s effort to recover the sense of cosmic worship in the liturgy, the hierarchical role of each participant became more clearly defined and facilitated. During Mannion’s tenure, dialogical exchanges which the priest and people sing together, particularly those belonging to the first degree of sung parts, were sung consistently in the liturgy. Eventually, dependent on the clerical personnel and their comfort level with singing, the goal will be to get these responses back into use by the congregation. In the meantime, the congregation is still physically participating in fifty-seven percent of the sung parts at liturgy; however, the only pieces sung in their entirety are one to two hymns, the *Sanctus*, and the Lord’s Prayer. Many other parts are sung in a responsorial or alternating fashion between the congregation and the cantor or choir. Having a cantor in front of the pulpit is necessary for prompting these responses visually and vocally. The use of worship leaflets, in place of hymnals or missalettes, allows for greater flexibility in the types of music that can be
included in the liturgy. For easy use by the congregation, a single melody line with text underlay is included, and chants are displayed in modern notation. Printed English translations of choral pieces allow the assembly to join their hearts and minds to the words being sung by the choir and assist in cultivating interior participation during the liturgy. As the choristers’ depth of repertoire and musicality has evolved, the musical roles and capabilities of the congregation and choristers have become more disparate. Due to their rigorous training, it is possible for choristers to perform a vast treasure of complex sacred choral works which the assembly has come to increasingly rely on to enrich their worship experience alongside their maturing spirituality.

While not fully manifest during each student’s time at the choir school, the long-term impact of such a unique musical, liturgical, and spiritual formation can be seen in the Madeleine’s alumni. A considerable number of alumni are currently pursuing vocations through which they are serving the church and the music profession. Christopher Gray represents the first student from the choir school to be ordained a priest.127 Alumnus Brett Patterson was appointed diocesan Music Director in Alexandria, Louisiana after studying organ improvisation with Gerre Hancock and the English choral tradition at King’s College and St. John’s College in Cambridge.128 By the time my research had been completed for this study, Brett had been appointed director of music at Our Lady of the Atonement Catholic Church and The Atonement Academy in San Antonio, Texas. Marc Day received a master’s degree in vocal performance and currently sings at St. John the Divine in New York and in the professional chorus Music


128 Young, “Madeleine Choir School Graduate Is Appointed Director of Diocesan Music in Louisiana.”
Sacra, both under director Kent Tritle. Pianist Evan Shinners, referred to as "the voice of Bach for today’s generation," returned to perform as part of the Madeleine Festival in 2013. Jessica French earned a master’s degree in organ performance and directs a chorister program at an Episcopal Church. The St. Cecilia Choir recently performed one of her compositions. Nic Chuaqui came back to the Madeleine in 2013 after completing a bachelor of music degree to teach the changed voice and music theory classes for one year. During the course of my study, Nic went on to pursue graduate studies in composition. Matthew Yost is pursuing undergraduate composition studies at The Catholic University of America; his work Ut Sol, Ut Luna was selected for the Benjamin T. Rome School of Music’s Fiftieth Anniversary Gala Concert at the John F. Kennedy Center for the Performing Arts in April 2015. If the breadth of these graduates is any indication, the Madeleine is in a distinctive position to significantly impact the life of the church with exceptionally well-formed vocalists, organists, pianists, conductors, composers, and religious. It is clear that The Madeleine Choir School has played an important role in setting these and countless other individuals on their current paths.

129 Forgey, “A Noteworthy Education: Music and Liturgy Enrich Learning at Cathedral’s Coed Choir School.”


131 Ibid.


The Madeleine Choir School convincingly met all eight musico-liturgical objectives of this study. The school exceeded the highest levels in areas of musical, liturgical, and spiritual formation. For the majority of the school’s students who are selected as choristers, an abundance of musical opportunities exist wherein students serve the liturgy, the cathedral’s concert series, and the community at large. Advanced-level repertoire which is engaged daily, along with international performance tours, comprise essential parts of the pedagogical process. The Madeleine Choir School stands out for its vision of incorporating sacred repertoire from all historical eras which reflect and promote the primacy of chant and polyphony. Having composers-in-residence such as Leo Nestor and Richard Proulx, who expand the sacred treasury with new compositions in this same vein, is of great benefit to students. In addition to cultivating young composers of sacred music, it helps students to see the Church as a living reality through which God the Divine Artist continues to work in our present day.
CHAPTER V

THE ATONEMENT ACADEMY

Background

The Atonement Academy is a Catholic, college preparatory school in the Archdiocese of San Antonio, Texas, located at Our Lady of the Atonement Catholic Parish, the founding parish for the Anglican Use liturgy within the Roman Rite of the Catholic Church. Recognizing the importance of Catholic education, the parish adopted this as its main apostolate and established a school in 1994 for students in kindergarten through third grade. As subsequent years necessitated, grade levels were added, and the school expanded into a co-educational day school serving students in pre-kindergarten through twelfth grade. Fr. Christopher Phillips, founding pastor of Our Lady of the Atonement Parish, explains the purpose of the school is “to encourage the rise of literate, wise and moral contributors for society by integrating the classical educational approach with a constant awareness of our culture of Western Christianity and with the magisterial teachings of the Catholic faith.”¹ Within this classical and Catholic education, liturgy and sacred choral music are placed at the core. According to Edmund Murray, music director of Our Lady of the Atonement Church and Academy, “Part of Fr. Phillips’ vision in

founding the school was to make the study of music available to every student and to become, in essence, though not in name, a choir school.”

The student handbook articulates the school’s mission of endeavoring toward “excellence in the physical, the intellectual, and the spiritual virtues through a challenging course of classical and Catholic education.” The physical component emphasizes the idea of clear thinking and students’ treating their bodies with respect as temples of God’s Holy Spirit, in conjunction with a strong physical education program. The spiritual element is addressed through the students’ participation in daily Mass and faith practices woven throughout the entire day. The intellectual element comes from a classical program of instruction grounded in Western culture, thought, and methods. Constructed loosely upon the concept of the medieval trivium and quadrivium, studies include grammar, literature, science, mathematics, history, government, economics, music, theology, art history, Latin, and ancient Greek. The adjoining architectural structure of the gymnasium, school building, and church, made to resemble a medieval castle, symbolizes this unified concept of body, mind, and spirit. In educating the whole person, music touches on all three of those things. Because every student participates in daily choral training, and each choir starting with grade three alternates singing for the school Mass each day, “The academy’s choral

---


music program is a distinctive and important part of the school curriculum and culture.”⁵ Due to the level of course content and auxiliary programs offered, according to Fr. Phillips, the entire school curriculum not only meets, but exceeds, the guidelines required by the Archdiocese of San Antonio and the Texas Catholic Conference Accreditation Commission (TCCAC), the accrediting authority for all Catholic schools in the State of Texas.⁶ Furthermore, the academy has been voted a “Blue Ribbon School of Excellence” by the Department of Education and selected to be named among the nation's “Top 50 Catholic High Schools” by the Cardinal Newman Society.⁷

Though the high school has thus far produced only seven graduating classes since its opening, one hundred percent of these Academy graduates have received acceptances at four-year institutions, including many of the nation’s highest ranking Catholic and secular colleges and universities such as the University of Notre Dame, Boston College, The Catholic University of America, Thomas Aquinas College, the University of Dallas, Stanford University, the University of Pennsylvania, Rice University, Tufts University, Boston University, and the US Naval Academy.⁸ The goal is not that every student will actually attend college, but that the possibility be opened up to them to go out and do whatever it is God is calling them to do. Fr. Phillips gives the humble lives of the saints as an example of this: “Look at the number of

---


⁶ Phillips, interview.


⁸ Ibid.
religious saints, for instance, who spent their whole life as the porter, or doorkeeper – that is all they did. They opened the door for guests, and yet they had a tremendous effect on the people they would meet and people would come to them for spiritual advice and guidance.”

The purpose of the academy is to open up students’ eyes to horizons they might otherwise never know existed and prepare them to live as Christian “whole persons” in whatever they do.

A brief look into the founding of Our Lady of the Atonement Parish will provide several key insights into the history and development of The Atonement Academy. The parish and its founding pastor became part of the Catholic Church in a rather unique way. The momentum for what would result in the founding of the parish in August 1983 really began in 1980 with the Pastoral Provision promulgated by Pope John Paul II. This provision “provided for the ordination of married, former priests coming from the Episcopal Church, and for the creation of personal worship communities which would be allowed to retain elements of the Anglican liturgy.”

In response to his own growing conversion toward the Catholic faith and a direct invitation he received from a few individuals who were leaving the Episcopal Church to become Roman Catholics, Fr. Phillips stepped down from his ministry in the Anglican Church and moved to San Antonio, TX with his wife and children in 1982. His case was then presented directly to Pope John Paul II, rather than the Congregation of the Doctrine of the Faith, since he was the first instance of a married former Episcopal priest under consideration as canonical

---

9 Phillips, interview.


On 15 August 1983 Fr. Phillips was ordained a Catholic priest and appointed pastor. At that same Mass, the original eighteen converts made their Professions of Faith, becoming the first parishioners of Our Lady of the Atonement. In November of that same year, Fr. Phillips spent time in Rome serving on the Liturgical Commission for the Anglican Use to produce a missal for these new parishes and a few smaller groups. *The Book of Divine Worship* was the result, combining Anglican liturgical elements from the American Book of Common Prayer with the 1973 *Missale Romanum* of the Latin Rite. To preserve and promote the Anglican patrimony, this missal is used exclusively for all Masses and Evensongs at Our Lady of the Atonement Parish, except for the celebration of the *Novus Ordo Missae* in Latin on Friday mornings and Sunday evenings.

For the first several years, Masses and liturgical celebrations were held in rented facilities throughout the city of San Antonio. In 1987, a small church was erected on the current site in the northwest area of the city. Fr. Phillips explains the impetus for the growth that occurred in the early years as “more people were attracted to the parish’s particular combination of active apostolates, unique liturgical style, an emphasis upon scriptural preaching, and a tradition of excellent music and hymnody.” By 1993, there was enough interest to construct a small kindergarten through grade-three school, which opened the following year with sixty-six students.

---


children. From the school’s beginning there was sung Mass every day. Fr. Phillips, having studied voice and organ at Westminster Choir College for one year prior to entering the seminary, would gather the students together during a section of the day and teach them chant hymns and responses to their parts of the Mass. Rather than the intention of starting out with a music program, as is the case with most schools, teaching the students music was solely born out of the necessity of needing music for Mass and needing them to be able to sing it. According to Fr. Phillips, “That is really the little seed that started our music program. It was the idea of the students having their part in the liturgy.”\footnote{Phillips, interview.} Francis Elborne served as the first music director of the school from 1994 to 2002, and Kenneth Knott succeeded him from 2002 to 2004.

As the student population grew over the years, new grade levels were added until in 2003 the decision was made to expand beyond the eighth grade by building a high school. Along with this, the church was enlarged to twice its original size in order to accommodate the rising number of students and parishioners. With the completion of the high school in 2004, husband and wife Edmund and Chalon Murray came on board to serve as music director and assistant music director for the school and the church. Edmund Murray describes the school program when they started:

There was one choir that sang for Mass every day, and that consisted of every student in the middle school – boys and girls, changed and unchanged voices. They had one binder of music for the entire year which had some Rutter and simple hymns they used as anthems. The singing was mostly unison and some two-part music with the girls on one part and the boys on the other.\footnote{Edmund Murray, Music Director of Our Lady of the Atonement Church and The Atonement Academy, interview by author, digital recording, San Antonio, TX, 30 April 2014.}
Within the first few years, the Murrays separated the changed-voice boys from the rest of the middle school to form their own choir. Then they started having each choir learn different repertoire and more than one choir rotate singing for the daily school Mass. With a large increase in sixth-grade enrollment in 2010, they were able to split the treble choristers of the middle school into separate boys’ and girls’ choirs. In the high school’s early years, only one choir track was possible due to the very small number of students, creating great disparity in ability levels among students coming in new to the school and those who had attended since kindergarten. Once the enrollment was large enough, the high school was separated into two choirs: one auditioned group and one non-auditioned. Eventually the non-auditioned choir was split again between the boys and the girls. The increased number of choirs has allowed daily singing duties to be distributed among more choirs and also gives each ensemble more time to prepare repertoire. The number of music faculty members needed to direct these choirs has also increased.

From very humble beginnings and eighteen founding members, the parish has grown to over 600 households today. With the school’s enrollment at nearly 600 students, one of the biggest obstacles the Murrays face is the lack of space and the location of the music room. Due to the music room’s position directly adjacent to the church’s choir loft, the two spaces cannot be used simultaneously. Edmund Murray expounds, “For weekday funerals we have a real problem, because classes cannot meet in the music room during that time.” An expansion project in excess of ten million dollars is currently under way to build a separate high school building containing new classrooms, science labs, offices, music rooms, a faculty area, a dining

\[^{17}\text{Ibid.}\]
facility, two practice gyms, an athletic area, and the shell for a future theater. Eventually a performing space, either an auditorium or theatre, will be decided upon and built to provide a better place for concerts. This marks the third and largest school building project the parish has undertaken to date.

Once the new expansion is complete to accommodate 250 students in the high school, the total enrollment capacity of the academy will be 850 students. The current enrollment for the 2013-14 academic year is 576 students. The middle and high school presently have between twenty-five to forty-two students per grade level. Of the existing student body, ninety-four percent of students are Catholic, and sixty percent of all school families are active in the parish. On occasion, some students and their families convert to Catholicism while their child is attending the school.

Admission to the school is contingent upon a family visit and interview as well as, to an extent, past academic records. Because many of the students are younger, particularly those entering the school in the pre-kindergarten, or lack singing experience all together, a vocal audition is not included in this process. The philosophy is rather that the strong choir training at the school will prepare students adequately by the time they reach third grade and enter the rotation of choirs singing for Mass. As Fr. Phillips explains in the parish profile, “Those non-parish families choosing to enroll their children do so because they have decided this is the

---


19 Murray, interview.

institution which will provide what they want for their children’s education; namely, a Catholic education with a classical curriculum, reflecting those aspects of Anglican culture and heritage which have been approved by the Holy See.” \(^{21}\) Being Catholic or possessing singing talent and experience is not necessary to attending the school; nevertheless, all students are expected to participate in theological instruction, choral training, daily Mass, and prayers throughout the day to develop in these areas. It is typically at this stage that families decide whether the program is a good fit and if they will pursue admittance for their child. Hence, self-selection is also an important part of the admittance process. Additionally, students in first grade and above are required to take placement exams in writing, reading, and math before gaining admittance.

Once attending the academy, several factors lead students to rapid musical, spiritual, and academic development. First of all, since the family has chosen this specific type of education, they will likely offer their full support and willingness to help their child meet the requirements of the program, including the spiritual and musical components. Parents must provide daily transportation for their child and often participate in carpooling arrangements with other families. Some students commute nearly an hour one-way to attend the academy. Edmund Murray explains, “Considerably more active parental involvement is needed if the students choose to participate in the parish choirs, which rehearse and perform for many liturgies and musical events outside of school hours.” \(^{22}\) Second, the academy offers a number of high quality programs to help students excel, including an Accelerated Reader Program in the lower grade levels, comprehensive instruction in Latin and music throughout the pre-kindergarten to twelfth

\(^{21}\) Fr. Christopher Phillips, “Our Lady of the Atonement Church: Parish Information and Profile.”

\(^{22}\) Murray, interview.
grade, and a college preparatory curriculum for high school students.\textsuperscript{23} Many measurable trends have been observed among the student body. Select high school choristers have the opportunity to participate in state-wide contests each year which are open to both public and private school students, with some advancing to the highest level of the prestigious Texas All-State Choir.\textsuperscript{24} Student SAT scores regularly exceed the national average.\textsuperscript{25} Sixty-two percent of students achieved “cum laude” awards on the National Latin Exam in March of 2014.\textsuperscript{26} The perfect college acceptance rate among graduating seniors referenced above sets this institution in a high-ranking position.

The 2013-2014 tuition cost at The Atonement Academy is between 6,545 and 6,875 dollars, depending on the grade level. There is an additional 600 dollar registration fee each year.\textsuperscript{27} Merit-based scholarships are available for eighth graders continuing on to ninth grade. Though it is not a line item in the budget, need-based assistance is available to families that belong to the parish. Generally when this occurs, the administration finds a way to raise the money. Fr. Phillips states, “The last I knew, we were giving well over a quarter of a million dollars a year in financial aid to students – either because of family size or just direct financial

\textsuperscript{23} The Atonement Academy, \textit{Parent-Student Handbook 2013-2014}, n. 4.6-4.10.

\textsuperscript{24} Murray, interview.


\textsuperscript{26} Russell Wolny, Chairman, Department of Classics at The Atonement Academy, e-mail message to author, 16 January 2015.

aid to a student. I do not want any child kept out for money."

Each family is financially responsible for items such as textbooks, academic and athletic uniforms, hot lunches, field trips, membership dues in the Junior and National Honor Society, club and sports fees, Advanced Placement testing costs, school supplies, before- and after-school care, mandatory study hall, detention, and in-school suspension. Revenue from tuition alone covers one hundred percent of the cost of operations at the school. Annual events sponsored by the Parent Teacher Club, such as the King’s Fair, Gala, and Stampede, are more socially driven; any monies raised typically go toward future building projects or back into the parish. Likewise, the church does not support the school financially. Fr. Phillips explains the school’s situation of fiscal independence:

The school is self-sufficient and ends up in the black every year through tuition and good stewardship. All of the staff workers are “parish” employees who serve both the church and the school; they do not have separate offices. Even though we have to divide out the budget for the school, we view it as one budget. All of the spending decisions are made by people who are involved in the whole program. This is a strength for us, because most Catholic schools see themselves in competition for the dollars from the parish, so they end up having to take big subsidies from the parish and that is always held over their head. In many cases that has led to schools closing.

In the case of the expansion project, a financial appeal was made to all parishioners, whether they have students at the school or not, since these new buildings will belong to the parish. Fr. Phillips points out, “This is part of our ministry to the wider community and investment in the future of the church. We have this obligation to provide a Catholic education for the children

---

28 Phillips, interview.

29 Ibid.
who are being put here. Everyone sees the importance of that and that is why they give generously.”

The pastor, Fr. Christopher G. Phillips, serves as the canonical head of the school as well as its spiritual leader. Mr. Walter Spencer is the headmaster and several administrators assist in running the day-to-day business of the school. A school council of six volunteers and six administrators assist with carrying out special projects to ensure the school’s growth and sustainability. In addition, a parent-teacher club helps organize important social events for the school. The total number of faculty at the school is forty-two; four of whom teach music and two others who serve as religion/theology instructors. Among the faculty who teach music, three possess master’s degrees in music, one of whom is additionally trained in the Ward Method; a fourth teacher holds a bachelor’s degree and Level One Kodály certification. Among the faculty who teach religion and theology, one possesses a master’s degrees in theology.\footnote{The Atonement Academy, “Faculty & Staff,” The Atonement Academy Website, accessed 26 August 2014, https://atonementonline.com/index.php/staff/}

**Presentation of Data**

The same methods of data collection and analysis used for the previous two schools will now be applied to determine the degree to which The Atonement Academy fulfills the musico-liturgical goals established by the Church since Vatican II.

\footnote{Ibid.}
Standard #1:
Catholic institutions and schools attach great importance to the teaching of music.

1.1 Musical training advocates strong choral music experiences, particularly when they give fervent expression to the Catholic ethos within the context of liturgy.

Reflecting the Anglican patrimony of the parish, the choral music program and its service to the liturgy are primary to students’ formation at The Atonement Academy. This patrimony preserves not only reverence toward the liturgy but also, as Fr. Phillips explains, “the idea of excellence in liturgical music, the place of the organ in worship, the place of congregational singing, the wonderful treasury of English hymnody, the use of Anglican chant, and having a strong choral tradition.”32 This strong choral tradition, now lost in many parishes, originated within the Catholic Church. The Anglican Use, with its roots in the Oxford movement, seeks to preserve and bring back this Catholic choral and liturgical tradition. Liturgical scholar Fr. Christopher Smith exclaims that The Atonement Academy has “created an atmosphere where the very air you breathe is Catholic!”33

Every student at the school participates in daily choir rehearsal and daily Mass Monday through Friday. The student handbook states, “Daily attendance and participation at the Holy Sacrifice of the Mass is the foundation for everything that we do at The Atonement Academy.”34 The school choirs take turns singing at each of these weekday liturgies as well as occasional weekend liturgies, concerts, festivals, and contests. To further strengthen the students’ formation

32 Phillips, interview.
33 Murray, “An Overview of the Music Program at Our Lady of the Atonement Church & Academy: Part 1.”
34 The Atonement Academy, Parent-Student Handbook 2013-2014, n. 4.3.
in choir and liturgy, the school offers comprehensive programs of study in religion/theology and art history.

The school year at The Atonement Academy is approximately forty-four weeks, spanning from mid-August to early June. During those ten months, the school choirs provide music for over 210 liturgies and performances at Our Lady of the Atonement. Additional performances in the community are typically undertaken by the parish choirs and not the school choirs. The majority of musical responsibilities fall to the choirs in grades three and up, including the following four ensembles: the Middle School Girls, a treble choir for girls in grades six through eight; the Middle School Treble Boys, a treble choir for boys in grades six through eight; the Changed Voice Boys, a choir for boys with changed voices in grades six through eight; and the Upper School Honors Choir, an auditioned, advanced choir for young men and women in grades ten through twelve who sing mixed-voice repertoire. Like public school, students attend class on 180 days, or thirty-six out of forty-four weeks when accounting for holidays and breaks.\(^{35}\)

The school day and academic schedule are constructed to accommodate the demanding choral training and liturgical responsibilities of the students. Edmund Murray explains the configuration of the music schedule:

> Since every child has music, they put the middle school classes at lunch. The girls have music during the first lunch and the boys have music during the second lunch; nothing else goes on at that time. During the last period of the day, every single high school student has music at the same time, though typically in three different locations: Honors Choir, Women’s Chorale, and Men’s Chorale.\(^{36}\)

\(^{35}\) The Atonement Academy, 2013 Calendar (San Antonio: The Atonement Academy, 2013).

\(^{36}\) Murray, interview.
In order to execute the demanding performance schedule of liturgical music and maintain the high quality of music for which the academy is known, a rigorous rehearsal schedule is employed. Students in the pre-kindergarten through second grade have vocal music for twenty to thirty minutes daily; students from the third through eighth grade receive forty minutes of choir instruction daily; high school students receive fifty minutes of choir instruction per day. In order to accommodate the students’ attending daily Mass, the school day is increased by fifty minutes as compared with other schools and extends from 7:30 a.m. until 3:30 p.m. on Monday through Friday.

To calculate the amount of time students spent in musico-liturgical experiences, I used the same procedure as was explained earlier by the example in Fig. 3.1. Consulting the class schedule alone permitted me to collect necessary data for each choir. Unlike the two previous schools, afterschool and weekend rehearsals, liturgies, and concerts occur so infrequently that they were not included in the chart below as they have no impact on the data. The final calculation for the choirs at The Atonement Academy, resulting from these procedures, is illustrated below in Fig. 5.1. Of the 180 instructional days annually at the academy, students in these choirs averaged between 762 and 817 minutes (twelve and a half to thirteen and a half hours per week), or thirty-two to thirty-four percent of their time engaged in rehearsals, liturgies, and related musico-liturgical classes such as religion/theology and art history.

---

Fig. 5.1. Minutes per week spent in musico-liturgical subject areas

THEO = Theology, AH = Art History

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Choir</th>
<th>Total School Day</th>
<th>Choir Rehearsal</th>
<th>Liturgy</th>
<th>Other Musico-Liturgical Subject Areas</th>
<th>Total for all Musico-Liturgical Experiences</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Middle School Girls</td>
<td>2400</td>
<td>205 (9%)</td>
<td>257 (11%)</td>
<td>THEO 250 AH 50 = 300 (12%)</td>
<td>762 (32%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle School Treble Boys</td>
<td>2400</td>
<td>205 (9%)</td>
<td>257 (11%)</td>
<td>THEO 250 AH 50 = 300 (12%)</td>
<td>762 (32%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changed Voice Boys</td>
<td>2400</td>
<td>205 (9%)</td>
<td>257 (11%)</td>
<td>THEO 250 AH 50 = 300 (12%)</td>
<td>762 (32%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honors Choir</td>
<td>2400</td>
<td>260 (11%)</td>
<td>257 (11%)</td>
<td>THEO 250 AH 50 = 300 (12%)</td>
<td>817 (34%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Middle School Girls average fifty-five to sixty singers each year. Their primary responsibilities are sung weekday Mass approximately twice per month as well as one Sunday morning Mass, two school concerts, and eighth-grade graduation Mass annually. In 2013, the Middle School Girls sang for twenty-six liturgies/concerts (0.6 per week). The Middle School Girls devote an average total of 762 minutes each week, or thirty-two percent, of their school day to rehearsals and liturgies as well as classroom instruction in theology and art history. The Middle School Treble Boys and the Changed Voice Boys, averaging twenty-five to thirty singers each, have the same responsibilities and time commitments in these musico-liturgical areas as the Middle School Girls.

---

38 Ibid.

The Upper School Honors Choir averages fifty singers. Their primary responsibilities are sung weekday Mass approximately three times per month as well as one Sunday morning Mass, the Requiem Mass on All Souls’ Day, two school concerts, TPSMEA Concert and Sight-Reading Contest, and special performances annually. In 2013, the Upper School Honors Choir sang for thirty-five liturgies/concerts (1.0 per week) and devoted an average total of 817 minutes each week, or thirty-four percent of their school day to rehearsals and liturgies as well as classroom instruction in theology and art history.

Participation in a rich variety of musico-liturgical events as well as collaborations and interactions with renowned musicians provide opportunities for the students to grow as choristers. In addition to sung Mass for the Anglican Use on Monday through Thursday and the Novus Ordo Missae on Fridays, students participate in sung Evensong about six times each year to mark special feasts and celebrations. The Honors Choir also prepares a major requiem Mass with the parish adult choir and professional orchestra, consisting of players from the San Antonio Symphony, which is sung within the context of Evensong for the Commemoration of All the Faithful Departed each year. Past requiems have included settings by John Rutter, Maurice Duruflé, and Gabriel Fauré. In addition to liturgies, school students participate in two concerts annually in December and May, the latter of which includes secular repertoire. The Honors Choir has given joint performances with local college choirs such as The University of Texas at San Antonio and Trinity University; they have also sung for Masses at Our Lady of Walsingham in Houston and St. Mary’s in Arlington, two Anglican Use parishes. The entire middle school has sung as part of the noontime concert series at St. John’s Lutheran Church in downtown San

Ibid.
Antonio. Fifth-grade students were recently invited to be the featured choir for the archdiocesan school Mass at San Fernando Cathedral. On various occasions, prominent conductors, composers, organists, and sacred musicians have visited the school to work with the students and lead them in liturgical services, including Jean Ashworth Bartle, James David Christie, Gerre and Judith Hancock, and Marie-Louise Langlais.

Interested and musically advanced students also have the option of taking part in parish offerings. Currently six parish choral ensembles exist in which students may choose to be involved. Edmund and Chalon Murray direct each of these parish choirs, so they have already taught each of these students in the school setting. Girls participate in the Saint Nicolas Children’s Choir if they are in grades three through five and the Saint Cecilia Youth Choir if they are in grades six through eight; each of these choirs sings for the nine o’clock Mass on Sunday morning as scheduled. Boys with unchanged voices in grades three through eight may audition to participate in the Saint Augustine Boychoir, which sings for the nine o’clock Mass on Sunday morning, gives joint performances with visiting and local choirs such as the Houston Boychoir and the San Antonio Choral Society, and performs as part of the noontime concert series at St. John’s Lutheran Church and Rampage Minor League Hockey. Outside of the parish, the treble choirs regularly take part in choral festivals and Masses sponsored by the American Federation Pueri Cantores (AFPC), the official choral organization for the Catholic Church. Honors Choir students may audition for a choral scholar position in the parish adult choir where they gain valuable leadership skills and a 1,000 dollar stipend annually. High school men may also audition to participate in the Saint Gregory Schola Cantorum which sings the Latin chants for the Novus Ordo Mass each Sunday evening at six o’clock and has occasionally performed
chant for organ recitals and events of the American Guild of Organists. Developing a sound proficiency in the art of chant, a handful of these same high school men lead the chant propers each day at the school Masses. The newest of the parish ensembles to form is the *Collegium Cantorum*, a mixed high school choir that sings once a month at the Sunday evening Mass.

The parish music series has offered students opportunities to hear world-famous organists and musicians in performance, such as David Briggs and James O’Donnell. *Musica Sacra*, a resident choral ensemble comprising some professional singers, provides Sunday choral Evensong four to five times per year at the church. Additionally, a special opportunity to take part in the parish pilgrimage to Rome is given to high school students every other year during their fall break. In Rome, students not only experience the Catholic culture that permeates the city, but their vast knowledge of art history and sacred music also allows them to connect the beauty of art and music with the life of the church. The high school students on the trip, consisting of thirty-five students this past year, provide singing for the daily Masses at each of the different churches. While parents are ultimately responsible for the cost of the trip, some fundraising opportunities and 1,000 dollar academic scholarships are available to students.

Outside of the school, Academy students participate in a number of clinics and contests at the city, region, area, and state levels to build their music skills. Joining public and private schools across Texas, individuals and ensembles from the academy are extremely involved in events sponsored by TMEA (Texas Music Educators Association), TPSMEA (Texas Private

---


42 Phillips, interview.
School Music Educators Association), and TCDA (Texas Choral Directors Association).

According to TMEA, being chosen for All-State is considered, “the highest honor a Texas music student can receive. Over 1,500 students are selected through a process that begins with over 55,000 students from around the state vying for this honor to perform in one of thirteen ensembles (bands, orchestras, and choirs).” High school students at the academy wishing to try out for these coveted spots often elect to participate in All-State camps held at universities throughout the state over the summer and spend extra time in the fall working on the music after school in order to prepare for this rigorous process. Students begin the process by auditioning within Region 11 (San Antonio and vicinity) each October. After advancing to the Pre-Area and Area levels, the highest scoring musicians of the Area competition earn a seat with one of the TMEA All-State ensembles. During the annual TMEA Convention each February, these students work with nationally recognized conductors, such as Elena Sharkova, Joe Miller, Brady Allred, Richard Bjella, Jerry McCoy, and Z. Randall Stroope, to prepare a culminating performance that closes the convention. In 2014, three students from The Atonement Academy successfully earned this distinguished honor of singing in the Texas All-State choirs. Two of these same students also took first and third place at the local National Association of Teachers of Singing (NATS) competition. The Honors Choir, Women’s Chorale, and Men’s Chorale from the academy compete in the TPSMEA Concert and Sight-Reading Contest each March, consistently receiving superior rankings. Performing individually and in small groups, many high school students also receive superior scores in the TPSMEA Solo and Ensemble contests.

---

Middle school and elementary choristers have earned places in the TCDA Honors Choir, the TPSMEA Honors Choir, and the TMEA Middle School All-Region Choir. In 2014, the academy took third place overall in the State Academics, Speech & Fine Arts Meet sponsored by the Texas Christian Athletic League and first place in the Catholic Arts and Academic Competition sponsored by the Archdiocese of San Antonio.

1.2 A rigorous curriculum serves as the framework in which the sequential acquisition of skill and learning takes place, through use of a graded choir system or similar, appropriate to the varying ability levels of individuals.

With the substantial rise in enrollment at the academy over the past ten years, the number of school choirs has increased significantly, becoming more grade and gender based. Students in third through twelfth grade sing for liturgies and are divided up among ten choirs: Boys and Girls (Gr. 3), Girls (Gr. 4-5), Boys (Gr. 4-5), Middle School Girls (Gr. 6-8), Middle School Treble Boys (Gr. 6-8), Changed Voice Boys (Gr. 6-8), Women’s Choir (Gr. 9-12), Men’s Choir (Gr. 9-12), Chorale (Gr. 9-12 Women’s and Men’s choirs combined), and Honors Choir (Gr. 10-12 SATB). The middle school boys are separated by voice part so that repertoire with varied and appropriate tessiture may be employed. Mostly seventh and eighth graders comprise the Changed Voice Boys, while typically sixth and seventh graders comprise the Treble Boys. Because of their vastly different developmental stages at this age, boys and girls sing separately in fourth through eighth grade; only on select occasions do the middle school choirs combine. The two genders sing together on a more regular basis once they reach high school, particularly the Honors Choir. The choirs are separated according to ability at the high school level. New
students coming in at this level are almost always placed in the Chorale when they begin at the school to give them time to catch up vocally and musically to the other students (e.g., learning solfège). Honors Choir is the most advanced choir a student may sing in at the academy. After achieving the level of Honors Choir for at least one year, students are eligible to receive the Distinguished Achievement Diploma with Atonement Academy Honors, the academy’s highest diploma awarded upon high school graduation.\footnote{The Atonement Academy, Parent-Student Handbook 2013-2014, n. 4.23.2.}

The music curriculum, determined largely by Fr. Phillips and the Murrays, has from its inception been liturgy based. Because of its exclusively choral and liturgical nature, applying the National Standards for Music Education,\footnote{Consortium of National Arts Education Association, National Standards for Arts Education.} which serve secularly-based public schools in large part and are also representative of general and instrumental music programs, are not entirely applicable in many instances; though in some areas they overlap. Catholic Connections to Music in the National Standards for Arts Education, based on and developed in conjunction with these national standards, aligns somewhat more closely but is still problematic in that it does not fully reflect or reference the musico-liturgical directives of the Second Vatican Council as do these choir school programs.\footnote{Barbara Varian Barrett, et al., Catholic Connections to Music in the National Standards for Arts Education.} In pre-kindergarten through second grade, concepts of Kodály are used with students where a sequential approach is taken to the acquisition of musical skills, largely due to the teacher’s training in Kodály. In third grade, students receive one year of training in the Ward Method, again because of another teacher’s expertise in that method. Since the third grade is also the point at which the choirs become more active in singing at Mass, more focus on
preparing liturgical repertoire becomes needed. From the fourth grade on, very few aspects of Kodály and Ward are continued; rather students apply previously learned principles to a variety of new situations at an increasing degree of depth as they learn to sing more repertoire. From an extensive body of chant, motets, anthems, and a few Mass settings, vocal and musical skills are refined and perfected throughout the year and from one year to the next. The Middle School Girls learn approximately twenty-eight pieces annually. The Middle School Treble Boys learn thirty pieces. The Changed Voice Boys learn a minimum of twenty-two pieces. The Honors Choir learns forty pieces. Each year the academy works to expand the treasury of repertoire it uses, particularly with works by modern church composers.

Prior to middle school, students receive a solid foundation in singing and reading music. The Kodály philosophy gives younger students first-hand, active music-making experiences primarily through singing, especially folks songs. Using moveable DO tonic solfa, Curwen/Glover hand signs, and Chêvé rhythm syllables of ta and ti-ti, the Kodály approach gives students tools and symbols they can apply to reading and notating music beginning with the SOL-MI interval. In the third grade, these concepts are expanded using book one of the Ward Method, *That All May Sing*, where students are exposed to vocal training, intonation exercises, rhythm syllables, creative improvisation and composition activities, notation, dictation, and conducting in each lesson. However, because neumes and the major chants of the Church are not introduced until books three and four, the introduction to chant in the third grade is very brief but nonetheless provides a substantial departing point on which to build in successive years.


By grades four through eight, students are expected to apply the vocal training as well as solfège and rhythm reading skills they have acquired in the lower grade levels to the printed page as they prepare large amounts of repertoire for the liturgy. Careful attention is paid to selecting music that is not only of high quality for the liturgy, but also possesses suitable ranges and developmentally appropriate musical challenges. Individual octavos, along with the compilation book the Bronze Collection (Royal School of Church Music), which is employed in the sixth through eighth grade, form the main body of repertoire students sing at Mass. The Parish Book of Chant (Church Music Association of America) is additionally required for the Changed Voice Boys. The music series Experiencing Choral Music (Glencoe) is incorporated as a supplement and contains secular works that are often sung for the spring concerts. The academy uses the first two levels of this text series (Grades 6-7 and Grades 7-9) for the treble-voice students in grades four through eight; each of the levels comes with a separate sight-singing book the students also use for extra practice. According to Edmund Murray, “Within the musical preparation, we try to incorporate as many of the National Standard objectives as possible, such as solo singing, being able to sing in groups, singing in different languages, singing with instruments, clapping rhythms, and understanding musical terminology. In every single piece of music we point out and do all of that.”

---


student fluency in solfège, part singing, theory and analysis, rhythm, meter, transferring pitches to the piano keyboard, style, history and culture, articulation, dynamics, and languages as they sing each piece. Special spotlight sections increase awareness of such important topics as vowels, diction, vocal technique, posture, breath, composition and arranging, concert etiquette, careers in music, male and female changing voices, improvisation, jazz, blues, musical theatre, and music periods and composers. To complement this formation in repertoire, students in these grade levels work with recorders and hand chimes on occasion. Though typically these instruments are not used outside of the classroom, I observed a rare occurrence of the Middle School Girls accompanying themselves on hand chimes while singing a highly effective setting of *Drop, Drop, Slow Tears* by Sam Batt Owens as the communion anthem at one of the Lenten weekday Masses.

When the boys’ voices change during the middle school years, they are admitted into a choir of their own which sings tenor-bass repertoire. The philosophy is to have them stay involved as much as each of the other middle school choirs. According to Edmund Murray,

> Our changed voice boys keep singing, and I know in some choir schools that is not the case where they are relegated to serving once their voice changes. Several studies that I have read advocate encouraging boys to keep singing to the extent that is possible through the voice change. I think if you stop them from singing, it is very hard to get them back.\(^{53}\)

\(^{52}\) Murray, interview.

\(^{53}\) Ibid.
One particular area of focus for these boys is learning to chant using *The Parish Book of Chant* as well as resources from the Corpus Christi Watershed website.\textsuperscript{54} The Changed Voice Boys sing these chants at Mass throughout the year. Boys that become quite proficient go on to sing in the small weekday *schola* when they reach high school and the Saint Gregory Schola Cantorum, which sings the Latin Mass on Sunday evening. Reading neumes and learning liturgical and chant terminology (e.g., tract, flex, quilisma, etc.) is part of this training. On occasion this choir combines with the high school tenors and basses to sing men’s repertoire or the Middle School Girls to sing mixed repertoire. At other times, they join the Middle School Treble Boys to form more of the classic men and boys’ arrangement. Edmund Murray says, “The American Boychoir, which goes up through eighth grade, is the model for doing this.”\textsuperscript{55}

While most choir schools stop at the end of eighth grade and need to import professional men to sing the tenor and bass parts, this is not the case at the academy. Both the high school choirs, and the middle school to a lesser extent, have their own in-house mixed choirs. Because both boys’ and girls’ voices become more settled in regards to tone and range by high school, there is a marked difference in the level of repertoire and students’ performance abilities as they progress from middle to high school. As Fr. Phillips attests, “By continuing the program past the eighth, students are able to mentally and physically reach a whole new level of music which they would never tackle earlier on. So it makes sense, that having given them that foundation, to now

\textsuperscript{54} Corpus Christi Watershed, “Music for the Liturgy.”

\textsuperscript{55} Murray, interview.
build something fabulous on it.” Individual octavos reflecting much of the church’s standard treasury, along with the compilation book *The New Oxford Easy Anthem Book* (Oxford) form the main body of repertoire students sing. Two publications by the Church Music Association of America, *The Parish Book of Chant* and *Communio,* are additionally required for the high school men. Having developed a strong proficiency in vocal technique, reading notation, and musicianship skills by the time they reach high school, the highest percentage of class time is spent working on repertoire and musical nuance. Though not done every day, time and attention are given to singing solfège and historical meaning when looking at a new piece for the first time. For advanced students, entry into the Honors Choir is a goal. Edmund Murray says, “They need to be able to sing in a quartet with three experienced Honors Choir singers and hold their own part on something that they have supposedly learned and rehearsed with the Chorale (e.g., *If Ye Love Me* by Tallis).” By having such a graded structure at the academy, an environment is provided where the older and more experienced singers are provided with adequately challenging experiences while serving as leaders and role models to the younger, less experienced singers.

During my observations at the academy, I witnessed students engaged in some particular areas of human and character development. Open-mindedness, especially to things students might be unfamiliar with, is taught as part of the academy’s mission in forming the

---

56 Phillips, interview.


59 Murray, interview.
“whole person” and opening students’ eyes to things they might not otherwise know existed.

During the process of being involved in the choir, students often discover that they like to sing or that singing is something at which they are really good; it becomes something for which they want to excel. Particularly with students who are not the strongest vocally or whose voices are changing, Fr. Phillips believes it is important that students have a productive and enjoyable experience in music:

That is a very important aspect of making a pre-kindergarten through grade twelve music program work; you do not want students to end up hating music. . . . This is one of the places where it is cool to sing because everyone is doing it. We have young men who are on the wrestling, basketball, and baseball teams as well as girls that are winning at volleyball; they are all in choir. There is a lot for the younger students to emulate. . . . When they have the idea of singing chorally within a choir, it builds up the idea of working as a team, being part of something bigger than yourself, and producing something that you could never produce on your own. It gives them all the sorts of lessons I would want to give them within this kind of education.  

The teacher will often ask for volunteers in rehearsal, or simply select a group of students to demonstrate a concept or sing a specific passage in the music; this activity helps students build confidence and also understand the importance of team-work. When everyone is able to pull their weight and work to their capability, the ensemble is at its best. Lastly, singing is approached very much as a gift from God that provides a way for students to express their faith and to participate in the liturgy in a very special way. Often following a morning when a choir sings for Mass, the instructor will spend a few minutes soliciting feedback from students. This exercise helps guide students in self-assessment as well as developing the ability to learn from both praise and criticism.

---

60 Phillips, interview.
While the integration of many associated subjects was observed in the choral rehearsal (e.g., vocal production, music reading and theory skills, linguistics, liturgy, spirituality, and human formation), the school provides other formal places for students to develop in these areas. As referenced earlier, all students of the school participate together in daily Mass Monday through Friday in one capacity or another. All Catholic boys in grades three through twelve take turns as altar servers; high school boys may additionally serve as lectors at Mass. Girls in the middle school assist as greeters at liturgies. To continue their theological, liturgical, and spiritual formation that is first initiated in the liturgy, all students receive religion/theology instruction five times per week. In each of the elementary, middle, and high school grades students receive instruction in Latin; students in grade six through twelve additionally study art history once each week. Private lessons in voice, piano, and organ are available to students on a limited basis after school. Edmund Murray states, “There are older students who give private piano lessons to about six younger students after school. If we wanted to teach more piano students, we could be doing that full-time.”

A professional voice teacher gives private lessons to a small number of high school students as well. For students in grades three through eight who want to play string instruments, it is recommended that they participate in musical instruction through the String Project, which is held a few miles away at the University of Texas at San Antonio (UTSA) campus. Students that start in the String Project often go on to participate in the prestigious Youth Orchestra of San Antonio (YOSA). The music faculty has proposed adding the option of Advanced Placement Theory to the high school curriculum as a class for the coming year; this proposal is currently awaiting administrative approval.

---

61 Murray, interview.
1.3 Aspects of good, healthy vocal production are promoted during singing.

Healthy vocal training begins as early as pre-kindergarten, when a student may have little or no prior experience in singing, and evolves over the next thirteen years at the academy. Initially, concepts such as teaching the difference between the speaking and singing voice as well as simply getting the children to enjoy singing are the main focus. Among the earliest music learned are some of the most basic responses for Mass, so that even the youngest students can participate in the sung parts. Singing in head tone is developed as early as possible and serves as the foundation for additional vocal development. The Ward Method using movement, including conducting, to teach skills like breath control and phrasing is employed in third grade. The six-part lessons by Ward are specifically designed to include exercises for intonation and vocal training which develop pure vowels. As fourth- and fifth-grade students progress through the program, Edmund Murray states, “Our primary goal is on developing the head tone, but then when we get to pieces that use a different tessitura, we do not seem to spend as much time on the lower range.” Recently, an extra effort has been made to give more attention to developing the middle and lower range, so that stronger alto voices are moving up through the middle and high school. Until around middle school, treble boys’ and girls’ voices sound very similar. By sixth grade, girls’ changing voices become softer and breathier, while boys’ voices possess exceptional strength and clarity until their voices too begin to change. Building healthy vocal technique in changing voices requires a strikingly different philosophy, which will be discussed separately at the end of this section. There are also emotional and attention-span issues at this

---

62 Ibid.
stage, which affect vocal production. Much of the seemingly strong musical prowess that students exhibit in the fourth- and fifth-grade years recedes during middle school, only to reemerge in high school. At the high school level, less vocal technique and more vocal nuance become the focus. Vocal style, legato singing, natural vibrato, smooth blend when moving between registers, agile technique, and increased breath control, all trademarks of the bel canto singing style, are emphasized at this stage.

Warm-up exercises at the beginning of each rehearsal are designed to cultivate healthy vocal technique in students. Because they are so vocally strong at this stage, the Middle School Treble Boys generally devote more time to exercises that emphasize musical concepts and ear training and less time specifically targeting vocal technique. The trebles in the lower grades work on developing head tone by starting in the upper register and singing five-note descending scales and similar exercises. This approach of carrying the head voice down is in contrast to starting exercises on middle C and working up the keyboard. Based on my own experiences of teaching, children have a much more difficult time singing on pitch and singing in the upper register without straining when the latter bottom-up approach is employed. Applying the chant concepts of arsis and thesis when conducting in the Ward Method, students kinesthetically engage breath support for phrasing and making crescendos. High school choirs use exercises incorporating arpeggios to practice smooth, blended transitions up and down through the passaggio. Vocalises that incorporate melismatic passages are used to develop agility and flexibility. Other vocal concepts are referenced as the repertoire is being rehearsed. During rehearsal, I observed references to the International Phoenetic Alphabet (IPA) and instructions to sing with taller vowels or better consonants. In Lauridsen’s Dirait-on, students worked on
connecting notes to make the lines more legato by energizing the space in between notes with more breath. The basses worked on maintaining stamina through difficult passages in Grieg’s *Ave maris stella* when the notes ascend and crescendo. In Brahms’s *Wie lieblich sind deine Wohnungen*, students worked to use less straight tone and a warmer Romantic sound. To assist in keeping them engaged and energized, students are allowed to alternate between sitting and standing on risers when singing.

I observed two tonal philosophies at The Atonement Academy, depending on the age of the student: the King’s College, Cambridge school of thought is employed with the younger trebles, while the *bel canto* singing style encapsulates the philosophy used for the high school choirs. Under the leadership of David Willcocks, King’s College came to be associated with the hooty, top-heavy, more straight-tone sound. Edmund Murray describes this sound as using “British vowels” and characterized by “a round, open tone, much like the flute stop of a pipe organ.” To most ears, these vowels lean more toward the swallowed rather than the brighter side of the spectrum, particularly noticeable in such words as “God” or “and.” Of the sound they want the high school choirs to emulate, Edmund Murray says,

> I want a mature sound; I am looking for depth and color of tone. We do not want them to sound like high school freshmen; we want them to sound like college singers. We are trying to take the juniors and seniors and make them the best that they can be, so they should be emulating the next step which is the college level. In my ear, I know what a good rich choir sound should be and I think that it is getting to the spin, getting the ring in the sound, and getting pure vowels. And then straight tone every now and then on Renaissance and other kinds of music, but I am not really a straight tone choir person for high school. I do not think it helps here in Texas to get you anywhere as far as developing individual voices or

---

63 Ibid.
getting into All-State and All-Region. Vibrato is good but should not be overdone or operatic sounding.  

As the number of students accepted into the TMEA choirs and the ranking of the academy choirs at state-wide competitions has reflected in recent years, this philosophy has been effective.  

During the changing voice years, the required approaches are distinctive from the techniques described above. As Fr. Phillips states, “Figuring out what to do with these changed voices was a mystery for us for a while, particularly at this stage amongst young men. But even the girls’ voices are not so mature vocally.”  When girls’ voices change they do not have the big mystery of shifting register as do boys; their voices instead exhibit an unusual amount of breathiness that makes them sound less vocally strong. According to Edmund Murray, “We treat the girls’ choir much like a group voice class and work on vocal technique, good tone, spin, breath, and getting the vocal chords to come together.”  Warm-ups I observed included exercises for range extension, melismas for flexibility, and hissing for engaging the breath. As cited above, the treble boys at this age do not seem to need as much warm-up as the girls. The boys’ time at the beginning of class is instead an opportunity for the teacher to go around the room and hear where individual boys are with their ranges. One exercise I observed that was particularly effective jumped around on the keyboard as opposed to modulating by half step; this helped the boys practice finding the correct register in which to sing and become more accustomed to using their changing instruments. Not only do these vocal disparities exist, but

---

64 Ibid.  
65 Phillips, interview.  
66 Murray, interview.
the approach to learning is also vastly different between the boys and girls at this age. The girls have more of an attention span for listening to instructions and thinking things through, so a great deal more can be achieved as far as musicianship, even though their voices are not as strong at this stage. Work with three-part chords (major, minor, diminished, augmented) is done quite a bit with the girls; that way they develop more independence on changing pitches and singing in tune. Edmund Murray states, “Many of the boys do not care about putting the extra thought in; they just want to do it. The boys have to work so much more on listening, because they do not like to do that.”

In addition to working with registers, the boys’ time is often used to teach concepts such as half steps or whole steps, articulation, musical terminology, etc.

The largest issue during this middle school phase is, of course, the boys’ voices changing from the treble to the bass clef range. Keeping the boys engaged in singing as much as possible during this time helps them get through the change already knowing what to do. Edmund Murray explains,

> When the voices of the stronger singers do change, they do not have as difficult of a time making the transition because their vocal muscles and breathing are so strong. When they get into a bigger instrument, they already know what to do and how to use it; it is not teaching from square one. Singing all of the time during the school year makes a big difference. Some of the boys whose voices transition so gradually can still sing alto or even soprano once their voices began to change without sounding like they are straining or singing flat because they are trying to sing high. Often what happens is, over the summer when they are not singing much, they come back in the fall and the voice has dropped.

For the most part, the philosophy of classifying voices at the academy aligns with the six stages researcher John Cooksey has devised for the changing voice (see Fig. 5.2). The one exception is

---

67 Ibid.

68 Ibid.
that the unchanged range is much higher at the academy due to their extensive work with developing the head tone and extends A3-A5.

Fig. 5.2. Stages of the boys’ changing voice – by John Cooksey

As cited above, these changes in register begin to appear in the Middle School Treble Boys choir. As a result, this choir gets smaller as the year goes on, as more boys are moved to the Changed Voice Boys. Every few months, and particularly when the teacher observes some type of change in the tone or range of a boy’s singing or speaking voice, the teacher will meet with the student one-on-one to take them through a sequence of exercises. If any changes have taken place, the student keeps track of their progress on a chart they are given to fill out. During these hearings, the teacher will ask the boys to count backwards from ten to determine their speaking pitch. Their lowest singing note is usually a step or two below. The speaking pitch serves as a departing point from which the boys then ascend and descend chromatically to ascertain the range. Pieces that could be easily sung at the beginning of the year, such as Malcolm Archer’s *My Song is Love Unknown*, are no longer possible in the spring because the lower treble part is

---

now too high for the altos. When the breathiness and huskiness start to come into their voice and their eyes squint when trying to sing anything above C5, these are the most noticeable indications that the voice is beginning to change to Midvoice I. Using three-part music whenever possible assists a great deal in that the ranges of each part are narrower; in these pieces the alto part is closer to the Midvoice II stage, or a cambiata part, which centers on middle C. According to Edmund Murray, “When the boys’ voices are in the middle of changing, F4 and G4 are right on the edge of what they can sing; G3 up to E4 is easy. That is why the music of French composer Jean Langlais is great, because his alto parts are all right around middle C and stay within a four- to five-note range.”

When students reach Midvoice IIA, a decision must be made whether to keep the boy singing in the Treble choir. Edmund Murray explains, “This stage is marked by a huskier speaking voice and a diminished singing ability. Even though the range is only two notes lower, it is still really difficult for them. This is the hardest time because they can be either alto or tenor.” Movement to the Changed Voice Boys depends on a host of factors: the boy’s ability to use his falsetto voice to comfortably continue singing in the treble range, the nature of the shift, and the age and grade of the boy. Sixth-grade boys are typically not placed in the Changed Voice Boys unless there is really no other option. In the Changed Voice Boys, some boys are able to vocalize as low as F2. I observed that the boys in this choir could typically sing up to D4-E4 before flipping over into their falsetto voice. During this time, students continue to do exercises in the E4 to Eb5 range using this head voice to help strengthen their voices. According to Edmund Murray, “Sometimes they will take a lyrical piece,

\[^{70}\text{Murray, interview.}\]
\[^{71}\text{Ibid.}\]
something that moves quickly, from the Treble choir and sing it all in head voice for practice."\textsuperscript{72} Many times after becoming a new baritone, the boy’s voice will come back up to tenor.

### 1.4 Music reading skills are developed.

As referenced in section 1.2, elements of the Kodály philosophy and the Ward Method are used in the early years, so that by the time students reach third and fourth grade they already possess proficiency in ear training and music reading. This is important since students begin learning repertoire for Mass on a regular basis at this point. Edmund Murray states, “Students do not sing music that they are not able to read.”\textsuperscript{73} Since the Mass repertoire is not taught by rote, students must possess the skills to translate what is on the written page mainly through relying on their facility of solfège. The instructor for the Ward Method displays short melodies on a dry erase board which the students sing back on solfège while conducting. The teacher also hums short melodies which students then sing back on solfège. In this way students are trained to not only visually identify pitches but to hear what they should sound like. Notation and dictation exercises allow the students opportunities to synthesize the two. Like Kodály, the Ward Method uses LA-based minor and movable DO; the pitch of DO is changed constantly during class exercises to show that the tonic may start on any pitch. Students must rely on the key signature to give them clues to finding where DO would be on the staff. In learning pieces of music, the students must be able to sing pieces accurately on solfège; words are added only at the very end.

\textsuperscript{72} Ibid.

\textsuperscript{73} Ibid.
During the solfège process, the teacher randomly stops and asks which word they ended on to ensure students are following along in the music and actually reading what they see. Because the repertoire sometimes contains pitches which the students are not yet as familiar with (e.g., TE, FI, etc.), this process can be excruciatingly slow in the beginning. With the third and fourth grades it may take multiple days to sing through an entire song on solfège, since they may be learning one page per day. By the fourth and fifth grade, students are expected to be able to sing scales, chords, and chromatic passages using solfège and hand signs. Students are frequently asked to volunteer to create short motives that start on DO or to sing one measure of a piece on solfège. Students also practice inhaling and coming in on the pitch A440 to work on developing relative pitch. The supplemental sight-reading books that accompany the music series *Experiencing Choral Music* (Glencoe), which was referenced above, are used in grades four through eight for additional practice.\(^7^4\) Overall, the employment of solfège to read pitches is consistent throughout all grade levels. However, the system for reading rhythm is much less systematic and consistent. For example, “ta” and “ti-ti” rhythm syllables developed by Emile-Joseph Chêvé are used along with other Kodály concepts in grades pre-kindergarten through second grade; “la” and “long” along with tapping in the hand is used with the Ward Method in third grade; counting on numbers and mathematical values are employed from grade four up; and the Solesmes Method of rhythm is used with middle and high school boys for chant. The piano is used occasionally during rehearsal as accompaniment, but usually not to double the voice parts. Overall, the singing in the rehearsals is confident and in tune.

By the time students are in middle and high school, they know how to read music and spend less class time practicing pieces on solfège and more time on nuancing the repertoire. In general, the Middle School Girls and Treble Boys sing two- and three-part repertoire. The Changed Voice Boys employ TB, TBB, and TTBB repertoire as well as some SATB pieces when combined with the other middle school choirs. The Honors Choir sings mostly SATB or SATB-divisi music.

1.5 A wide spectrum of musical literature, particularly those songs of the Sunday liturgy, is employed during musical training.

Because the primary role of the choirs at The Atonement Academy is to sing for liturgies, seventy-nine works out of 106, or seventy-five percent of the choral literature they prepare, is only for use in the liturgy; the other twenty-five percent is for concerts and competitions (see Fig. 5.3-5.8). This body of literature, taken from Catholic and Anglican sources, reflects every period of the church’s history, particularly the Anglican patrimony and esteemed English choral tradition. The choirs spend the majority of their time and effort during rehearsals preparing the pieces they sing alone during the weekday liturgies: the Gospel Alleluia with a verse and a communion anthem for each Mass. In addition to this choral literature, a schola of high school men, and sometimes the Changed Voice Boys, prepare communion antiphons from the Graduale

---


76 Murray, “An Overview of the Music Program at Our Lady of the Atonement Church & Academy: Part 1.”
Romanum, Graduale Simplex or one of the collections of English propers.\textsuperscript{77} On feast days and solemnities, the choir will prepare choral Mass settings or additional anthems, and the schola will chant the entire Propers for the day. Due to incorporating vocal and solfège practice into each choral rehearsal as well as employing repertoire that is moderately difficult and not repeated often, an average of only two or three pieces are rehearsed in a single class. If pieces do reoccur, they are repeated only two or three times each year at most. Typically the same repertoire is used for the same grade level, so every new class of students filtering through that grade has an opportunity to learn it at that specific developmental point. This core repertoire is supplemented each year with new pieces. Occasionally works will be repeated at different grade levels; for example, if students learn a work in fourth grade, the same piece might be brought back when they are in sixth grade. In this way, they have had experience singing it already and can focus on other aspects besides learning notes. Another reason for being able to prepare high-quality music in a short amount of time is that many of the choirs consist of combined grade levels; the Honors Choir has sophomores, juniors, and seniors while each of the middle school choirs has students from grades six, seven, and eight. When pieces are repeated every one to two years, there are always a handful of students who are already familiar with the music. The four choirs I examined from The Atonement Academy had a combined repertory of nearly eighty choral works which they employed in the liturgy in 2013, including four choral Masses. This repertoire will be discussed further in sections 3-5.

In addition, the choirs participate in the congregational singing of the hymns, responses, acclamations, psalms, and Mass parts. To join in the congregational participation, the choirs use

\textsuperscript{77} Ibid.
the same resources during liturgies as the congregants. Two printed sources are used during Masses on weekdays and Sundays: a Mass booklet and a hymn sheet or printed bulletin. The Mass booklet produced in-house contains the Order of Mass according to the Anglican Use in English and the Missa Normativa in Latin. Simple notation is indicated for some of the English responses, but text-only is provided for the Latin Mass and English Ordinary. These settings are sung completely from melodic memory. Since the same Ordinary settings as well as responses have been used for years at both the weekday school Masses and the weekend parish Masses, a great majority of people are able to sing them. Four settings comprise the Masses familiar to the congregation: three English settings and one Latin chant setting. However, only two are used on a frequent basis. The Kyrie, Sanctus, and Agnus Dei from Healey Willan’s Missa de Sancta Maria Magdalena are used in conjunction with the Gloria and Credo from Martin Shaw’s An Anglican Folk Mass for all English celebrations of the Eucharist. The composite chant Mass from Sing to the Lord, containing Kyrie XVI, Gloria VIII, Credo III, Sanctus XVIII, and Agnus Dei XVIII, along with the Latin responses, is used for all Latin celebrations of the Missa Normativa. Since there are no hymnals in the pews, a hymn sheet containing the selected offertory hymns for each day of the week is used at the school Masses. On Sundays, a printed bulletin with multiple hymns, proper texts and readings, and a psalm set to Anglican chant is provided. In general, no musical notation is included on either the weekday or Sunday leaflets, but the major sources from which these hymns are drawn include: The Hymnal 1982 and The Hymnal 1940, published by the Episcopal Church in the United States; The English Hymnal, published by the Church of England; and the St. Gregory Hymnal, published by the St. Gregory Guild in the United States. Fr. Phillips has also written a number of hymn texts, which are set to
familiar tunes and include some texts written for specific feasts. But the most frequently sung of his texts are *Jesus, Lord and Savior*, set to the tune ADORO TE DEVOTE, which is sung at every school Mass after receiving Communion; and *Our Lady of the Atonement*, set to AURELIA, which is sung during the Marian months of October and May at the conclusion of Mass as a substitute for the hymn *O Sacrament Most Holy*. There is substantial carry-over with using the same hymns at both school and parish liturgies. In addition, Anglican chant has a prominent place in both, being used for the Sunday gradual psalms as well as the psalms, *Magnificat*, and *Nunc dimittis* of Evensong. With the exception of reviewing the pointing of the Gospel verses of the day, the congregational music and responses are generally familiar enough to the choir students that it does not need to be reviewed in rehearsal.

*Standard #2:*

*Gregorian chant is given pride of place in liturgical services.*

2.1 Choirs and congregations are exposed to hearing live chant in the liturgy and singing a minimum repertory of this chant.

Regularly participating in a variety of liturgical chants at The Atonement Academy, the congregation possesses proficiency in Mass Ordinaries, responses, hymns, and psalms. As referenced in section 1.5, one of the two main Ordinary settings the congregation sings is the composite chant Mass specified in *Sing to the Lord*. The congregation also frequently sings *Kyrie VIII*. According to the role of each, the presider, deacon, and lector chant all of the presidential prayers and dialogues of the Mass. In turn, the congregation contributes sung Latin responses during the greeting, the end of each presidential prayer, the beginning and end of
scripture readings, the prayer of the faithful, the preface dialogue, the Memorial Acclamation, the doxology and Great Amen, the Lord’s Prayer, and the dismissal. Set to various Ambrosian and Gregorian chant melodies, these same responses plus the Fraction Anthem are sung in English during the Anglican Use liturgy. A few other chants, including some of the hymns specified in the Sacred Congregation for Divine Worship’s Jubilate Deo, are also part of the congregation’s repertory: Adoro te devote, Ave verum corpus, Pange lingua, Tantum ergo, and the Magnificat set to Gregorian psalm tone eight. Some of these hymns are sung in Latin, while others have adapted English texts to the original chant melodies. At both Mass and Evensong, Anglican chant, not to be confused with Gregorian chant (although it is in many respects a harmonized adaptation of the Gregorian psalm tones), is also sung by the congregation. Organ accompaniment is provided for the congregational chant during the Mass Ordinary, hymns, and psalms, but not for the responses; those are usually a cappella.

In addition to participating in the congregational chants, choristers present other forms of chant during the Mass. Some of the students, mainly the high school men’s schola, know additional ordinary chants which are sung on occasion, including Kyrie XI, Sanctus VIII, Agnus Dei VIII, and Agnus Dei IX. Likewise, the men are able to sing some of the major sequences (Victimae paschali laudes and Veni Sancte Spiritus), Marian antiphons (Regina coeli and Salve Regina), and other Latin chants such as Ave maris stella, Parce Domine, Veni creator Spiritus, Ubi caritas, Da pacem, Te Deum, and Asperges me. The Parish Book of Chant is the main resource used for these chants.

---

78 Murray, interview.
Above all else, the primary responsibility of the schola, however, is to chant the communion antiphon at the school Mass each weekday. A second resource, Communio, contains this set of chants, providing antiphons with psalm verses for all Sundays and feast days in the current three-year Missal cycle. Since it does not contain proper chants for weekdays because none exist unless it falls on a feast or solemnity, the men use the communion chant from the previous Sunday and sing that chant two or three times during the week. On the other days, the men sing one of the antiphons for general use or substitute a Latin hymn that is fitting to the liturgical season. While the Graduale Romanum contains prescribed proper chants for each day of the liturgical year, there are no verses with these chants. An advantage of using Communio is that it contains verses set to psalm tones that can be used with each of the antiphons. A second benefit is that English translations of the antiphon and psalm verses are provided at the end of each chant in the book. One disadvantage, however, is that the eight formularies for the Gloria Patri are not written out anywhere in the book with the words and music together; to compensate for this, students have pasted their own copy of the eight Gloria Patri settings inside the front and back covers of the book for easy accessibility. During the reception of Communion at the weekday Mass, the men begin by chanting the antiphon, then alternate verses with the antiphon. The number of verses varies due to the timing that is needed; once the last verse is sung, the doxology and antiphon conclude the chant. The men sing from the choir loft without organ accompaniment and then proceed downstairs to join the end of the communion procession once they have finished singing the chant. On feast days, following the opening hymn, the schola also

---


80 Rice, “Communio.”
sings an introit as the priest is incensing the altar. On lesser feasts, this chant is taken from the Anglican-Use Gradual (which sets English texts to Gregorian psalm tones) or the Palmer Burgess Gradual (which sets English texts to chant melodies from the Graduale Romanum). On major feasts, the Latin chant from the Graduale Romanum is employed. The offertory chant is also sung, typically to a psalm tone. Due to their exceeding difficulty, the offertory and gradual chants in the Graduale Romanum are not used. Edmund Murray states, “We try to project the idea of progressive solemnity in whatever settings we use of the music. In the past five years there has been an explosion of settings of the Propers; there is a definite renewed interest in singing the Propers not just by choirs but by congregations too.”

2.2 Teachers possess effective methods of teaching and promoting chant.

The motivation for pursuing a study of chant and Latin at the academy stems from the centrality of both to the history of the Catholic Church, particularly in the celebration of the liturgy. From the lower grades that have Latin instruction twice per week to the high school where Advanced Placement Latin is offered and daily instruction is given, students not only learn vocabulary, grammar, and syntax, but they are taught songs and prayers from the very beginning. As a result, the Mass each Friday is offered in Latin, using the Ordinary Form.

---


83 Murray, interview.
According to Fr. Phillips, every part of the curriculum at the school, in fact, contributes to the celebration of daily Mass:

We are not teaching our students chant as some type of music appreciation; it is so they can use it at the Mass. Even the little ones, when they start out chanting it is painful, because it is note to note and there is no sense of a phrase. That comes later and you can see how they develop that. But they understand that when they are learning chant or when they are learning Latin, it is to be used at the Mass. Whatever they are studying in whatever class, it is to hone them intellectually, to open up the treasures of knowledge throughout the ages, to open up the treasure of music and art so that they bring that knowledge and that experience with them into the Mass and it makes it real for them.84

Initially, the lower grades hear chant more than they sing it. Gradually, more formal training in chant occurs, beginning with a year of the Ward Method in the third grade, as was already discussed in sections 1.2 and 1.3 above. While these students gain experience in shaping melodies according to the Solesmes rhythmic technique of *arsis* and *thesis*, because the chants are indicated with numbers, students do not learn to read chant notation at this stage. Not until middle school do the boys in the changed-voice choir begin learning to read chant from neumes. *A Gregorian Chant Master Class* by Theodore Marier is the main resource used in teaching the boys.85 Students practice feeling the groupings of twos and threes by inflectively reading the Latin text aloud. Each grouping tells the students where the ictus falls; student volunteers take turns conducting the class. As we have seen from the high school men’s *schola*, overall, the boys at the school have more experience and knowledge of chant than the girls do, though the Chorale Girls have sung the communion chant once or twice, and some of their anthems are chant-based.

---

84 Phillips, interview.
85 Marier, *A Gregorian Chant Master Class*. 
The music program at The Atonement Academy preserves and promotes the use of Gregorian chant regularly through the liturgical music the congregation sings, the chants and motets the choir sings, and the organ improvisations during the liturgy which incorporate chant motives. On Marian feasts, for example, the organist often weaves phrases from the melody of a chant such as the *Ave Maria* through various improvisations preceding the Gospel *Alleluia*, for Communion, or during the postlude. Chant-based motets, including *Jesu dulcis memoria* by Jean Langlais and *Rorate caeli desuper* by Leo Nestor, are also sung regularly. The philosophy at The Atonement Academy is to open up students’ minds to the beauty of what chant can give them through the liturgy. Fr. Phillips elaborates on the aesthetic quality of chant when it is more than something listened to on a compact disc, but rather placed in the context for which it was intended and the impact this has on the students:

> When we put that chant into the liturgy for which it was designed, it vivifies it; it makes it come alive and you see the excitement in our kids. The young high school men in the *schola* do a lot of that work on their own. They meet during their lunch hour to practice; no one has told them to do that, but they want to do that. When you go to a museum and see the beautiful pieces of art, you can admire a lot of the religious paintings. When you go to a church where they still are places of veneration, and you see them in their place, you realize museums are nice but they were painted or carved for this place. Opening up our students’ minds to that is really opening up their souls to that as well. They will never look at chant the same; they will never hear a recording of chant without thinking that the church is where that really belongs.\(^{86}\)

Much like knowing one’s family history, when something from the tradition of the church, such as chant, transcends time and space to still speak to us today, we are able to claim it for our own and make it part of our history. Edmund Murray explains how this has been the case at the academy: “When students latch onto it, it is really amazing. The young men who sing in the

\(^{86}\) Phillips, interview.
schola for the weekday Mass are largely student-led; I do not have much to do with that group at all. They are very serious about it and committed to it. Even after they graduate, they try to keep this chant tradition going wherever they go off to college.”

Standard #3:
Sacred polyphony is included in liturgical celebrations.

3.1 The singing of polyphony is employed by the choir, or other capable individuals, in liturgical and non-liturgical celebrations at times for the benefit of the ecclesial community.

Standards 3-5 of this study will discuss the sacred treasure as it relates to choral repertoire sung at The Atonement Academy. After collecting the music list of all sung choral works in 2013 from these four choirs, a data base of 106 works was the result. Fig. 5.3 reflects the number of works that are represented by each historical period. The composer(s) that was most frequently performed among the choirs in that era is listed as the most represented composer. Of the 106 works, fourteen are from the Renaissance, six are from the Baroque, six are from the Rococo and Classical periods, fourteen are from the Romantic/Cecilian/Oxford era, fourteen are from the twentieth century, and fifty-two represent compositions by living composers.

---

87 Murray, interview.

Fig. 5.3 Choral repertoire performed at The Atonement Academy in 2013
* The figures below represent repertoire sung by the four choirs used in this study and no other choirs at the school or parish.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Historical Era</th>
<th>Number of works</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Most represented composer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Renaissance Polyphony</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>William Byrd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baroque</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>Johann Sebastian Bach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rococo/Classical</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>Giovanni B. Pergolesi Thomas Attwood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romantic/Cecilian/Oxford</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>Gabriel Fauré Felix Mendelssohn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twentieth Century</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>Jean Langlais</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Living Composers</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>John Rutter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total number of works</strong></td>
<td><strong>106</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Renaissance polyphony comprises thirteen percent of choral works performed by the choirs studied at The Atonement Academy (see Fig. 5.4). The Honors Choir engaged this body of repertoire with the highest frequency, performing it for Mass on weekdays. The twelve motets, anthems, and canons were used exclusively during the reception of Communion, while two polyphonic Mass settings were employed occasionally for the Kyrie, Sanctus, and Agnus Dei of the ordinary on solemnities and important feast days. Though polyphonic music was performed once a month on average throughout all of the liturgical seasons, higher concentrations occurred on solemnities and during the seasons of Lent and Easter. Polyphonic motets and anthems were rarely performed in non-liturgical settings as part of concerts. William
Byrd, Richard Farrant, and Giovanni Palestrina are the main composers represented on The Atonement Academy’s list of repertoire. The English Renaissance is most represented with five composers, while the Italian tradition is also rather highly represented with three composers.

The complete list of Renaissance pieces is below (see Fig. 5.4).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHOIR</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>COMPOSER</th>
<th>VOICING</th>
<th>GENRE</th>
<th>TEXT</th>
<th>USE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>Haec Dies</td>
<td>Byrd, William</td>
<td>SSATTB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSTRB</td>
<td>Non nobis, Domine</td>
<td>Byrd, William</td>
<td>SAT</td>
<td>canon</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>Surge Illuminare</td>
<td>Byrd, William</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSG, CV</td>
<td>Hide not Thou thy face</td>
<td>Farrant, Richard</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>Lord For Thy Tender Mercies' Sake</td>
<td>Farrant, Richard</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>Missa secunda</td>
<td>Hassler, Hans Leo</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSTRB, CV</td>
<td>This is the Day (Haec Dies)</td>
<td>Morley, Thomas (arr. Greening)</td>
<td>SAB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>Haec Dies</td>
<td>Palestrina, Giovanni P. d.</td>
<td>SSATTB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>Exsultate Deo</td>
<td>Palestrina, Giovanni P. d.</td>
<td>SAATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>If Ye Love Me</td>
<td>Tallis, Thomas</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSG</td>
<td>O Holy Spirit, Lord of Grace</td>
<td>Tye, Christopher</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>Missa L’hora passa</td>
<td>Viadana, Lodovico</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MGS</td>
<td>Ave Maria</td>
<td>Victoria, Tomás (arr. Robinson)</td>
<td>SSA, opt. kybd.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>Miserere mei Deus</td>
<td>Allegri, Gregorio</td>
<td>SSAB solos, SSATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

With the Honors Choir, a unique opportunity is provided to the congregants to hear mixed-voice polyphony occasionally during weekday Masses. The middle school treble and changed-voice choirs have also combined periodically to present this type of repertoire. When this is the case, often the vocal ranges are narrow, or arrangements of pieces are used. While the congregants hear this body of *a cappella* music on occasion, the majority of choral works these choirs sing is accompanied by organ. The Parish Music Series regularly features guest choirs who perform Renaissance polyphony for parishioners in a concert setting.

*Standard #4:*

_The treasure of sacred music is preserved and fostered with great care._

4.1 The singing of all the different types of sacred music that exist within the church treasury (e.g., Masses, antiphons, motets, anthems, hymns, cantatas, oratorios) is employed by the choir, or other individuals, in liturgical and non-liturgical celebrations for the glory of God and sanctification of the faithful.

Aside from the thirteen percent of Renaissance works already discussed and the forty-nine percent of pieces by living composers which will be discussed in section five, music from the Baroque, Rococo, Classical, Romantic, Cecilian, Oxford, and twentieth century periods comprises the remaining thirty-eight percent (see Fig. 5.5-5.8). Masses, requiems, motets, anthems, carols, hymns, canticles, cantatas, oratorios, spirituals, and gospel are among the sacred genres represented. On occasion, larger works such as the Requiem settings of Fauré, Duruflé, or Rutter were sung by the Honors Choir and Parish Festival Choir in their entirety within the liturgy. Among the 106 works, twenty-seven are secular in nature; these works are showcased at choral competitions and on the bi-annual school concert programs. The school, along with guest artists, performs an average of fifteen concerts at Our Lady of the Atonement each season,
including works such as Britten’s *St. Nicolas* and recitals featuring vocal chamber music and sacred organ works with brass. In both liturgical and non-liturgical settings, students and parishioners are exposed to a multitude of works from the church’s treasure of sacred music.

Repertoire from the Baroque period, comprising six percent of works, is represented exclusively by the *seconda pratica* style. Featuring a single melody line or duet with chordal accompaniment, such pieces are well suited to treble voices. As a result, we find the Middle School Treble Boys and the Middle School Girls, the two treble-voice ensembles, engaging this body of repertoire with the highest frequency, performing it with organ accompaniment during Communion for weekday Masses. While J. S. Bach is the most represented composer, arrangements of these works provide text settings in English rather than German. Composers Henry Purcell and Maurice Greene provide additional anthems that may be sung in English.

Fig. 5.5. Choral repertoire in 2013: Baroque (6 out of 106 works) = 6%

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHOIR</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>COMPOSER</th>
<th>VOICING</th>
<th>GENRE</th>
<th>TEXT</th>
<th>USE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>All Breathing Life, Sing &amp; Praise</td>
<td>Bach, J.S. (arr. Williamson)</td>
<td>SATB, continuo</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSTRB</td>
<td>Rejoice, O my Spirit</td>
<td>Bach, J.S. (arr. Easson)</td>
<td>unison, kybd.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSTRB</td>
<td>Thou visitest the earth</td>
<td>Greene, Maurice</td>
<td>treble solo, SATB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSG</td>
<td>O mysterium ineffabile</td>
<td>Lallouette, Jean Francois</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>Rejoice in the Lord always</td>
<td>Purcell, Henry (arr. Shaw)</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CV</td>
<td>Laudate Dominum</td>
<td>Vivaldi, Antonio (arr. Liebergen)</td>
<td>SSA, piano, opt. fl.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


The Rococo and Classical periods, comprising six percent of works, is tied with the Baroque period for the era with the smallest number of choral works represented (see Fig. 5.6). The middle school choirs perform the bulk of these pieces as communion anthems during the week. Giovanni B. Pergolesi and Thomas Attwood are the two composers most represented by the repertoire. With the exception of Mozart, the absence of pieces from the First Viennese School, including Schubert, Haydn, and Beethoven, reflect the Anglican propensity toward using the organ in liturgy rather than orchestral textures and forms.

Fig. 5.6. Choral repertoire in 2013: Rococo/Classical (6 out of 106 works) = 6%

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHOIR</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>COMPOSER</th>
<th>VOICING</th>
<th>GENRE</th>
<th>TEXT</th>
<th>USE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MSTRB, CV</td>
<td>Lenten Prayer</td>
<td>Pergolesi, Giovanni B.</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSG</td>
<td>Stabat Mater</td>
<td>Pergolesi, Giovanni B.</td>
<td>SA, org.</td>
<td>hymn</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CV</td>
<td>Jubilate Deo</td>
<td>Mozart (arr. Spevacek)</td>
<td>SA or TB, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSG, MSTRB</td>
<td>Love One Another</td>
<td>Wesley, Samuel</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


The Romantic period, with its outgrowths of the Cecilian and Oxford movements, comprises thirteen percent of the choral works performed by the academy (see Fig. 5.7). Composers such as Gabriel Fauré, Camille Saint-Saëns, and Lorenzo Perosi loosely embody musical elements of the Cäcilienverein, which sought to purge liturgical music of operatic tendencies. Edward Elgar, John Goss, Charles Parry, John Stainer, and Charles Stanford reflect
hallmarks of the Oxford movement. Requiems also became a particularly popular genre during the nineteenth century. Other works composed in the Romantic style include those by German composers Brahms and Mendelssohn as well as Russian composers Balakirev and Rachmaninoff. Due to the forces required, technical difficulty level, and German and Slavonic language challenges, these pieces are most frequently performed by the Honors Choir.

Fig. 5.7. Choral Repertoire in 2013: Romantic/Cecilian movement/Oxford movement (14 out of 106 works) = 13%

MSG = Middle School Girls; MSTRB = Middle School Treble Boys; CV = Changed Voice Boys; HC = Honors Choir
DO = Divine Office; M = Mass; NL = Non-liturgical

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHOIR</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>COMPOSER</th>
<th>VOICING</th>
<th>GENRE</th>
<th>TEXT</th>
<th>USE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>Send Forth Thy Light</td>
<td>Balakirev, Mily A. (ed. Stetsenko)</td>
<td>SATB (divisi)</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>Schaffe in mir Gott</td>
<td>Brahms, Johannes</td>
<td>SATBB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>German</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSTRB</td>
<td>Ave verum corpus</td>
<td>Elgar, Edward</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CV</td>
<td>Cantique de Jean Racine</td>
<td>Fauré, Gabriel</td>
<td>TTBB, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>Requiem</td>
<td>Fauré, Gabriel</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>requiem</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>DO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>O Savior of the World</td>
<td>Goss, John</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSTRB</td>
<td>O rest in the Lord</td>
<td>Mendelssohn, Felix</td>
<td>unison, kybd.</td>
<td>oratorio</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CV</td>
<td>The Lord is a Mighty God</td>
<td>Mendelssohn, Felix (arr. Ehret)</td>
<td>2-pt. mixed</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>I Was Glad</td>
<td>Parry, Charles H. H.</td>
<td>SSAATTBB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CV</td>
<td>Laudate Dominum</td>
<td>Perosi, Lorenzo</td>
<td>2vv., org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>Bogoroditsye, Dyevo</td>
<td>Rachmaninoff, Sergei</td>
<td>SATB (divisi)</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Slavonic</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CV</td>
<td>Tollite Hostias</td>
<td>Saint-Saëns, Camille (arr. Mulder)</td>
<td>TTB</td>
<td>oratorio</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>God so loved the world</td>
<td>Stainer, John</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSTRB, CV</td>
<td>O for a closer walk with God</td>
<td>Stanford, Charles Villiers</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Music from the twentieth century represents thirteen percent of the choral works performed at the academy (see Fig. 5.8). Both treble choirs and the Honors Choir engaged this body of repertoire an equal amount. Likewise, an even number of works from the sacred and secular veins of this century are employed for liturgical and concert performance respectively. The majority of the composers on the list are the English, including Peter Aston, Maurice Bevan, Benjamin Britten, and Patrick Hadley. Works by English minimalist composer John Tavener and English-born Canadian organist and composer Healey Willan have been sung by the Honors Choir. Two works by French composer and organist Jean Langlais are employed by the treble choirs: a Latin Mass setting and a motet. Sam Batt Owens, American church music composer, and Moses Hogan, known for his African-American spiritual settings, are also among the composers represented. In general, a wide range of voicings, genres, and instrumental accompaniment options are embodied by the music of this period.
Many traditional Latin hymn texts, such as *Ave verum corpus*, *Laudate Dominum*, and *Ave Maria* have been set to original music by composers throughout the centuries and made into choral motets. Aside from these hymn-motets, the choirs’ main body of hymns is drawn from numerous hymnal sources, which were discussed previously in section 1.5. Forming a solid core
of this body of hymns are many original texts by Fr. Christopher Phillips, pastor of Our Lady of the Atonement Parish. As stated on the music department page of the school’s website, “Rather than being frozen in time, the ancient treasure of the church is brought alive and cherished at The Atonement Academy.”

Standard #5:
Composers cultivate new works of sacred music to increase the church’s store of treasures.

5.1 Sacred works by recent and living composers are among those taught and employed by Catholic institutions.

Compositions by living composers comprise the remaining forty-nine percent, the largest category of choral works performed (see Fig. 5.9). The trebles engaged this body of repertoire with the highest frequency, performing the anthems, hymns, carols, and motets with organ accompaniment as well as many secular works by contemporary composers. The vast majority of these works used by the middle school are found in the Bronze Collection, a publication by the Royal School of Church Music which includes anthems by English composers Peter Moger, Malcolm Archer, John Rutter, L. J. White, Barry Ferguson, Martin How, Simon Lole, Richard Shephard, and more. English composers Bob Chilcott, Martin How, John Rutter, and Malcolm Archer are the most represented living composers on the repertoire list. A number of works sung by the Changed Voice Boys have been written by American composers such as David Brunner and Mark Patterson, as well as local Texas composers David Hill, Joseph Martin, and Laura Farnell. Other sacred works by American composers include Paul Bouman, Leo Nestor, Morten

---

90 The Atonement Academy, “Department of Music.”
Lauridsen, Paul French, Patti Drennan, and Texas composer David Ashley White. Almost all employ English texts over Latin.

Fig. 5.9. Choral repertoire in 2013: living composers (52 out of 106 works) = 49%

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHOIR</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>COMPOSER</th>
<th>PERIOD</th>
<th>VOICING</th>
<th>GENRE</th>
<th>TEXT</th>
<th>USE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MSTRB</td>
<td>I lift up my eyes to the hills</td>
<td>Bouman, Paul</td>
<td>b. 1918</td>
<td>SA, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSTRB</td>
<td>The Call: Two Fishermen</td>
<td>Toolan, Suzanne</td>
<td>b. 1927</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSTRB</td>
<td>Advent Message</td>
<td>How, Martin</td>
<td>b. 1931</td>
<td>unison, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSG</td>
<td>Bless, O Lord, us Thy Servants</td>
<td>How, Martin</td>
<td>b. 1931</td>
<td>1-3vv., org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSG</td>
<td>Day by Day</td>
<td>How, Martin</td>
<td>b. 1931</td>
<td>SA (divisi), org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSTRB, CV</td>
<td>Fairest Lord Jesus</td>
<td>How, Martin (arr.)</td>
<td>b. 1931</td>
<td>2vv., org.</td>
<td>hymn</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSG</td>
<td>Praise, O praise our God and King</td>
<td>How, Martin</td>
<td>b. 1931</td>
<td>SA (divisi), org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSTRB</td>
<td>Listen</td>
<td>Nazareth(arr. Archer)</td>
<td>b. 1938</td>
<td>SA, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSTRB</td>
<td>Masters in This Hall</td>
<td>Dicie, Don Michael</td>
<td>b. 1941</td>
<td>2-pt.,kybd.,fl.,ob.</td>
<td>carol</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSG</td>
<td>Away with Gloom, away with doubt</td>
<td>Ferguson, Barry</td>
<td>b. 1942</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSG</td>
<td>I Sing</td>
<td>Goetze, Mary</td>
<td>b. 1943</td>
<td>SSA, piano</td>
<td>secular</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>O Nata Lux</td>
<td>Lauridsen, Morten</td>
<td>b. 1943</td>
<td>SATB (divisi)</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>Sure On This Shining Night</td>
<td>Lauridsen, Morten</td>
<td>b. 1943</td>
<td>SATB(divisi), piano</td>
<td>secular</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSG</td>
<td>A Lenten Prayer</td>
<td>White, David Ashley</td>
<td>b. 1944</td>
<td>SA, org., flute</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSTRB</td>
<td>A Gaelic Blessing</td>
<td>Rutter, John</td>
<td>b. 1945</td>
<td>SA, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSG</td>
<td>Christmas Lullaby</td>
<td>Rutter, John</td>
<td>b. 1945</td>
<td>SSA, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSG</td>
<td>For the Beauty of the Earth</td>
<td>Rutter, John</td>
<td>b. 1945</td>
<td>SA, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHOIR</td>
<td>TITLE</td>
<td>COMPOSER</td>
<td>PERIOD</td>
<td>VOICING</td>
<td>GENRE</td>
<td>TEXT</td>
<td>USE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSG, MSTRB</td>
<td>I Will Sing With the Spirit</td>
<td>Rutter, John</td>
<td>b. 1945</td>
<td>SA, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSTRB</td>
<td>Mid-Winter Carol</td>
<td>Rutter, John</td>
<td>b. 1945</td>
<td>SA, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>The Peace of God</td>
<td>Rutter, John</td>
<td>b. 1945</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSTRB</td>
<td>Here's Two Cohan!</td>
<td>Spevacek, Linda (arr.)</td>
<td>b. 1945</td>
<td>3-pt. mx., piano</td>
<td>patriotic</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>Brother James' Air</td>
<td>Bullard, Alan (arr.)</td>
<td>b. 1947</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>Rorate caeli desuper</td>
<td>Nestor, Leo</td>
<td>b. 1948</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Lat./Eng.</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSG</td>
<td>The Star-Spangled Banner</td>
<td>Crocker, Emily (arr.)</td>
<td>b. 1949</td>
<td>SSA</td>
<td>patriotic</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSG, CV</td>
<td>The Easter Song of Praise (Exultet)</td>
<td>Shephard, Richard</td>
<td>b. 1949</td>
<td>SATB</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>Song of Mary</td>
<td>Shephard, Richard</td>
<td>b. 1949</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>canticle</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSTRB</td>
<td>Yonder Come Day</td>
<td>Tucker, Judith (arr.)</td>
<td>b. 1951</td>
<td>SSA</td>
<td>spiritual</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>And I Saw a New Heaven</td>
<td>Archer, Malcolm</td>
<td>b. 1952</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSG</td>
<td>My Song is Love Unknown</td>
<td>Archer, Malcolm</td>
<td>b. 1952</td>
<td>SA, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>The Lord Goes Up</td>
<td>Archer, Malcolm</td>
<td>b. 1952</td>
<td>SATB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSG, CV</td>
<td>We Cannot Measure</td>
<td>Archer, Malcolm (arr.)</td>
<td>b. 1952</td>
<td>S, solo, SATB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSG</td>
<td>Laudate Dominum, omnes gentes</td>
<td>Drennen, Patti</td>
<td>b. 1952</td>
<td>SA, org.</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CV</td>
<td>Welcome, All Wonders</td>
<td>Brunner, David</td>
<td>b. 1953</td>
<td>2-pt., piano</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>O My Luve's Like a Red, Red Rose</td>
<td>Clausen, René</td>
<td>b. 1953</td>
<td>SATB, piano, vln., vc.</td>
<td>secular</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>Be Thou My Vision</td>
<td>Chilcott, Bob</td>
<td>b. 1955</td>
<td>solo, SATB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>Gaudete!</td>
<td>Chilcott, Bob (arr.)</td>
<td>b. 1955</td>
<td>SSAATBB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSG</td>
<td>Happy Land</td>
<td>Chilcott, Bob</td>
<td>b. 1955</td>
<td>SSA, piano</td>
<td>gospel</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSTRB</td>
<td>Mid-Winter</td>
<td>Chilcott, Bob</td>
<td>b. 1955</td>
<td>SA, piano</td>
<td>secular</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSG</td>
<td>The Lake Isle of Innisfree</td>
<td>Daley, Eleanor</td>
<td>b. 1955</td>
<td>SSA, piano</td>
<td>folk song</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHOIR</td>
<td>TITLE</td>
<td>COMPOSER</td>
<td>PERIOD</td>
<td>VOICING</td>
<td>GENRE</td>
<td>TEXT</td>
<td>USE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSTRB</td>
<td>Chili Caliente</td>
<td>Giardiniere, David</td>
<td>b. 1955</td>
<td>2-pt., piano, opt. perc.</td>
<td>secular</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>Noel!</td>
<td>Holmes, Brad (arr.)</td>
<td>b. 1956</td>
<td>solos, SATB, perc.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>Kituba</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CV</td>
<td>Buffalo Gals</td>
<td>Krunnfusz, Dan (arr.)</td>
<td>b. 1956</td>
<td>TTB, opt. piano</td>
<td>folk song</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>A Dream Within a Dream</td>
<td>Scroggins, Debra</td>
<td>b. 1956</td>
<td>SATB (divisi), piano</td>
<td>secular</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSG</td>
<td>I am the Bread of Life</td>
<td>Lole, Simon</td>
<td>b. 1957</td>
<td>Unison, desc., org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSG</td>
<td>The Father's Love</td>
<td>Lole, Simon</td>
<td>b. 1957</td>
<td>SA, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSTRB,HC</td>
<td>Memorare</td>
<td>French, Paul</td>
<td>b. 1959</td>
<td>Children, SATB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CV</td>
<td>Canto del Agua</td>
<td>Hill, David (arr.)</td>
<td>b. 1960</td>
<td>TTB, piano</td>
<td>folk song</td>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>Teach me, O Lord</td>
<td>Moger, Peter</td>
<td>b. 1964</td>
<td>SAB, org.</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CV</td>
<td>Gloria</td>
<td>Patterson, Mark</td>
<td>b. 1969</td>
<td>TB, piano</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSG</td>
<td>O Lux Beatissima</td>
<td>Patterson, Mark</td>
<td>b. 1969</td>
<td>SSA, desc., org., handbells</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>Lat./Eng.</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CV</td>
<td>Dona Nobis Pacem</td>
<td>Farnell, Laura</td>
<td>b. 1975</td>
<td>TTB</td>
<td>motet</td>
<td>Lat./Eng.</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CV</td>
<td>What Child Is This</td>
<td>Farnell, Laura</td>
<td>b. 1975</td>
<td>TTB, piano</td>
<td>anthem</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>NL</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


In addition to performing contemporary works, students have several opportunities to interact with living composers. In 2010, organist and composer Gerre Hancock spent several days on campus working with students. Participation in events and festivals throughout the state provide additional opportunities. Each January, treble singers in the fourth grade through high school participate in the Texas Lutheran Youth Choir Festival with composer Bob Chilcott. Participants in the Region 11 TMEA choir were led by composer-conductor Z. Randall Stroope.
in 2013. Students had sung works by all of these composers in advance, so the opportunity of meeting them in person was particularly meaningful. Edmund Murray adds,

Many of the pieces that we sing by modern composers are more in the traditional classical style (e.g., Neo-Renaissance), such as Duruflé’s *Requiem* or Leo Nestor’s *Rorate caeli desuper*. We do not really sing anything atonal. The Honors Choir is the only ensemble that tends to do pieces that are outside the box on occasion such as John Tavener’s *The Lamb* or György Orbán’s *Daemon Irrepit Callidus*.91

5.2 Reasons for adding new works to the treasure of sacred music are identified.

Since The Atonement Academy employs the *Book of Divine Worship* rather than the *Missale Romanum* for its English Masses, the new English translations have not had an impact on the music used in their liturgies. Rather the main reasons for adding new works has been to mark liturgical feasts and seasons more fittingly, to expand the variety of repertoire used by the choirs, and to give witness to the creative work of God in the present day liturgy by including newly composed pieces. Because the school celebrates Eucharist daily, repertoire that can bear the repetitive demands of the liturgy as well as engage worshippers at an increasing depth is needed. Fr. Philips has composed a number of very specific hymn texts to supplement the otherwise scarce collection available for the minor and patronal feasts that are celebrated by the parish, such as hymns in honor of St. Joseph and Our Lady of the Atonement. The choirs also incorporate new works on a frequent basis to keep students’ ears and minds engaged in worship. According to Edmund Murray, “Compositions by new composers help us understand that the

91 Murray, interview.
church is living and active and that we do not depend exclusively on things from the past.” Fr. Phillips explains why it is so important to include music by living composers in the liturgy:

Just like in previous eras, God continues to shower great creativity on many composers – named and nameless. Who knows who put all the chants together; they are nameless people who were inspired by God. We do not know because we were not there, but I am sure over the centuries there was music being used that was not of the highest quality or did not meet the needs of the liturgy and it just died. Like today, there was probably a great deal that was throw away music. The best works have endured and that is what we have. These new compositions must be used someplace, or they are never going to be tested to see which will stand the test of time. It is utterly essential for us to give them the chance and to recognize that God is still working in the minds and hearts of people to create these things. That is why I am very happy when I hear our choirs learning more modern pieces of music.93

Through their association with various professional organizations (e.g., AGO, TMEA, AFPC, and CMAA) and personal connections with individuals in the church music field, the Murrays have access to contemporary composers and compositions which are otherwise unpublished or difficult to obtain. Choristers and the parish in general benefit tremendously from this extensive contact with new works.

5.3 Sources that serve as inspiration for composers to create new music for the church are identified.

In addition to looking to the sacred treasure as inspiration, liturgical repertoire for children’s voices is identified as one of the most important areas for modern composers to consider as they look to expand the church’s store of sacred music. With the amount of

92 Ibid.

93 Phillips, interview.
reertoire employed by the academy choirs, Edmund Murray states, “We really have a need for more and better repertoire for children’s voices – especially two and three-part treble music. A lot of the things you see from children’s choir publishers are really not of quality or substance because they are geared toward choirs that rehearse very little – maybe once a week.”

In my own experiences, many of the children’s choirs in Catholic school and parish settings often employ unison congregational songs from the hymnal as a main staple of repertoire, which are subsequently pitched too low for children’s voices. According to Edmund Murray, “Pieces should develop the head tone and also the middle range with nothing below middle C, or at least use this lower range very sparingly.”

Works should exhibit textual and musical interest. Edmund Murray explains, “You want to be able to teach them about their faith. When a piece contains quality texts, you can talk about and teach them things from the text.”

Pieces that are musically interesting and challenging help students practice particular intervals, rhythms, concepts, etc. While there has been a movement in recent decades to greatly increase the quality of secular treble music available, Catholic choir school programs such as this create an overwhelming need for sacred pieces of the same caliber.

\[94\] Murray, interview.

\[95\] Ibid.

\[96\] Ibid.
5.4 Criteria which makes some pieces of sacred music more appropriate than others for the liturgy is acknowledged.

In addition to the musical criterion described above, Fr. Phillips believes that music used in the liturgy must be God-centered. According to Fr. Phillips, “The most fitting works of music and their texts have a certain vertical nature to them. In other words, something that is lifting us to God and giving us a deeper knowledge of God, rather than the horizontal where we are singing at each other and about each other.” To illustrate this point further, Fr. Phillips compares music styles to the various styles of church architecture throughout history. In Gothic architecture is found the epitome of this verticality with church spires of never-before-seen proportion extending toward heaven. Music of that time also reflected this ethereal aspiration. Present church architecture is reflected in buildings that consist of lowceilings and round configurations. Likewise, the music often reflects an inward-looking idea of focusing on each other. Again it is a matter of what will stand the test of time as far as music and architecture that is most suited for the liturgy. According to Fr. Phillips,

Already we are seeing some of the younger priests coming out of seminary, who have been greatly influenced by the way of thinking that John Paul II and Benedict XVI embraced which draws out all that needed to be drawn out for the liturgy. When they get into the parishes, we have seen the efforts to turn these long, low inward-looking buildings into something with a focal point, something in which people can place their own concentration – not on each other, but on something that is “other.” This is based on the whole idea of God as “other;” God is not me.

---

97 Phillips, interview.

98 Ibid.
New compositions that have the capability to move one into a deeper knowledge and love of God must be especially sought after for the liturgy. Fr. Phillips states, “Some of this contemporary music is very beautiful; some of it is very thought-provoking. I would not really even call it beautiful, but I would call it moving. I think that is eventually what music needs to do – to move us in that way. This will be the mark of contemporary music in the liturgy.”

Standard #6:
The faithful are led to full, conscious, and active participation in liturgical celebrations.

6.1 Sung parts of the liturgy foster both the internal and external participation of the congregation in liturgical celebrations.

Since the founding of the parish in 1983, Our Lady of the Atonement has promoted and preserved liturgical principles of the Anglican patrimony, as granted by Pope John Paul II in the 1980 Pastoral Provision, Into Full Communion. Under this provision, “former faithful of the Episcopal Church . . . may retain certain liturgical elements proper to the Anglican tradition.” In 2009, Pope Benedict’s Apostolic Constitution Anglicanorum coetibus further solidified the church’s stance in this regard by stating that,

The Ordinariate has the faculty to celebrate the Holy Eucharist and the other Sacraments, the Liturgy of the Hours and other liturgical celebrations according to the liturgical books proper to the Anglican tradition . . . so as to maintain the liturgical, spiritual and pastoral traditions of the Anglican Communion . . . as a

99 Ibid.

Inherent in this liturgical tradition is the prominent place of congregational singing, hymnody, Anglican chant, choral music, organ music, and overall excellence in liturgical music. As a result, *The Book of Divine Worship*, a missal reflecting elements from the Anglican tradition, has been employed, and the parish has reflected elements of this patrimony since its inception. Since many of the founding members were Anglican converts coming from this tradition already, it has not been necessary to instruct them on inherent aspects such as internal and external participation in the liturgy. Musicians have never stood up before Mass to make announcements regarding participation, and the priest has never talked about this in a homily. Fr. Phillips explains, “What I count on is that the liturgy itself will so draw them in that they will want to participate in that. One of the important things is that we do not change things around a lot... so I think just making it conducive to joining in. I count of the liturgy itself to do the work, and it tends to.”

The liturgies I observed at The Atonement Academy revealed exceptionally strong external participation by the congregation as well as some indication of interior participation during the choir portions. To the extent that assessment is possible, the fact that the congregants were not shifting in the pews or staring around the church during the choral pieces may suggest that they were engaged in what was being sung. Fr. Phillips reveals, “I think people feel the intensity of it, and a lot of this is due to the fine work of our musicians here. They choose things

---


102 Phillips, interview.
The impact that the repertoire and the division of musical roles have on congregational participation, initially referenced in section 1.5 of this chapter, will now be discussed further.

During my visit to the school, I observed the choirs singing for four different types of liturgies – weekday Mass, weekday solemnity Mass, Novus Ordo Missae, and Sunday Mass. All of the liturgies followed the Anglican Use with the exception of the Friday Latin Mass which followed the Roman Rite. Using the same process as in the previous schools, I timed and digitally recorded five of the liturgies I attended and then calculated the timing of individual musical elements, documenting which participants were involved. The results of these calculations and the distribution of sung parts are shown below in Fig. 5.10. Overall, singing comprised fifty-one percent of these liturgies on average; in many instances music was taking place simultaneously with liturgical actions. Solo organ repertoire is, once again, not included in this figure. Even with the choristers and men’s schola playing a major liturgical role and singing thirty-four percent of all sung music, the congregation along with the presider and deacon physically participated in sixty-six percent of the sung liturgical music. The last three roles have been combined, since the congregation, presider, and deacon are often singing together or in dialogue during greetings, prayers, and responses. As I have previously pointed out, these dialogical exchanges and parts that the priest and people sing together are of the greatest importance to be sung in the liturgy according to Musicam sacram.\textsuperscript{104}

\textsuperscript{103} Ibid.

\textsuperscript{104} MS 7.
Fig. 5.10 Calculation procedure for determining amount of singing by the presider, deacon, choir, men’s *schola*, and congregation in the five liturgies observed at The Atonement Academy (minutes: seconds)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STEP 1: Amount sung at each liturgy</th>
<th>STEP 2: Amount sung at all five liturgies</th>
<th>STEP 3: Average amount sung at liturgies</th>
<th>STEP 4: Division of sung parts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Liturgy #1</td>
<td>Liturgy #2</td>
<td>Liturgy #3</td>
<td>Liturgy #5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Presider</strong></td>
<td><strong>Deacon</strong></td>
<td><strong>Choir</strong></td>
<td><strong>Men’s schola</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2:13</td>
<td>5:25</td>
<td>11:45</td>
<td>2:30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2:00</td>
<td>0:22</td>
<td>2:07</td>
<td>6:25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2:38</td>
<td>0:47</td>
<td>2:37</td>
<td>8:20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4:37</td>
<td>2:20</td>
<td>3:50</td>
<td>7:37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2:12</td>
<td>0:22</td>
<td>3:20</td>
<td>6:27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.35%</strong></td>
<td><strong>2.95%</strong></td>
<td><strong>7.53%</strong></td>
<td><strong>9.97%</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>8.55%</strong></td>
<td><strong>5.80%</strong></td>
<td><strong>14.79%</strong></td>
<td><strong>19.59%</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Sung</strong></td>
<td><strong>Total Non-sung</strong></td>
<td><strong>Total Liturgy</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46:43</td>
<td>53:17</td>
<td>100:00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22:24</td>
<td>30:36</td>
<td>53:00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35:45</td>
<td>27:15</td>
<td>63:00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31:07</td>
<td>16:53</td>
<td>48:00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23:55</td>
<td>26:05</td>
<td>50:00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>159:54</td>
<td>154:06</td>
<td>314:00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>50.93%</strong></td>
<td><strong>49.07%</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>n/a</strong></td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Multiple components assist in facilitating the congregation’s exterior and interior participation. The strong musicianship and involvement of the priest, and even the deacon, in leading sung prayers, dialogues, and hymns during the Mass serve as an example of participation.
to those present. At the beginning and end of every Mass the priest, deacon(s), lectors, and altar servers process up the center aisle. The clergy at Our Lady of the Atonement participate heartily and reverently in the singing of hymns during these processions. According to Fr. Phillips, “I think it is helpful if I am belting out the hymns, then other people figure that they are supposed to sing too. A lot of men sing along just as robustly as can be. Everything comes down to if people are encouraged to do that or not.”

The choir and men’s *schola* are positioned in the rear gallery where the organ is, so between the reinforcement from the singers in the back and clergy in the front, the congregation can easily participate in the sung parts of the liturgy with confidence. As a result of this independence, the musically conducive acoustics of the church, the robust accompaniment of the organ, the division of musical duties among the clergy, choir, and congregation, and the worship booklets and hymns sheets that contain all musical information needed, there is essentially no need for a cantor. Fr. Phillips believes these are precisely the reasons why the congregational singing is so strong in the parish:

> It is very important to have an accompaniment to hymns that helps people to sing. I think a lot of people need to feel like they are not really being heard. When you have small, weak electronic organs or guitars, there is nothing conducive to making people want to belt it out. As much as I love singing, if I am in a place where a cantor is bellowing at me through a microphone, I find that I am not really singing at full strength, but my singing is *sotto voce*. Microphones have not been a friend to sacred music and the more we can get away from having it artificially amplified, the better and that makes people want to sing.

The English Masses always use the same Ordinary, so congregants have become quite proficient with this setting. The only other Mass Ordinary used is the composite chant setting for the Latin

---

105 Phillips, interview.

106 Ibid.
Mass. Fr. Phillips emphasizes the importance of familiarity, repetition, and orthodoxy in matters of congregational music:

We want to make it comfortable and familiar enough that you do not really need to think any more about it. So anybody that has been attending Mass here for six months, they know how to sing the *Gloria*, the Creed, and the Mass parts anytime the choir is not doing a choral setting of one of these. They all know it and everyone is singing; even the altar servers are singing. Familiarity is one of the keys to the student’s Mass. We do not entertain them; we do not try to come up with some new gimmick to keep their interest. Children, and I think it translates into adults as well, want to know that they can depend on things being the way they are. Not that they do not want to be brought along, because within a context and structure that does not change you can introduce all sorts of wonderful new ideas that can continue to make it interesting; but it is always within that set structure. As I tell folks when they come here; you know you are never going to be surprised. I promise people that we will never have anything gimmicky and people can relax in that, because people really do not like that if they are serious at all about their faith.\(^{107}\)

Furthermore, the church is typically at full capacity when accommodating the entire school for weekday liturgies. The sheer number of people and their close proximity makes for easy participation without feelings of isolation and hesitancy. Interesting organ introductions and improvisations, as well as the omission of hymn announcements and singing instructions, help create seamless and inspiring transitions during the liturgy which assist the congregation in maintaining focus throughout the liturgical action. From start to finish, no matter who is singing or speaking, the congregation appears engaged as if the entire act belonged to each of them. Initially it is somewhat difficult, even for those who are accomplished musicians, to participate in the congregational singing because there is no musical notation to follow. However, after a few months of regularly attending liturgies at the parish, it is easy to develop proficiency singing these elements. The one thing that would likely advance participation even further, as well as

\(^{107}\) Ibid.
reinforce the music literacy concepts advocated so strongly in the choir curriculum, would be to include musical notation for the hymns and Mass Ordinary in the pew resources, rather than text only. In the end, the sung settings of the Gloria and Credo in English actually feel quite natural and are surprisingly easier than speaking the newest set of English translations of the Missale Romanum, which still proves a stumbling block for many Catholics and clergy.

Singing duties of the congregation during Evensong and Mass are as follows. In the Evensong and Benediction I observed, the choir (and also deacon) did not have assigned roles, nor do they typically. Rather, all sung parts are divided between the congregation and the priest, who intones many of the components. Since the purpose of this study was to assess liturgies in which the choirs participate, I did not include data from this liturgy in the above figures, though I will now discuss it briefly for the benefit of congregational perspective. In this liturgy, metric and plainchant hymns, including Phos hilaron and Ave verum corpus, versicles, prayers, and responses are sung in unison by the congregation. The Apostles’ Creed and the Lord’s Prayer are chanted in recto tono style, while four-part Anglican chant is employed for the psalm, Magnificat, and Nunc dimittis. The organist provides prelude and postlude music as well as accompaniment during all sung parts.

In the Masses, on the other hand, I observed separate singing roles by the choir, deacon, presider, congregation, men’s schola, and even at times the lector. On Sundays, solemnities, and major feasts, congregational participation consists of all sung parts that belong to the first, second, and third degrees as stated in Musicam sacram, with the exception of the Kyrie, Sanctus,
Agnus Dei, and the responses following the readings of Sacred Scripture.\textsuperscript{108} The former are sung by the choir, and the latter is spoken. On Sundays, solemnities, and major feasts, the prayer of the faithful and Gospel are chanted by the deacon. The deacon also leads responses before and after the Gospel, the Fraction Anthem, and the dismissal. The congregation sings four hymns, responses, acclamations, a four-part Anglican psalm setting, the Lord’s Prayer, and the \textit{Gloria} and \textit{Credo} portions of the Mass. In addition to employing choral settings of the \textit{Kyrie}, \textit{Sanctus}, and \textit{Agnus Dei}, the Gospel \textit{Alleluia} verse and at least one communion motet or anthem are sung by the choir. The men’s schola sings the entrance, offertory, and communion chants on these days. For each of the Sunday Masses, solemnities, feast days, and weekdays, the priest and deacon use the same sung responses, as these are the most primary and common elements of any sung liturgy.

For school Masses on Monday through Thursday, along with all the common responses and acclamations, the congregation sings three hymns, the \textit{Kyrie}, \textit{Sanctus}, and \textit{Agnus Dei}. The choir sings only the Gospel \textit{Alleluia} verse and one motet or anthem during Communion, while the schola sings only the communion chant. The deacon sings the Fraction Anthem and the dismissal.

For Friday school Masses when the \textit{Novus Ordo Missae} is celebrated, the schola will sing an entrance and communion chant, and the deacon will sing the responses before and after the Gospel and the prayer of the faithful. Since the Fraction Anthem is a component unique to the Anglican Use liturgy, it is not used in the Latin Rite. The choir sings only the Gospel \textit{Alleluia

\textsuperscript{108} MS 29-31.
verse and one motet or anthem during Communion. Additionally, a student lector chants the short response at the conclusion of the Old Testament reading.

Theological, liturgical, and pastoral rationale has been employed in developing the musical roles of the choir and congregation since the founding of the church and the school. Until the Murrays arrived, the choirs never sang parts of the Ordinary by themselves. Today the choirs sing choral settings of the Kyrie, Sanctus, and Agnus Dei at some, but not all, of the Masses; the weekday and nine o’clock Masses on Sunday use only congregational settings of the Ordinary for the most part. The Gloria and Credo are sung by the congregation but never by the choir alone. Fr. Phillips explains the reasoning for these assignments:

I think it is important, particularly when it comes to the Creed, for us to say the words “I believe.” That keeps a balance in that way. The more contemplative or purely praise aspects, like the Kyrie, even if someone else is singing it, the words are our own. There is that sense of, while the choir is singing on our behalf, we are still very much involved. Even when the choir has some sort of an anthem or motet during Communion time, I never have the sense that that belongs to the choir. A number of parishioners have commented to me how moving it is when the choir sings these parts. I have never had anyone say to me that they felt it was intrusive. That is a sign of the successful use of a choir within a liturgical setting. ¹⁰⁹

This perspective aligns with the writings of Cardinal Joseph Ratzinger, now Pope Emeritus Benedict XVI, who discusses the use of the choral Sanctus within the Regensburg tradition. In this discussion, Ratzinger makes the important distinction that the “acclamatory character,” which is invoked at the end of the preface to sing in unison with the heavenly choirs, should not be interpreted as exclusively belonging to the congregation. Such a unison, which unites heaven

¹⁰⁹ Phillips, interview.
and earth, those present and those absent, already implies representation, or a proclaiming on behalf of someone else. Ratzinger states,

If the congregation has a choir that can draw it into cosmic praise and into the open expanse of heaven and earth more powerfully than its own stammering, then the representative function of the choir is at this moment particularly appropriate. Through the choir a greater transparency to the praise of the angels and therefore a more profound, interior joining in with their singing are bestowed than a congregation’s own acclamation and song would be capable of doing in many places. . . . Does it not do us good, before we set off into the center of the mystery, to encounter a short time of filled silence in which the choir calms us interiorly, leading each one of us into silent prayer and thus into a union that can occur only on the inside? . . . The choral Sanctus has its justification even after the Second Vatican Council.  

The hierarchy of representation extends from the priest, the deacon, and the lay ministers who perform particular functions on behalf of the rest of the faithful, to the parts that belong to the entire congregation. According to Fr. Phillips,

There would be that gradation in any really successful liturgy. Looking at it historically, there have been times when it has gotten out of balance, when people would be in the back clicking their beads and whatever was going on at the altar did not make any difference to them because everything was being done on their behalf. One of the good developments is that there are actually some things you can do or say for yourself and you should be doing that. It shows a level of maturity in our worship when you do not have to depend on someone else to be doing this for you.  

At The Atonement Academy, the presider, deacon, and congregation are involved in sixty-six percent of the sung liturgical components including an extensive body of hymnody, responses, dialogues, acclamations, and Mass settings (see Fig. 5.10 above). In a complementary way, the choirs preserve and promote the great treasure of sacred music for the benefit of the congregation.

110 Ratzinger, *A New Song for the Lord*, 179-82.

111 Phillips, interview.
through motets and anthems, *Kyrie, Sanctus,* and *Agnus Dei* settings, and the communion chants from the *Graduale Romanum* which they sing. In this way, a healthy balance exists which facilitates the faithfuls’ participation both internally and externally.

*Standard #7:*

*Singers receive a genuine training in liturgy.*

7.1 A basic understanding of liturgy and liturgical functions is integrated with the training of singers.

At The Atonement Academy, there are two primary sources that assist students in their understanding of liturgy and liturgical functions: 1) singing, serving, greeting, and attending liturgies, and 2) receiving formal instruction in religion/theology and art history. In addition, liturgical formation is also addressed indirectly in two other ways: 1) general classroom practices throughout the day, and 2) the choral rehearsal.

Students have opportunities to serve as altar boys, lectors, and greeters at various points in their educational career at the academy, from which they increase their knowledge of liturgical aspects. Starting in the third grade, every Catholic boy takes turns being an altar server four to five times per year. Initially, one training session is required in the beginning, with the remainder of the mentoring taking place on the job. Often, less experienced servers are paired with more experience boys. Fr. Phillips explains, “They start out by having one simple job such as opening the gates. To train them to genuflect, pick up the cushion, close or open the gates – that’s a pretty big job for some of those little ones.”112 Boys advance from thurifer, candle

---

112 Ibid.
bearers, and paten to crucifer, head server (who is in charge of the bells), and finally lector once they are in high school. Aside from singing in the choir, girls rotate turns serving as greeters when they are in sixth grade.

Middle and high school students participate in religion/theology class for fifty minutes each day. While Jerome Bruner’s spiral curriculum serves as the primary model for guiding students’ knowledge of and formation in the Catholic faith, each of the classes, with the exception of Moral Theology, also contains a liturgy unit of study. In sixth grade, students examine and acquire appropriate terminology for naming the larger structures and individual elements of the Mass.\footnote{The Atonement Academy, \textit{Religion 6 Curriculum Guide} (San Antonio: The Atonement Academy, 2012), 3, 10-11.} In seventh grade, students analyze the prayers of the Mass that contribute to its sacrificial nature as well as make comparisons between different Rites within the Church such as Roman Catholic and Byzantine Catholic.\footnote{The Atonement Academy, \textit{Religion 7 Curriculum Guide} (San Antonio: The Atonement Academy, 2012), 6, 9-10.} In eighth grade, students define the role of worship in faith in addition to differentiating between public forms of worship that constitute liturgy and private acts that are devotional. They also discuss those elements of the liturgy that are changeable and those that are unchangeable (e.g., Proper and Ordinary). In discussing those components that change according to the day, season, or saint being celebrated, students explore the liturgical year and the meaning of various liturgical colors.\footnote{The Atonement Academy, \textit{Religion 8 Curriculum Guide} (San Antonio: The Atonement Academy, 2012), 6.} Catholic Doctrine, typically taken by students during the ninth grade, connects theological ideas to what is taking place in the liturgy. The work of the Holy Trinity in liturgy and concepts such as
anamnesis (the section of the Eucharistic Prayer in which Christ’s passion and resurrection is remembered sacramentally), *ex opere operato* (the manner in which the sacraments confer grace from the action of the sacrament itself rather than through holiness of the priest or recipient), and *lex orandi, lex credendi* (what we pray and how we worship reveals what we believe) are explored. Likewise, the meaning and use of sacred signs, symbols, space, and objects such as tabernacle, altar, sacred chrism, cathedra, lectern, ambo, and baptistery are identified.\(^{116}\) Sacred Scripture, open to high school students, includes an examination of the use of scripture in the Liturgy of the Hours, the Mass, and other liturgies.\(^{117}\) Church History, also required of high school students, interjects major liturgical developments at respective points throughout the progression of the course. Topics include: the transition of liturgies in the home to the building of churches for public worship; Gothic cathedrals of the medieval period; Renaissance art, architecture, and music; Baroque architecture and concert-style Masses; and changes in liturgy after the Second Vatican Council.\(^{118}\) By examining these multiple facets in their religion and theology coursework, students no doubt develop a deeper and more meaningful understanding of what they experience in the liturgy daily.

Since 2011, middle and high school students have received instruction in art history for fifty minutes once per week. Though less overtly, liturgical topics do comprise a portion of the curricular content for this course sequence, particularly in developing a better understanding of


the sacred space in which liturgical events occur. In these courses, students study art and architectural features that have been used to depict religious scenes, ideas of faith, and church teachings throughout the ages, including but not limited to: Egyptian carvings, Byzantine domes, early Christian mosaics, Romanesque illuminations, Gothic spires and stained glass windows, Humanist frescoes and sculptures of Christ and Mary, and Baroque baldachin canopies. For example, sixth graders look at and discuss symbolism in the works of Fra Angelico. Students learn that architecture and pieces of art in a church affect the way we celebrate liturgy. Altars, domes, and rose windows serve as focal points, which draw our attention upward toward the divine and heavenly liturgy. In the eighth-grade class I observed, students were learning about Flemish altar pieces and were recalling a recent homily in which Fr. Phillips had discussed the altar piece in their own church. The triptych was currently closed during the liturgical season of Lent to depict a scene of the Annunciation and opened the rest of the liturgical year to portray Christ as the final judge. Tenth graders devote an entire chapter of study to examining the power that abbots had in commissioning art for the church in the eleventh and twelfth centuries and “discussing how The Word has become not only heard through the liturgy but has been also decorated physically to glorify God.” In their study of church architecture, the seventh-grade classes “discuss religious symbols and how the Church is the vessel of meaning.”

---


examining various designs throughout history, students are able to identify modern changes in church art and architecture to evaluate how these affect liturgy today.

Beginning in the lower grades, classroom teachers review elements of the Mass with students at the start of each academic year. Once students’ reading skills are at the level that they are able to follow along, typically in third grade, they are given Mass booklets to use during liturgy. Classroom teachers spend time practicing sung responses and prayers with the students as needed to assist them in participating as much as possible in the liturgy.

Students learn that, by singing in rehearsals and in the liturgy, they have an important responsibility and privilege of serving the liturgy in a way that contributes to its celebration and various elements. Fr. Phillips explains,

> The students rehearse and rehearse, but I think they really learn the value and place of their music when they go out and sing it as part of the Mass. An important part of their music training is to put it in the setting where it comes alive. I do not think every student necessarily thinks in those terms, but it needs to be pointed out to them and part of their learning with music. I take seriously the idea of music being the handmaid of the liturgy; I want that idea to get across to the students and I think that they get it.\(^\text{122}\)

From their overall demeanor at liturgies, students show signs that they understand and undertake this role conscientiously.

\(^\text{122}\) Phillips, interview.
7.2 Teachers develop linguistic, scriptural, and theological understandings of sung musical texts with singers so that they may incorporate them more meaningfully into the liturgy.

Emphasizing scriptural, linguistic, and theological understanding of sung musical texts assists students in expressing works more meaningfully. All of the compilation sources used for choir at the academy – the Bronze Collection, The New Oxford Easy Anthem Book, The Parish Book of Chant, and Communio – have English translations in the scores already, so additional attention to textual meaning is typically not necessary unless the meaning of key words is being highlighted. Scriptural and theological significance is occasionally addressed with the elementary and high school students, but not as much with students during the middle school years. According to Edmund Murray,

> When we introduce a brand new piece, we try to see if students are able to identify what the piece was written for or why we are singing it. There is a very strong sense of the liturgical year and saint’s feasts here because of celebrating Mass daily. You obviously would not have to say much about a piece if it was for Christmas, but if we put something Marian on the music calendar like Ave maris stella, there has to be a liturgical reason for singing it.\(^\text{123}\)

To help guide the interpretation of a work and make connections to what is happening liturgically, age-appropriate theological understanding becomes a useful tool. For example, because of its mysterious-sounding accompaniment, Langlais’ Panis angelicus conveys the heavenly bread of angels becoming miraculously transformed into bread for lowly mankind. The mysterious action that happens when the bread is consecrated during the Mass is put into a context that students can understand; this in turn gives them clues to sing the piece with smooth musical phrasing and in a prayerful manner.

\(^{123}\) Murray, interview.
Prominent musical texts from the liturgy are frequently discussed in religion/theology class and in daily homilies. As early as the pre-kindergarten, students begin learning how to chant the Lord’s Prayer in English and Latin to sing at Mass. Because there is a constant use and review of texts such as these, it is easy for students to gain fluency interfacing with a large body of these hymns, prayers, and responses over the years. From sixth grade up, students regularly incorporate a number of texts in their religion classes, including Magnificat, Regina caeli, Gloria Patri, Ave Maria, Pater Noster, and Salve Regina. At various points, students are given quizzes asking them to write out these and similar texts in Latin and English. Fr. Phillips describes references he has given to these texts in his homilies:

> When we first started to use the Trisagion during Lent, I gave a little talk in the homily about where that came from and I think I probably wrote an article and posted it on my blog. Even though there were some new students, I did not repeat it this year; I probably should. So there is that opportunity; I try to use the building and the liturgy as a teaching tool. Everything exists for a reason and symbolizes something; it is not in the liturgy or the church because someone happened to think it sounded or looked pretty.  

Reinforcement in a variety of settings assists students in developing a strong understanding of these musical texts and how that meaning is strengthened when they are used in the liturgy.

7.3 From the manner and length of the liturgy celebrated, those liturgies and elements which are of highest importance receive due emphasis.

By participating in liturgies of various types throughout the year, students come to experience the principle of progressive solemnity which applies to music as well as other elements. Of the liturgies I attended, the least solemn were the regular weekday Masses, which

---

124 Phillips, interview.
were fifty minutes long. Sung portions include all of the common responses and dialogues led by the priest and deacon, three hymns, *Kyrie, Sanctus, Agnus Dei,* and the communion chant. The Friday *Novus Ordo Missae,* being forty-eight minutes long, was quite similar in its degree of solemnity. The only additional sung components are an introit chant, responses before and after Gospel, the prayer of the faithful, and the response at the conclusion of the Old Testament reading. Though I did not observe a feast-day Mass, this type, consisting of an additional two hymns, *Gloria,* an offertory chant, and incense would be the next-highest ranking. The Sunday Mass, being eighty minutes in length, is only below a solemnity in order of progression and additionally utilizes a four-part Anglican psalm setting, the deacon chanting the Gospel, sung prayer of the faithful, and choral settings of the ordinary and Gospel *Alleluia* verse. Sundays and solemnities additionally employ the *Credo* as well as occasional choral settings of the Mass Ordinary. This school Mass for the solemnity I observed was sixty-three minutes long. More elaborate organ intonations and improvisations and an increased number of clergy and altar servers are also used to convey a greater degree of solemnity for these celebrations.

*Standard #8:*

*Singers receive spiritual formation of the highest standards.*

8.1 Spiritual formation helps singers cultivate a personal ongoing relationship with the Lord while, at the same time, develop in their liturgical ministry to help form the faith of others.

Along with developing students in physical and intellectual capacities, “excellence in spiritual values” is a main component of the school’s mission.\(^\text{125}\) As we have already seen in

---

section 7.2, examining the theological and liturgical connections of sung musical texts aids choristers in developing an increased understanding of what they are singing. When employed within the context of the liturgy, these texts likely take on an even greater meaning for members of the choir. According to Edmund Murray, “They are constantly encountering these different texts which hopefully have meaning to them and enhance their faith.”\textsuperscript{126} Through the ministerial role of singing in the choir, students have the opportunity not only to cultivate their own faith but also to support the spiritual formation of others. The music department webpage reflects this idea of singing being born out of faith, or God’s work in each person: “Out of love, we raise our voices in singing the beautiful proclamation – echoing back the love that God has shown . . . ”\textsuperscript{127} This sung proclamation of faith in the liturgy, as well as the way they live their lives, impacts those with whom they come in contact and reflects the spiritual formation they receive at the academy. As a reminder of the ways in which they are called to serve, students recite \textit{A Prayer for Choristers} at the beginning of each choir rehearsal:

\begin{center}
\begin{verse}
Bless, O Lord, us Thy servants, 
who minister in Thy temple. 
Grant that what we sing with our lips, 
we may believe in our hearts, 
and what we believe in our hearts, 
we may show forth in our lives. 
Through Jesus Christ our Lord. 
Amen.\textsuperscript{128}
\end{verse}
\end{center}

\textsuperscript{126} Murray, interview.

\textsuperscript{127} The Atonement Academy, “Department of Music.”

In addition to choir, art history and religion/theology coursework forms students spiritually at the academy. By analyzing well-known pieces of art and architecture from the Catholic Church, students connect art’s key role in impacting the faith of countless individuals. At some points in the Church’s history, such as the Middle Ages, art served as a particularly vital source of theology for those who were uneducated and could not understand Latin. Church art and architecture still speak to us today and have a profound impact on faith. This connection between art and spirituality is seen by the eighth graders who, in studying different images of Christ from the later Renaissance Period, understand how faith became more humanized. By comparing and contrasting Catholic and Protestant art of the time, students also learn to differentiate expressions central to Catholicism from those of Protestantism.\(^{129}\)

Theology courses, providing further spiritual formation, serve as places where “Students . . . not only learn the doctrine of the Church but are also guided to understand the thinking behind what the Church teaches.”\(^{130}\) Sacred Scripture not only discusses the use of scripture in the Liturgy of the Hours, the Mass, and other liturgies, but also guides students in developing a prayerful approach, known as *lectio divina*, that may be used to receive added benefits and understanding.\(^{131}\) To help organize and articulate the various spiritual concepts learned in their theology sequence, students are encouraged to participate in speech competitions, such as the Archdiocesan Catholic Arts and Academic Competition (CAAC), where they demonstrate and cultivate their facility in the area


\(^{131}\) The Atonement Academy, *Sacred Scripture Curriculum Guide*, 3.
of apologetics. Overall the academy places great emphasis on students putting into action the faith they have received and facilitates many opportunities through which to do this.

8.2 Daily Mass, celebrations throughout the liturgical year, and a variety of spiritual practices built of the Word of God, grounded in the sacraments, and devoted to the Eucharist, as well as studying the lives of the saints and the Blessed Virgin Mary are a primary means of forming individuals spiritually.

Participating in a variety of liturgical and spiritual practices assists in forming students spiritually at the academy. Comprising nearly an hour each school day, daily Mass is the most important of these. From the experience many students have of serving regularly at Mass, particularly the young men, Fr. Phillips hopes that vocations will result:

I know it is horribly unfair to the girls, but we want to continue reflecting what the age’s long tradition of the church always was, and that is there were the minor orders when you were instituted as a lector and only men could be instituted in these ministries. To serve at the altar is where the great majority of priestly vocations are nurtured.  

In addition to Mass, other daily practices help students develop spiritually. According to the school’s handbook, “Every class and activity at the academy begins with prayer, in which all students are required to participate.” As we already have seen with the choristers’ prayer in choir rehearsals, every class has a special prayer that is recited at the start of class. Students and teachers also pause at noon each day to recite the Angelus. The handbook continues, “Students are also required to participate in the many devotional exercises held at the academy throughout

---

132 Phillips, interview.
133 The Atonement Academy, Parent-Student Handbook 2013-2014, n. 4.4.
the year.”¹³⁴ In the lower classes, students use advent wreaths along with prayer and reflection to mark the penitential season preceding Christmas with their classroom teachers. During Lent, the school participates in Stations of the Cross each Friday afternoon. Many of the classes, including the religion/theology classes, attend Eucharistic adoration for ten minutes each Friday during Lent and various other times throughout the year. Many student-initiated clubs and projects are also part of students’ spiritual growth at the school: the Rosary Club prays the rosary at lunch each day during Lent and the St. Gianna Molla Club engages in activities which support pro-life causes. Chores for Charity and the Penny Wars are annual events where students help raise money for selected charities. National Honor Society students undertake service projects which benefit others in the community.

In addition to Holy Eucharist, other types of liturgies and practices throughout the year, such as penance, Evensong, and Benediction, form students in the sacraments, the Word of God, and the Eucharist. Every six weeks, classes participate in the sacrament of penance. One of the most venerable traditions that has existed in the Church of England and remains a distinguishing feature of the Anglican patrimony is the public and popular celebration of Matins and Evensong. Today English cathedrals and collegiate chapels continue this daily practice, but most parishes, as a result of becoming more Mass-centered and having fewer resources available, only hold these services sporadically. Originally the school had Evensong using choral settings of the Magnificat and Nunc dimittis. On a few occasions, there have been opportunities for special Sunday Evensongs when guest artists such as Gerre Hancock have come and conducted the students. For a while, the school tried having Evensong each Wednesday during Lent, but with

¹³⁴ Ibid.
the addition of Stations of the Cross on the Fridays during Lent, it was decided that Evensong would work better with the school schedule if it was spread out on important feasts throughout the year. According to Fr. Phillips, “The issue is that it takes place during the school day and takes time away from instruction.”\footnote{Phillips, interview.} As a result, the current arrangement of celebrating Evensong with Benediction on major and patronal feasts, such as Our Lady of Victory, All Soul’s, Our Lady of Lourdes, and St. Joseph the Worker, as well as significant events such as Senior Commencement and groundbreaking ceremonies, was put in place.

Besides being a major outlet for studying the Word of God, the sacraments, and the Eucharist, the religion/theology sequence provides a broad study of the lives of the saints and the Blessed Virgin Mary. With the exception of Sacred Scripture and Moral Theology, specific saints are connected with themes and chapters throughout each level in the curriculum. Some examples of these associations in sixth grade include: St. Gianna Molla with family life; St. Thomas More with authority and obedience; St. Elizabeth Ann Seton with charity, forgiveness, and scandal; St. Francis of Assisi with the use of material goods; and St. Philip Neri with being called to speak the truth.\footnote{The Atonement Academy, \textit{Religion 6 Curriculum Guide}, 4-7.} An entire chapter is also dedicated to sainthood and patron saints at the sixth-grade level.\footnote{Ibid, 2.} As part of the eighth-grade course of study, several chapters include such topics as the Communion of Saints, patron saints and their role in faith, the canonization process, and examining saints who played significant roles in various areas throughout the history of the Church (e.g., the Church Fathers and individuals such as St. Ignatius of Loyola,
who led the spiritual renewal of the Church through the Society of Jesus).\(^{138}\) Church History makes mention of many saints within its chapters on the Apologists and Church Fathers, the monks as evangelizers, new religious orders and universities, scholars, influential popes, and American saints.\(^{139}\) Likewise, the lives of individual saints are regularly discussed in the homilies at daily Mass as the liturgical year and various feast days are commemorated. Feasts such as St. Nicholas, on December 6, are celebrated with additional activities in student classrooms. To prepare for Pope John Paul II’s canonization, Fr. Phillips explains, “One of the first-grade classes decorated a bulletin board in the hallway. Outside their classroom it says, ‘Saint John Paul II, pray for us!’ The emphasis on the saints as our intercessors and as our examples is a big thing here. Not every saint is going to speak to every student, but there are some that do.”\(^{140}\) Similarly, appropriate emphasis is given to the Blessed Virgin Mary. The recitation and study of Marian prayers is included throughout the religion/theology curriculum. In the seventh grade, a special unit is dedicated to the Blessed Virgin Mary and Marian dogmas.\(^{141}\) In the eighth grade, an entire chapter is devoted to discussing the Blessed Virgin Mary, the life of Mary, and our veneration of Mary.\(^{142}\) Catholic Doctrine includes a chapter on Mary as Mother of Christ and Mother of the Church.\(^{143}\) Marian veneration is also woven into the


\(^{139}\) The Atonement Academy, Church History Curriculum Guide, 2-13.

\(^{140}\) Phillips, interview.

\(^{141}\) The Atonement Academy, Religion 7 Curriculum Guide, 13.

\(^{142}\) The Atonement Academy, Religion 8 Curriculum Guide, 7.

\(^{143}\) The Atonement Academy, Catholic Doctrine Curriculum Guide, 7.
liturgies that take place and classroom practices. During the months of October and May, and on Marian feast day, students sing the hymn *Our Lady of the Atonement* at the end of Mass. May crowning is also a highlight for students each year.

**Summary**

In this chapter I studied the praxis of The Atonement Academy to determine if it fulfilled the same eight standards as the two previous schools. Once again, these eight areas of assessment are: 1) placing importance on teaching music, 2) giving pride of place to chant, 3) preserving and fostering polyphony, 4) preserving and fostering the full treasure of sacred music, 5) cultivating new compositions, 6) facilitating active participation, 7) providing liturgical training, and 8) fostering spiritual formation.

The central place of music in the educational experience at The Atonement Academy is visible in a number of areas. Despite having a non-auditioned choir program, all students are expected to sing daily at Mass and engage in rigorous daily training to develop their musical skills. This school-wide participation in the choral program assures that everyone, including the girls, gains opportunities serving in liturgy. Supportive clergy, proficient music personnel, financial backing, and making instructional time in the curriculum are essential components to having such a program. According to Fr. Phillips, “There are no other electives. We have determined what their electives are, and we put all that time into choral music.”\textsuperscript{144} A minimum of twenty percent of the school day is comprised of musical studies and singing in liturgy (see \textsuperscript{144} Phillips, interview.)
Fig. 5.1 above). While the music curriculum is generally grade and gender based, at the high school level the choirs are separated according to ability, where the most talented students gain membership into the school’s top ensemble. Besides the Honors Choir, a wealth of other opportunities are available to interested and musically advanced students at all age levels, including involvement in the parish choirs and participation in numerous choral festivals, clinics, and contests sponsored by outside organizations including AFPC, TMEA, TPSMEA, TCDA, and NATS. While the use of Kodály’s ideas and Ward’s method develops the successive progression of skills in the lower grades, no one teaching philosophy is prominently used with students after third grade. Because the liturgy-based choir curriculum presents repertoire according to the liturgical calendar rather than according to any sequential musical curriculum, the building of musical concepts is not necessarily gradational throughout any given academic year. The sequential acquisition of learning becomes evident when examining the choirs progressively over the span of many grade levels. I observed progressing musical and vocal skills as the grades increased; the difficulty level of the repertoire also increased during this time. The techniques used in teaching healthy vocal technique align with differing schools of thought depending on the age of the students. The King’s College, Cambridge philosophy is employed in developing head tone with the younger students. John Cooksey’s stages for the changing voice form the basis of boys’ vocal placement at the middle school level. Unlike St. Paul’s and the Madeleine, a unique feature of this choir program is its extension past the eighth grade. With high school voices that are more mature and settled, it is possible to continue building on the strong foundation of the earlier years and develop students to a rather advanced level of the bel canto singing style. In this way, too, the need for importing professional men to sing the tenor and
bass parts in the mixed choirs is alleviated. The use of solfège syllables, accompanied by hand signs, is employed exclusively in the teaching of repertoire at all grade levels. While initially this process of learning repertoire on solfège is quite slow, students eventually develop the skills to read music with ease and great accuracy. Providing musical notation on the daily hymn sheets and Sunday worship leaflets would further assist in promoting these music literacy goals.

Nearly seventy-five percent, or seventy-nine out of 106 works studied by the choirs, comprising works new and old from the church’s treasure, is used in the liturgy (see Fig. 5.3-5.8 above). This literature reflects every period of the church’s history and particularly the Anglican patrimony and esteemed English choral tradition. Approximately half of the repertoire consists of works by living composers, many of whom students often have the opportunity to interact with in person. In addition, some students, particularly the men’s schola, who sing communion propers daily, perform a wide body of chant. A wealth of hymns, including Latin chant hymns and several modern hymns with texts composed by Fr. Phillips, is used at Mass. Because Evensong is celebrated occasionally throughout the year, students also gain experience singing Anglican chant, a music form unique to this parish in the archdiocese. By providing students with musical training that is grounded in the Western sacred choral tradition, it is hoped that they will go forth from this program continuing to cherish and advance this musical treasury in the liturgy for years to come.

Extending from the clergy (priest and deacon) to the ministers (lector, schola, choir) to the congregation, the hierarchy of representation in sung components of the liturgy is particularly well-integrated at The Atonement Academy in a way that facilitates participation by the faithful both internally and externally. As was discussed previously, the congregation is involved in
sixty-four percent of the sung components at Mass and nearly 100 percent of the liturgy during Evensong and Benediction. Because the priest and deacons help to lead sung parts of the Mass and because the musical responses do not change frequently, strong external participation by the congregation is promoted. Only two Ordinary Mass settings and set of responses (either the English or the Latin) are used by the congregation and priest for every Mass, whether it be a Sunday, solemnity, feast, or weekday. This consistency and limited amount of repertoire allow the laity to develop great familiarity with the sung parts. As a result of these and other factors, congregational singing is exceptionally confident and effortless. It is interesting to note that there was no cantor or artificial amplification, and yet the congregational singing was the strongest I heard out of all three schools. Also noteworthy is the successful use of the choir within the liturgical setting in nurturing the church community interiorly. The rationales for dividing the sung roles accordingly parallel many ideas seen in the writings of Cardinal Joseph Ratzinger.

The many student-initiated practices that are visible at The Atonement Academy attest to the students’ strong liturgical training and spiritual formation. Establishing student groups, completely unprompted, to pray the rosary, advocate pro-life causes and acts of charity, and prepare proper chants for daily Mass demonstrates a significant maturity that should not be underestimated. Visitors take notice of the unique combination of musical, liturgical, and spiritual studies at the school. Sacred music and liturgical scholar Rev. Fr. Christopher Smith states, “The care for the sacred liturgy and discipleship formation, the school, the music: I recommend to every priest, school principal and church musician that they make a long visit and
learn from what they have accomplished there in such a short time.” While the school perhaps serves as an educational model in these areas, it also equips students to make substantial contributions on behalf of the Church now and in the future. Edmund Murray explains,

> The goal is that when they leave here, they somehow still find a way to stay involved in music – they join their college choir or they join an a cappella group. Later on, they join their church choir or a community choir. Graduates from The Atonement Academy, who are extensively literate in choral music and the church’s treasure of sacred music, will enrich these types of programs with their expertise and leadership in the future.¹⁴⁶

Unfortunately, because the first high school class graduated as recently as 2008 and the classes were rather small during the first few years, a more comprehensive measurement of the school’s alumni is not possible at this time. A few recent graduates of the academy currently show signs of continuing studies in music and sacred music as well as pursuing religious vocations, but a more long-term evaluation is necessary to gain meaningful data. Liam McDonough is currently minoring in music at The Catholic University of America and playing the organ in the Crypt Church of the Basilica of the National Shrine of the Immaculate Conception. Alejandro Oliveros has begun undergraduate studies in Music Education at the University of Texas at San Antonio. Anthony Dorsa is studying to become a priest at Guadalupe Seminary in Denton, Nebraska.¹⁴⁷ Despite its newness, The Atonement Academy has already been called “the pride of San Antonio’s Catholic K-12 school program” by the Rivard Report where “a solid academic

---


¹⁴⁶ Murray, interview.

education and equally rigorous spiritual grounding are guaranteed.” As the school continues to expand its campus and graduate an increasing number of students, it will no doubt produce more sacred music and religious vocations as well as successful individuals in a variety of fields in the future.

The Atonement Academy overwhelmingly met the goals of all eight directives derived from the Second Vatican Council. In the area of musical, liturgical, and spiritual formation, the school excelled to the highest levels. A generous amount of musical opportunities both inside and outside the parish are offered to students that rival the best schools in the area. The Atonement Academy stands out for its vision of giving an entirely un-auditioned student body access to quality music-making experiences and the chance to serve the liturgy as a chorister. Also notable is its work with boys’ changing voices and its extensive performance of works by living composers. As the music department continues to grow, it will no doubt continue to refine and integrate its pre-kindergarten through grade twelve curriculum; music theory and instrumental music are some areas where instruction might be expanded in the future. Much like art history and Church history, parallel courses in music history would likely benefit students a great deal. In the area of interior and exterior participation, an exemplary balance occurred between the sung roles of the clergy, choir, and congregation, which should serve as a model to any Catholic liturgy. The strong impact of this liturgical and spiritual education is reflected in the student-led men’s schola and other student-initiated clubs and practices on campus.

CHAPTER VI
ANALYSIS AND CONCLUSION

This chapter will evaluate data collected in the previous three chapters to make meaningful comparisons among the schools in this study. In the first section, I will make an initial assessment of the overarching trends that occurred among the institutions. Namely, I will propose that the three choir schools maintain an identity that is not only distinctively Catholic, but also modern American, based on a number of areas that are distinct from their European choir school counterparts. I will also suggest that pastoral vision is among the most essential elements in establishing a choir school. In the second section, I will discuss how the schools were able to meet each of the eight ecclesiastical standards regarding the importance of teaching music, giving pride of place to chant, preserving and fostering polyphony, promoting the full treasure of sacred music, cultivating new compositions, facilitating active participation, providing liturgical training, and fostering spiritual formation. Procedures for calculating statistical information used in this analysis will also be explained. In the third section, I will offer my conclusions about what these findings mean, areas for future consideration, and how this study may contribute to Catholic education and the New Evangelization in the future.

Initial Assessment

As this study confirms, choir schools come in many different shapes and sizes according to the particular needs and missions of each, but perhaps none as diverse as these three American models. At the same time, these schools are grounded within the lineage of chorister training
throughout history. These American choir schools continue to train musicians in singing vast quantities of plainchant for the liturgy, a practice which originated with the fourth-century *schola cantorum*, or singing school. In teaching students to read musical notation, The Madeleine Choir School and The Atonement Academy use a modern adaptation of solfège syllables, based on the eleventh century invention by Guido of Arezzo that made it possible to preserve and teach the entire repertory of chants to singers. Formation in Latin and the liturgy continues to be part of the choir school education as it was in medieval cathedrals and monasteries where boys were prepared for potential entry into the priesthood. Like choir boys from the Renaissance period, such as Josquin, Morales, Victoria, and Palestrina, trebles along with men regularly engage in singing complex polyphony in the liturgy. In the post-Reformation Church of England, the chorister’s main work has hinged on daily Matins and Evensong; we see the vestiges of weekly, seasonal, and occasional celebrations of Evensong/Vespers included in the ministry of these three schools. The Oxford Movement revived worship in the Church of England and re-introduced numerous Roman Catholic practices that had been lost during the Reformation.\(^1\) As it did in England and the three schools of this study, this more reverent, elevated type of liturgy has revived daily congregations and increased the standard of music and demand for highly trained choristers. Preparing vast amounts of choral anthems for these daily services has become the norm for English choir schools. Around the beginning of the twentieth century, and particularly in response to Pope Pius X’s 1903 motu proprio *Tra le sollecitudini*, Gregorian chant and Renaissance polyphony began once again to be a musical staple of the Mass and Divine Office. Richard Runciman Terry and Westminster Cathedral revived polyphony of the English Tudor era, while Lorenzo Perosi and the Sistine Chapel gravitated toward the music of Palestrina and

\(^1\) Mould, *The English Chorister*, 176-77.
the Italian Renaissance. The influence of both institutions can be seen in the core repertory of
the three choir schools, based heavily in chant and polyphony. This is about where the
similarities cease.

St. Paul’s Choir School, for boys only, aligns closest to traditional English choir school
models in mission and composition. The Atonement Academy demonstrates that high-quality
chorister training programs on par with choir schools are possible in non-auditioned parochial
school settings. The Madeleine Choir School, combining both of the above approaches, admits a
large population of students to the school for musical and academic formation, but then engages
a selection process whereby a fraction of the students in grades five through eight serve the
liturgy regularly. While exhibiting chorister practices from nearly every period of history, all
three institutions stand out for their uniquely American identity. Differences in the focus and
type of institution, composition of the student body and choirs, number of choirs engaged in
liturgical ministry, singing responsibility, philosophy of boys’ changing voices, chorister
selection process and training period, and financial structure contribute to this new identity. For
a side-by-side overview of the three schools, see Fig. 6.1 below.
Fig. 6.1 Comparison of school statistics for 2013-2014
S = soprano, A = alto, T = tenor, B = bass

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Focus</th>
<th>St. Paul's Choir School</th>
<th>The Madeleine Choir School</th>
<th>The Atonement Academy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Type</td>
<td>Day school</td>
<td>Day school</td>
<td>Day school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>boys</td>
<td>co-educational</td>
<td>co-educational</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grades</td>
<td>4 – 8</td>
<td>pre-k – 8</td>
<td>pre-k – 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enrollment</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>337</td>
<td>576</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Catholic</td>
<td>85-90%</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>94%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Admittance and training process</td>
<td>Audition to gain admittance; first year probationers are “in training”</td>
<td>Basic evaluation to gain admittance; musical training from pre-k to 4th grade, then only select 5th-8th graders sing in liturgy</td>
<td>No audition for admittance; musical training from pre-k to 2nd grade before singing in liturgy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Size of each choir</td>
<td>Trebles 15-20</td>
<td>Cecilia 25-30</td>
<td>MS Girls 55-60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Choristers 15-20</td>
<td>Gregory 18-24</td>
<td>MS Treble Boys 25-30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Schola (Changed Voice) 5-10</td>
<td>Schola 16-20</td>
<td>Honors Choir 50 (SATB)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Changed Voice 4-12</td>
<td>Changed Voice 25-30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Additional professional and adult singers</td>
<td>Choristers +16 ATB</td>
<td>Cecilia + 20 SATB</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Gregory + 20 SATB</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Schola + 20 SATB</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Singing responsibilities for each choir</td>
<td>Two weekday and one Sat./Sun. Mass per week; Wednesday Vespers; additional concerts and liturgies during the year</td>
<td>Two weekday Masses per week; bi-monthly Sun. Mass; Sunday Vespers during major liturgical seasons; cathedral concert series; additional liturgies</td>
<td>Bi-monthly weekday Mass; one Sunday Mass annually; two to three concerts annually</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daily Mass</td>
<td>12:10-12:50 p.m. (T-F)</td>
<td>5:15-6:00 p.m. (M-TH)</td>
<td>9:20-10:10 a.m. (M-F)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liturgies and concerts</td>
<td>275</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*School day schedule</td>
<td>8:50 a.m.-3:30 p.m. (M)</td>
<td>8:30 a.m.-6:00 p.m. (M, W)</td>
<td>7:30 a.m.-3:30 p.m. (M-F)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7:50 a.m.-7:00 p.m. (W)</td>
<td>8:30 a.m.-3:30 p.m. (T, TH, F)</td>
<td>8:30-10:00 a.m. (one SUN/year)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4:00-5:50 p.m. (SAT)</td>
<td>9:45 a.m.-12:15 p.m. (SUN)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Avg. no. of hours/week</td>
<td>41 – 46</td>
<td>39.5 – 43.5</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School days</td>
<td>172</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tuition</td>
<td>$6,200</td>
<td>$4,623-7,250</td>
<td>$6,545-6,875</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Funding sources</td>
<td>Tuition, parish, donations, Parent Guild fundraisers, archdiocesan school tax, performances</td>
<td>Tuition, Friends Annual Appeal, Spring Gala Auction, endowments, private foundation grants</td>
<td>Tuition</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Due to the complexity of the schedule and exceptions for each choir, this information serves as representative data. Figures 3.1, 4.1, and 5.1 were used to calculate the number of school hours each week. Mandatory extra liturgies and concerts were included in determining the average number of hours per week.*
The tradition in England has, in many ways, been the standard-bearer for choir schools. There are presently nearly forty operating choir schools in England that belong to the Choir Schools’ Association. Typically attached to a cathedral or college and specializing in training choir boys and girls, English choir schools are known under many different titles – preparatory school, cathedral school, college school, and choir school. For example, King’s Rochester Preparatory School, Hereford Cathedral School, King’s College School, Westminster Abbey Choir School, and Westminster Cathedral Choir School are all choir schools, even though they are identified by various titles. According to Information Officer Jane Capon, criteria for membership in the Choir Schools’ Association (CSA) requires that “schools have public sung daily services by the choristers on at least four days with the music reflecting ‘cathedral style church music;’ all choristers must be pupils at the school which is attached to an abbey, cathedral, minister, chapel, college, or parish church; and schools must be specifically arranged in a way that supports choristers’ welfare and academics along with their musical training.”

Ms. Capon indicated that liturgical and spiritual formation was not part of the choir school training. Because no one size fits all, as we have seen from the three schools in this study, these conditions for membership in CSA are as close as we can come to defining the universal characteristics of choir schools. Whether an institution identifies themself as a choir school by practice and/or by name, as well as what this constitutes, is left up to each individual institution to make these determinations. To form students in such high musical standards, many institutions in England require choristers to board on site. Some schools, such as Westminster

---

2 Jane Capon, Information Officer for the Choir Schools’ Association, e-mail message to author, 13 February 2015.
Abbey, have a self-contained academic program tailored specifically around the choristers’ music schedule. In this case, the choristers, being somewhere around thirty in number, are the only students on campus and academic class size may be only six or eight students. Other schools such as Westminster Cathedral, and even the Domspatzen in Regensburg, Germany, offer boarding for a small number of boy choristers while operating as a day school for a much larger group of non-singing students whose presence help sustain a strong academic body and financially stable institution. The fact that European choir schools are boarding schools geared toward a relatively small number of highly-selected choristers (20-30 trebles) greatly influences their curriculum and mission. Their goal is generally to have one choir which is capable of engaging a rigorous schedule of music on an advanced professional level. In the 1990s, a few schools in England began offering this type of education to girl choristers (Salisbury Cathedral, Exeter, Wells, and York Minster), but most schools remain for boys-only in order to maintain the tradition of the men and boys’ choir.³

On the other hand, many American choir schools, including Washington National Cathedral, Grace Cathedral, and the three schools in this study, are exclusively day schools so that choristers may remain living with their families while attending. One of the challenges of choristers not living on campus is maintaining the intensive training and performance schedule. As a result, the American mission has been modified to engage a somewhat smaller body of repertoire and spread liturgical responsibilities among a larger and sometimes more expanded demographic of choristers. Similar to what we see at St. Paul’s Choir School, Sandborg confirms the “peak” choir school period for boys is typically ages eight through thirteen.⁴

³ Sandborg, English Ways, xviii.
However, The Madeleine Choir School and The Atonement Academy are both co-educational institutions which encompass a wider age range and much higher enrollment of singing students than traditional choir schools. Two of the schools, St. Paul’s and The Atonement Academy, have daily Mass during the school day in which the entire student body participates. The daily Mass at the Madeleine takes place at 5:15 in the evening. With the exception of The Atonement Academy, all three schools engage in an extensive amount of rehearsals, performances, and liturgies outside of traditional school hours. Calendars from these three schools indicate that their students performed between approximately 180 to 275 liturgies and concerts in 2013. It entails a substantial commitment and effort from students and parents to accommodate such an “extended school day.” All three schools educate their choristers in liturgical and spiritual formation alongside the extensive musical formation.

*Number of choirs, singing responsibilities, composition and size of each choir*

To meet the great demands that accompany serving the daily liturgy, the American practice of spreading out the musical responsibilities among two or more choirs has not only proven effective but offers many additional benefits as well. The inclusion of girls has made a large contribution to sustaining such high quality programs. In addition to helping with the rotation, so each choir does not have to sing as frequently or learn as great a quantity of repertoire, it allows more rehearsal time in between performances for challenging music to be mastered and polished. It also gives a greater number of students, including girls, experiences in serving the liturgy. By having multiple choirs, The Atonement Academy offers all students in

---

4 Ibid.
grades three through twelve the opportunity to serve as choristers in the liturgy. The Madeleine Choir School alternates daily liturgical duties between two main choirs of select fifth through eighth graders, the Sts. Cecilia and Gregory choirs. St. Paul’s also has two choirs that alternate the bulk of daily liturgical duties, the Trebles and the Choristers. Other choirs also help with these responsibilities on occasion. Among the treble choirs of the three schools, the number of singers ranges from fifteen to sixty singers in a single choir. One important point to note about the smaller number of singers at St. Paul’s is that, like English choirs, all choristers sing only the soprano part in mixed repertoire, while professional men sing the alto, tenor, and bass parts. At both the Madeleine and The Atonement Academy, trebles divide to sing both the soprano and alto parts. The Atonement Academy is the only school that engages students to sing the tenor and bass parts rather than professional men, as their program extends through the twelfth grade.

Philosophy regarding the boys’ changing voices

When boys’ voices begin changing in England, choir schools do not generally have them continue singing in the choir. For this reason, many of the major choir schools extend only up through the eighth grade. If a boy’s voice breaks before the end of the eighth grade, the chorister is typically excused from singing duties to pursue instrumental or music theory studies. It is hoped that he will return to singing in his later high school years when his voice has become more settled. However, the philosophy of the three American schools in this study, and some German choir schools, is to keep boys singing through the changing voice years as much as possible and continue giving them liturgical singing responsibilities. In this way, they are more likely to continue singing as tenors and basses following their adolescent years. The Dresden
Kreuzchor and the Domspatzen accommodate boys from approximately age nine to nineteen. At St. Paul’s and the Madeleine, boys with changing voices continue to sing a reduced schedule during their time at the schools, often in conjunction with other choirs for reinforcement. Upon completion of the choir school education at the end of the eighth grade, both schools strive to keep these students engaged in singing by offering them choral scholar or membership positions among the adults that combine with the trebles in the mixed choir. Likely due to its larger size of at least twenty-five students and instructional focus that accommodates various stages of the changing voice, the Middle School Changed Voice Choir at The Atonement Academy is particularly strong and the most self-sustained out of the three schools. They perform with the same regularity in liturgies and concerts as the treble choirs. In keeping boys engaged in singing, the hope is to build musically skilled tenors and basses who will continue to sing in church, college, community, and professional choirs as adults.

**Chorister selection process and training period**

With the schools in this study, I found three different approaches to the selection and training process. As is common with many English models, St. Paul’s admits students through audition, then incorporates a probationary period where first-year singers are “in training” until they are able to perform their full duties as a chorister. In rare cases where a student is not able to meet these expectations, a mutual decision is usually made between the administration and the parents to withdraw the student from the school. The Madeleine Choir School and The Atonement Academy do not base their admittance on a formal audition; rather, they use the time from pre-kindergarten through third and fourth grade to nurture the musical and vocal ability of
their students in preparation for becoming choristers. At the beginning of fifth grade students are selected to sing in one of the choirs for the liturgy at the Madeleine. The Atonement Academy does not have any selection process since all student choirs sing in the liturgy from third grade up; however, an audition is required to gain admittance into the Honors Choir, the high school’s most advanced ensemble. In the case of the latter two schools, there is not the situation of a student withdrawing from the school if they are unable to meet the expectations of a chorister. They merely would not be selected to participate in the more advanced choirs that carry out a higher percentage of the performing duties. These approaches differ greatly from the rigorous, highly selective audition process in England where boys compete for a handful of positions that open up in the choir each year.

Financial structure

While the English cathedrals and colleges usually have sizable endowments to provide financial backing for their choir schools, two of the three schools in this study are financially independent from the church or cathedral they serve. St. Paul’s is the only school that receives funding from the parish in exchange for the choristers’ singing at liturgy. While an endowment is helpful, these schools have proven there are other ways to create financial sustainability, primarily through tuition, grants, and fundraising. At the Madeleine sixty percent of revenue needed is generated from tuition, while scholarships, concerts and auxiliary programs (transportation, extended care, diocesan support), Annual Appeals, galas, and private foundation grants produce the remaining funding. The budget at The Atonement Academy is maintained through tuition alone. Tuition costs being essentially equal among the schools, it appears that
enrollment numbers have the biggest correlation with the cost of educating each student. In other words, a teacher receives the same salary whether s/he has six or twenty-six students in his/her class. The cost of educating each student at St. Paul’s is double the cost of educating a student at The Atonement Academy.

Pastoral vision

Evidence gathered during this study supports the idea that pastoral vision is one of the most crucial components to the success of a choir school. Fr. Augustine Hickey was instrumental in getting the congregation at St. Paul’s Church to distinguish the importance of both external and internal participation in the liturgy. Fr. Joseph Collins’s "demonstration Masses" also advanced the spirituality received through the Mass. This atmosphere laid the groundwork for Dr. Theodore Marier to establish a choir school that would feed the parish internally in the liturgy. A vision grounded in the liturgy also led the mission of The Madeleine Choir School and The Atonement Academy. According to Lucas Tappan, “Whereas many parochial schools tend to rely heavily upon classroom instruction to teach the Faith, The Madeleine Choir School believes in the importance of the sacred liturgy in religious formation.”

In the midst of trying to rejuvenate the parish at The Madeleine Cathedral, Monsignor Francis Mannion urged Greg Glenn to begin the process of observing other choir schools, such as the one at Westminster Cathedral, in the fall of 1992. The music program at The Atonement Academy was born out of Fr. Christopher Phillips’s teaching students to sing music that was needed for the Mass. The pastoral staff from each of the schools in this study shares an

---

5 Tappan, “The Madeleine Choir School (Salt Lake City, Utah): A Contemporary American Choral Foundation,” 75.
overwhelmingly similar (and patristic) liturgical theology; liturgy must focus on elevating us from the ordinary, everyday life to the cosmic, heavenly liturgy. Not only does this viewpoint realize the central importance of liturgy in the life of the Church and in forming individuals in the faith, but it also recognizes the significance of the choir school in contributing to this reality. All of the signs and symbols, solemnity and beauty, that are part of liturgy help the faithful experience a deeper, more transcendent encounter with the Divine.

To engage such encounters frequently, as through daily liturgy, there must be a pastoral willingness to devote the necessary time and resources (music staff and financial backing) to adequately support the choir school program. Not only did Bishop George Niederauer grant approval for Glenn’s proposed choir school at the Madeleine, but he was also instrumental in raising needed funds and securing major donors for the endeavor. As the musical staff was in this study, personnel need to be highly accomplished, possessing thorough knowledge of the sacred music, Church liturgy, and the choir school tradition. Because the students’ liturgical and spiritual formation permeates all aspects of learning at these choir schools, staff must also serve as role models for students, being practicing Catholics of great religious faith themselves. In hiring current director John Robinson, Fr. Michael Drea’s goal was finding someone to develop the choir school in ways that would make a significant contribution to the liturgical life of the church. There also must be a commitment to providing time in the schedule. Students in this study spent an average of four to twenty-two percent of the school day in choir rehearsals, seven to thirteen percent of the school day in liturgies and concerts, and eight to sixteen percent of the day in related musico-liturgical classes (see comparison in Fig. 6.2 below).
Analysis of Data and Explanation of Procedures

Standard #1:
*Catholic institutions and schools attach great importance to the teaching of music.*

In the case of all three schools, choir and liturgy are central to the mission of the school. All students at St. Paul’s Choir School and The Atonement Academy participate in choir and liturgy daily. While almost all students participate in daily choir rehearsal at The Madeleine Choir School, only a select group of choristers alternates serving the liturgy daily. While the main focus of these choirs is to serve the daily Mass, students have opportunities to advance their musicianship through Vespers/Evensong, concerts, tours, collaborations with other organizations, recordings, and contests. A large amount of time in the schedule is devoted to engaging these strong musical experiences on a regular basis. The choirs at each school spend a minimum of twenty-nine percent of the school day in musico-liturgical activities, and, in some cases, as much as forty-six percent (see Fig. 6.2 below). According to the National Center for Education Statistics, in 2005-2006 the average length of the school week for private schools was between 30.5 and 35 hours each week. Due to the liturgical and performance schedule, the “school day” at these three institutions averages anywhere between 2373 and 2765 minutes per week, or 39.5 hours and 46 hours.

---

Fig. 6.2 Comparison of musico-liturgical minutes per week among the choirs and schools for 2013-2014

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School and Choir</th>
<th>Total School Day</th>
<th>Choir Rehearsal</th>
<th>Liturgy and Concerts</th>
<th>Other Musico-Liturgical Subject Areas</th>
<th>Total for all Musico-Liturgical Experiences</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SP Trebles</td>
<td>2379</td>
<td>461 (19%)</td>
<td>240 (10%)</td>
<td>280 (12%)</td>
<td>981 (42%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SP Choristers</td>
<td>2765</td>
<td>650 (22%)</td>
<td>365 (13%)</td>
<td>300 (11%)</td>
<td>1315 (46%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SP Schola</td>
<td>2455</td>
<td>90 (4%)</td>
<td>335 (13%)</td>
<td>380 (16%)</td>
<td>805 (33%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAD Cecilia</td>
<td>2492</td>
<td>380 (15%)</td>
<td>195 (8%)</td>
<td>200 (8%)</td>
<td>775 (31%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAD Gregory</td>
<td>2507</td>
<td>390 (15%)</td>
<td>200 (8%)</td>
<td>200 (8%)</td>
<td>790 (32%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAD Schola</td>
<td>2602</td>
<td>420 (16%)</td>
<td>265 (9%)</td>
<td>200 (8%)</td>
<td>885 (34%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAD Changed Voice</td>
<td>2373</td>
<td>334 (14%)</td>
<td>157 (7%)</td>
<td>200 (8%)</td>
<td>691 (29%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AT MS Girls</td>
<td>2400</td>
<td>205 (9%)</td>
<td>257 (11%)</td>
<td>300 (12%)</td>
<td>762 (32%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AT MS Treble Boys</td>
<td>2400</td>
<td>205 (9%)</td>
<td>257 (11%)</td>
<td>300 (12%)</td>
<td>762 (32%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AT Honors Choir</td>
<td>2400</td>
<td>260 (11%)</td>
<td>257 (11%)</td>
<td>300 (12%)</td>
<td>817 (34%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AT Changed Voice</td>
<td>2400</td>
<td>205 (9%)</td>
<td>257 (11%)</td>
<td>300 (12%)</td>
<td>762 (32%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Highest              | 2765             | 650 (22%)       | 365 (13%)            | 380 (16%)                             | 1315 (46%)                                 |
| Lowest               | 2373             | 90 (4%)         | 157 (7%)             | 200 (8%)                              | 691 (29%)                                  |

Besides the substantial amount of time devoted to musical training in the schedule, each school utilizes a very specifically tailored curriculum and philosophy for successfully achieving this chorister training (see Fig. 6.3 below). In examining these curricula, I found implementation of only some of the *National Standards for Music Education* or state standards such as the *Texas Essential Knowledge and Skills (TEKS), Massachusetts Curriculum Frameworks*, and *Utah Core Standards*. This is understandable since the mission of choir schools is not to focus on general music, music appreciation, composition/arranging, improvisation, music technology, or guitar/keyboard/harmonizing instruments as these national and state standards imply, but rather to give students highly specialized choral training so they can use these skills to serve as liturgical musicians. As a result, music appreciation, improvisation, composition, and a varied
repertoire inclusive of secular music were not generally represented in the choir school curricula. Instead, the choir schools are focused on exclusively developing performance-, repertoire-, and liturgy-based music skills in students. For this reason, applying musico-liturgical standards of Vatican II, derived from documents such as Sacrosanctum concilium, is a much more applicable and adequate way of assessing such liturgical music programs. In examining the curricula of the three institutions, the common areas that are unanimously and extensively developed among each school are healthy vocal technique, music reading, performance practice, chant, Latin, religion/theology/liturgy, human and character formation, and repertoire reflecting the Western classical tradition of sacred choral music. Multiple choirs exist at each institution in order to accommodate students at varying ages and stages of development.
Fig. 6.3 Comparison of musico-liturgical curricula and methods from 2013-2014

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>St. Paul's Choir School</th>
<th>The Madeleine Choir School</th>
<th>The Atonement Academy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Vocal technique</strong></td>
<td><strong>YES</strong></td>
<td><strong>YES</strong></td>
<td><strong>YES</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Music reading/theory</strong></td>
<td>ABRSM theory courses</td>
<td>Theory and solfège</td>
<td>Employs sight reading &amp; solfège for repertoire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Instrumental instruction and ensembles</strong></td>
<td>Piano, recorders, hand bells</td>
<td>Violin, orchestra</td>
<td>Occasional hand chimes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Performance practice</strong></td>
<td><strong>YES</strong></td>
<td><strong>YES</strong></td>
<td><strong>YES</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Music history</strong></td>
<td><strong>Very little</strong></td>
<td><strong>Formal course</strong></td>
<td><strong>Very little</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Art history</strong></td>
<td>Experiences during educational field trips to art museums</td>
<td>Experiences during choir tours to Italy, etc.</td>
<td>Formal course once per week</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Latin</strong></td>
<td>Formal courses</td>
<td>Formal courses</td>
<td>Formal courses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Religion/Theology/Liturgy</strong></td>
<td>Formal courses</td>
<td><strong>Formal courses</strong></td>
<td><strong>Formal courses</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Human and character formation</strong></td>
<td><strong>YES</strong></td>
<td><strong>YES</strong></td>
<td><strong>YES</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Liturgy-based</strong></td>
<td>78% of works are used in liturgy</td>
<td>97% of works are used in liturgy</td>
<td>75% of works are used in liturgy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Performance-based</strong></td>
<td>275 concerts/ liturgies annually</td>
<td>180 concerts/ liturgies annually</td>
<td>210 concerts/ liturgies annually</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Repertoire-based</strong></td>
<td>147 works annually</td>
<td>203 works annually; large masterworks</td>
<td>106 works annually</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Reperoire</strong></td>
<td>Roman Catholic with emphasis on English composers; changed voice boys sing barbershop and art songs on occasion</td>
<td>Exclusively sacred, Latin, and Roman Catholic; emphasis on chant and polyphony</td>
<td>Traditional Anglican and Roman Catholic; emphasis on living composers; some secular for concerts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chant</strong></td>
<td>Number system used to identify scale degrees</td>
<td>Solfège used to determine first few pitches</td>
<td><strong>Ward and Marier Method</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Polyphony</strong></td>
<td><strong>YES</strong></td>
<td><strong>YES</strong></td>
<td>Mostly performed by the Honors Choir</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Newly composed works</strong></td>
<td>Some interaction with living composers</td>
<td>Composers-in-residence</td>
<td>Frequent interaction with living composers and performance of these works</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Methods and techniques used in teaching music</strong></td>
<td>Repertoire, intervals, number system</td>
<td>Repertoire, Kodály, Suzuki, Bertalot, RSCM</td>
<td>Repertoire, Kodály, Ward, Cooksey, RSCM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Tonal philosophy</strong></td>
<td>English “continental” (St. John’s Cambridge, George Guest)</td>
<td>German “warmer with more bell-like resonance at the top” (Dresden Boys’ Choir)</td>
<td>English “hoot” (Kings College Cambridge, David Willcocks); <em>bel canto</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The techniques and methods used, however, vary a great deal. While St. Paul’s teaches music reading through the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music’s theory and piano sequence as well as some interval training in choir, The Atonement Academy relies almost entirely on the use of solfège to develop music reading. The Madeleine Choir School incorporates teaching theory, solfège, and violin to their students. Out of the diverse body of choral literature students are taught, at least seventy-five percent of those pieces indicated on the schools’ music schedules were explicitly used within the liturgy (see Divine Office and Mass usage in Fig. 6.6 below). Most of the repertoire is Roman Catholic (e.g., chant-based, Latin texted, specific to the Roman Rite, written by Catholic composers), with some inclusion of works by English composers and representatives of the Anglican tradition. Each school uses a different method in teaching students to sing chant. St. Paul’s uses a number system representing the scales degrees; The Madeleine Choirs School uses solfège, and The Atonement Academy uses the Ward and Marier methods. Polyphony is employed by the more advanced mixed choirs. All three schools rely upon repertoire as the method through which to train choristers in singing. The Madeleine Choir School and The Atonement Academy also use aspects of several leading music educators and organizations in their approach to musical instruction, such as Kodály, Ward, Suzuki, Bertalot, RSCM, and Cooksey. While the philosophies used to shape the chorister’s vocal sound vary widely between English continental (Guest), German choral, English hoot (Willcocks), and bel canto tonal schools, each is aesthetically pleasing and of exemplary quality and merit in its own right.
Standard #2:
Gregorian chant is given pride of place in liturgical services.

Since chant is performed daily by the choirs, as well as frequently sung by the congregation, chant is experienced as part of every liturgy at these three schools. The bulk of the chants used are the entrance and/or communion chants. At St. Paul’s and the Madeleine, choristers sing the same entrance chant from the Graduale Romanum at each daily Mass in order to better refine this difficult chant for the succeeding Sunday. On Sundays, the communion antiphon from the Graduale Romanum is additionally sung by the choir or just the men. At The Atonement Academy, a student-led men’s schola chants the communion antiphon at each daily Mass and additionally sings the entrance chant on major feast days and solemnities. The set of chants which the congregation sings with the most frequency is the composite chant Mass (Kyrie XVI, Gloria VIII, Credo III, Sanctus XVIII, and Agnus Dei XVIII), suggested in the United States Conference of Catholic Bishops’s document Sing to the Lord. At The Atonement Academy, this composite Mass is sung for all weekly celebrations of the Missa Normativa in Latin, along with the shorter Latin responses throughout the Mass. At the Madeleine, the choir and congregation alternate phrases or sections when chanting the Gloria and Credo. While a few additional ordinary chants are familiar and used by these congregations, one of the interesting things I noticed was the popularity of English plainsong settings. The plainsong setting in the new Roman Missal as well as the newly-composed setting by Jeff Ostrowski, Mass of the English Martyrs, are English settings I found to be in regular use at two of the schools. A few congregational chant hymns, Adoro te devote, Pange lingua, Tantum ergo, Ubi caritas, Veni creator Spiritus, sometimes with adapted English texts, reoccur consistently among these
schools. Depending on the liturgical season, the congregation at the Madeleine also sings one of the four Marian Antiphons (Alma Redemptoris mater, Ave Regina cælorum, Regina cæli, and Salve Regina) at the conclusion of daily Mass. Organ accompaniment is typically used, with the exception of the very short Mass responses, to provide reinforcement and build confidence on the congregational chants at each of the schools.

In addition to the above core repertory that occurs most frequently, other chants and chant-based music are promoted among these schools. St. Paul’s choristers chant the major sequences and Marian antiphons on occasion. At both Mass and Vespers, the congregation at St. Paul’s joins the choir in singing the psalm verses antiphonally in English using Gregorian chant psalm tones 1-8. The Madeleine choristers include several other chant Masses in their rotation during the week, including Mass I, IV, VIII, IX, XI, XII, XIII, XVI, XVII, and XVIII. For Vespers, the Madeleine also uses many Magnificat settings based on Gregorian tones, such as Lechner’s Magnificat octavi toni, Grassi’s Magnificat octavi toni, and Bevan’s Magnificat primi toni and Magnificat octavi toni. On occasion, the schola at Atonement sings the major sequences, Marian antiphons, and additional Ordinary chants, including Kyrie XI, Sanctus VIII, Agnus Dei VIII, and Agnus Dei IX. Chant-based choral motets and organ improvisations are also used as a way of promoting chant and using its aesthetic properties as a common thread throughout the liturgy.
Standard #3: Sacred polyphony is included in liturgical celebrations.

Despite the musical challenges it poses to perform, the singing of polyphony by the choristers and other capable individuals was observed at each of the three schools to a substantial degree. The schools in this study performed between fourteen and fifty-four polyphonic works as part of their liturgical celebrations in 2013 (this will be discussed further in Fig. 6.6 below). In the schools where less frequent liturgical occurrences of polyphony are possible, the parish music series offers opportunities for guest choirs and resident choirs to perform Renaissance polyphony for parishioners in a concert setting. As will be reflected in Fig. 6.5 below, almost no polyphonic music exists for treble-only voices; in most cases, a mixed-voice choir is needed to execute the singing of Renaissance polyphony. With the exception of The Atonement Academy’s Honors Choir, all of the other choirs in this study do not have the forces needed to sing this type of repertoire during the week. As a result, the highest concentrations of this type of music at St. Paul’s and the Madeleine occur on Sundays and holy days, when the men of the choir are present. The Madeleine Choir School incorporates an astounding nineteen Renaissance motets into their seasonal Sunday Vespers liturgies (see Fig. 6.6 below). At The Atonement Academy, high concentrations of polyphony occur on solemnities and during the seasons of Lent and Easter. St. Paul’s Choir School features polyphonic works on concert programs throughout the year. The prominent place of Renaissance polyphony within these three schools will be elaborated further in the next section.
As I have explained throughout this study, choir school programs are repertoire-based. In the case of all three schools, the choirs overwhelmingly preserve and foster the full Church treasure by singing sacred music from all historic periods and genres both within and, at times, outside of liturgy. To fully analyze the choral repertoire sung by the choirs in this study, I collected music lists from each school that contained all the liturgical and non-liturgical (concerts, tours, etc.) programs these choirs had performed in 2013. After creating a repertoire database for each school, I then categorized the works according to choir, title, composer, voicing, genre, text, and usage. I divided the database into charts according to historical period: Renaissance, Baroque, Rococo/Classical, Romantic/Cecilian Movement/Oxford Movement, twentieth century, and living composers (see Fig. 3.5-3.10, 4.3-4.8, 5.4-5.9 from previous chapters). I counted the entries on these charts to calculate the number of pieces represented by each period as well as the total number of pieces these choirs sang in 2013. Data from the charts was drawn upon to make conclusions about the schools’ repertoire. While the charts included in school chapters offer specific examples of repertoire used, the section below will consolidate the results from all three schools for side-by-side comparison of general patterns and anomalies. Collectively, this data is intended to offer ideas for finding repertoire that not only fulfills Church directives for the liturgy, but is also appropriate in the training of young choristers.

Out of the entire 456 choral works documented from the three schools, the largest number of works comes from the twentieth century (109), living composers (106), and from the Renaissance period (99). See Fig. 6.4 below for these calculations.
Fig. 6.4 Comparison of choral repertoire and most frequently performed composers for 2013

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Historical Era</th>
<th>St. Paul's Choir School</th>
<th>The Madeleine Choir School</th>
<th>The Atonement Academy</th>
<th>Total Works</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Renaissance Polyphony</td>
<td>31 (21%)</td>
<td>54 (27%)</td>
<td>14 (13%)</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tomás Luis de Victoria</td>
<td>Giovanni Pierluigi da Palestrina</td>
<td>William Byrd</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baroque</td>
<td>13 (9%)</td>
<td>17 (8%)</td>
<td>6 (6%)</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Orlando Gibbons</td>
<td>Johann Sebastian Bach</td>
<td>Johann Sebastian Bach</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rococo/Classical</td>
<td>7 (5%)</td>
<td>6 (3%)</td>
<td>6 (6%)</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Wolfgang A. Mozart</td>
<td>Wolfgang A. Mozart</td>
<td>Giovanni B. Pergolesi Thomas Attwood</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romantic/Cecilian/Oxford</td>
<td>32 (22%)</td>
<td>41 (20%)</td>
<td>14 (13%)</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Josef Rheinberger</td>
<td>Gabriel Fauré</td>
<td>Gabriel Fauré</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Ralph Vaughan</td>
<td>Felix Mendelssohn</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Williams</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twentieth Century</td>
<td>42 (28%)</td>
<td>53 (26%)</td>
<td>14 (13%)</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Herbert Howells</td>
<td>Richard Proulx</td>
<td>Jean Langlais</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Living Composers</td>
<td>22 (15%)</td>
<td>32 (16%)</td>
<td>52 (49%)</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>John Rutter</td>
<td>Colin Mawby</td>
<td>John Rutter</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total repertoire</strong></td>
<td><strong>147</strong></td>
<td><strong>203</strong></td>
<td><strong>106</strong></td>
<td><strong>456</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Interestingly, the Romantic period (87) is also rather well represented, most likely due to the inclusion of music influenced by the Cecilian and Oxford movements, both of which focused on composing sacred music expressly for the liturgy. Another pattern that emerges is that the Baroque (36) and Rococo/Classical (19) are the least represented consistently among each of the schools. While, as I will show in Fig. 6.5, the Baroque period does offer a substantial amount of treble-voice music, in general the data from these schools confirms that music from these two periods is not as widely adaptable for the liturgy overall. The orchestral scoring and duration of Classical period works make them particularly impractical to use in the liturgy on a regular basis. From examining the most frequently performed composers at each school, composers from
England were the most represented. The highest percentage of choral repertoire sung at St. Paul’s comes from the twentieth century as well as from English composers. The highest percentage of choral repertoire sung at the Madeleine comes from the Renaissance period as well as from Catholic composers. The highest percentage of choral repertoire sung at The Atonement Academy comes from living composers.

Among the schools’ repertoire, 162 out of 456 works, or thirty-six percent, are scored for treble-only voices (see Fig. 6.5 below). These works are most regularly employed in liturgical services during the week when the tenors and basses are not present. The largest representation comes from the twentieth century where fifty-three out of 109 works, or forty-nine percent, are scored for treble voices. Fifty-one out of 106 pieces, or forty-eight percent, by living composers are likewise highly represented. A substantial number of works also comes from the Romantic and Baroque periods. As cited above, almost no works from the Renaissance represent this voicing.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Historical Era</th>
<th>St. Paul's Choir School</th>
<th>The Madeleine Choir School</th>
<th>The Atonement Academy</th>
<th>Total %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Renaissance Polyphony</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1/99 (1%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baroque</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>18/36 (50%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rococo/Classical</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7/19 (37%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romantic/Cecilian/Oxford</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>32/87 (37%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twentieth Century</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>53/109 (49%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Living Composers</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>51/106 (48%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total repertoire</strong></td>
<td><strong>53</strong></td>
<td><strong>63</strong></td>
<td><strong>46</strong></td>
<td><strong>162/456 (36%)</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In addition to representing various historic periods and voicings, a variety of genres, languages, and uses are embodied in the repertory of these schools. Masses, requiems, passions, antiphons, motets, anthems, carols, hymns, canticles, reproaches, cantatas, oratorios, spirituals, gospel, and sacred operas are among the genres represented. A diverse body of congregational hymns complements the choral repertoire performed by each of the schools as well. Printed worship leaflets or hymnals that have been produced in-house allow for inclusion of chant hymns, hymns from all historic periods, and more recently composed texts and tunes, such as those by Dr. Theodore Marier and Fr. Christopher Phillips. The Madeleine Choir School performs the highest percent of choral music in Latin and languages other than English in comparison to the two other schools (see Fig. 6.6 below). To calculate these figures, I used the
information in the repertoire lists from the Madeleine (Fig. 4.3-4.8) to count the number of pieces that identified having Latin text. Out of 203 works sung by the Madeleine in 2013, 137 works indicated Latin text (fifty-two works from the Renaissance, nine from the Baroque, six from the Rococo/Classical, twenty-five from the Romantic/Cecilian/Oxford, thirty from the twentieth century, and fifteen by living composers). Representing 137 works out of 203, it could be calculated that sixty-seven percent of all works performed by the Madeleine were sung in Latin. The number of works in each of the other categories were counted and calculated likewise from each school’s repertoire list. The Atonement Academy performs seventy-five out of 106 works in English, the highest percent of choral works in English.

Fig. 6.6  Language and usage of sung repertoire at each school in 2013

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>St. Paul's Choir School</th>
<th>The Madeleine Choir School</th>
<th>The Atonement Academy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>25+4+7+15+14+6= 71 (48%)</td>
<td>52+9+6+25+30+15= 137 (67%)</td>
<td>9+2+2+4+2+6= 25 (23%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>6+9+0+14+27+16= 72 (49%)</td>
<td>2+5+0+9+21+15= 52 (26%)</td>
<td>5+4+4+7+11+44= 75 (71%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German, Spanish, French, Slavonic, Old English</td>
<td>0+0+0+3+1+0= 4 (3%)</td>
<td>0+3+0+7+2+2= 14 (7%)</td>
<td>0+0+0+3+1+2= 6 (6%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total number of works</td>
<td>147</td>
<td>203</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Divine Office</td>
<td>0+0+0+0+5+1= 6 (4%)</td>
<td>19+2+0+2+11+3= 37 (18%)</td>
<td>0+0+0+1+0+0= 1 (1%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mass</td>
<td>23+12+7+27+27+13= 109 (74%)</td>
<td>35+14+5+39+37+29= 159 (78%)</td>
<td>14+6+6+13+7+32= 78 (74%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-liturgical</td>
<td>8+1+0+5+10+8= 32 (22%)</td>
<td>0+1+1+0+5+0= 7 (4%)</td>
<td>0+0+0+0+7+20= 27 (25%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Totals were calculated by adding the number of pieces from each historical period.*
In the case of all three schools, the largest percentage of choral works was used at Mass. The Madeleine Choir School also sang a substantial amount of choral pieces for Vesper celebrations. When combining the figures from the Divine Office and Mass in the chart above (Fig. 6.6), 115 out of 147 works, or seventy-eight percent of pieces were sung in the liturgy at St. Paul’s. At the Madeleine, 196 out of 203 were used in liturgy. At The Atonement Academy, seventy-nine out of 106 works were sung in the liturgy. In looking further at the twenty-seven non-liturgical pieces on the Atonement music lists, it can be seen that this body of repertoire is comprised largely of secular pieces. Works that are of a secular nature are showcased at choral competitions and on non-church-related concert programs. On occasion, larger works, such as the Requiem settings of Fauré, Duruflé, and Rutter, were sung in their entirety within the liturgy. Opportunities to expose choristers and parishioners to more extensive sacred works mostly occur through the parish’s concert series. Two larger treble-voice masterworks in particular have been performed by all three schools, Benjamin Britten’s *A Ceremony of Carols* and Pergolesi’s *Stabat Mater*. The Madeleine Choir School prepares a half dozen larger works that it performs in non-liturgical settings annually.

**Standard #5:**

*Composers cultivate new works of sacred music to increase the church’s store of treasures.*

As was alluded to in the previous section, these schools also promote the cultivation of new compositions of sacred music. The schools in this study performed between twenty-two and fifty-two works by living composers in 2013 (see Fig. 6.4 above). American composers such as Carson Cooman, Robert Lehman, Michael Olbash, John Karl Hirten, Gerald Near, Morten Lauridsen, Frank Ferko, Jeff Ostrowski, Kevin Allen, Joel Martinson, David Brunner, Mark
Patterson, David Hill, Joseph Martin, Laura Farnell, Paul Bouman, Leo Nestor, Paul French, Patti Drennan, and David Ashley White are represented among the choristers’ repertoire. Students at these institutions have also had personal interactions with living composers, including Richard Proulx, Leo Nestor, Carson Cooman, Gerre Hancock, Bob Chilcott, and Z. Randall Stroope. Almost half of these new works performed are scored for treble-only voices (see Fig. 6.5 above), which makes them an especially important resource for choir schools. Due to the volume of pieces needed to maintain weekday liturgical services, Catholic choir school programs create an overwhelming need for quality two- and three-part treble music. These pieces must be both musically interesting for the choristers and substantively inspiring to all ages, including adults that attend these liturgies.

Reasons for adding new works to the treasure of sacred music are identified by each of the schools. There are requirements which meet the basic needs of liturgy, such as composing new music to comply with new ecclesiastical translations or to fit a specific ritual length in the Mass. But beyond these utilitarian purposes, there was a recurring insistence that new music must also be capable of engaging the faithful and moving the soul on a deeper level. While pastoral staff at all three schools believe that the biggest source of inspiration for new music should be the Church’s tradition of sacred music, particularly chant and polyphony, they also require that this music possess a freshness that will open ears and add variety to the repertoire already in use by the choirs. In addition to the need for more treble-voice music mentioned above, there is a continual necessity for quality works to mark special occasions, liturgical feasts, and seasons fittingly. Minor and patronal feasts that are celebrated by a parish, for example, often have particularly scarce musical resources from which to draw. Above all, these schools
recognize the importance of incorporating new compositions to bear witness to the ongoing creative work of God in the present day liturgy.

Standard #6:
The faithful are led to full, conscious, and active participation in liturgical celebrations.

While this directive is the most difficult to measure in the study, due to problematic and speculative nature of evaluating interior participation, evidence gathered among these schools shows exterior congregational participation to be exceptionally strong during the liturgy. These results are consistent with what we know from key individuals throughout the history of each of these schools, including Fr. Augustine Hickey, Fr. Joseph Collins, Monsignor Francis Mannion, Greg Glenn, and Fr. Christopher Phillips, who have placed great importance on distinguishing the difference between external and internal participation and understanding the spirituality of the Mass. At times, demonstration Masses and instructional classes have been offered to aid in these areas. At other times, these schools have relied on a well-executed liturgy to speak for itself and invite the faithful into deeper participation. I will discuss the participation I observed both quantitatively and qualitatively, describe factors that impact the participation, and offer a number of conclusions as to why this may be the case.

Among the liturgies observed, each extended between thirty and one hundred minutes in duration (shown in Fig. 3.11, 4.9, and 5.10 above). An average of forty-seven to sixty-one percent of each liturgy comprised singing, depending on the school. All things being equal, the results were extremely similar among the schools, with sung roles averaging between fifty-eight to sixty-nine percent for the congregation and thirty-one to forty-two percent for the choir (see Fig. 6.7 below). The congregation’s average of singing was slightly higher at St. Paul’s than the
others due to the inclusion of Vespers, a liturgy that consists almost entirely of congregational singing. The Madeleine Choir School congregational average was slightly lower because of the low presider and deacon participation. I combined the roles of presider, deacon, cantor, and congregation since these individuals typically sing together, or in dialogue, during greetings, prayers, and responses. These roles were also combined for greater parity among the schools since two did not employ a cantor for singing and the other had almost no sung priest/deacon elements. With this being the case, congregational participation equaled sixty-nine percent of all sung components at St. Paul’s Choir School, fifty-eight percent at The Madeleine Choir School, and sixty-six percent at The Atonement Academy. To provide a true comparison with the other two schools, the choir and schola figures for The Atonement Academy were also combined. With that being the case, choir participation equaled thirty-one percent of all sung components at St. Paul’s Choir School, forty-two percent at The Madeleine Choir School, and thirty-four percent at The Atonement Academy.

Fig. 6.7 Comparison of musical roles in the liturgy among the three schools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>St. Paul's Choir School</th>
<th>The Madeleine Choir School</th>
<th>The Atonement Academy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Presider and Deacon</td>
<td>8.56%</td>
<td>2.77%</td>
<td>14.35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Congregation (and Cantor)</td>
<td>60.67%</td>
<td>55.34%</td>
<td>51.28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL CONGREGATION</td>
<td>69.23%</td>
<td>58.11%</td>
<td>65.63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Choir</td>
<td>30.95%</td>
<td>41.89%</td>
<td>14.79%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (schola)</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>19.59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL CHOIR</td>
<td>30.95%</td>
<td>41.89%</td>
<td>34.35%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Numbers presented in figures 3.11, 4.9, and 5.10 above have been transferred to this chart for side-by-side comparison among schools.
In examining the distribution of sung elements at Mass, a comparison can be made between which parts the congregation (along with presider, deacon, and cantor) typically sings and which parts the choir and schola sing (see Fig. 6.8 below). The three degrees of progressive solemnity are achieved by The Atonement Academy; all of those elements which belong to the first and second degree are employed by St. Paul’s, with the exception of the sung acclamations at the Gospel and the prayer of the faithful; several elements belonging to the first degree are currently not sung at The Madeleine Choir School. Among all three schools, the entrance chant, Kyrie or Gloria, Gospel Alleluia intonation and verse, Agnus Dei, communion chant, and communion motet are sung by the choir. The entrance hymn, psalm, Gospel Alleluia refrain, Credo, Memorial Acclamation, Great Amen, Lord’s Prayer, and one to three additional hymns are sung by the congregation. Other items vary, depending on the school and Mass. At the Madeleine, a hymn of praise is sung either at the end of Communion or for the recession, but not both. Certainly the rationale for dividing the musical duties as such between the congregation and choir is to have the parts and prayers that belong to the priest or other ministers sung as much as possible, that the congregation may respond. In addition to these responses and dialogues, elements which the congregation and choir may each sing on their own are utilized. In the case of these schools, the responses, two to four hymns, and half of the ordinary parts are relegated to the congregation. The proper items, half of the ordinary items, and one to two motets are sung by the choir.
**Fig. 6.8 Distribution of sung elements at Mass**

1 = belonging to the first degree of *Musicam sacram*  
2 = second degree  
3 = third degree  
♦ = presider, deacon, cantor, congregation  
♪ = choir  
♫ = men’s schola  
◊ = one or the other is sung

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Element</th>
<th>St. Paul's Choir School</th>
<th>The Madeleine Choir School</th>
<th>The Atonement Academy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Entrance chant – 3</td>
<td>♪</td>
<td>♪</td>
<td>♪</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entrance hymn – 3</td>
<td>♦</td>
<td>♦</td>
<td>♦</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greeting – 1</td>
<td>♦</td>
<td>not sung</td>
<td>♦</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kyrie – 2</td>
<td>♪</td>
<td>♦</td>
<td>♪</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gloria – 2</td>
<td>♪</td>
<td>♦</td>
<td>♪</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collects – 1</td>
<td>♦</td>
<td>not sung</td>
<td>♦</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response after readings – 3</td>
<td>not sung</td>
<td>not sung</td>
<td>♦</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psalm – 3</td>
<td>♦</td>
<td>♦</td>
<td>♦</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gospel Alleluia/ verse – 3</td>
<td>♪ ♪</td>
<td>♪ ♪</td>
<td>♪ ♪</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acclamations at the Gospel – 1</td>
<td>not sung</td>
<td>not sung</td>
<td>♦</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gospel chanted – 3</td>
<td>not sung</td>
<td>not sung</td>
<td>♦</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credo – 2</td>
<td>♦</td>
<td>♦</td>
<td>♦</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prayer of the Faithful – 2</td>
<td>not sung</td>
<td>♦</td>
<td>♦</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Offertory chant – 3</td>
<td>not sung</td>
<td>not sung</td>
<td>♪ ♪ ♪ simple form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Offertory motet – 3</td>
<td>♪</td>
<td>♪</td>
<td>♪</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Offertory hymn – 3</td>
<td>♦</td>
<td>not sung</td>
<td>♦</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preface – 1</td>
<td>♦</td>
<td>not sung</td>
<td>♦</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanctus – 1</td>
<td>♦</td>
<td>♦</td>
<td>♦</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Memorial Acclamation</td>
<td>♦</td>
<td>♦</td>
<td>♦</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Great Amen – 1</td>
<td>♦</td>
<td>♦</td>
<td>♦</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Lord’s Prayer – 1</td>
<td>♦</td>
<td>♦</td>
<td>♦</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Fraction Anthem</td>
<td><em>Anglican Use only</em></td>
<td><em>Anglican Use only</em></td>
<td>♦</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agnus Dei – 2</td>
<td>♪</td>
<td>♪</td>
<td>♪</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communion chant – 3</td>
<td>♪ ♪</td>
<td>♪ ♪</td>
<td>♪ ♪</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communion motet – 3</td>
<td>♪ ♪</td>
<td>♪ ♪</td>
<td>♪ ♪</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communion hymn – 3</td>
<td>not sung</td>
<td>♦</td>
<td>♦</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blessing and dismissal – 1</td>
<td>♦</td>
<td>not sung</td>
<td>♦</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recessional hymn</td>
<td>♦</td>
<td>♦</td>
<td>♦</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Within this division of roles between the choir and congregation, I observed exceptionally confident singing from the congregations as well as visually affirming cues of their engagement during the choral music (e.g., not shifting in pews, reading bulletins, texting). These results suggest that having strong choir involvement in the liturgy does not diminish congregational participation. Even with the choristers singing up to forty-two percent of all sung music by themselves, if the congregation understands and executes their external and internal roles toward participating, the two can co-exist. In fact, the choristers’ affective ministerial role may actually inspire the congregational participation. The same was observed of students sitting in the congregation during liturgies. At all three schools I observed students having a high degree of singing participation when they were not “on-duty” but rather attending as a member of the congregation. One hopes that these habits will be formative and continue into adulthood to produce faithful, engaged members of the congregation. In order for the entire treasure of sacred music to be heard in the liturgy, it is fitting that some parts of the singing be assigned to the choir as it has been with these schools.

Besides the spiritual maturity of the congregants and the aesthetically-pleasing choral music, I witnessed a number of other factors which likely contributed to such strong congregational participation. In every case, there was a general flow to the liturgies that kept the congregation engaged and participating both exteriorly and interiorly from one element to the next. Worship leaflets and/or in-house hymnals with numbers posted on a hymn board were used to eliminate the need for instructions and announcements before each hymn, sparing the liturgy of these interruptions. Organ improvisation connected transitions seamlessly, and elaborate introductions to hymns and psalms built excitement leading up to singing. Organ, as
opposed to a piano or guitar, accompanied all of the congregational parts to add foundational reinforcement without the use of artificial amplification. Reliance upon a common body of music (e.g., the composite chant Mass from *Sing to the Lord*) and the repetition of hymns and responses at each Mass fosters confidence in the singing. St. Paul’s repeats the same three hymns and congregational Mass setting throughout the entire week from Tuesday to Sunday.

Overall, The Atonement Academy had the best congregational singing and participation of the three schools. I was hard pressed to locate anyone around me that was not singing and the overall sound was extremely engaged and robust. A number of features unique to this parish likely contribute to this. Inherent to their Anglican liturgical patrimony is the prominent place of congregational singing, hymnody, Anglican chant, choral music, organ music, and overall excellence in liturgical music. Along with the strong hymn singing that takes place, frequent repetition of Mass parts and a small repertoire of recurring Anglican psalm tones assist the congregation in building great familiarity. Because there is no cantor, there is no representation *in persona ecclesiae*, where the cantor is singing on behalf of the people. Rather, there is a sense of responsibility placed on each individual sitting in the pews to sing on his/her own behalf as the church community. The smaller church building and more compact seating allow the organ and the singing to easily fill the space. By involving all of their 500+ school students in chorister formation at The Atonement Academy, the result of those proficient in singing the liturgy are exponentially increased.
Singing, serving, and attending daily liturgy comprises a fundamental part of formation for students at each of these schools. It is one thing to discuss the meaning of musical texts or liturgical feasts and seasons in the choir rehearsal or religion/theology class, but these schools recognize that the experience which is most crucial to choristers’ training is being able to sing this music in the liturgy, the context for which it was intended to come alive. From these repeated ritual experiences, students come to understand why the Magnificat has a central place in Vespers or what the spirituality is behind the Sanctus. There is a very strong sense of the liturgical year and saint’s feasts at each of these institutions because of celebrating Mass daily. Each school also exposes students to the fruits of the Divine Office through the celebration of Lauds and Vespers/Evensong weekly or on prominent liturgical days. Throughout the liturgical year, students come to know the range of progressive solemnity from their direct experience in the liturgies in which they participate as choristers. They begin to develop a better understanding of liturgy and the different meaning music takes on in this context where it becomes an act of prayer, reveals the glory of God, and nourishes spiritual life.

Serving as choristers in the liturgy is also an important means of religious formation for students. Their choir ministry helps them to understand spiritual concepts, such as the mystical body of Christ or the Communion of Saints that are otherwise difficult to convey or experience. Music helps students better explore, understand, and respond to non-tangible realities including the divine mysteries being celebrated, giving students a greater variety of modes, particularly non-verbal, in which to express their faith. Formal religion/theology courses three to five times
per week at each of these institutions also offer students an opportunity to discuss and process what they have experienced in the liturgy, in order to build a deeper understanding of what is taking place. In looking through the curricula for these courses, I identified many units and topics included for study that would advance students’ liturgical knowledge. These areas include the origin and meaning of feasts and liturgical seasons, different Rites within the Church, sacraments celebrated within the liturgy, elements and theological understanding of the Mass, Church history and liturgical developments, sacred scripture, and the use of sacred signs, symbols, and objects. A final commonality between these schools is their efforts to include tours, lectures, and even formal weekly courses on church art, art history, and architecture. Such studies are essential for helping students gain a better understanding of the sacred space in which liturgical events occur.

Standard #8:
Singers receive spiritual formation of the highest standards.

The main sources of spiritual formation in the three schools are liturgies, devotional practices, religion/theology classes, and choir rehearsals. Engaging in daily Mass, the Divine Office, and prayers at the beginnings and ends of each class, receiving the sacrament of penance regularly, and performing devotional acts, including Eucharistic adoration, Stations of the Cross, Advent wreath meditations, and studying the lives of the Saints, teach students about the importance of having a regular prayer life. Not only does developing this life of prayer and theological understanding help students grow in their own relationship with God, but it also cultivates their ministerial role of singing in the choir. Formal religion/theology classes help
students understand that through their choir ministry, they are part of the royal priesthood of the universal church, which is perpetually offering sacrifice to God and joining its thanksgiving to the heavenly liturgy. Through catechesis and mystagogical reflection, theology classes assist choristers’ understanding of the readings, musical texts, and themes they experience in the liturgy. While students are often able to develop spiritual awareness simply from repeating repertoire over time and gaining familiarity with the specific feast or season in which it is used, theological and liturgical connections of the sung musical texts is also developed within the choir rehearsal at times. The collective aim is that choristers may cultivate their own faith as well as incorporate musical works more profoundly in the liturgy to support the spiritual formation of others.

One thing that became clear early on in this study from the literature reviewed was the problematic nature of trying to assess spirituality within students of this age. A past study on chorister spirituality by Martin Ashely confirms the difficulty and confusion children have expressing ideas about their faith. In probing topics such as the concept of heaven, Ashely received responses including, “. . . It’s above the clouds and rockets and things, but I don’t know really. It’s like a mystery isn’t it?” Because theological concepts are generally difficult to both conceptualize cognitively as well as articulate verbally, the level of understanding from choristers of this age cannot be reliably obtained often. This is no doubt why each of these schools has instead chosen to focus efforts on the long-term formation of these students. In the case of all three schools, the choir school years are intended to plant the seeds and set individuals on the path toward a life-long spiritual journey. For this reason, it is important to employ

---

7 Ashley, “The Spiritual, the Cultural and the Religious: What Can We Learn from a Study of Boy Choristers?,” 262.
teaching staff who are practicing Catholics and of great religious faith themselves, that they may serve as role models and examples of faith in action for students. While each of the schools strives to guide faith-filled individuals to religious life and sacred music vocations, ultimately the goal is to equip all students with Christian life skills that are transferrable to any vocation a student pursues. Because of the uniqueness of their choir ministry, from an early age, students are formed in a way that utilizes their talents at the service of the Church and the local community. Such an education equips them to continue church ministry on a broader level later in life. As a result, the fruits of this spiritual formation are best measured in the schools’ alumni. As we have seen, each of these schools has already produced an impressive slate of alumni who are making the Church’s work their life vocation.

**Conclusion**

Until 2014, the only in-depth studies and dissertations that had been conducted pertaining to choir schools in the United States were those associated with the Episcopal Church. With virtually no data on Catholic choir school programs, the purpose of studying St. Paul’s Choir School (Cambridge, MA), The Madeleine Choir School (Salt Lake City, UT), and The Atonement Academy (San Antonio, TX) was to provide much-needed information on these types of Catholic institutions. By investigating and analyzing the praxis of each, this study was able to conclude that these schools prove highly successful in realizing the goals of Vatican II in their everyday practice. As such, they offer models and methods which may be adapted by other kinds of Catholic institutions seeking to better implement the conciliar goals. Secondarily, the research standards developed for this study have contributed a set of benchmarks through which
other institutions can assess their own progress in achieving the musico-liturgical objectives of Vatican II. Because the conciliar directives are sometimes vague and difficult to interpret, it is important to ground our understanding of them in a comprehensive study of scholarly sources and other Church documents to know their true meaning. Only once this is achieved can we begin to comprehend the spirit in which the Council intended them to be implemented. These choir school programs are on the forefront of this rediscovery, or “reform of the reform.”

By examining related literature and data collected during the study, I found that several patterns emerged among the schools. First, the three choir schools maintain an identity that is not only distinctively Catholic but also modern American. Second, pastoral vision is among the most essential elements to establishing a choir school. There are also two areas in which this study failed to provide answers. Due to the nature of the English choir school tradition, relying primarily upon choirmasters who were once choristers themselves to know and pass down the tradition, a substantial limitation of my study is that there was not one specific method, technique, or curriculum of chorister formation to better understanding the praxis. The best means of learning this tradition remains through direct observation of this training in progress. Additionally, I was also anticipating that, because of their congruity with Anglican choir school models, these institutions would have provided more of a solution to the problem of regularly celebrating the Divine Office as a public prayer of the Church. Evensong has thrived in the Anglican Church, yet aside from religious houses, some cathedral churches, and seminaries, the Catholic Church has yet to achieve this same type of success with the Divine Office flourishing alongside the Mass.
This study was also advantageous in unveiling areas where further attention is needed. More work needs to be done in the area of advocacy so that as in England and Europe, Catholics in the United States have an understanding of what a choir school is and what it can contribute to the life of the twenty-first-century Church. On behalf of the entire Church, choirs singing liturgies daily fulfills an essential ministry of praying without ceasing and joining the church’s collective voice to that of the perpetual liturgy in heaven. Furthermore, choirs are necessary to aid understanding and render the rich meaning of the Word of God more effectively. Bishops and priests must take an interest in liturgical theology, how the choir’s role assists this, and the importance of both working in tandem in inspiring the faith of Catholics. Many, like the writers of the Snowbird Statement, stress the value and position of choir schools in the post-Vatican II Church: “Choir schools, of historically proven ability for high-quality musical training, remain important for the renewed liturgy.”

However, choir schools have also been viewed as “elitist” or as “enrollment threats” to neighboring parochial schools that are struggling. So far, reviving the choir school tradition has been a grass-roots effort in various pockets throughout the country. In addition to the three schools focused on in this study, a choir school at Most Pure Heart of Mary Catholic Church in Topeka, Kansas is currently being founded by Lucas Tappan, cited above for his investigation of The Madeleine Choir School.

For these choir school programs, liturgy is the central experience through which all points of the students’ education intersect; it is not something which is added on to their musical and academic training. As a result, these schools are conducive to successfully meeting the musicoliturgical directives of Vatican II and serving as models for the formation of programs in other types of institutions. In some cases, that could mean establishing a diocesan choir school to meet

---

both the needs of musically gifted students and the liturgical needs of the diocese, much like St. Paul’s Choir School. A similar model could be implemented in smaller institutions, such as seminaries. On a larger scale, it could mean adopting a model more like The Atonement Academy in parochial schools where all students are trained to participate in the liturgy as choristers. As greater advocacy takes place, choir school programs have the capability of helping to bring the intentions of the Second Vatican Council to a more fruitful fulfillment and re-directing the course of liturgical music in the Church. As each of these schools has proven, it is possible for the seemingly disparate goals of Vatican II to co-exist; it is not necessary to select certain goals over others. It is possible to preserve and promote chant, polyphony, and the sacred treasure of music while, at the same time, fostering active participation and the composition of new sacred works. The importance of choir schools as models for implementing these theoretical conciliar directives in actual practice in a way that allows the traditio and progressio to be mutually enriching should not be underestimated.

Important considerations to make when establishing a choir school program include determining the ages, gender, and number of choristers that will be responsible for the liturgical duties at the institution. Peak vocal years should be taken into account. I observed at these schools that boys’ treble voices tended to be strongest around the fifth and sixth grade while girls’ voices did not reach their strongest until high school. Also, changed-voice boys do not become settled tenors and basses until high school. Although two of the schools in this study are co-educational, the boys and girls sing in separate choirs according to gender. As this study reveals, the correlation between operating cost and enrollment size, as well as funding sources, needs to be accounted for. Financial aid at each institution allows students of various
socioeconomic backgrounds to have access to this type of education and creates a more diverse student body. Each of the schools in this study exists in an urban area where there is a large pool from which to draw interested (and talented) students. Some type of selection process, either upon admittance or at a later point, may be necessary; otherwise, students who do not possess adequate interest or musical skill may contribute to classroom management issues to the detriment of the choir. As we have seen, strong academic programs alongside the choristers’ training are also essential for parents considering choir school as an option for their children. At the same time, students need to have the capability of keeping up academically alongside the intensive liturgical and musical schedule.

In conclusion, the choir school model should continue to be held in high esteem because of the potential benefits it offers. The future of Catholic music as well as the successful advancement of Vatican II goals is at stake. Throughout history, numerous examples exist of choir schools being instrumental in the cultivation of priests, composers, and adult choristers as well as legions of individuals who lead exemplary, successful, and inspirational lives in numerous professions as a result of this early formation. Today, formation in Catholic musical, liturgical, and spiritual aspects remains equally essential for developing well-qualified leaders to serve the Church and society. The three choir schools in this study are successfully forming students in this manner. As a result, they may offer timely solutions to the American Church, which struggles with plummeting numbers of religious vocations, declining enrollment in Catholic schools, and decreasing percentages of Catholics attending Mass. Among the choir schools of this study, there have been several examples of alumni pursuing religious and sacred

---

music vocations. Two out of the three choir schools boast student enrollments which have more than quadrupled in recent years. Through their inspirational singing in the liturgy, sacred music concerts, tours, and recordings, choir schools may prove a catalyst for the New Evangelization in nourishing and reigniting the faith of alienated Catholics. In the case of the three congregations observed, having strong choir involvement in the liturgy seemed to suggest an increased congregational participation, both interiorly and exteriorly. Furthermore, choir school education offers certain lasting benefits which regular Catholic schools do not. By being centered on a choral daily Mass, embodying the Church’s entire treasure of sacred music, promoting the singing of chant, inspiring a cosmic view, developing whole persons, building community through the choral ensemble, and fostering regular prayer life and sacramental living, these choir schools have the advantage of producing a decidedly “Catholic ethos.” Many of these traits serve as benchmarks when evaluating a school’s Catholic identity according to teachings by the Holy See.¹⁰ Choir schools are not only particularly conducive to teaching music in a way that promotes musico-liturgical objectives in accord with Church teachings, such as those of Vatican II, but the numerous other advantages they are likely to contribute to the twenty-first-century-Church are worthy of great attention.

¹⁰ Archbishop J. Michael Miller, CSB, The Holy See’s Teaching on Catholic Schools (Atlanta: Solidarity Association, 2006).
### Appendix A

**Rehearsal/Classroom Observation Form**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REHEARSAL/ CLASSROOM OBSERVATION FORM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>School</strong>: ___________________________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Date</strong>: _____________________________</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Materials used** (text books, sight singing books, scores, vowel/ solfège charts, visual aids, hymnals, chant books, prayer/ liturgical books, choral compilation books, handouts, piano, tuning fork, metronome, etc.)

______________________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________________

**Activity #1**: ___________________________ **Time**: __________________

**Objective**: Students will be able to...

(know/ do what skill, by employing the use of…)

______________________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________________

**Assessment**

______________________________________________________________________________

Aspect(s) addressed:

- Vocal Production (including diction)
- Music Reading/ Music Theory
- Learning Repertoire
- Performance Practice
- Meaning of the Text
- Music/ Church History
- Liturgical
- Spiritual/ Catechetical
- Scriptural
- Human Formation (intra- and interpersonal) truthfulness, respect for others, justice, humility, integrity, generosity, kindness, trust, self-awareness, self-discipline, working with others, ability to learn from both praise and criticism, etc.
ACTIVITY #2 ________________________________ Time __________________

Objective: Students will be able to…

(know/do what skill, by employing the use of…)

Assessment

Aspect(s) addressed:
- Vocal Production (including diction)
- Music Reading/ Music Theory
- Learning Repertoire
- Performance Practice
- Meaning of the Text
- Music/ Church History
- Liturgical
- Spiritual/ Catechetical
- Scriptural
- Human Formation (intra- and interpersonal) truthfulness, respect for others, justice, humility, integrity, generosity, kindness, trust, self-awareness, self-discipline, working with others, ability to learn from both praise and criticism, etc.

ACTIVITY #3 ________________________________ Time __________________

Objective: Students will be able to…

(know/do what skill, by employing the use of…)

Assessment

Aspect(s) addressed:
- Vocal Production (including diction)
- Music Reading/ Music Theory
☐ Learning Repertoire
☐ Performance Practice
☐ Meaning of the Text
☐ Music/ Church History
☐ Liturgical
☐ Spiritual/ Catechetical
☐ Scriptural
☐ Human Formation (intra- and interpersonal) truthfulness, respect for others, justice, humility, integrity, generosity, kindness, trust, self-awareness, self-discipline, working with others, ability to learn from both praise and criticism, etc.

ACTIVITY #4__________________________________________Time __________________

Objective: Students will be able to…

_______________________________________________________________

_______________________________________________________________

Assessment

_______________________________________________________________

Aspect(s) addressed:
☐ Vocal Production (including diction)
☐ Music Reading/ Music Theory
☐ Learning Repertoire
☐ Performance Practice
☐ Meaning of the Text
☐ Music/ Church History
☐ Liturgical
☐ Spiritual/ Catechetical
☐ Scriptural
☐ Human Formation (intra- and interpersonal) truthfulness, respect for others, justice, humility, integrity, generosity, kindness, trust, self-awareness, self-discipline, working with others, ability to learn from both praise and criticism, etc.
SUMMARY

Philosophy and teaching method utilized by the teacher in regards to:

Vocal Production/ Tone _________________________________________________________

Music Reading ________________________________________________________________

Repertoire ____________________________________________________________________
(chant, polyphony, 20th/21st c. compositional techniques, etc.)

Additional Comments (describe vocal tone, changing voice, etc.) ________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________

Percentage of instructional time spent addressing each aspect:

_____ Vocal Production (incl. diction)
_____ Music Reading/ Music Theory
_____ Learning Repertoire
_____ Performance Practice
_____ Meaning of the Text
_____ Music/ Church History
_____ Liturgical
_____ Spiritual/ Catechetical
_____ Scriptural
_____ Human Formation
## LITURGICAL OBSERVATION FORM

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Church</th>
<th>Choir</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Type of liturgy**

Feast/theme/focus

**Participants**

**Congregational Worship Aids**

(e.g., chant sources, missalettes, hymnals, worship leaflets, Book of Divine Worship, Roman Missal, etc.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Place in rite</th>
<th>Musical setting</th>
<th>Sung or played by</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Timing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Example**

1. introit / chant from *Graduale Romanum* / boys-antiphon + men-verses / from choir loft / 2 minutes, 30 seconds

2. 

3. 

4. 

5. 

6. 

7. 

8. 

9. 

10. 

11. 

12. 

13. 

14. 

358
Non-musical elements that contributed to or diminished the degree of solemnity

Elements that contribute to the development of spirituality pertaining to the following:

- Word of God
- Sacraments
- Eucharist
- Saints
- Blessed Virgin Mary
Appendix C
Research Questions

*Data from school documents, observations, and interviews was collected to answer the following questions, providing evidence for the eight standards.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STANDARD</th>
<th>QUESTIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>#1: Catholic institutions and schools attach great importance to the teaching of music.</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 1.1 Musical training advocates strong choral music experiences, particularly when they give fervent expression to the Catholic ethos within the context of liturgy. | • Are the choir program and liturgy central to the mission of the school?  
• Are all students at the school required to participate in choir and liturgy daily?  
• Is the school schedule built around the choir program and liturgy?  
• How much time do students spend in liturgies and choir per week on average?  
• What are the size, composition, and primary responsibilities of each choir?  
• What additional special music programs, liturgies, and choral experiences are students exposed to on an annual or occasional basis?  
• What separate classes are offered at the school besides choir to further strengthen the students’ musical training (music theory, private lessons in voice, piano, organ, and other instruments)?  
• What is the expectation for students to do with this education (e.g. pursue vocations in sacred music)? |
| 1.2 A rigorous curriculum serves as the framework in which the sequential acquisition of skill and learning takes place, through use of a graded choir system or similar, appropriate to the varying ability levels of individuals. | • What is required to gain admittance to the school?  
• Who decides the school curriculum or what is taught?  
• Is the curriculum modeled after the traditional European choir school, the National Standards for the Arts, State Core Content Standards, the Royal School of Church Music, or based on the specific musico-liturgical needs of each institution?  
• What aspects have and have not been adopted from these existing models?  
• What subjects comprise the school curriculum and what percent of instructional time do students spend in each of the musico-liturgical subject areas?  
• Is there a sequential method as students progress?  
• What are the various graded levels singers may achieve?  
• Is this division by grade, gender, or musical ability?  
• Of what does the choir and music curriculum consist and what specific skill acquisition is expected at each level?  
• What benchmarks must be passed in order to achieve each level or choir?  
• Is there some type of ceremony where the choristers are vested into these various levels?  
• What materials/books are used in choir and related musico-liturgical classes?  
• What are the specific music teaching philosophies or methods used?  
• How is character education included in the choir curriculum? |
### STANDARD #1 (con’t)

#### 1.3 Aspects of good, healthy vocal production are promoted during singing.
- What aspect(s) of vocal production are addressed and how are they addressed?
- How is the treble boys’ sound different from the girls’ sound?
- Are techniques for teaching boys to sing similar or different from teaching girls?
- What materials are used to teach singing (e.g., vowel charts, music text books)?
- To what extent is good vocal technique modeled by other students and/or by the instructor?
- What is the philosophy of tone?
- What is done pedagogically to achieve this sound?
- How does this vary among music of different stylistics periods?
- Is there alignment with any particular vocal technique/tonal production school of thought (e.g., English models)?
- Is there alignment with any school of thought presented by various researchers on the changing voice? Some chorister programs have boys stop singing all together.
- How is the changing voice accommodated?
- How is vocal technique refined as students progress?
- What are the benefits and also possible disadvantages of having (or not having) girls in the program?
- How frequently do the girls and boys combine?
- What are the advantages to having them sing separately rather than mixed?
- Do the girls and boys each sing with the tenors and basses at different times?
- How does having a group of professional men singing the tenor and bass parts impact the choristers’ singing?

#### 1.4 Music reading skills are developed.
- What are the music reading abilities for each choir (unison, 2-pt., etc.)?
- What aspect(s) of music reading are addressed?
- What philosophies or methods are employed in teaching students to read music?
- What materials are used (e.g., sight singing books, charts, music text books)?
- How are choristers able to sing such large quantities of challenging music all of the time (does teaching by rote, repetition, or solfège training factor into this)?
- What are choristers thinking about as they sing through the music (e.g., contour, intervals, scale degree numbers, solfège)?
- How far in advance do choristers begin working on new pieces or major works like Duruflé’s Requiem?

#### 1.5 A wide spectrum of musical literature, particularly those songs of the Sunday liturgy, is employed during musical training.
- What types of repertoire are utilized for each choir?
- What types of songs from the Sunday liturgy do the choristers sing (e.g., congregational responses, Mass settings, and hymns)?
- What materials are used for the repertoire (e.g., hymnals, chant books, choral compilation books, music text books)?
- Which Ordinary Mass settings is the congregation (including the choristers) able to sing?
- Which additional Ordinary Mass settings is the choir alone able to sing?
#2: Gregorian chant is given pride of place in liturgical services.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2.1 Choirs and congregations are exposed to hearing live chant in the liturgy and singing a minimum repertory of this chant.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• In which of the chants set forth by <em>Jubilate Deo</em> and <em>Sing to the Lord</em> are the congregation and choristers proficient?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• In which additional chants are the congregation and choir proficient?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What chant sources are used by the choir?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What chant sources are used by the congregation?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• How frequently is chant used in liturgies?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2.2 Teachers possess effective methods of teaching and promoting chant.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Which pedagogies are employed in teaching students to read chant notation (e.g., Ward, Solesmes, solfège)?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What other types of music are used in liturgy to promote chant (e.g., chant-based organ and choral works)?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• How does the program promote the preservation and use of Gregorian chant?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#3: Sacred polyphony is included in liturgical celebrations.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3.1 The singing of polyphony is employed by the choir, or other capable individuals, in liturgical and non-liturgical celebrations at times for the benefit of the ecclesial community.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• What is the annual repertoire list of polyphony used in liturgies, concerts, tours, and other performances by the choirs?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What materials are used for this music (e.g., choral compilation books)?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• When does the choir use polyphony in the liturgy (place in the rite and feast/solemnity)?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Are there times outside of the liturgy when polyphony is performed?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#4: The treasure of sacred music is preserved and fostered with great care.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>4.1 The singing of all the different types of sacred music that exist within the church treasury (Masses, antiphons, motets, anthems, hymns, cantatas, oratorios) is employed by the choir, or other individuals, in liturgical and non-liturgical celebrations for the glory of God and sanctification of the faithful.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• What is the annual list of choral repertoire used in liturgies, concerts, tours, and other performances by the choirs?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• When does the choir use music from the church’s sacred treasury in the liturgy?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What kinds of hymns comprise the choristers’ repertoire - main hymnal(s) used?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• In <em>Theological Problems of Church Music</em>, then Cardinal Ratzinger speaks of an “attitude in which all [previous] church music . . . was not regarded as belonging to the present and hence could not be part of a contemporary practice, such as liturgy can and must. Instead traditional culture is pushed aside into a more or less museum-like state of preservation in the concert hall.” Why is it important for students to sing this music of the church’s tradition?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Do students feel that an ancient culture is being imposed upon them or do they connect to this music of the past...in what ways do they connect?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What opportunities exist for the choir to sing sacred music or larger works that are not appropriate for the liturgy but continue to be relevant and spiritually edifying for the faithful?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### #5: Composers cultivate new works of sacred music to increase the church’s store of treasures.

| 5.1 Sacred works by recent and living composers are among those taught and employed by Catholic institutions. | • What is the annual repertoire list of modern sacred music used in liturgies, concerts, tours, and other performances by the choirs?  
• What interaction have students had with living composers or discussions about them? |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.2 Reasons for adding new works to the treasure of sacred music are identified.</td>
<td>• What are some reasons why your institution has needed new works of sacred music?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 5.3 Sources that serve as inspiration for composers to create new music for the church are identified. | • What would your institution advise composers to look to as sources for inspiration in writing new music for the Church?  
• What types of compositional techniques have you discovered in modern pieces sung by the choir that reflect a looking back to the *traditio* while at the same time exhibit the *progressio* of a living faith? |
| 5.4 Criteria which makes some pieces of sacred music more appropriate than others for the liturgy is acknowledged. | • What criteria do you use to gauge whether new works are appropriate for liturgical use? |

### #6: The faithful are led to full, conscious, and active participation in liturgical celebrations.

| 6.1 Sung parts of the liturgy foster both the internal and external participation of the congregation in liturgical celebrations. | • What percentage of every liturgy comprises singing?  
• What percentage of the sung portions do the congregation, choir, cantor, deacon, and presider engage in as part of their ministerial role?  
• What components does each sing and what is the rationale for dividing up the musical duties as such between the congregation and choir?  
• What additional factors impact participation (e.g., acoustical space, logistical aspects, worship aids and resources, use of cantor, use of organ, etc.)?  
• What has been done to instruct the congregation and develop them in both internal and external forms of participation?  
• How has strong congregational singing been fostered at parish and school liturgies?  
• Does the choir ever sing the *Sanctus* chorally? |
| --- | --- |
#7: Singers receive a genuine training in liturgy.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>7.1</th>
<th>A basic understanding of liturgy and liturgical functions is integrated with the training of singers.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
|     | • What are the main sources of liturgical formation at the school?  
     | • What classes are offered to assist in liturgical formation (e.g., Latin, theology, spirituality, church history, art history)?  
     | • What materials and textbooks are used to teach students about the liturgy?  
     | • What is the choristers’ understanding of how their singing contributes to the celebration of liturgy and its various elements?  
     | • In what sense do choristers understand their participation as something that obeys a stricter law than the commonplace of everyday life or mere utilitarianism, but rather must stem from the Logos and lead to the Spirit as part of the cosmic liturgy (“sense of awe and wonder”/ “maturing appreciation of the concept of mystery”/ “a feeling you can’t out into words”)? |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>7.2</th>
<th>Teachers develop linguistic, scriptural, and theological understandings of sung musical texts with singers so that they may incorporate them more meaningfully into the liturgy.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
|     | • Are linguistic, scriptural, and theological understandings of sung musical texts used in liturgy expanded upon in choir or other classes?  
     | • What pedagogies are employed during choral rehearsals to help students understand the musical texts they sing and their meaning in the liturgy? |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>7.3</th>
<th>From the manner and length of the liturgy celebrated, those liturgies and elements which are of highest importance receive due emphasis.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• How are liturgies of varying degrees of solemnity differentiated liturgically and musically?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#8: Singers receive spiritual formation of the highest standards.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>8.1</th>
<th>Spiritual formation helps singers cultivate a personal ongoing relationship with the Lord while, at the same time, develop in their liturgical ministry to help form the faith of others.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
|     | • What are the main sources of spiritual formation at the school?  
     | • How is spiritual formation addressed within the choir rehearsal, the liturgy, and formal theology classes?  
     | • In what ways does singing this music impact students’ faith and prepare them for a lifelong role as faith-filled individuals?  
<pre><code> | • In what ways do the choristers bring this spiritually to their liturgical ministry to impact the faith of others? |
</code></pre>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STANDARD #8 (con’t)</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 8.2 Daily Mass, celebrations throughout the liturgical year, and a variety of spiritual practices built of the Word of God, grounded in the sacraments, and devoted to the Eucharist, as well as studying the lives of the saints and the Blessed Virgin Mary are a primary means of forming individuals spiritually. | • In addition to daily Mass and theology courses, what are some other daily practices that help develop students spiritually?  
• What types of seasonal liturgical celebrations and devotional practices do students partake of throughout the year?  
• In what ways is students’ spirituality developed through the Word of God (e.g., Vespers)?  
• The Divine Office originated in the Catholic Church, but it seems to be an almost exclusively-Anglican practice today. How does the Divine Office co-exist alongside the Mass, particularly when there is a choir school to carry it out so beautifully on a regular basis?  
• You sing Evensong occasionally right now; is this something that might be expanded in the future?  
• In what ways is students’ spirituality grounded in the sacraments and devoted to the Eucharist?  
• In what ways are the lives of the saints studied?  
• In what ways is Mariology developed?  
• What types of printed materials or textbooks are used to teach students about spirituality?  
• What impact has this spiritual formation had on students over the long-term? How many alumni are pursuing religious life or sacred music vocations? |
### Appendix D
#### Additional General and School-Specific Questions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GENERAL QUESTIONS ASKED OF ALL THREE SCHOOLS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• What accreditations and awards does your school hold?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• How is the school supported financially?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Do you offer scholarships for students that need financial assistance to attend the school?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Describe the parental support.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What are the essential elements to your particular choir school program?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What have been the stages in getting the program where it is today?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Describe the program when you arrived. What changes have you made?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What have been the biggest obstacles to overcome?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What are your goals for the future of the school and the choir program?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• To what degree are you a model for the entire diocese/archdiocese and beyond?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Is there interaction between your school and other Catholic schools in the area?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Why is your program important in the twenty-first-century Catholic Church?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SCHOOL-SPECIFIC QUESTIONS: ST. PAUL’S CHOIR SCHOOL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• When you audition boys, is there a certain range that they need to be able to reach because a lot of the unison music the treble choristers sing lies in the soprano range?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What is the method for training students in the English choir school tradition?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• You recently hired a new music director. What attributes were you looking for in the ideal candidate?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SCHOOL-SPECIFIC QUESTIONS: THE MADELEINE CHOIR SCHOOL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• How does a Catholic choir school exist in Salt Lake City which is predominately Mormon?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What do students have to do to be chosen as a head chorister? What are their duties once in this role?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• You have stated that one goal of the school is to further integrate members of the growing Hispanic Catholic population. How do you plan to do this?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SCHOOL-SPECIFIC QUESTIONS: THE ATONEMENT ACADEMY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• What are the advantages of everyone in the school participating in a non-auditioned choir program?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What advantages are there to continuing the program through the twelfth grade?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Why retain the Anglican Use? What unique musical and liturgical offerings does it preserve?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
BIBLIOGRAPHY


367


Capon, Jane. Information Officer for the Choir Schools’ Association. E-mail message to author. 13 February 2015.


371


_____.


Music Director of Our Lady of the Atonement Church and The Atonement Academy. Interview by author. Digital recording. San Antonio, TX, 30 April 2014.


376


Robinson, John. Music Director of St. Paul’s Church and Choir School. E-mail message to author. 12 January 2015.


_____. Liner notes to Silent Night, directed by Dr. Theodore Marier, recorded 1960s and 70s, St. Paul’s Choir School, CD, digitally remastered, 2013.


Wolny, Russell. Chairman, Department of Classics at The Atonement Academy. E-mail message to author. 16 January 2015.

